THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUAL, **PESHAWAR**

Appeal No. 1469/2018

Date of Institution

05.12.2018

Date of Decision

14.01.2019

Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No. 2025 R/O Hassan Khel Essa Khel, Tehsil and

District Bannu.

... (Appellant)

VERSUS

Provincial Police Officer, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar and 5 others.

(Respondents)

MR. JEHANGIR KHAN,

Advocate.

For appellant

MR. HAMID FAROOQ DURRANI,

CHAIRMAN

JUDGMENT

HAMID FAROOQ DURRANI, CHAIRMAN:-

The facts as laid down in the memorandum of appeal in hand are that the appellant joined Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Department as Constable in July, 2007. He was removed from service on 28.05.2009 on account of absence from duty. Thereafter, departmental appeal of appellant was rejected vide order dated 01.08.2009. On 10.11.2016 the appeal under Rule 11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1974 was also dismissed on the ground of limitation as well as merits, hence the instant service appeal.

I have heard learned counsel for the appellant who questioned the impugned order dated 28.05.2009 mainly on the ground that it was given retrospective effect, therefore, was void. The period of limitation for filing of appeal was, therefore, not to

run against such order. He, in the said regard, relied on judgment pronounced by this Tribunal in Service Appeal No. 1108/2016.

30.11.2008. On the said count, he was proceeded against departmentally under the provisions of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Removal from Service (Special Power) Ordinance, 2000 and notices of his absence were published in two daily newspapers on 20.02.2009. A show cause notice was sent to his residence which was received by him on 22.04.2009. The impugned order dated 28.05.2009, imposing major penalty of removal from service was, therefore, passed against the appellant on account of absence of more than five months. The order was though given effect from the date of absence of appellant.

The record is also depictive of the fact that an appeal against the order of removal was submitted by the appellant purely on the ground of absence due to domestic issues which was rejected on 01.08.2009. The appellant, thereafter, went into slumber for more than seven years and then preferred departmental appeal/review under Rule-11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1975. Upon rejection of said appeal on 10.11.2016, once again, the appellant remained indolent and brought the appeal in hand on 05.12.2018. Here, it shall not be out of place to note that owing to the proceedings taken against the appellant under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Removal from Service (Special Power) Ordinance, 2000, he was barred from submitting any review petition under Rule 11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1975 after rejection of his departmental appeal.

4. In view of the above facts it becomes abundantly clear that the appeal in hand is hopelessly barred by time. The judgment of this Tribunal relied upon by the appellant is also distinguishable due to the fact that codal requirements were not fulfilled the referred case during proceedings against the appellant therein which was not the case in the instant appeal. It also requires to be noted that the retrospective

3

operation of order of removal dated 28.05.2009 would not vitiate the proceedings against the appellant as the error in the order is curable, as such, the same is modified to have effect from the date of its issuance i.e. 28.05.2009 and not from 30.11.2008. With the said modification the appeal in hand is dismissed in limine.

File be consigned to record room upon completion.

(HAMID FAROÒÒ DURRANI) CHAIRMAN

ANNOUNCED 14.01.2019

Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of	 	
Case No	 1469 /2018	

•	Case No. 1469/2018		
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge	
1	2	3	
1-	07/12/2018	The appeal of Mr. Irfan Ali Shah resubmitted today by Mr. Jehangir Khan Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and	
2-	13/12/2018	This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on 14/61/2019.	
	. •	CHAIRMAN	
		•	
in the state of th			

The appeal of Mr. Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No. 2025 r/o Hassan Khel Essa Khel District Bannu received today i.e. on 05.12.2018 is incomplete on the following score which is returned to the counsel for the appellant for completion and resubmission within 15 days.

- \hbar Σ opy of revision petition mentioned in the memo of appeal is not attached with the appeal which may be placed on it.
- 2- Copy of order dated 10.11.2016 is illegible which may be replaced by legible/better
- 3- Annexures of the appeal may be attested.

No. 2357 /S.T.

Dt. 05/12/2018.

REGISTRAR **SERVICE TRIBUNAL** KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR.

Mr. Jahangir Khan Adv. Pesh.

Respected Si,

Re-submilled after needfull.

Rospertal Si,

referre d = 12 inland' Appel.

BEFORE THE HONOURABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PUKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No $\frac{469}{2018}$

Irfan Ali Shah

VERSUS

P.P.O KP and others

INDEX

S NO	DESCRIPTION OF DOCUMENTS	ANNEX	PAGE
1.	Grounds of Appeal alongwith Affidavit	- .	01 - 06
2.	Addresses of the parties	-	07
3.	Copy of the order dated 28-05-2009	'A'	08
4.	Copy of the application and order dated 01 st August, 2009	'B'	09
5.	Copy of the departmental appeal and order dated 10-11-16	'C'	10
6.	Wakalat Nama (In original)	-	11

Appellant

Through:

(JEHANGIR KHAN)

Advocate,

High Court, Peshawar Office: C-2 Rehman Plaza Khyber Bazar, Peshawar Cell # <u>0334-1600044</u>

Dated: -05-12-2018

BEFORE THE HONOURABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PUKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR

In Re: Service Appeal No 1469,

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

Diary No. 1731

Dated 95/12/20/8

Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No 2025 R/O Hassan Khel Essa Khel,
Tehsil and District Bannu.....(Appellant)

VERSUS

- 1. Provincial Police Officer, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 2. Commandant FRIP, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3. Superintendant of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 4. Capital City Police Officer, Peshawar
- 5. AIG/Establishment Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police, Peshawar
- 6. District Police Officer, Bannu.....(Respondents)

Filedto-day
Registraf

Re-submitted to -day and filed.

Registrar

Appeal under Section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Services Tribunal Act, 1974 against the impugned order dated 10-11-2016, whereby the review petition of the Appellant has been rejected against the order dated 01-08-2009; whereby the punishment of removal from service as major punishment was awarded/confirmed by the Respondent No 2 for no good ground, which is against the law, constitution and norms of natural justice; hence the same is void ab-initio

PRAYER IN APPEAL:-

On acceptance of instant appeal, the order dated 10th November, 2016, 01st August, 2009 and 28th May, 2009 may be kindly be set aside the Respondents may be directed to reinstate the Appellant into his service as with all back and consequential benefits, any other remedy which this this Honourable Tribunal deem fit and appropriate may also be awarded to the Appellant.

Respectfully Sheweth:-

The Appellant humbly submits as under:-

- 1) That the Appellant joined the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police

 Department as constable in July, 2007 and then the

 Appellant performed his duties with full zeal and devotion.
- That then the Appellant was removed/dismissed from service on the ground of absence from duty without any show cause notice and without giving an opportunity of hearing to the Appellant by the Respondent No vide order dated 28-05-2009. (Copy of the order is attached as Annex 'A').
- 3) That thereafter, the Respondent No 2 confirmed the order of the Respondent No 3 vide order dated 01-08-2009 and then the Respondent No 2 also failed to comply with the provision of law as neither the Appellant was provided

- That thereafter, the Respondent No 5 vide order dated 10th November, 2016 dismissed the departmental appeal of the Appellant on the ground of limitation. (Copy of the order dated 10-11-2016 is attached as <u>Annex 'C'</u>).
- That feeling extremely aggrieved from the order dated 10th November, 2016, 01st August, 2009 and 22nd May, 2009; the Appellant approaches this Honourable Tribunal on the following grounds inter-alia:

GROUNDS:-

- A) That the orders mentioned above are against the law, facts, norms of justice and material available on record, hence not tenable.
- B) That the Respondents passed the impugned orders in total haste without complying with the provisions of relevant laws and constitution, hence liable to be set aside.
- C) That the Respondents, while passing the impugned orders have committed grave injustice by not giving any show cause notice and opportunity of hearing to the Appellant, hence the impugned orders are void ab-initio.

- D) That the Respondents did not decide the case of the Appellant in accordance with the prescribed procedure as no proper chance of defence was provided to the Appellant as neither the statement were recorded in presence of the Appellant nor give him opportunity of defence which show that the Appellant was condemned unheard throughout, thus the impugned orders are liable to be set aside on this score alone.
- E) That the allegation leveled against the Appellant have not been proved through any cogent evidence and they Inquiry Officer has recommended the punishment on the basis of surmises and conjecture which are not permissible under the law of the land.
- F) That the Appellant has not been given proper chance of personal hearing before imposing the penalty which is against the norms of justice.
- G) That the Appellant has not been dealt in accordance with law, rules and principles of justice and fair play, therefore the impugned orders are liable to be set aside.
- H) That the other grounds not here specifically raised may also graciously be allowed to be raised at the time of arguments.

PRAYER:-

It is, therefore, most respectfully prayed that on acceptance of this Appeal, the order dated 10th November, 2016, 01st August, 2009 and 28th May, 2009 may be kindly be set aside the Respondents may be directed to reinstate the Appellant into his service as with all back and consequential benefits, any other remedy which this this Honourable Tribunal deem fit and appropriate may also be awarded to the Appellant.

Appellant

Through:

(JEHANGIR KHAN)

Advocate,

High Court Peshawar

NOTE:-

Dated: -05-12-2018

No such like appeal for the same Appellant has earlier been filed by me before this Honourable Tribunal prior to instant one. as per the instant. I gipellat.

Advocate



BEFORE THE HONOURABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PUKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR

Irfan Ali Shah

VERSUS

P.P.O KP and others

AFFIDAVIT

I, Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No 2025 R/O Hassan Khel Essa Khel, Tehsil and District Bannu, do hereby solemnly affirm and declare on oath that all the contents of accompanying Appeal are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed OR withheld from this Honourable Court.

Olive Ulers DEPONENT

Identified by:-

(JEHANGIR KHAN) Advocate Peshawar



ATTESTED

BEFORE THE HONOURABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PUKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR

Irfan Ali Shah

VERSUS

P.P.O KP and others

ADDRESSES OF THE PARTIES

APPELLANT

Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No 2025 R/.O Hassan Khel Essa Khel,

Tehsil and District Bannu

RESPONDENTS

- 1. Provincial Police Officer, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 2. Commandant FCR, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3. Superintendant of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 4. Capital City Police Officer, Peshawar
- 5. AIG/Establishment Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police, Peshawar
- 6. District Police Officer, Bannu

Dated: 05-12-2018

Appellant

Through:

(JEHANGIR KHAN)

Advocate,

Ḥigh Court, Peshawar

ORDER

Constable Irfan Ali Shah No. 2025 absented himself from lawful duty w.e.f. 30-11-2008 till today without any leave/permission of the competent authority. He was informed through Daily Newspapers "Ausaf" & Mashrig on 20-02-2009 but the delinquent Police Constable did not pay any heed.

Consequently, a Show-cause Notice in accordance with Removal from Service (Special Powers) Ord: 2000 was sent at his home address which was properly received by him on 22-04-2009 but he did not bother to report his arrival for duty or to submit his reply to Show-cause Notice. The delinquent constable had remained absent from thity for more than 05 months which inter-alia suggests that, there is no likelihood of his return for duty as such he is not likely to become a good Police Officer, therefore, I, ABDUL QAYYUM JAN Superintendent of Police, FRP Bannu Range Bannu, in exercise of the power conferred upon me under the NWFP Removal from Service (Special Powers) Ord:2000, the delinquent constable Irian Ali Shah No. 2025 is hereby removed from Service from the date of his absence.

OB No. 367

Dated 28 105 12009

Superintenden of Police

ATTASTED TO

7/10/1

Ammere Ammere رس الما و السرما و الرام مان مشور الفالمف كالمات و لول سي Loginon SP-FRP wond on (F), ly La los in plant Dungle and 200 108 1151 is and sold in 12 ES-FER will on wish to (8) y (1) (duid (6-10, W)) (wy y musis 2, flib victime de, françis -ار دلده (ع میل المرن ط مای ما سام - (در دلده (ع میل ۱ انسره نری در ر میمون (دیگا مناسب سمیس اور نجه در با ده میارست سونول رد - (ر میمون (زیران بال مناسب سمیس اور نجه در با ده میارست سونول رد لا وليره (الم له كرور كرور) عذب لساه جود فرمل ليه دعال المات 2001act # 0302-5820346. = 2, WW Julon
2001act # 0302-5820346. = 2, WW Julon
2011act # 0302-5820346. occió AFTENTED 10 18 7/12/12

Annez B

ORDER.

This order shall dispose off the appeal of Ex-Constable Irfan Ali Shah No.2025 of FRP Bannu Range

Brief facts of the case are that when absented himself from duty w.e.f.30.11.08 till the date of removal from service for a total period of 178 days without any leave/permission of the competent authority. He was issued charge sheet/statement of allegation and LO-II FRP Bannu was appointed as Enquiry Officer. After conducting proper enquiry the Enquiry Officer recommended the defaulter constable for major punishment. Therefore he was removed from service by the SP FRP Bannu Range vide his OB No.367 dated 28.05.09.

However, from the perusal of record and findings of Enquiry

Officer, there are no cogent reasons to interfere in the order of SP FRP Bannu Range

Bannu. Therefore his appeal is rejected.

COMMANDANT

FRONTIER RESERVE POLICE

No. 5889-90 /EC dated Peshawar the

2.:

e dated resinawar the 77 709.

Copy of above is sent for information and n/a to:-

Superintendent of Police FRP Bannu Range Bannu w/r to his Memo: No 1284 dated 20.07.09. His service roll and Fuji missal are returned herewith for record in your office.

Ex constable Irfan Ali Shah No.2025 S/o Noor Ali Shah R/o Village Hassan Khel Issaki Distt & Tehsil Bannu.

SE TRUE COPY

7/12/18



OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL OF POLICE KHYBER PARHTUNKHWA

PESHAWAR.

No. S/ 7/72 -- /16, dated Peshawar the /0 /// /2016

Amnere

<u>ORDER</u>

This order is hereby passed to dispose of departmental appeal under Rule 11-A of Khyber Palicability a Police-Rule-1975 submitted by Ex-Constable Irfan Ali Shah No. 2025. The appellant as removed from service w.e.f 30.11.2008 by SP/FRP Bannu vide OB No. 367, dated 28.05.2009 on the circus of absence from duty for 05 months and 28 days.

This appeal was rejected by Commandant, FRP, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar vide

Alceting of Appellate Board was held on 06.10.2016 wherein appellant was heard in them. During hearing petitioner contended that his mother was ill who later on died.

The impugned order of removal from service of petitioner was passed vide order dated of 100 and his appeal was rejected vide order dated 01.08.2009. The instant review petition filed on 100 fell is badly time barred. Thus his appeal is rejected on grounds of limitation and merit as well.

This order is issued with the approval by the Competent Authority.

(NAJEEB-UR-REHMAN BUGVI)

AIG/Establishment,
For Inspector General of Police,
Khyber Pakhfunkhwa,
Peshawar,

7/73-79/16.

Copy of the above is forwarded to the:

- i. Commandant, FRP, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,
- 1 Supdt: of Police, FRP, Bannu.
- a PSO to !GP/Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, CPO Peshawar.
- A. FA to Addl: IGP/HQrs: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5. PA to DIG/HQrs: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar, :
- 6. Office Supdt: E-IV CPO Peshawar.
- 7. Central Registary Cell, CPO

BETRUE COPY

Tiolis

Better Copy

OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL POLICE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR

No S 7172/16 dated Peshawar the 10/11/2018

ORDER

This order is hereby passed to dispose of departmental appeal under Rule 11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rule 1975 submitted Ex-Constable Irlan Ali Shah No 2025. The appellant was removed from service w.e.f 30.11.2008 by SP/FRP Bannu vide OB No 367 dated 28.05.2009 on the charge of absence from duty for 05 months and 28 days.

His appeal was rejected by Commandant, FRP, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar vide order Indst No 5889-90/EC dated 01.08.2009.

Meeting of Appellate Board was held on 06.10.2016 wherein appellant was heard in person. During hearing petitioner contended that his mother was ill who later on died.

The impugned order of removal from servicer of petitioner was passed vide order dated 28.05.2009 and his appeal was rejected vide order dated 01.08.2009. The instant review petition filed on 23.02.2016 is badly time barred. Thus his appeal is rejected on grounds of limitation and merit as well.

This order is issued with the approval by the Competent Authority.

(NAJEEB-UR-REHMAN BUGVI)

AIG/Establishment For Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar

NO/S/7173-79/16

Copy of the above is forwarded to the:

- 1. Commandant FRP, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar
- 2. Supdt: of Police FRP Bannu
- 3. PSO to IGP/Khyber Pakhtunkhwa CPO Peshawar
- 4. PA to Addl: IGP/HQrs: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar
- 5. PA to DIG/HQrs: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

Office Supdt: E-IV CPO Peshawar

Central Registry Cell, CPO

DIA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUAL, PESHAWAR

Appeal No. 1469/2018

Date of Institution

05.12.2018

Date of Decision

14.01.2019

Irfan Ali Shah Ex-Constable No. 2025 R/O Hassan Khel Essa Khel, Tehsil and District Bannu. (Appellant)

VERSUS

Provincial Police Officer, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar and 5 others.

... (Respondents)

MR. JEHANGIR KHAN, Advocate.

.. For appellant.

MR. HAMID FAROOQ DURRANI,

CHAIRMAN

JUDGMENT

HAMID FAROOQ DURRANI, CHAIRMAN:-

The facts as laid down in the memorandum of appeal in hand are that the appellant joined Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Department as Constable in July, 2007. He was removed from service on 28.05.2009 on account of absence from duty. Thereafter, departmental appeal of appellant was rejected vide order dated 01.08.2009. On 10.11.2016 the appeal under Rule 11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1974 was also dismissed on the ground of limitation as well as merity hence the instant service appeal.

2. I have heard learned counsel for the appellant who questioned the impugned order dated 28.05.2009 mainly on the ground that it was given retrospective effect, therefore, was void. The period of limitation for filing of appeal was, therefore, not to

run against such order. He, in the said regard, relied on judgment pronounced by this Tribunal in Service Appeal No. 1108/2016.

30.11.2008. On the said count, he was proceeded against departmentally under the provisions of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Removal from Service (Special Power) Ordinance, 2000 and notices of his absence were published in two daily newspapers on 20.02.2009. A show cause notice was sent to his residence which was received by him on 22.04.2009. The impugned order dated 28.05.2009 imposing major penalty of removal from service was, therefore, passed against the appellant on account of absence of more than five months. The order was though given effect from the date of absence of appellant.

The record is also depictive of the fact that an appeal against the order of absured due to removal was submitted by the appellant purely on the ground of domestic issues which was rejected on 01.08.2009. The appellant thereafter, went into slumbers for more than seven years and then preferred departmental appeal/review under Rule-11-A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1975. Upon rejection of said appeal on 10.11.2016, once again, the appellant remained indolent and brought the appeal in hand on 05.12.2018. Here, it shall not be out of the place to note that owing to the proceedings taken against the appellant under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Removal from Service (Special Power) Ordinance, 2000 the appellant was barred from submitting any review petition under Rule 11 A of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules, 1975 after rejection of his departmental appeal.

In view of the above facts it becomes abundantly clear that the appeal in hand is hopelessly barred by time. The judgment of this Tribunal relied upon by the appellant is also distinguishable due to the fact that codal requirements were not the referred case during fulfilled in that case while proceedings against the appellant therein which was not the case in the instant appeal. It also requires to be noted that the retrospective

3

application of order of removal dated 28.05.2009 would not vitiate the proceedings against the appellant as the error contained in the order is curable as such the same is modified to had effect from the date of its issuance i.e. 28.05.2009 and not with from 30.11.2008. With the said modification the appeal in hand is dismissed in limine.

File be consigned to record room upon completion.

(HAMID FAROOQ DURRANI) CHAIRMAN

ANNOUNCED 14.01.2019

