Petitioner present through counsel.

Notice of the instant execution petition be issued to respondents for implementation report. To come up for implementation report on 15.06.2022 before S.B.

⋠∤ (Rozina Rehman) Member (J)

15th June 2022

Counsel for the petitioner present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Addl. AG present.

Learned AAG seeks some time to implement the judgment. Granted. The respondents shall implement the judgment and submit implementation report positively on 03.08.2022 before S.B. Original file be requisitioned.



(Kalim Arshad Khan) Chairman

03.08.2022

Petitioner present in person. Mr. Kabir Ullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General for respondents present.

Addl. AG seeks further time for submission of implementation report. To come up for implementation report on 14.09.2022 before S.B.

(Kalim Arshad Khan) Chairman

Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of	
Execution Petition No.	66/2022

	Exec	cution Petition No. <u>66/2022</u>
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2 `	3
1	24.01.2022	The execution petition of Mr. Shaheen Shah submitted today by Mr. Asad Mahmood Advocate may be entered in the relevant register and put up to the Court for proper order please. REGISTRAR
2-		This execution petition be put up before S. Bench at Peshawai on 25/02/22
		CHAIRMAN
	25.02.2022	Due to retirement of the Worthy Chairman, the Tribunal is defunct, therefore, case is adjourned to 12.05.2022 for the same as before.
		Roader.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

Execution Petition No. 66 /2022

In Service Appeal No. 1385/20

Shahin Shah

VS

Edu Deptt

INDEX

S.No.	Documents	Annexure	Page No.
1.	Memo of Execution Petition		01-02
2.	Copy of Judgment	- A -	03-08
3.	Vakalat Nama		09

PETITIONER

Shahin Shah

Through:

SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI

Advocate, High Court

Date: 20/01/2022 Cell No: 0306-5109438



Execution Petition No. 66 /2022

In Service Appeal No.1385/2020



Mr. Syed Shahin Shah Ex-PST R/o Gulbahar N0.4 House No, D-17, Near Police Chowki Gulbahar Peshawar..

PETITIONER

VERSUS

- 1. The Secretary E&SE Deptt:, KP, Civil Secretariat Peshawar.
- 2. The Director E&SE KPK Peshawar.
- 3. The District Education Officer Male peshawar.

RESPONDENTS

EXECUTION PETITION FOR DIRECTING THE RESPONDENTS TO IMPLEMENT THE JUDGMENT DATED: 11.11.2021 OF THIS HONOURABLE TRIBUNAL IN LETTER AND SPIRIT.

Respectfully Sheweth:

- 1. That the applicant/Petitioner filed Service Appeal No.1385/2020 against the dismissal order.
- 2. That the said appeal was finally heard by the Honorable Tribunal on 11.11.2021. The Honorable Tribunal is kind enough to accept the appeal and the appellant is held entitled to pensional benifits. (Copy of judgment is attached as Annexure-A).
- 3. That the respondents were totally failed in taking any action regarded the Hon'able Tribunal Judgment dated 11.11.2021.



- 4. That in-action and not fulfilling formal requirements by the respondent after passing the judgment of this august Tribunal, is totally illegal amount to disobedience and Contempt of Court.
- 5. That the judgment is still in the field and has not been suspended or set aside by the Supreme Court of Pakistan, therefore, the respondents are legally bound to pass formal appropriate order.
- 6. That the petitioner has having no other remedy to file this Execution Petition.

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that the respondents may be directed to obey the judgment dated 11.11.2021 of this august Tribunal in letter and spirit. Any other remedy, which this august Tribunal deems fit and appropriate that, may also be awarded in favor of applicant/appellant.

Petitioner

5. Shalin Shah

Shahin Shah

Through:

YED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI)
Advocate High Court.

Advocate Fign Court.

It is affirmed and declared that the contents of the above Execution Petition are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

DEPONENT

FORE THE KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWA

APPEAL NO. 1365 /2020

Mr. Syed Shahin Shah Ex. PST. R/o.Gulbhar No.4 House No, D-17, Near Police Chowki Gulbahar, Peshawar

Bard 25/2/2020

(Appellant)

VERSUS

- 1. The Secretary E&SE Deptt: KPK, civil secretariat Peshawar.
- 2. The Director E&SE KPK Peshawar.
- 3. The District Education officer Male, Peshawar.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KP SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT 1974, AGAINST THE ORDER DATED 30.03.2017, WHEREBY THE PREVIOUS REMOVAL ORDER DATED 17.01.2013 IS KEEP INTACT. AND AGAINST THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL WHICH WAS NOT RESPONDED WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF 90 DAYS.

Fledto-day

PRAYER:

A THE STATE OF THE

ON ACCEPTANCE OF THIS SERVICE APPEAL THE ORDER DATED 30.3.2017, MAY PLEASE BE SETASIDE AND THE APPELLANT MAY BE REINSTATED INTO SERVICE WITH ALL BACK AND CONSEQUENTIAL BENEFITS. ANY OTHER REMEDY, WHICH THIS AUGUST TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT AND APPROPRIATE THAT, MAY ALSO, BE AWARDED IN FAVOUR OF APPELLANT.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Sérvice Appeal No. 1385/2020

Date of Institution ...

25.02.2020

Date of Decision

11.11.2021



Syed Shahin Shah Ex-PST, Rio Gulbahar No. 4 House No. D-17, Near Police Chowki Gulbahar, Peshawar.

(Appellant)

VERSUS

The Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Civil Secretariat Peshawar and two others.

(Respondents)

SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI, Advocate

For Appellant

MR. RIAZ KHAN PAINDAKHEIL Assistant Advocate General

For Respondents

SALAH-UD-DIN
ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR

MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
MEMBER (EXECUTIVE)

JUDGMENT

that the appellant was initially appointed as Primary School Teacher (PST) in the Commissionarate of Afghan Refugees vide order dated 22-04-1982, who continued such service until 2010. During the course, some posts of PST were advertized by Education Department, wherein the appellant also applied and was appointed as PST vide order dated 10-05-2010, but the appellant was terminated from service vide order dated 17-01-2013 being overage. After exhausting departmental remedies, the appellant filed service appeal No. 928/2013, which was decided vide judgment dated 04-07-2016 and the appellant was re-instated in service with



direction to the respondents to conduct de-novo inquiry in accordance with law within a period of two months, otherwise it shall be deemed that the appellant has been re-instated in service with all back benefits by treating the service w.e.f 13-01-2013 till the date of judgment as leave of the kind due. In pursuance of the judgment, the appellant was re-instated in service vide order dated 08-08-2016, but as a result of de-novo proceedings, the appellant was again terminated vide order dated 30-03-2017 by restoring the previous termination order dated 17-01-2013, but in the meanwhile, the appellant filed an execution petition No. 67/2017 with the contentions that the respondents has not completed de-novo proceedings within the stipulated timeframe, hence he is entitled to be re-instated in service with all back benefits. Stance of the appellant was accepted vide order sheet dated 29-03-2018 and respondents were directed to implement decision of the tribunal and submit implementation report on next date, but on the next date, the respondents had produced order dated 13-09-2018 passed by the august Supreme Court of Pakistan in CP No. 470-P/2018, wherein not only leave to appeal was granted but even operation of the order of this Tribunal dated 29-03-2018 was also suspended. The Supreme Court of Pakistan vide its detail judgment dated 16-09+2019 set aside the impugned order sheet dated 29-03-2018 of this Tribunal but did not touch judgment of this Tribunal dated 04-07-2016, thereafter the appellant filed departmental appeal, which was not decided within the statutory period of 90 days, hence the instant service appeal with prayers that since the appellant has reached his age of superannuation on 11-10-2017, hence he may be granted pensionary benefits under Regulation No 371(A) of Civil Service Regulations (CSR)

02. Learned counsel for the appellant has contended that during the course of litigation, the appellant reached his age of superannuation on 11-10-2017, thus his total service comes to 35 years, as the appellant was initially appointed as PST on 22-04-1982 in Afghan Commissionarate, where he served until 2010, thereafter he

in light of judgment of Supreme Court of Pakistan reported as 1997 SCMR 1477.

CP GO .

was appointed as PST by respondents vide order dated 10-05-2010; that the appellant was illegally terminated from service vide order dated 17-01-2013 without adopting legal formalities, hence he was re-instated vide judgment dated 04-07-2016 of this Tribunal in Service Appeal No. 928/2013; that the inquiry officer thrice recommended his case for re-instatement but the respondents did not agree with recommendations of the inquiry officers and illegally constituted a committee, upon whose recommendations, the appellant was again terminated from service vide order dated 30-03-2017; that the appellant has now reached his age of superannuation and has served continuously for almost 35 years, hence he may be granted pensionary benefits under regulation No. 371-A of the CSR by counting his portion of service borne on temporary establishment towards pensionary benefits; that similar benefit has already been granted by Supreme

Court of Pakistan vide judgment reported as 1997 SCMR 1477.

that the appellant had served as PST in Afghan Commissionarate from 1982 until 1995 and again served as PST in an NGO working under the supervision of Afghan Commissionarate until 2010; that the appellant was again appointed as PST in respondents department in 2010, but such order was rescind vide order dated 17-101-2013 as the appellant was overage; that upon judgment of this Tribunal, the appellant was re-instated and de-novo proceedings were also conducted, but in the meanwhile, the respondents filed CPLA in the Supreme Court of Pakistan and the Supreme Court of Pakistan vide judgment dated 16-09-2019, set aside the order sheet dated 29-03-2018 of this Tribunal, against which the appellant again filed departmental appeal, which was not acceded to; that the appellant has no cause of action to file this service appeal.

04. We have heard learned counsel for the parties and have perused the record.

Street Bura

O5. Record reveals that the appellant fought a long legal battle for continuance of his job as PST, but in the meanwhile, he reached his age of superannuation on 11-10-2017. Admittedly, the appellant joined as PST in 1982 in Afghan Commissionarate and served there until 1995 and again until 2010 but after 1995, Afghan Commissionarate handed over such activities to an NGO, but the said NGO was working under supervision of Afghan Commissionarate. Vide order dated 10-05-2010, the appellant was regularly appointed as PST in respondents department after observing codal formalities, but upon objection of Accountant General Office, his appointment order was rescind vide order 17-01-2013. Again he was re-instated in light of judgment dated 04-07-2016 of this tribunal, but the supreme court of Pakistan vide judgment dated 16-09-2018 set aside the order sheet dated 29-03-2018 of this tribunal and the appellant once again filed a departmental appeal to the respondents, which was not responded, hence the appellant again filed the instant service appeal.

- of. We have observed that the appellant served as PST for almost 35 years and the appellant deserve to avail the benefits of such long service. The question before us is as to whether the appellant is entitled to any pensionary benefits under Regulation 371-A of Civil Service Regulations. The supreme court of Pakistan in its judgment reported as 1997 SCMR 1477, while referring to a judgment of the Federal Service Tribunal in appeal No 123(R) 1991 have declared employees of Afghan Refugees Organization as civil servants within the meaning of Civil Servant Act, 1973, hence the appellant is entitled to pensionary benefits and is covered by Regulation No 371-A of CSR.
- O7. Admittedly, the appellant put in almost 35 years of service both in Afghan Commissionarate as well as with respondents department, therefore, entitled to pensionary benefits under Regulation No 371-A of CSR. In view of the situation, the impugned order dated 30-03-2017 is set aside and the appellant is held



entitled to pensionary benefits. Parties are left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to record room.

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2021

> (SALAH-UD-DIN MEMBER (J)

(ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR) MEMBER (E)

Certified to he ture core

Ex viinky

Khyber Fakhankhwa

Khyber Fakhankhwa

Khyber Fakhankhwa

30-11-21 30-11-21 32-21 32-21 3

VAKALATNAMA

IN THE COURT OF KP SERVICE TRIBUNAL PE	
Syed ShahiN Shah	SHAWAR
VERSUS	Appellant Petitioner Plaintiff
I/WE Syed ShahiN Shah	Respondent (s) Defendants (s)
do hereby appoint and constitute the SYED NOMAN ALI BUK High Court for the aforesaid Appellant(s), Petitioner(S) Respondent(s), Defendant(s), Opposite Party to commence and appear and defend this action / appeal / petition / reference on my al proceedings that may be taken in respect of any application consame including proceeding in taxation and application for review deposit money, to file and take documents, to accept the process appoint and instruct council, to represent the aforesaid Appellan Plaintiff(s) / Respondent(s), Defendant(s), Opposite Party agree(s) acts done by the aforesaid.	, Plaintiff(s) / I prosecute / to / our behalf and nunected with the w, to draw and of the court, to
DATE	They
(CLIENT ACCEPTE	

SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

CELL NO: 0306-5109438

Selver many compression وعوكي باعث تحريراً نك مقدمہ مندرجہ عنوان بالامیں اپی طرف سے داسطے بیردی دجواب دہی دکل کاردائی متعلقہ میں مرکز ہن مقام کیست کورے سیلئے املائی کو محل طریق کی جو مرکز مقرركر كے اقراركيا جاتا ہے۔ كەصاحب موصوف كومقدمه كىكل كارواكى كاكال اختيار ، وكا _ نيز ويل مها حب كورامني تاميرة وتقرر فالت وفيصله برحلف دييج جواب دي اورا قبال دعوي اور بهسورت وکری کرنے اجراءا درصولی چیک در دیسیار عرضی دعوی ادر در خواست ہرتشم کی تفیدیق زراین بردسخذا کرانے کا ختیار ہوگا۔ نیز صورت عدم پیردی یا ڈگری میکطرف یاا بیل کی برایدگی اورمنسوخی نیز دائز کرنے ابیل نگرانی ونظر ثانی دیپیروی کرنے کا ختیار 4وگا۔از بھورت ضرورت مقد مہذکور کے کل ما جزوی کا روائی کے واسطے اور وکیل ما مختار قانونی کواییے ہمراہ ٹاایے بجائے تقرر کا اختیار مونگا بدا در مها حسب منفر رشنده کوئهمی د هی جمله ند کور ۱۰ با اختیارات حاصل مول می ا دراس کا ساخته برداخته منظور قبول موگا دوران متندمه میں جوخر چدد ہرجاندا سو، ۔۔
کوئی تاریخ بیشی مقام دورہ پر ہویا حدے باہر ہوتو وکل صاحب پابند ہول کے اور کی استار کی استار کی استار کی استار ہے۔

استار کی ساز کی استار ہے۔ ۔ استار ہے ۔۔ استار ہوتا ہے ۔۔ استار ہو ۔۔ استار ہے IL Sundy 2 Lider - Lid

"B"

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD

No.	•
Appeal No. F. P. No. 66	of 20 2.2
Syad Shakir Shah	
Versus	
the Sey: EX SE Dept KPK Respondent No. 1.	
the Sey 12,X 2 Dept. Ky.K.	Respondent
Pagnandant No.	
Respondent ivo <u>1</u> .	
Notice to: _ the Perretary ElsE Depr	t. NP. poshowas.
Province Service Tribunal Act, 1974, has been presented/regist the above case by the petitioner in this Court and notice has been hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for hereby informed that the said appeal and in the date fixed the case may be postponed either in person or by authorised Advocate, duly supported by your power of Attorney. You are, the this Court at least seven days before the date of hearing 4 coalongwith any other documents upon which you rely. Please default of your appearance on the date fixed and in the manappeal/petition will be heard and decided in your absence. Notice of any alteration in the date fixed for hearing of the given to you by registered post. You should inform the Regist.	n ordered to issue. You are aring before the Tribunal arge anything against the or any other day to which representative or by any erefore, required to file in pies of written statement also take notice that in oner aforementioned, the his appeal/petition will be rar of any change in your
address. If you fail to furnish such address your address contain	
address given in the appeal/petition will be deemed to be your co	
notice posted to this address by registered post will be deemed so this appeal/petition.	intelent for the purpose of
2 1	
Copy of appeal is attached. Copy of appeal has already	been sent to you vide this
office Notice Nodateddated	
Given under my hand and the seal of this Court, at Pesh	awar this34
	- ,
Day of 20 y :	
for Internation 2 post 2 Khyber Pakhtus	<i>10</i> w
epost 1	legistrar,
2 Khyber Pakhtu	nkkrwa: Service Tribunal,

The hours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays. Always quote Case No: While making any correspondence.

Note:

«B»

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIKUNAL, PESHAWAR. JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD (1); PESHAWAR

the case may be postponed either in person or by authorised representative or by any
appellant/periting for you are at liberty to do so on the date fixed, or any other day to which
*onat 8.00 A.M. If you wish to urge anything against the
hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for bearing before the Tribunal
the above case by the petitioner in this Court and notice has been ordered to issue. You are
WHEREAS an appeal/petition under the provision of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa- Province Service Tribunal Act, 1974, has been presented/registered for consideration, in
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Notice to: - the Renatary ESSE Dept WP poshound.
11 8 4
Syad Shah Sppellam Petitioner Versus TESSE Dept Kyk Respondent Respondent No. 1.
1 km mach mark the state of the mach mach mach mach mach mach mach mach
CEOCE DOWN
Versus
comma commande commentario de la commencia de
Shale Investigance
Appeal No F
Amend No E. P. Mr. 66 of 34.22
No.

Notice of any aiteration in the date fixed for hearing of this appeal petition will be given to you by registered post. You should inform the Registrar of any change in you address. If you fail to furnish such address your address contained in this notice which the address given in the appeal petition will be deemed to be your correct address, and further notice posted to this address by registered post will be deemed sufficient furthe purpose of this appeal patition.

Advocate, duly supported by your power of Attorney. You are, therefore, required to file in this Court at least seven days before the date of hearing 4 copies of written statement alongwith any other documents upon which you rely. Please also take notice that in default of your appearance on the date fixed and in the manner aforementioned, the

appeal/petition will be heard and decided in your absence.

^{1.} The pours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Hollanys.

2. Always quote Gase No. While making any correspondence

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR. JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD

*		PES	SHAWA	R.		
No.		巨月	NO · (96	22	
•	Spinand	o. Shahir	, Sho	h	of 20 .	
	the Row	(E2)	E Do	PAT: KP1	Appellant/Petitio A	ner
		••••••	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		 Respondent	
	the	Director	E _{Respo}	E KIN	Peshaw	a8.
Notice to:						
Province So the above con hereby info *on	etitioner you are you be postponed uly supported be at least seven dany other docurour appearance tion will be hear	Act, 1974, has oner in this Corsaid appeal/pe	been presurt and nation is A.M. If y lo so on the son or by date of late of late and nation your abour	sented/regis otice has be fixed for he ou wish to ne date fixed y authorise y. You are, t hearing 4 c rely. Pleas d in the ma	stered for conseen ordered to it caring before urge anything d, or any other d representation herefore, requipolics of writtes also take near aforements.	issue. You are the Tribuna g against the day to which ve or by any ired to file in en statement otice that in ntioned, the
Notice given to you	e of any alterat by registered	ion in the date post. You shou	fixed for	hearing of	this appeal/per	tition will be
address give	ou fail to furnis en in the appeal/ d to this address	h such address petition will be	your add deemed	ress contair to be vour <i>c</i>	ned in this noti orrect address	ce which the
	•				_	
	of appeal is att					rou vide this 31 に
	e No				******	
Given	under my hand	l and the seal o	of this Co	ourt, at Pes	hawar this	<u> </u>
Day of		tation)	••••••	20		兰

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: Service Tribunal, Peskawar.

Registrar,

Note:

The hours-of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays. Always quote Case No. While making any correspondence.

66B"

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

JUDICIAL COMPLEX (OLD), KHYBER ROAD,

PESHAWAR.

No. Appeal Mon Change of the	P. No. 60	of 20	
the Very: FZ!	SEVERIERT: 1	Respondent	
Notice to: —	Responde Edua Cai Je shawar	Lion Offices Male	
WHEREAS an appeal/petition under the provision of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province Service Tribunal Act, 1974, has been presented/registered for consideration, in the above case by the petitioner in this Court and notice has been ordered to issue. You are hereby informed that the said appeal/petition is fixed for hearing before the Tribunal *on			
Notice of any alteration in the date fixed for hearing of this appeal/petition will be given to you by registered post. You should inform the Registrar of any change in your address. If you fail to furnish such address your address contained in this notice which the address given in the appeal/petition will be deemed to be your correct address, and further notice posted to this address by registered post will be deemed sufficient for the purpose of this appeal/petition.			
Copy of appeal is attached.	Copy of appeal has	already been sent to you vide this	
office Notice No	dated	31 lb	
Given under my hand and th	ie seal of this Cour	t, at Peshawar this	
for I plementation Coport	My 106/72	Registrar, Pakhtunkhwa: Service Tribunal,	

2. Always quote Case No: While making any correspondence.



Peskawar.

The hours of attendance in the court are the same that of the High Court except Sunday and Gazetted Holidays.