21.04.2022

Learned counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel for the appellant seeks adjournment. Adjourned. To come up for preliminary hearing on 01.06.2022

before S.B.

(MIAN MUHAMMAD) MEMBER(E)

2022 Ist June,

Counsel for the appellant present.

Pre-admission notice be given to the other side. Case

to come up on 14.07.2022 before S.B.

Chairman

14,07:2022

Learned counsel for the appellant present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General for the respondents present.

Learned Additional Advocate General apprised about the preadmission notice, as per order sheet dated 01.06.2022. He committed at the Bar that reply of the official respondents will be submitted shortly. Adjourned. To come up for reply as well as preliminary hearing on 05.08.2022 before S.B.

> (MIAN MUHAMMAD) MEMBER (EXECUTIVE)

تيريون ا

# Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court	ال	 
o No		169/2022

S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	07/02/2022	The appeal of Mr. Itbar Shah presented today by Mr. Noor
		Muhammad Khattak Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please.
		REGISTRAR
2-	7	This case is entrusted to S. Bench at Peshawar for preliminary
2-	· .	hearing to be put there on 01 04 - 2012
		CHARMAN
0	1.04.2022	Junior of learned counsel for the appellant present.
		Seeks adjournment on the ground that learned senior
		counsel is not available today due to some domestic
		engagement. Adjourned. To come up for preliminary
		hearing on 21.04.2022 before the S.B.
		Chairman

### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

			160	3
SERVICE	APPEAL	NO.	10	/2022

**ITBAR SHAH** 

V/S

## INDEX

S.N	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1	Memo of appeal	80848446	1-3
2	Affidavit	*******	4
3	Impugned letter/order	A	5
4	Application	В	6
5	Complaint dt: 25.01.2022	С	7
6	Departmental appeal	D	8
7	Wakalat Nama	2700224455	9

Dated: \_\_\_\_/02.2022

APPELLANT

Through:
NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE 0345-9383141

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL	NO		/2022
--------	----	--	-------

#### **VERSUS**

1- The Director General Health Services Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The District Health Officer Merged Area, Peshawar.

3- The Deputy District Health Officer, Sub Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar.

.RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION 4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ORDER DATED 25-6-2020 COMMUNICATED TO THE APPELLANT ON 20-10-2021 WHEREBY THE APPELLANT HAS BEEN REMOVED FROM SERVICE AND AGAINST THE INACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY NOT DECIDING THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the impugned order dated 25-06-2020 communicated to the appellant on 20-10-2021 may very kindly be set aside and the appellant may please be re-instated into service with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Service Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

#### R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

# Brief facts giving rise to the present appeal are as under:

- 1- That appellant was appointed as Behshti (BPS-3) in the respondent department and was serving in the respondent department quite efficiently and to the entire satisfaction of high ups.
- 2- That astonishingly, the appellant during performance of duties at Dispensary Amir Nawaz Deputy District Health office, Sub Division Hasan Khel Peshawar the respondent department orally informed the appellant that services of the appellant has been terminated.

- 3- That time and again the appellant requested for provision of documents to ascertain reasons and grounds of termination but every time appellant was dodged.
  - That after strenuous efforts by the appellant, the respondent No.4 has provided/communicated the impugned letter/order dated 26-06-2020 addressed to the respondent No.3 whereby services of the appellant has been removed.

Copy of the impugned letter/order is attached as annexure----- A.

5- That the appellant after being disappointed with the attitude and lukewarm response of the respondents, wrote an application dated 27-12-2021 under the RTI Act 2013 to respondent No.4 for provision of required documents so that the appellant may defend himself properly.

Copy of the application is attached as annexure......B.

6- That in response to the above referred application the appellant moved a complaint dated 25-01-2022 to the Chief Information Commissioner Peshawar against the respondents for not providing the requisite information/documents to the appellant.

Copy of complaint dated 25-01-2022 is attached as annexure-----C.

7- That feeling aggrieved from the impugned letter/order dated 25-06-2022 communicated to the appellant on 20-10-2021, the appellant preferred departmental appeal but no response has been given by the department till the expiry of the statutory period of ninety days.

8- That appellant, having no other remedy, prefer the instant appeal on the following grounds inter alia as under:

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the impugned orders dated 25-06-2020 is against the law, facts, norms of natural justice and materials on the record hence not tenable and liable to be set aside.
- B- That appellant has not been treated in accordance with law and rules by the respondent Department on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the respondents acted in arbitrary and mala fide manner by awarding major penalty of removal from service of the appellant.

- D-That after removal, the respondent department despite constant contacts has not provided the required documents to the appellant which is against the norms of justice and fair play.
- E- That act of respondent department regarding removal of appellant without any just cause sis nothing else but just to accommodate its blue eyed which tantamount to nepotism and favoritism and against the law of the land and objectives of Maqasede- Shari'a the basic unit of the Islamic Welfare State of Pakistan.
- F- That it is important to mention here that it is the consistent view of the apex court that no major punishment be awarded to a civil servant without conducting regular inquiry and intimating its outcome to the appellant enabling him to defend himself properly.
- G- That no charge sheet and statement of allegation has been served on the appellant prior to the issuance of the impugned order dated 25-06-2020
- H-That no show cause notice nor chance of personal hearing has been provided to the appellant before the issuance of the impugned order dated 25-06-2020
- I- That appellant seeks permission to advance other grounds and proofs at the time of hearing.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

Dated:

APPELLANT

ITBAR SHAH

THROUGH:

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK

KAMRAN KHAN

UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND

SAID KHAN

KHANZAD GUL ADVOCATES

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

SERVICE	<b>APPEAL</b>	NO	/2022
DEKATOR	ALI PAP		

**ITBAR SHAH** 

VS

**HEALTH DEPTT:** 

#### AFFIDAVIT

Stated on oath that the contents of the accompanying service appeal are correct to best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Service Tribunal.

DEPONENT

**CERTIFICATE:** 

anar Distr

Certify that no earlier service appeal has been filed by the appellant in the instant matter before this Honorable Service Tribunal.

CERTIFICATION

TETHE DEPUTY DISTRICT HEALTH OFFICER SUB

AVISION HASSAN KHEL PESHAWAR

Tawas Khari Colony neor Alloma iqbal public school ring road Peshawar

15-94

Date 25/06

ANNEX A

The Director Health Services Merged Areas Peshawar

Subject: TERMINATION OF MR. ITBAR SHAH BESHTI CD AMIR NAWAZ DDHO SDHK

Sir

Reference to this office letter no 1759-61/DDHO/SDHK/Pesh dated 19/06/2020, he was directed to appear the undersigned for personal hearing within 3 days but you failed to do so, After lassing the time period you didn't reply to the undersigned or come to the office.

It is further added that it has come into the notice of the undersigned that he is long absent.

Therefore the undersigned is pleased to remove him from his services under E&D Rules section. 12:139.

Deputy District Health officer
Sub Division Hassan Khen Pashawa

Copy Fol ward to the:

1. Askistorit Commissioner Sub division Hassan khel, Peshawar

Deputy District Health Offi Sub Division Hassan Khel P



To,

Dated: 27/12/2021

The Deputy District Health Officer, Sub Division Hassa Khel, Peshawar.

Subject: Request for information under RTI Act 2013

Dear Sir,

With reference to RTI act 2013, the following information/documents are requested from your good office.

- 1. Appointment letter of the undersigned
- 2. Charge sheet
- 3. Show Cause Notice issued to undersigned
- 4. Inquiry report, and ToR of the inquiry committee
- 5. Name and designation of the inquiry committee chairman and members
- 6. Termination letter/order of a competent authorities
- 7. Dispatch register copy of the explanation letter/letters issued (from 1 Jan 2020 to 31 Jan 2021)

It is hope that you will provide the requisite information within stipulated time.

Sincerely your

Aitbar Shah

CNIC: 17301-9795465-1

Cell: 0333-9305475 / 03129305475

Address: Mohalla Alladad Khel, Dak Khana Kohi Hassan Khel, Sub Division Hassan Khel,

District Peshawar.

Received: June 12 27-12/21



The Chief Information Commissioner,

KP Right to Information Commission,

Peshawar.

## Subject: Complaint against request for Information under RTI Act 2013.

Respected Sir,

It is stated that I have submitted an information request to the Deputy District Health Officer (DDHO), Sub Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar on 27/12/2021 (copy attached). I waited for the period as stipulated in the "Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013" for the provision of information. However the requested information was not provided to me till date by the DDHO Office. Therefore I lodge a complaint with KPRTI Commission against the DDHO Office for non-provision of information under RTI Act 2013 please provide me the requested information details:

- 1. Appointment letter of the undersigned
- 2. Charge sheet
- 3. Show Cause Notice issued to undersigned
- 4. Inquiry report, and ToR of the inquiry committee
- 5. Name and designation of the inquiry committee chairman and members
- Termination letter/order of a competent authorities
- 7. Dispatch register copy of the explanation letter/letters issued (from 1 Jan 2020 to 31 Jan 2021)

Yours Sincerely.

Aitbar Shah

· CNIC: 17301-9795465-1

Cell: 0333-9305475 / 03129305475

Address: Mohalla Alladad Khel, Dak Khana Kohi Hassan Khel, Sub Division Hassan Khel,

District Peshawar.

Echishtig) photographico Jing June Junes Junes June س دولرن سی ارام در از سے والز ا بے آور اب سی ی ملی تعلق سے سائم کو لوال کا سے الم اللہ کا کیا ہے cs 0 2 0 gr 01/6 is do س رکوم کاروای اور سازی FUSE KINDING WILL CIUDA IN (10/0 / cl/0) / (10/0) / (10/0) / (10/0) / (10/0) Dekishti wy C#17301-9795465-1 MOB # 0333-9305475

# 9

## **VAKALATNAMA**

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO:	OF 2022
Itbor Shah	(APPELLANT) (PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)
	<u>VERSUS</u>
Health D	(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)
I/We <b>Ifbar</b>	Shah
compromise, withdraw of my/our Counsel/Advoca without any liability for hengage/appoint any other I/we authorize the said receive on my/our behalf	Peshawar to appear, plead, act, or refer to arbitration for me/us as te in the above noted matter, his default and with the authority to er Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. Advocate to deposit, withdraw and of all sums and amounts payable or count in the above noted matter.
Dated/202	2
	CLIENTS ACCEPTED
	NOOR MUHAMMAD KHATTAK
	KAMRAN KHAN
	SAID KHAN  HAIDER ALI
	& KHANZAD GUL
	ADVOCATES

A. M.

### "B"

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD, PESHAWAR.

Annac	d No	ika		or 20 2 2
Appea 14.	bax S	heh	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	Appellant/Petitioner
the )	Director.	Versus Gential	Healt	KPKRespondent
•		/ Res <sub>l</sub>	pondent No.	2
_ the	Distr	Healt	Office	8 Merged Avea
	Do	shawab.		
REAS an apervice Tribute ase by the permed/that/theceptone postport of the permedial supported at least sever any other degree any other degree and appears	peal/petitional Act, 197 titioner in the said apple are at liber and by your personance on the	on under the part of the part of the court and the court and the court and the court and the court of the cou	provision esented/re notice has s fixed for you wish the date fixed fixed fixed authoring. You are four rely. Pland in the	of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa gistered for consideration, in been ordered to issue. You are hearing before the Tribunal to urge anything against the xed, or any other day to which sed representative or by any e, therefore, required to file in a copies of written statement ease also take notice that in
ou by register you fail to fur en in the app ed to this add	red post. Yo rnish such a eal/petitior ress by regi	ou should infor address your ad a will be deeme astered post wil	rm the Reg Idress cont d to be you Il be deeme	gistrar of any change in your cained in this notice which the cr correct address, and further ed sufficient for the purpose of
of appeal is	attached.	Copy of appea	Lhas alrea	dy been sent to you vide this
n under my l	and and th	ne seal of this (	Court, at F	Peshawar this. 14
				. Registrar,
	EREAS an apper described at least sever any other de your appearantion will be how of any alto wen in the appeted to this addipetition.	EREAS an appeal/petition of any other documents to your appearance on the ition will be heard and do ce of any alteration in the busy registered post. You fail to furnish such a your appearance on the ition will be heard and do ce of any alteration in the busy registered post. You fail to furnish such a your appearance on the ition will be heard and do ce of any alteration in the post of any alteration in the post of any alteration in the post of any alteration in the your appeal is attached. The petition will be appeal will be appeal is attached. The petition will be appeal is attached will be appeal is attached will betatached will be appeal is attached will be appeal is attached wi	Response of the seal of this en under my hand and the seal of this entered the content of the provided t	Respondent No.  Appeal No.  No.  Respondent No.  Respondent No.  Appeal San appeal/petition under the provision Service Tribunal Act, 1974, has been presented/recase by the petitioner in this Court and notice has cormed/that/the said appeal/petition is fixed for the said appeal/petition is fixed for said appeal/petition is fixed for at 8.00 A.M. If you wish petitioner/you are at liberty to do so on the date fixed post postponed either in person or by authoridally supported by your power of Attorney. You are at least seven days before the date of hearing any other documents upon which you rely. Pluy your appearance on the date fixed and in the ition will be heard and decided in your absence.  The company of the such address your address continuity of all to furnish such address your address continuity of all to furnish such address your address continuity and the appeal/petition will be deemed to be you seed to this address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to this address by registered post will be deemed to this address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to the such address by registered post will be deemed to be your address of the such address of the suc

. The hours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays.

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal, Peshawar.

2. Always quote Case No. While making any correspondence.

Note:

## KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR. JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD, CAR

,	,**	PESHAW	AR.	3.10
No.	,			
•	Appeal No	169	of 20 <sub>2</sub> .	2
	illa al		of 20	Petitioner
••••	ナスロンチャー・コント	Versus		
4	nu Lu	1 1	1 At 11 De Rosno	andont
d the	····/JRECKOF	I were the	Post the VI H Kespo	muem
•		Res	pondent No3	•••••
Notice to:	he Deputy	Distr	Health Office Deshawor.	ex Sub Division
•	Hasso	in Wheel	Deshawas.	
*on/fy	oner you are at liber postponed either upported by your past seven days before the documents appearance on the will be heard and day alteration in registered post. You il to furnish such the appeal/petitio this address by region.	at 8.00 A.M. If erty to do so on in person or power of Attorn fore the date oupon which you decided in your the date fixed a fou should info address your acon will be deemon to the decided post with	s fixed for hearing be you wish to urge any the date fixed, or any oby authorised represency. You are, therefore, f hearing 4 copies of you rely. Please also tand in the manner aforabsence.  or hearing of this appoint the Registrar of and dress contained in this ed to be your correct ad II be deemed sufficient.  Notice I has already been ser	thing against the other day to which entative or by any required to file in written statement ake notice that in orementioned, the eal/petition will be my change in your s notice which the dress, and further afor the purpose of
office Notice No.	,	dated	••••••••	••
Given und	ler my hand and t	he seal of this	Court, at Peshawar th	is.g#
Day of		June	2g 2:	
	<b>\</b> .			
	\			

Registrar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal, Peshawar.

Note:

The hours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays. Always quote Case No. While making any correspondence.

## "B"

# KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR. JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD, PESHAWAR.

No.	Annaal No	169	of 20 2	2
	Ithory Cha	1	4 4 ./3	9 - 222 - 2 - 2
, <i>f</i> f.	h Dixutos	Versus J Jameisa J	Isult UN Respo	ndent
Notice to: —	he Divertoo	Respond entor Jen Deshawas	ieni No. 1 ever Health	Depar:
Province Service the above case by hereby informed *on	S an appeal/petition of Tribunal Act, 1974 by the petitioner in the distance of the control of t	t, has been presents Court and not eal/petition is fix 8.00 A.M. If you ty to do so on the n person or by a wer of Attorney. The date of he date fixed and	nted/registered for ice has been ordered to has been ordered to wish to urge any date fixed, or any couthorised represed You are, therefore, earing 4 copies of the hanner aforther the manner aforthered to the the manner aforthered to the theorem to th	consideration, in ed to issue. You are fore the Tribunal thing against the other day to which entative or by any required to file in written statement ake notice that in
given to you by address. If you fa address given in notice posted to this appeal/petit	in the second	a should inform ddress your addrewill be deemed to tered post will be a famission	the Registrar of an ess contained in thi be your correct ad e deemed sufficient No Eia	ny change in your s notice which the dress, and further for the purpose of
Copy of a	ppeal is attached. C	op <del>y of appeal ha</del>	s already been see	nt to you vide this
	••••••			A.
Given und	der my hand and the	e seal of this Cou	ırt, at Peshawar th	is IM
Day of		June	20 7.2	
٥				

Registrar, **Khyber Pakhtunkhw**a Service Tribunal, **Peshawa**r.

2. Always quote Case No. While making any correspondence.

Note:

<sup>1.</sup> The hours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays.