23.01.2019

Learned counsel for the appellant Dr. Gul-e-Rana appeared and stated that he had instituted appeal No.987/2018 against the posting transfer order dated 30.04.2018. However without his knowledge the appellant has filed second service appeal No.1033/2018 on 17.08.2018 against the same impugned order. File requisitioned. To come up alongwith service appeal No.987/2018 also filed by the appellant on 25.01.2019 before S.B

Member

25.1.2019

Mr. Muhammad Adnan Sher Advocate for appellant and Addl. AG alongwith Hazrat Shah Superintendent for the respondents present.

The representative of respondents has produced copy of notification dated 30.08.2018, whereby the appellant has been transferred from PMO B.S 19 DHQ Hospital, KDA Kohat to Medical Superintendent Liaqut Memorial Hospital, Kohat. The same is placed on file.

In view of the development the appeal in hand appears to have become infructuous, therefore, is disposed of as such. File be consigned to record room.

Chairman

Announced: 25.1.2019

23.11.2018

Counsel for the appellant present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional AG alongwith Mr. Jaffar Ali, Assistant for the respondents present. Written reply not submitted. Learned Additional AG requested for adjournment. Adjourned. To come up for written reply/comments on 13.12.2018 before S.B.

Muhammad Amin Khan Kundi Member

13.12.2018

Counsel for the appellant present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional AG alongwith Mr. Hazrat Shah, Superintendent and Mr. Jaffar Shah, Assistant for the respondents present. Written reply not submitted. Learned Additional AG requested for further adjournment. Last opportunity is granted. Adjourned. To come up for written reply/comments on 22.01.2019 before S.B.

Muhammad Amin Khan Kundi Member

Junior to counsel for the appellant present. Written reply not submitted. Hazrat Shah representative of the respondent department present and seeks adjournment to furnish written reply/comments. Granted. To come up for written

reply/comments for 25% 1:39 before S.B.

Member

210.2018

Counsel for the appellant present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional AG for official respondents No. 1 to 3 and private respondent No. 4 in person present. Written reply on behalf of respondents not submitted. Requested for adjournment. Adjourned. To come up for written reply/comments on 29.10.2018 before S.B. In the meanwhile status-quo be maintained till the date fixed.

(Muhammad Amin Khan Kundi) Member

Due to & Retirement of Honorable Chairman The Tribunal is nonfunctional Turefaces the base is adjourned to Come up for the Same on 12-11-2018 Refoles

Due to retirement of Hon'ble Chairman, the Tribunal is defunct. Therefore, the case is adjourned. .To come up on 23.11.2018. Written reply not received.

READER

Appeal Vo. 1033/2018 Dr. Grul-e-Rana vs Gort

24.08.2018

Counsel for the appellant Dr. Gul-e-Rana present. Preliminary arguments heard. It was contended by learned counsel for the appellant that the appellant was serving in Health Department as Medical Superintendent in Women and Children Hospital in management cadre since 29.11.2016. It was further contended that the appellant was transferred from the said post i.e Medical Superintendent Liaqat Memorial Hospital Kohat to DHQ Hospital Kohat against the vacant post of PMO (BPS-19) vide order dated 2.604.2018. It was further contended that the appellant filed departmental appeal on 30.04.2018 but the same was not responded despite direction by the worthy Peshawar High Court in the stipulated period hence, the present service appeal on 17.08.2018. It was further contended that the appellant was transferred against Transfer/Posting Policy as the normal period of two years was not completed. It was further contended that the appellant was transferred on political influence as Class-IV employee was appointed by the appellant and due to some political influence departmental proceeding was initiated on that basis but later on the inquiry officer exonerated her vide order dated 13.02.2018 and due to that reason the appellant was transferred politically. It was further contended that the appellant was serving in Management Cadre but she was transferred to General Cadre against the Health Management Service Rules, 2008. It was further contended that the appellant has not relinquish the charge so far therefore, the impugned order is illegal and liable to be set-aside.

The contention raised by the learned counsel for the appellant need consideration. The appeal is admitted for regular hearing subject to deposit of security and process fee within 10 days thereafter, notice be issued to the respondents for written reply/comments for 02.10.2018 before S.B. Learned counsel for the appellant also submitted application for suspension of impugned notification dated 25.04.2018. Notice of the same be also issued to the respondents for the date fixed. In the meanwhile status-quo be maintained till the date fixed.

Appellant Deposited Security a Process Fee

> (Muhammad Amin Khan Kundi) Member

# Form- A

# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of		· ·	 
Case No	1033 <b>/2018</b>	<u> </u>	

	Case No	1033/2018	
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge	
1	2	3	
1-	17/08/2018	The appeal of Dr. Gul-e-Rana presented today by Mr.  Muhammad Adnan Sher Advocate may be entered in the Institution	
2-	18-8-2018	Register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please.  REGISTRAR 17/8/18  This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on $24-8-2018$ .	
· .			
,		CHAIRMAN	
	-		
		•	

Service Appeal No: 1033/2018

Dr. Gul-e-Rana

# **VERSUS**

Govt of KP & Others

S.	Documents	Annexure	Page No.
No			
1.	Service Appeal		01-06
2.	Application for Suspension		07
3.	Affidavit	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	08
. 4.	Copies of the Notification dated 29.11.2016 and Charge Certificate "A" & "A-1" r	" <u>A</u> ", " <u>A-1</u> "	9-10
5.	Copy of Notification dated 13.02.2018	" <u>B</u> "	11
6.	Copy of <i>impugned Notification</i> & Ban Notification dated 31.07.2018	" <u>C</u> " , " <u>C-1</u> "	12-13
7.	Copy of the departmental appeal	" <u>D</u> "	14
8.	Copy of the judgment dated 30.05.2018	" <u>E</u> "	15-19
9.	Copy of the Notification dated 25.06.2018	" <u>F</u> "	20
10.	Wakalatnama		

Dated:

Through

MAD ADNAN SHER MUHAMMAD ADNAN SHER Advocate High Court, Peshawar

## IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No: 1033/2018

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunai

Diary No. 1302

Dated 17-8-2018

Dr. Gul-e-Rana

Presently Posted as Principal Medical Officer (PMO) District Headquarter (DHQ) Hospital KDA, Kohat

. APPELLANT

## **VERSUS**

1. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Through Chief Secretary KP Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

2. Secretary Health (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa)

Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

3. Director General Health (KP)

Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

4. Dr. Naeem Shah

MS Liaqat Memorial Hospital, Kohat

... RESPONDENTS

# SERVICE APPEAL UNDER SECTION 4 OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHAWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974

Respectfully Sheweth;



That the appellant is Senior Member Health Services (Management Cadre) in the Health Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and was posted as Medical Superintendent Women and Children Liaqat Memorial Hospital (hereinafter referred to as LMH) Kohat on 29.11.2016 and took charge of her office as MS on 05.12.2016. (Copies of the Notification dated 29.11.2016 and Charge Certificate are hereby annexed as Annexures "A" & "A-1" respectively).

(2)

- 2. That the appellant was performing her duties in **LMH** with devotion, sincerity and uprightness and earned a good reputation because of her efficiency and hard work in imparting her medical expertise in short span of time however in the mean while, some posts of Class-IV fell vacant in the year 2017 in **LMH** and so due process of law was adopted for fulfillment of these vacancies.
- 3. That with the news of vacancies of Class-IV in LMH, the local political elite became astir so as to get maximum output in the upcoming elections of 2018 and for the same reason, the agonies of the present appellant began when she was approached through different channels and wire pulling by the same political elite for the purpose of appointing and accommodating their blue eyed ones on these vacant posts of Class-IV in LMH, Kohat and the same fact is disclosed from the departmental appeal of the present appellant.
- 4. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the appellant was even threatened with dire consequences for not making favorable appointments to the said posts of Class-IV, however, despite this fact, the appellant stood determined and fearless and without caring for any threats and political approach, fulfilled the vacant posts of Class-IV on merit and in accordance with law.
- 5. That thereafter, the appellant was made subject to political victimization when an inquiry was held against the appellant to probe into the charges of illegal appointment of Class-IV in LMH, however as such charges were just politically motivated, the inquiry officers/ committee discarded and did not approve of the charges in inquiry report and on the basis of this inquiry report, *vide* Notification No. SOH(E-V)7-178/2018 dated 13.02.2018, the appellant was exonerated from all such baseless charges by the Competent Authority(Copy of the (Copy of Notification dated 13.02.2018 is hereby annexed as Annexure "B").
- 6. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the appellant did not surrender to the undue political influence of the annoyed political elite and continued to perform her duties as MS in LMH however, the appellant was later on transferred from the said post vide Notification No. SOH(E-V)7-172 dated 25.04.2018 to the post of PMO DHQ Hospital, Kohat (hereinafter referred to as impugned Notification). It is pertinent to mention at this juncture that the impugned Notification was issued despite

(3)

the fact that ban was imposed on posting/ transfer. (Copies of *impugned Notification* and Ban Notification dated 31.07.2018 are hereby annexed as Annexures "C" & "C-1" respectively).

- 7. That the appellant being aggrieved by the *impugned notification*, filed departmental appeal to the authority however the same remained undecided (Copy of the departmental appeal is hereby annexed as Annexure "D") and this attitude forced the appellant to approach hon'ble Peshawar High Court, Peshawar in W.P No. 2390-P/ 2018 whereby *vide* judgment dated 30.05.2018, the departmental authority was directed by the hon'ble Court to decide the departmental appeal of the petitioner/ appellant within one month after passing of judgment however till date appeal is yet to be decided.(Copy of the judgment dated 30.05.2018 is hereby annexed as Annexure "E").
- 8. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, in pursuance to directions of hon'ble Peshawar High Court, Peshawar in its judgment dated 30.05.2018, a Notification dated 25.06.2018 was issued by Respondent No. 2 admitting the fact in the said Notification that appelant's departmental appeal is based on merit however Election Commission has imposed ban on posting/ transfer and the summary to the acceptance of appeal and for the posting back as MS LMH will be moved to the Chief Minister KP within next three working days but till date the respondent/ respondents concerned are willfully and intentionally adopting delaying tactics one way or the other in implementing directions of hon'ble Peshawar High Court and deciding the department appeal. (Copy of the Notification dated 25.06.2018 is hereby annexed as Annexure "F").
- 9. That the appellant being aggrieved by the action of respondent/ respondents concerned and having no other alternate, sufficient or efficacious remedy, files instant appeal *inter alia* on the following grounds;

#### **GROUNDS**;

I. That the *impugned notification* is absolutely void, illegal and against the vested right of the appellant, hence liable to be struck down at once.

- II. That the *impugned notification* is otherwise not tenable in the eyes of law as the same is based on political victimization and influence and therefore *void ab initio*.
- III. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the said impugned Notification has been issued without any cogent reason despite the fact that the appellant has been exonerated from baseless charges by the Competent Authority but even then issuance of the impugned Notification clearly establishes the fact of political interference in the transfer of the present appellant.
- has been transferred as Principal Medical Officer (PMO) which is the post of General Cadre and not of Management Cadre whereas the appellant belongs to Management Cadre and she could not be transferred to any post other than that of post of Management Cadre and therefore the *impugned Notification* is against the law and Rules.
  - V. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, it is also pertinent to mention that the appellant has not yet relinquished charge from the post of MS LMH as the appellant is bound to obey the law and not the political whims or illegal orders and the impugned Notification is based on ulterior motives therefore has no legal backing to it and liable to be struck down.
  - VI. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the impugned Notification is otherwise against the law as the same was issued when the Election Commission of Pakistan had imposed ban on the posting/transfer in view of section 230 (2) (e) & (f) of Elections Act, 1979 and the same fact has been admitted to by Respondent No.2 in Notification dated 25.06.2018 and this dual standard by the respondent/respondents concerned is not at all warranted by law.
- VII. That despite the fact that the appellant has an unblemished service record and satisfactory performance throughout her career, issuance of the *impugned Notification* transpires malafide and ulterior motives of the respondent/ respondents concerned and therefore the same is liable to be set aside at the very outset.
- VIII. That even otherwise, the respondent/ respondents concerned are unwilling to implement the clear cut directions of the honb'le High

(3)

Court, Peshawar in its judgment dated 30.05.2018 which act of the respondent/ respondents concerned leaves no doubt that the appellant is intentionally penalized and punished for his upright and honest character which is not warranted by law at all.

- IX. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, before the appellant could have completed her mandatory period of two years on the post of MS, she was transferred from the said post and this ground alone is sufficient for setting aside the *impugned Notification* as the same is in violation of Government own policy.
- X. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the respondents have violated the principle of natural justice i.e. "audi altrem partem" while issuing the impugned Notification as she has not only been condemned unheard but no opportunity of personal hearing whatsoever was given and the same is therefore not maintainable.
- XI. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, the treatment meted out the present appellant on account of her keeping and promoting merit in appointments on vacant posts would otherwise discourage the officials of other departments to stick to promoting merit and surrender to illegal and unjustified demands of outsiders which would in general be a havoc to the society and justice demands that the impugned Notification be trashed out.
- XII. Without prejudice to the above and in addition thereto, it is admitted fact by the respondent/ respondent concerned that the department appeal of the appleant is based on merit and to be posted back as MS LMH, but even then not deciding the same leaves no doubt in one's mind that the same impugned Notification has been issued not in accordance with law.
- XIII. That it is the duty of every citizen of Pakistan to maintain loyalty to the State and Obedience to the Constitution and law however in the present case, the appellant is penalized and made to suffer on account of her obedience to law rather than political whims and therefore, the *impugned Notification* is nullity in the eye of law.
- XIV. That the Constitution of Pakistan, 1973 guarantees the fundamental right to every citizen to be treated in accordance with law however

(B)

issuance of the *impugned notification* is absolutely in violation to the said principle envisaged in Article 4 of the Constitution of 1973.

XV. Besides, Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 ensures equality of all the citizens before law and discourages any discrimination in services however in the case of the appellant, the *impugned Notification* is in violation to such fundamental rights and anything against the Fundamental Rights of the Constitution of 1973 is illegal and hence it is liable to be set aside on this score alone.

XVI. Any other ground that may be raised at the time of hearing of this service appeal.

It is, therefore, respectfully prayed that on acceptance of the present appeal, this hon'ble Tribunal may be pleased to;

- a. **Declare** *impugned notification* dated 25.04.2018 as null and void and the same be set aside **AND**
- b. **Direct** the respondent/ respondents concerned to treat the appellant as **MS** Liaqat Memorial Hospital, Kohat forthwith.
- c. *Any other* relief deemed fit and proper may kindly be granted in the given circumstances of the case.

Dated: , 2018

Through

APPÉLLANT

MUHAMMAD ADNAN SHEI Advocate High Court, Peshawar

#### Interim Relief;

By way of interim relief, this hon'ble Tribunal may be pleased to suspend the *impugned notification* dated 25.04.2018 till final disposal of subject service appeal.

#### IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No:

/ 2018

Dr. Gul-e-Rana

#### **VERSUS**

Govt of KP & Others

## APPLIACATION FOR SUSPENSION OF impugned Notification 25.04.2018

Respectfully Sheweth;

- 1. That the instant application may be considered as part and parcel of the enclosed service appeal pending adjudication before this hon'ble Tribunal in which date is yet to be fixed.
- 2. That the applicant/ appellant has got a *prima facie* case and sanguine about its success.
- 3. That the balance of convenience also tilts in favor of the applicant/appellant.
- 4. That if the interim relief as prayed for in the heading of application is not granted, the applicant/ appellant will suffer irreparable loss.

It is, therefore, respectfully prayed that on acceptance of this application, *impugned notification* dated 25.04.2018 may kindly be suspended and *status quo be granted*.

APPLICANT/ APPELLANT

Dated: , 2018

Through

MUHAMMAD ADNAN SHER Advocate High Court, Peshawar



#### IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No: / 2018

Dr. Gul-e-Rana

### **VERSUS**

Govt of KP & Others

#### **AFFIDAVIT**

- I, **Dr. Gul-e-Rana** presently posted as PMO, DHQ Hospital KDA, Kohat do hereby declare and affirm on oath;
- 1. That the contents of this application along with service appeal are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief &
- 2. That nothing has been concealed from the august court, which it is necessary to disclose.

DEPONENT

Shawar Hill



# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHW HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar, the 29th November/

NOTIFICATION

NO. SOH (E-V)4-20/2016: On Promotion to 3S-19 on regular basis in respect of doctor at sr.no.1, the competent authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) is pleased to order the posting/transfers of the following doctors in the public interest

S.NO	Name of doctor	From	To Medical
1.	Dr. Gul e Rana, Management Catire BS-19	Coordinator NP for FP and PHC Kohat	Superintendent, Woman and Children Hospital, Kohat vice sr. no.2
2.	Dr. Ubaid Hussain, Monagement Cadra BS-19	Medical Superintendent, Woman and Children Hospital, Kohat	Medical Superintendent, Civ Hospital Eadhabe Peshawar agains newly created post

Secretary Health Goyt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, KPK PESHAWAR

11:-1 (827) 37 (U-1) Copy forwarded to the :-

Dated Pesh, The O

01. District Health Officer, Kohat

92. Medical Supdt. Women & Children Hospital, Kohat,

03. District Health Officer, Peshawar.

04. AG Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.

05, DAO, Kohat,

06, AE-I, DGHS office Peshawar.

07, AE-IV, DGHS office Peshawar.

08. Doctor concerned.

For information and n/action.

ASSISTANT DIRECTOR (P-I) DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, KPK PESHAWAR.

ANNER MAT

## WOMEN AND CHILDERN/LIAQAT MEMORIAL HOSPITAL KOHAT

#### CERTIFICATE OF TRANSFER OF CHARGE.

Certified that we the following Doctors have this day after / before noon taken / handed over the charge of this office of MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT WOMEN & CHILDRE / LIAOAT MEMORIAL HOSPITAL KOHAT with reference to the Notification No. SOH (E-V) 4-20/2016 dated 29<sup>th</sup> November 2016.

Station: W&C/LMH KOHAT

Dated: 05TH DEC 2016

Signature of the Receiving Govt: Servant

Govt: Servant

DR. GUL E RANA

Designation: MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT BPS-19

Signature of the Relived Govt: Servant

Govt: Servant

Name:
Designation:

OFFICE OF THE MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT
WOMEN & CHILDREN/LM HOSPITAL KOHAT.

Endst: No. 1860-7/PF/W&C/LMH

Dated Kohat the 6 Dec. 2016

Copy forwarded to the:-

- 1. Secretary Health Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar
- 2. Director General Health Services Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 3. Deputy Commissioner, Peshawar.
- 4. Chief Executive DHQ & W&C/LM Teaching Hospitals Kohat
- 5. District Health Officer Kohat
- 6. Medical Superintendent DHQ Teaching Hospital Kohat.
- 6. District Account Officer Kohat.
- 7. Personal file.

MEDICAL SUPERINTENDENT WOMEN & CHILDREN HOSPITAL KOHAT

6



# ANNEX "B GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHY HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the 13th February, 2018

#### NOTIFICATION

NO.SOH(E-V)7-178/2018

WHEREAS Dr. Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre BS-19 Medical Superintendent Liaqat Memorial Hospital Kohat has been proceeded under Khyber

Pakhtunkhwa Govt Servants (Efficiency and Discipline) Rules, 2011 on account of illegal appointment of Class-tV in Liagat Memorial Fiospital Kohat.

formal inquiry was conducted into the matter with the approval of the competent authority (Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) against the doctor concerned to probe into the charges of illegal appointment of Class-IV in Liaqut Memorial Hospital Kohat.

AND WHEREAS the Inquiry Officers/Committee submitted inquiry report to Health Department which has been placed before the competent authority (Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa).

AND WHEREAS the charges of illegal appointment of Class-IV in Liagat Memorial Hospital Kohat has not approved against Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre Medical Superintendent (BS-19) Liaqat Memorial Hospital Kohat.

NOW THEREFORE in exercise of powers conferred under Sub Rule (3) of Rule-14 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Govt Servants (Efficiency and Discipline) Rules 2011, the competent authority (Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) has been pleased to exonerate Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre Medical Superintendent (BS-19) Liaqut Memorial Hospital Kohat from the charges mentioned in the charge sheet.

> SECRETARY HEALTH Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

#### Endst. No & Date Even.

Copy to the:-

1. Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. PSO to Chief Secretary Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Director General Health Services, Peshawar.

- 4. District Health Officer, Kohat
- 5. MS Liagat Memorial Hospital Kohat.
- 6. District Accounts Officer, Kohat.
- 7. PS to Secretary Health Department.
- 8. Computer Programmer Health Department.
- 9. Officer/doctor concerned.

( Muhammad irfanuddir SECTION OFFICER(E-V)

OFFICE OF THE DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR 7/- 9 5/E-1(G-81)

Copy of the above is forwarded to:-District Health Officer Kohet.

M.S Liagat Memorial Hospital Konat.

District Accounts Officer Kohat.

P.A. to DGHS Knyber Pakhtunkhwa Peuhawar.

Doctor concerned, for information and further necessary action.

DEPUTY BIRKCTOAYAB DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR





# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

# HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar, the 25th April, 2018

# NOTIFICATION.

NO.SOH(E=V)7-172/2017 The competent authority (Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) is pleased to order postings/transfers of the following doctors with Immediate effect in the public interest -

S#	Name of Doctor	From	ТО
1	Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadro BS-19	Lingat Memorial	DHO Hospital KDA Kohat. against the vacant post of PMO BS-19.
2	Dr Naeem Shah Management Cadre BS-19		MS Liagat Memorial

SECRETARY HEALTH
Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

# Endst. No. & Date even

#### Copy to :-

- 1. Accountant General Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. District Health Officer Kohat
- 4 MS DHQ Hospital KDA Kohat.
- 5. MS Liagat Memorial Hospital Kohat.
- 6 MS Category-D Hospital Shaker Darra Kohat
- District Accounts Officer Kohat.
- 8. PS to Minister Health Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9 PS to Secretary Health Department
- 10. PS to Special Secretary Health Department.
- 11. Computer Programmer Health Department.
- Doctors concerned

SECTION OFFICER-V

√om: Adnan Sher adnan sher@icloud.com &

Subject:

Date: August 14, 2018 at 2:37 PM
To: adnan sher@icloud.com

ANNEX "C-1"
(3)

# **ELECTION COMMISSION OF PAKISTAN**

#### NOTIFICATION

Islamabad the 31st July, 2018

No. F.2 (3)/2018-Cord. WHEREAS the Election Commission imposed ban on all type of recruitments and development schemes, approved w.e.f 1<sup>st</sup> April, 2018, vide Notification No. F. 2(3)/ 2018-Cord dated 11<sup>th</sup> April 2018;

AND WHEREAS a notification was issued on 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2018 whereby it was directed that transfers/ postings shall be subject to prior approval of the Election Commission and postings/ transfers made between 1<sup>st</sup> June and 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2018 were cancelled:

AND WHEREAS funds of all local government institutions were frozen vide Notification vide No. F. 2(3)/ 2018-Cord dated 8<sup>th</sup> June, 2018;

AND WHEREAS the Notification dated 11<sup>th</sup> April 2018 regarding ban on recruitments and development schemes was partially modified and ban on recruitment was withdrawn with a proviso that Caretaker Governments shall not make promotions, major appointments of public officials but may make acting or short term appointments in public interest;

Now when the General Elections have been held in the Country and new governments are going to be formed soon, therefore, above mentioned notifications are hereby withdrawn with immediate effect. The Caretaker Governments shall follow restrictions mentioned in Section 230 (2) (e) (f) of Elections Act 2017 for their remaining period in office.

By order of the Election Commission of Pakistan,

https://chat.whatsapp.com /7lxhG6qS0UqK082HRfHa M6

(Wagas Ahmed Malik) Deputy Director(Cord)

W & C Hospital Kohat Dated: 30.04.2018

То

The Secretary Health
Department of Health
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

## THROUGH PROPER CHANNEL

# Sub: APPEAL AGAINST THE NOTIFICATION FOR POSTING & TRANSFER

Sir.

Please refer to your Notification No: SPH (E-V) 7-172/2017, Dated: April 25, 2018 on the subject mentioned above.

It is to inform your good self that the subject notification of my transfer & posting is wrong and illegal based on the fact that:

1. I am senior member of the management cadre and as per rules and regulations I shall be posted & transfer anywhere on the management post only.

2. My transfer orders are premature as I have not completed my tenure (normal tenure 2 years) on the said post as evident from the fact that I joined this post Jan 5, 2017.

3. There is no complaint or irregularity reported against me.

4. The only reported inquiry during my period was political motivated and initiated by law Minister Mr. Imtiaz Qureshi which was directly conducted by law department and later informed health department: I was exonerated from all charges.

5. My transfer & posting is clear cut case of political victimization as mentioned earlier that the local MNA/Law Minister was aggrieved on having less share during class IV appointments during early 2017. Since then I have been victimized time to time and threats received verbally & through messenger but thanks to All Mighty Allah that all efforts against me were turned down & failed.

6. Last but not the least that I have never ever requested verbally or submitted any application to my department for my posting & transfer. Surprisingly through reliable source rumors spread in the department is that I (Dr. Gul e Rana MS W&C Hospital Kohat) have asked for her transfer, which is not only disappointing but shocking.

7. I therefore request your good self that I may please either retained on my existing post or may please transfer on the management post.

Medical Superintendent W & C Hospital Kohat

Copy to:

1. PA to Director General Health Services Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar

2. Additional Director General HRM, DGHS Office, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar

ANNEX "E"
(15)

# BEFORE THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT PESHAWAR

Writ Petition\_\_\_\_ / 2018.

Dr Gui- e- Rana w/o Syed Jamai Akbar R/o KDA Kohat.

#### Versus

- 1:- The Secretary Health Govt of Khyber PakhtunKhaw Peshawar.
- 2:-Director General Health Service KPK Peshawar.
- 3:-The Chief Minster through Secretary KPK Peshawar.
- 4:-The Provincial Law Minster through secretary
- 5:-Dr Naseem Shah (MS LMH Kohat)



(Respondents)

# WRIT PETITION UDER ARTICLE \$1\$, OF THE CONSTITUTION OF ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

Pray:

In the light of above circumstances it is respectfully prayed that on acceptance of instant writ petition the Hon bale Court may directed to respondents above to set a side all illegal or impugned order and the Petitioner may not transferred from LMH Kohat to DHQ KDA Hospital and petitioner may allowed to perform her duties as before, it also prayed that during the pendency of petition, the operation of the impugned order dated 25-04-2018 may graciously be suspended till the final disposal of the Petition and blessed with any other remedy in the larger interest of justice.

Respectfully Sheweth,

With great veneration the instant appeal is preferred by the Petitioners on the following grounds:-

EXAMINER TOUR HIGH COURT

2 1 JUN 2018

AVNE (16)

# PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR

# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of	************************
Case No	

Judge.	
raage.	
3	
Writ Petition No.2390-P/2018 with Interim Relief	
ate,	
SYED AFSAR SHAH, JDr. Gul-e-Rana,	
the petitioner, through instant constitutional petition,	
has asked for the issuance of an appropriate writ	
declaring that order dated 25.04.2018 of respondent	
No.1, whereby she has been transferred from the post	
of Medical Superintendent, Liaqat Memorial Hospital,	
Kohat to the post of PMO in DHQ Hospital KDA,	
Kohat, being nullity in the eye of law, is of no effect	
whatsoever.	
ehalf of the	
ondents by	
transferring the petitioner repeatedly within a short	
span of time, have violated their own policy and their	

ATTESTED

EXAMINER

Possession High Court

21 JUN 2018

act is totally based on mala fide intention and not in the public interest or in the exigencies of service, interference of this Court, in the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case, would be imperative and rather indispensable.

- 3. We have gone through the available record carefully and considered the submissions made by the learned counsel for the petitioner.
- Admittedly, the controversy involved in the instant case is of posting and transfer, which in essence and in substance, being related to the terms and conditions of service and in view of the judgments of the apex Court of Pakistan rendered in the cases of Miss Rukhsana Ijaz vs. Secretary, Education, Punjab & others (1997 SCMR 167); Ayyaz Anjum vs. Government of Punjab, Housing and Physical Planning Department through Secretary and others (1997 SCMR 169); Rafique Ahmad Chaudhry vs. Ahmad Nawaz Malik & others (1997 SCMR 170); Secretary Education NWFP, Peshawar and 2 others vs. Mustamir Khan & another (2005 SCMR 17) and Peer Muhammad vs. Government of Baluchistan through Chief



(18)

Secretary & others (2007 SCMR 54) and also judgments of this Court, rendered in the cases of Bakhtiar Ahmad vs. SMBR in W.P.No.1167 of 2006 decided on 03.08.2006; Professor Rehana Matiullah vs. Chief Secretary & others in W.P.No.1496 of 2006 decided on 12.02.2006; S. Mansoor Hussain Shah vs. Secretary LG/RD in W.P.No.1153 of 2006 decided on 03.08.2006; Waqif Khan Vs. Government of N.W.F.P. in W.P.No.1114 of 2006 decided on 28.07.2006; Pervez Khan vs. Addl. Chief Secretary FATA in W.P.No.2261 of 2006 decided on 14.02.2007; Serat Bibi vs. Government of NWFP in W.P.1559 of 2006 decided on 05.10.2006; Abdal Qadir vs. Government in W.P.No.561 of 2006 decided on 12.05.2006; Nawab Gul vs. SMBR in W.P.No.1033 of 2006 decided on 18.07.2006; Sardar Ali vs. Director Schools in W.P.No.942 of 2006 decided on 13.07.2006 and Muhammad Ilyas Khan vs. District Revenue and Estate Officer and others in W.P.No.835 of 2007 decided on 23.05.2007 and many other judgments, such like matters / controversies can well be urged before the departmental authority in the first instance and then before the Service Tribunal, we, in view of

ITESTED
EXAMINER
Shawar High Court
21 JUN 2018

(19)

the bar contained in Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 coupled with dictum laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of Pakistan in number of cases, mentioned above, cannot embark upon such like matters.

5. For the reasons discussed above, this writ petition being without substance is dismissed. However, while parting with the judgment, we would like to direct the departmental authority viz. Secretary Health to decide the appeal of the petitioner, which is pending adjudication before him since 30.04.2018, one way or the other strictly in accordance with law through a speaking order as early as possible but not later than one month, after receipt of this order.

Announced. 30. 05. 2018

JUDGE

JUDGE

2.1 JUN 2018

(Fayaz) (D.B. of Hon'ble Mr. Justice Rooh-ul-Amin Khan & Hon'ble Mr. Justice Syed Afsar Shah)

No of Posses

Copying

Urgent Habitation

Date of Posses

Cocycle of P

# ANDER.

# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA HEALTH DEPARTMENT



Dated Peshawar the 25<sup>th</sup> June, 2018

# NOTIFICATION

WHEREAS Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre 8S-19 was

transferred from the post of Medical Superintendent Liaquit Memorial Hospital Kohat after due approval of NO.SOH(E-V)7-172/2017 the competent authority (Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) under Schedule-III of the Rule of Business,

AND WHEREAS the said doctor submitted Writ Petition No.2390-P/2018 in the Peshawar High Court, 1985 Peshawar against this Department Notification dated 25.04.2018.

AND WHEREAS the honorable Peshawar High Court Peshawar in its judgment dated 30.05.2018 directed Secretary Health to decide the appeal of the Petitioner, one way or the other strictly in accordance with law through a speaking order as early as possible but not later than one month after receipt of the order dated 30.05.2018

AND WHEREAS Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre BS-19 was awarded personal hearing on 25 06 2018 in the presence of Additional Secretary (Establishment) Health Department.

AND WHEREAS, from the record it transpired that during the same time, the Provincial Inspection Team submitted inquiry against her Titled "Inquiry into the appointment of Class-IV in Liaqat Memorial Hospital Konat" with no charges to prove against her.

AND WHEREAS, her tenure on the post effective dated 10.11.2016 till 25.04.2018 was Eighteen months which is less than the normal tenure

NOW THEREFORE in view of the order of the Peshawar High Court Peshawar, her Departmental appeal ment consideration being based on merit. However, the Election Commission of Pakistan has imposed ban on posting/transfer and therefore, a summary will be moved to the Chief Minister Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, in lieu of the acceptance of appeal and for the posting back as Medical Superintendent Liagat Memorial Hospital Kohat within the next three working days

SECRETARY HEALTH Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

# Endst. No & Date Even.

Copy to the:-

- Accountant General Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. Registrar Peshawar High Court Peshawar with reference to the Writ Petition No.2390-P/2018 dated 30.05.2018.
- Section Officer (Litigation-I) Health Department.
- Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- PS to Secretary Health Department.
- Officer/Doctor concerned.

SECTIO

Scanned by CamScanner

باعد فتتحريرا نكه مقدمہ شدرج عنوان بالامیں این طرنب سے واسطے بیروی وجواب دہی وکل کاروائی متعلقہ ا مفر کرئے افراد کیا جاتا ہے۔ کہ صاحب موصوف کومقدمہ کی کل کا روائی کا کامل اختیار ہوگا۔ نیز وبل اساحب کوراضی نامه کریے وتقرر خالت و فیصله برحلف دیسے جواب دہی اورا تبال دعوی اور المدورت أكرى كري إجراءا ورصولي جيك وروبيدار عرضي دعوى اور درخواست برسم كي تقديق ر راین بردستخط کرانے کا اختیار ہوگا۔ نیز صورت عدم پیروی یا ڈگری بکطرفہ یا اپیل کی برایدگی اورمنسوخی نیز دائر کر ۔ نے ابیل مکرانی ونظر ٹائی و بیروی کرنے کا اختیار ہوگا۔ از بصورت ضرورت مقدمہ ندکور کے کل ما جزوی کا روائی کے واسٹے اور وکیل مامختار قانونی کواینے ہمراہ ٹیا اپنے بجائے تقرر کا اختیار ہوگا ۔ا در مساحب مفتر رشدہ کوبھی وہی جملہ ند کورہ باا ختیا رات حاصل ہوں محےاوراس کاسا ختہ و واختر منظور قبول برئاندوران مقدمه میں جوخر جدد برجاندالتواع مقدم كسبب سے وہوگا۔ كوكى تاريخ بيشي مقام دوره برجويا حدس بابر موتووكيل صاحب يابند مول محدكمه بيروى ند کور کر میں۔لہذا و کالت نا دیکھدیا کے سندر ہے۔ 1904



# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar, the 30<sup>th</sup> August, 2018

# **NOTIFICATION.**

## NO.SOH(E-V)1-946/2014

The competent authority (Chief Minister

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) is pleased to order postings/transfers of the following doctors with immediate effect in the public interest:-

S#	Name of Doctor	From	ТО
1.	Dr.Gul-e-Rana Management Cadre BS-19	PMO BS-19 DHQ Hospital KDA Kohat.	Medical Superintendent Liaqat Memorial Hospital Kohat.
2.	Dr.Naeem Shah Management Cadre BS-19	Medical Superintendent Liaqat Memorial Hospital Kohat	Medical Superintendent Category-D Hospital Shaker Darra Kohat against the vacant post of BS-19.

# SECRETARY HEALTH Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

### Endst. No. & Date even.

#### Copy to :-

- 1. Accountant General Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. District Health Officer Kohat
- 4. MS DHQ Hospital KDA Kohat.
- 5. MS Liagat Memorial Hospital Kohat.
- 6. MS Category-D Hospital Shaker Darra Kohat
- 7. District Accounts Officer Kohat.
- 8. PS to Minister Health Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9. PS to Secretary Health Department
- 10. PS to Special Secretary Health Department.
- 11. Computer Programmer Health Department.
- 12. Doctors concerned.

SECTION OFFICER-V