## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No. 337/2020

Date of Institution ...

14.01.2020

Date of Decision

15.12.2021

Mst. Jamsheda Bibi, Lady Health Visitor (LHV), Sub-Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar. (Appellant)

#### **VERSUS**

The Director Health Services (Merged Area), Merged Area Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar and two others. ... (Respondents)

Muhammad Maaz Madni, Advocate

For Appellant

Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General

For respondents

SALAH-UD-DIN ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR

•••

CHAIRMAN

**MEMBER (EXECUTIVE)** 

JUDGMENT

ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR MEMBER (E):- Brief facts of the case are that the appellant was initially appointed as Lady Health Visitor (LHV) by Agency Surgeon Kurram vides order dated 29-06-2013. The appellant was transferred from Kurram to FR Peshawar vide order dated 18-07-2014 and she started performing her duty in FR Peshawar. In the meanwhile, her salary was stopped in March 2018 by declaring that appointment of the appellant as illegal, but after verification, her salary was released, but since July 2019 her salary was again stopped, against which the appellant filed departmental appeal dated 02-10-2019, which was not responded, hence the instant service appeal with prayers that monthly salaries of the appellant since March 2019 may be released alongwith arrears @ of running basic pay withheld since March 2018 till date with

all consequential benefits and any other remedy deems fit may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

- Learned counsel for the appellant has contended that act of the respondents by not releasing the monthly salary of the appellant @ of running basic pay stopped since March, 2018 is against law, rule and norms of natural justice, hence not tenable in the eye of law; that the appellant has not been treated in accordance with law, as such the respondents violated Article-4 and 25 of the Constitution; that the respondents acted in arbitrary manner, while not addressing the issue of the appellant in accordance with law; that act of the respondents is discriminatory as other colleagues who were appointed with the appellant in the same merit list have been transferred to their home districts and are regularly receiving their monthly salary according to their current running basic pay scale of health department; that since 2014 the appellant is treated as a regular employee but all of a sudden, salary of the appellant was converted into fix pay, which is against law and rule, as such the appellant is punished for the faults of others; that under Article-38(e) of the Constitution, State is under obligation to reduce disparity in the income and earning of the individuals including persons in various services of Pakistan, but conversely, miseries of the appellant have been enhanced, which is against law, rule and norms of natural justice.
- 03. Learned Additional Advocate General for the respondents has contended that the appellant was transferred from Kurram to FR Peshawar on her own request, but due to non availability of regular post of LHV, the appellant was adjusted against ADP post; that salary of the appellant was stopped due to non-availability of funds and upon availability of funds, salary of the appellant from 01-07-2019 to 30-06-2020 has been released; that upon availability of regular post, the appellant will be adjusted against a regular post and issue of her salary will be resolved once for all.

- 04. We have heard learned counsel for the parties and have perused the record.
- Record reveals that the appellant was appointed as LHV vide order dated 29-06-2013 against a regular post after observing all the codal formalities. The appellant was transferred from Ex- Kurram agency now Tribal District Kurram to Ex-FR Peshawar now District Peshawar vide order dated 18-07-2014 and her services were placed at the disposal of Agency Surgeon FR Peshawar and as per report of agency surgeon vide his letter dated 16-07-2014, a regular post of LHV was shown as vacant under his supervision, but upon arrival, the appellant was adjusted against an ADP post, which naturally was a post on fixed pay. Record would reveal that the appellant though a regular employees, started receiving salary on fixed rate for years and ultimately the funds under the said ADP scheme exhausted in 2018-19, so salary of the appellant was stopped for almost one year and after availability of funds, such salary was released. The respondents have admitted the fact that due to non availability of regular post, the appellant was adjusted against an ADP post, due to which her salaries were stopped twice but were released upon availability of funds. Funny part of the story is that after her adjustment against an ADP post, the respondents in due course, started considering the appellant as employee of the project and for which her salary was stopped and clarification were sought from agency surgeon Kurram, who in response had clarified that the appellant is a regular employee, where salary of the appellant was released. We have observed that the appellant has not been treated in accordance with law and being a regular LHV, she received monthly salary on fixed pay for longer time, which however was not warranted. Respondents were required to adjust her against a regular post, instead of ADP post.
- 06. In circumstance, the instant appeal is accepted. The appellant is held entitled to her adjustment against regular post of LHV as well as to monthly

salary of a regular post. Respondents are directed to calculate the shortfall in her salaries due to payment of fixed pay and to reimburse the amount to the appellant immediately. Parties are left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to record room.

ANNOUNCED 15.12.2021

> (SALAH-UD-DIN) MEMBER (J)

(ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR) MEMBER (E) ORDER 15.12.2021

Mr. Muhammad Maaz Madni, Advocate for the appellant present.

Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General for respondents

present. Arguments heard and record perused.

Vide our detailed judgment of today, separately placed on file, the instant appeal is accepted. The appellant is held entitled to her adjustment against regular post of LHV as well as to monthly salary of a regular post. Respondents are directed to calculate the shortfall in her salaries due to payment of fixed pay and to reimburse the amount to the appellant immediately. Parties are left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to record room.

ANNOUNCED 15.12.2021

> (SALAH-UD-DIN) MEMBER (J)

(ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR) MEMBER (E) 26.07.2021

Mr. Muhammad Maaz Madni, Advocate, for the appellant present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General for the respondents present.

Learned counsel for the appellant sought time for submission of rejoinder. Adjourned. To come up for rejoinder as well as arguments before the D.B on 14.10.2021.

(ATIQ-UR-REHMAN WAZIR) MEMBER (EXECUTIVE)

(SALAH-UD-DIN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

14.10.2021

Appellant in person present.

Kabir Ullah Khattak learned Additional Advocate General for respondents present.

Former made a request for adjournment as her counsel is not available today; granted. Adjourned. To come up for arguments on 15.12.2021 before D.B.

∖tiq-Ur-Rehman Wazir)

Member (E)

(Rozina Rehman) Member (J)

24.11.2020

Junior counsel for appellant is present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General and Miss. Saima Raza, ADEO, for the respondents are also present.

Written reply on behalf of respondents No. 1 & 2 has already been submitted while written reply on behalf of respondent No. 3 is not submitted so far. Learned Additional AG request for further time to contact the respondent No. 3 and furnish written reply/comments on the next date of hearing. Last chance is given to respondent No. 3 for submission of written reply/comments. Adjourned to 13.01.20201 on which date file to come up for written reply/comments on behalf of respondent No. 3 before S.B.

(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

13.01.2021

Counsel for appellant is present. Mr. Kabirullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General for the respondents is also present.

Written reply on behalf of respondents No. 1 to 2 has already been submitted. Neither written reply on behalf of respondent No. 3 is submitted nor any representative on his behalf is present, therefore, he is proceeded against ex-parte. File to come up for rejoinder and arguments on 08.04.2021 before D.B.

(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

08-54-2021 Due to dernise of Chairman, case is adjourned to 26-7-21 for the same as before

1

Junior to counsel for the appellant present. Addl: AG for respondents present. Written reply not submitted. Learned AAG seeks time. To come up for written reply/comments on 12.08.2020 before S.B.

MEMBER,

12.08.2020

Junior to counsel for the appellant and Addl. AG alongwith Danyal Ahmad, Store Keeper for respondents No. 1 & 2 present. Nemo for respondent No. 3.

Representative of respondents No. 1 & 2 has furnished reply/comments on behalf of the said respondents. Fresh notice be issued to respondent No. 3 for submission of written reply/comments on 01.10.2020 before S.B.

Chairman

01.10.2020

Counsel for the appellant present.

Mr. Kabirullah, Khattak, Additional Advocate General for respondents present.

Written reply on behalf of the respondent No.3 not submitted. Learned AAG sought time to contact the respondent No.3 for submission of written reply/comments. Time is allowed.

Adjourned to 24.11.2020 for written reply/comments of respondent No.3 before S.B.

(Mian Muhammad) Member (E) 12.02.2020

Learned counsel for the appellant present. Preliminary arguments heard.

The appellant has filed the present service appeal for the release of her monthly salaries allegedly stopped since March 2019.

Submission made by learned counsel for the appellant need consideration. The present service appeal is admitted for regular hearing subject to all just legal objections. The appellant is directed to deposit security and process fee within 10 days. Thereafter notices be issued to the respondents for reply/comments. To come up for written reply/comments on 02.04.2020 before S.B.

Member

02.04.2020

Due to public holiday on account of COVID-19, the case is adjourned for the same on 25.06.2020 before S.B.

Reader

## Form- A

FURIM	UF	UKDEK	2HEE I	

Court of_		
Case No	337/ <b>2020</b>	

	Case No	337/2020
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
: <b>1</b> -	14/01/2020	The appeal of Mst. Jamsheda Bibi presented today by M Muhammad Maaz Madni Advocate may be entered in the Institution
		Register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please.  REGISTRAR (MOI)
_	15/01/20	This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on 1202 2020
		CHAIRMAN
:		
	!	

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL No. 337 /2020

Jamsheda Bibi

VS

DHS (MERGED AREA) & OTHERS

## **INDEX**

s.no.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of Appeal	•••••	1 – 4
2.	Appointment order dated 29-06-2013	Α	5
3.	Merit List	В	6
4.	NOC dated 16.07.2014	С	7.
5.	Transfer Order dated 18.07.2014	D	10
6.	Arrival Report Dated 21.07.2014	E.	11
7.	Letter dated 06.04.2018	F	12
8.	Departmental Appeal dated 02.10.2019	G	13
9.	Vakalatnama	•••••	14

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUHAMMAD MAAZ MADNI 14/ 9/2024

Advocate,

HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR

0333-9313113, 0314-9965666

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL **PESHAWAR**

APPEAL No. 337 /2020 Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

MST. JAMSHEDA BIBI, Lady Health Visitor (LHV), Sub-Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar.

. Appellant

#### **VERSUS**

- 1-THE DIRECTOR HEALTH SERVICES (Merged Area), Merged Area Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar.
- 2-THE DEPUTY DISTRICT HEALTH OFFICER. Sub-Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar, Tawas Khan Colony near Allama Igbal Public School. Ring Road, Peshawar
- 3-THE DISTRICTACCOUNTS OFFICER. Sub-Division Hassan Khel, Peshawar.

...... Respondents

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE INACTION OF THE RESPONDENT BY NOT RELEASING THE MONTHLY SALARY OF THE APPELLANT STOPPED SINCE MARCH 2019 ALONG WITH ARREARS (@ of Running Basic Pay with held since March 2018) AND AGAINST NOT TAKING ACTION ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL DATED 02-10-2019 OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS

#### PRAYER:

4/01/2020

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may be directed to release the monthly salary of the appellant stopped since March 2019 along with arrears @ of running Basic Pay with held since March 2018 till date with all consequential back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

## RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH: FACTS:

1- That, appellant was initially appointed as Lady Health Visitor (BPS-09) now (BPS-12) by Agency Surgeon Kurram vide order dated 29-06-2013 after proper recommendation of the Departmental Selection Committee and fulfilling all the codal formalities required for the post.

> Copy of the order & merit list is attached as ANNEXURE ..... A&B.

- 2- That the appellant submitted his arrival and charge report before the competent authority and started performing his duty quite efficiently, whole heartedly and upto the entire satisfaction of his high ups.
- 3- That appellant applied for her transfer from District Kurram to FR Peshawar and accordingly NOC was issued from the office of respondent no. 2 that a post is vacant in BHU Akbar Kali Sub-Division Hassan Khel Peshawar hence the appellant was transferred from District Kurram to Sub-Division Peshawar vide order dated 18-07-2014.

4- That the appellant took over the charge by submitted arrival report dated 21-07-2014 in Hassan Khel Sub-Division Peshawar and since then the appellant is performing her duty at subdivision Hassan Khel Peshawar regularly at the assigned stations as per the orders of her high ups.

Copy of Arrival Report dated 21.07.2014 is attached as ANNEXURE ..... E.

5- That astonishingly the salary of the appellant was stopped by respondent no. 2 in March 2018 by declaring that the appointment of the appellant is illegal and in this respect verification was also sort out from District Surgeon District Kurram which responded verified vide letter dated 06-04-2018.

Copy of the Letter dated 06-04-2018 is attached as ANNEXURE ...... F.

- 6- That after satisfactory verification of the entire requirement the respondents released the monthly salary of the appellant in July 2019 for 12 months stopped since March 2018 at the rate of Fixed Pay of amounting to Rs. 30,000/- per month instead of Running Basic Pay without assigning any reason.
- 7- That, since July 2019 the monthly salary of the appellant was again stopped by the respondents without any plausible reason. That the appellant feeling aggrieved from the inaction of the respondents filed Departmental Appeal dated 02-10-2019 for the release of her salaries and arrears @ of Running Basic Pay Scale which was not responded within the statutory period of 90 Days.

8- That appellant feeling highly aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

## **GROUNDS:**

- A- That act of the respondent by not releasing the monthly salary of the appellant @ of Running Basic Pay stopped since March 2018 is against the Law, Rule, Facts and material available on record and norms of natural justice hence not tenable in the eye of Law and needs interference of this Honourable Tribunal.
- B- That appellant has not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the appellant has been deprived from her due right of the non-payment of monthly salary w.e.f. March 2018 at the rate of running Basic pay Scale hence the appellant has been penalized for no fault on her part.
- D- That the respondents acted in arbitrary and malafide manner while not releasing the monthly salary of the appellant w.e.f. March 2018 at the rate of Running Basic Pay.
- E- That the act and action of the respondents is discriminatory as other colleagues who were appointed with the appellant in the same merit list have been transferred to their home districts and are regularly receiving their monthly according to the current running Basic Pay Scale of the Health Department.
- F- That act of the respondents by not releasing the monthly salary of the appellant @ of her Running Basic Pay is nothing but just to harass the appellant and to benefit their blue eyed persons.
- G- That, since from the date of appointment and transferring to Sub-Division Hassan Khel Peshawar in 2014 the appellant is treated as regular employee but salary of the appellant was converted into Fixed Pay which is against the Law & Rules available on the subject matter and as such the appellant is punished for the fault of others.
- H- That, appellant has been paid for quite considerable period i.e. till March 2018 on the running Basic Pay Scale of the appellant but all of a sudden when the salary was illegally and without assigning any plausible reason has been stopped in March 2018 and where after when the salary for 12 months was released in July 2019 the appellant was paid an

amount calculated @ Fixed Pay of Rs. 30,000/- per month which is against the Law and Natural Justice.

- 1- That, the appellant is regularly performing her duty at the assigned station in sub-division Hassan Khel Peshawar since taking over the charge on 21-07-2014 and not releasing the monthly salary of the appellant amounts to Force Labour.
- J- That under Article 38(e) of the Constitution of Pakistan 1973 state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of the individuals including persons in the various services of Pakistan.
- K- That appellant seeks permission to advance other grounds and proofs at the time of hearing.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that appeal of the appellant may be accepted as pray for.

Dated 14-01-2020

**APPELLANT** 

JAMSHEDA BIBI

Janshigh

Through:

MUHAMMAD MAAZ I

Advocate,

High Court, Peshawar

ANNEXURE-

## OFFICE OF THE AGENCY SURGEON KURRAM PARACHINAR.

OFFICE ORDER.

As recommended by the departmental selection committee held on 21/05/2013, Nrs. Jamshida Bibi D/O Bacha Gul of District Bunir is hereby appointed as, (LHV) in BPS, 9 (6200-380-17600), plus usual allowances as admissible under the rules against the vacant post in any BHU in Kurram Agency.

## TERMS AND CONDITIONS.

- She will be medically fit for Govt: service.
- Her service is purely on Temporary basis & liable to be terminated 2 without any notice/reason.
- She will be governed by all such rules and orders issued by the Govt: from time to time for the post for which she is originally recruited.
- If she wishes to resign from service, she will give one month notice in advance or in lieu thereof one month salary has to be deposited 4. in to Govt: treasury.
- The Appointment should be declared null and void and penalty will be imposed in accordance with the prevalent law if the documents 5. are proved tempered or bogus.
- If she accepts this offer, she should report to ASMP PHI. Kerners Parachinar for further posting in any BHUin Kurram Adency with in fifteen days of the receipt of this letter, otherwise the offer will be treated as cancelled.

S/d x x x x x x X Agency Surgeon Kurram, Parachinar.

NO	/Apptt:	dated,	Parachinar	the	<u> </u>	<u>/-</u> /2013.
1	C The Ag	opy forward ency Accou	led to:- nt Officer Kurran	n at Parac	hinar.	
2. 3.	ASM PF	HI Kurram				
4.	Accou	nt /Service E	Book Clerk of this	s office.		•
·	for info	ormation and	d necessary actio	on		An.

Agency Surgeon Kurram, Parachinar.



LIST	Name with	Domicile	S RECOMMENDED FOR Qualification		Experience Interview		1			
5.80	Father Name		Metric	FA	BA	MA		! 	Mark 68	To Produce Certificate
	Shabina D/O	Kurram	53	-	8	-	<b>-</b> .	'	00	
	Hanif Khan			<del> </del>	8		<del></del>	4	65	To Produce Certificate
2	Shabana Amin Gul D/O	-do-	53	-	0	-			ļ	
	Amin Gul	Malakand	51	16	<del> </del>	<u> </u>	-	16	65	To produce registration
3.	Sharafat D/O	Malakanu	. 12	1	İ	1				
ļ	Ahmad Jan	Bunir	53	6	<del> </del>	<del>.</del>	-	5	64	• .
4 4	Nazebat Rani D/O	Builli	1	"					ļ <u>.</u>	2dura ragistration
	Zarin Khan   SalminD/O	Malakand	53	6	-	-	-	5	64	To produce registration
, 5	Ahmad Jan	1	Ì						57	
6	Shakira D/O	Bunir	42	6	-	-	4	5	3/	
100	Fazal Wadood					<del> </del>		6	54	- 4
7	Shazia Bibi D/O	Bunir	42	6	-	-	1 -		-	15.
	Abdul Latif	<u> </u>	<u> </u>					6	48	To Produce Certificate
8	Jamshida Gul D/O	Bunir .	42	-	-	-				1
	Bacha Gul	ļ;	12	1		1-		4	46	Ţ
9 /	Zakia Bibi D/O	-do-	-42	1-	-	i -		1	1	

The appointment will be made against the vacant posts from the above merit list subject

to provision of qualification certificate.

DDA Admn: DHS

Zarin Khan

Medical Supid: AHQH PCR

Addll: Agency Surgeon, L/Central Kurram

ASM PPHI Kurram.

... Representative PPHI

Kurram.

Dr. Mucen Begum, Gynecologist AHQH PCR.

Agency Surgeon Kurram, Parachinar.



AGENCY SURGEON FR PESHAWAR

rial # X-9, A-5 Malice Plaza Kohat Road Peshawar (Opposite Gulshan-e-Pehman Colony) Telephone No.091-2322466

No 1240 / AS/FR/Pesh/Admin.

dated Peshawar the 16/67/2014

To,

The Director Health Services FATA Warsak Road Peshawar

Subject: -

REQUEST FOR TRANSFER

Sir

Reference your letter No 11698-99/DHS/FATA/Admin dated

13/06/2014.

I have the honour to state that one Mrs. Jamsheda LHV to attached Kurram Agency requesting for transfer, as this office has no objection on her transfer to FR, Peshawar. Furthermore it stated that one post is laying vacant at BHU Gul Akber Kali FR, Peshawar the post vacated by Naseem Akhter LHV.

Report is submitted to proceed further in the matter please.

Ageng Agergeon FR FR Chawar

ATTESTED OPE AGIOOPY

# DIRECTORATE OF HELATH SERVICES FATA FATA SECRETARIAT WARSAK ROAD PESHAWAR.

# 8

Annex-D

## OFFICE ORDER

Mst. Jamsheda LHV attached to Agency Surgeon Kurram at Parachinar is hereby transferred and placed her services at the disposal of Agency Surgeon FR Peshawar for further posting against the vacant post in the interest of public service with immediate effect.

		Sd/
		Director Health Services FATA, Peshawar
) _ '	/DHS/FATA/Admo	Dated: 151 / 507 / 2014

Copy forwarded to the:-

- 1- Agency Surgeons Kurram & FR Peshawar.
- 2- Agency Accounts Officer Kurram at Parachinar.
- 3- AGPR Sub Office Peshawar.
- 4 LHV concerned.

Director Health Services FATA, Peshawar

to be discoopy

Agency Surgeon (11 F. R Peshenian ANNEXURE-Arrived Report Subjecti-KSference DHS FATA Celler No 14179-85/DH8/1. 1/ John darkel 18-07-2014. Therefore I Submill my Arrived Report for duty or duted 21-07-2014 So please seeght my Assiver Therks Your, Shediently 1: L. 1 HV

. **.** .

F

(12)

ATXNEXURE- F

Deard Personne de 6 04 3813

EC.

The Agency Surgeon.
Kurrum at Parachiner.

The Director Health Services, FATA, Peshawar.

roojec -

MET: LAMSHIDA LIN.

Reference your fener No. 7135 DHSTATA ADMIN down 22 05 2003.

theforest vide to respon as rates beautifully and successful vide bound is successful vide bound of successful rates a successful rates and the successful vide bound in the successful rates and successful rates and successful vide bound in the successful vide bound in the successful vide bound in the successful video of the successful vide

tone Parking

Copy to the Samon the Pagener de martin

Kerima Paradicar





No.; 1032

dated: 06-04-2018

From:

The Agency Surgeon, Kurram at Parachinar

To

The Director health Services.

FATA Peshawar

Subject:

VERIFICATION OF APPOINTMENT ORDER IN RESPECT OF

MST: JAMSHEDA LHV

Mem: -

Reference your letter nO. 7135/DHS/FATa/Admin dated 22/03/2018.

I have the honour to state that appointment order in respect of Mst. Jamsheda received with your letter under reference is returned herewith duly verified.

Agency Surgeon, Kurram Parachinar

No. /-

Copy to FR Surgeon FR Peshawar for information.



Agency Surgeon, Kurram Parachinar

يناب لا الركويش صفيب سب عام الله تستر سلية في با رئينط pute for 1 de lis ANNEXURE- G انتهای آداب مرحن به کم مح يوبر في 102-6-19 كو كرم الجنس من الوفى الورازان جو لافى 1/06 كوس دولان دس عمل (تعادج) تما دلم الحوا-من رفانی! فعوی کی تنخوا میں سروم سے محمد مراری ہی ۔مگر سابقہ سرجن کا دور میں تنعواه بندكردكم من - فندكى تصى اور منام بهلق مثان كا الوائم حكاكم الل الله الن مَن دهند، عَام كافيزات عَمْ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهُ - مَامُ مِي ١٥١٥ وسِي سَخواه سَد سَخواه سَد مَا جُولاق ١٩٥٤م تو چاماه که تعزوایس بخال به وی- اس سے بیا ۱۹ می کو د اظر بالیز بدان تمام ویرامیل علی ى الله الله كاور فارها وليرى فكنس مكونى جسمس على المواطرى اصران ع وروى كو منها تدار المراسير سير المراء في من الله ساء والاكرا-منا سال أكرم المين من جربيم ميريكم فدي ترسان مرى نبوخ ما- اندور عبد كي رقع به مي ١١٨٠٠ رتكول اللؤنس سك دور طنامس درواسس الم أن اورسانق سرجن ترمش مي مي در دواسس دى مكر تا مال مسكر مل در بوسا فروى يزر تنولاكر يس كيك درفواست دى نو بغول سرجن مها بنى ركولالزابين Big by June w Jil & مناب عالی 7 میمام ن سے مختار ش کا طرق مع نے فردی کے در تو است تھا میر تورفر کا ا فدوی در ایمه دی مین میشار میس کی هی بیده کامه کی متو ایس می بیس وای که ما در در a colina sur l'is enclos of sois 330 min (C) 2 HV 03333891096



## VAKALATNAMA

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO		OF 20	)20
Jamsheda Bibi		(APF	PELLANT)
	VERSU	<u>S</u>	•
DHS (Merged Area) & c	other	(RESPON	DENTS)
I/We Jamedo hereby appoint a Madni Advocate High act, compromise, withous my/our Counsel/Adwithout any liability for engage/appoint any other l/we authorize the said receive on my/our behinder.	nd constith Court, For the court, For the construction of the construction of the court, and the court, and co	rute Muhamma Peshawar to appear fer to arbitration for the above noted It and with the aut ate Counsel on my, the to deposit, with one as and amounts pa	ar, plead, for me/us d matter, thority to /our cost. draw and ayable or
deposited on my/our ac	.count iii ti	ie above noted me	atter.

Dated: 14/01/2020

CLIENT(S)

(Jamsheda Bibi)

MUHAMMAD MAAZ MADNI

Advocate High Court, Peshawar (BC-11-1460) 17101-9263898-1

## **OFFICE:**

Flat No.3, Upper Floor, Islamia Club Building, Khyber Bazar, Peshawar City. Phone: 091-2211391 Mobile No.0345-9090737, 0333-9313113

## **BEFORE THE SERVICES TRIBUNAL**

## KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PESHAWAR

### **APPEAL NO. 337 / 2020**

Mst. Jamsheda LHV App	ellan
-----------------------	-------

#### **VERSES**

Director Health Services, Merged Areas and others----- Respondents

## Reply / comments on behalf of the Respondents No. 1 & 2

## **Respected Sheweth**

## Preliminary objections

- 1. That the appellant has got no locus standi to file the instant appeal.
- 2. That the appellant has not come to this Honorable Court with clean hands.
- 3. That the appellant has got no cause of action to file the instant appeal.

## **FACTS**

- 1. Correct.
- 2. Correct.
- 3. Correct to the extent transfer from District Kurram to Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar on her own request, but due to un-availability of regular post of LHV, the appellant was adjusted against ADP post, for that she submitted arrival report for duty on 21.07.2014.
- 4. Incorrect, as per report of the Deputy DHO Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar, the performance of the appellant was not satisfactory and often remained absent from her legitimate duties even from Polio vaccination (National Cause). In this regards, explanations were called and deduction of salary was also made due to absence from National Cause, attached at Annex-A & B.
- Correct.
- 6. Correct. As far as stoppage of salary is concerned, to it is due to unavailability of ADP funds.
- 7. Correct. However, after release of ADP funds, the salary of the appellant from 01.07.2019 to 30.06.2020 has been released.
- 8. Incorrect, as stated in above para, the appellant has no right to file the instant appeal.

## **GROUNDS**

- A- Incorrect. After transfer from District Kurram to Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar on her own request, the salary of the appellant was released from ADP post due to unavailability of regular post of LHV and received salary from 2014 upto 2019. Now after release of ADP funds, the appellant received salary from 01.07.2019 to 30.06.2020.
  - B- Incorrect as stated above.
  - C- Incorrect, as stated in Para A above.
  - D- Incorrect, as stated in Para A above.
  - E- Pertain to record. However, as stated in Para-A above.
  - F- Incorrect, as stated in Para-A above.
  - G- Correct to the extent of release of salary on fixed pay because the appellant was transferred from District Kurram to Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar on ADP post due to unavailability of regular post of LHV.
  - H- Incorrect as stated in Para-A & G above.
- I- Incorrect, in light of attached documents, the performance of the appellant is not satisfactory; however, her salary has now been released.
- J- Correct.
- K- The Department will also raise other grounds at the time of arguments.

In light of the above, it is humbly prayed that the appeal has no legal footing; therefore, it may please be dismissed.

Deputy District Health Of Sub Division Hassan Kne Peshawar.

Respondent No. 2.

Director Health Services, Merged Areas Peshawar.

Respondent No. 1

**胸腺性**医 1000 - 1

Opposite Sadaat CNG, Ring Road Peshawar Tawas Khan Colony House #2 Phone # 091-2322466.

To

All Staff

CHC Akbar Hussain

Subject: <u>EXPLANATION</u>

During my surprise visit to CHC Akbar Hussain on dated 10/7/2019 you have been found; absent from your duties without any prior notice to the Deputy District Health Office Sub-Division Hassan Khel.

You are hereby directed to explain your position within three days positively in case of failure unsatisfactory reply strict disciplinary action will be taken against all of you.

Note: Two (02) Days salary has been deducted.

Deputy District Health Officer
Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

C.C

- 1. The Director Health Services Merged Area Peshawar.
- 2. The Officials Concerned.

Deputy District Health Officer Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

OFFICE THE DELITY DISTRICT WERE IT OFFICER SUB DIVISION HASSAN EDEL PESHAW

Opposite Sadaat CNG, Ring Road Peshawar Tawas Khan Colony House #2 Phone # 091-2322466.

Ĩο.

The Addl:, AGPR Sub Office > Peshawar

Subject: <u>EXPLANATION/DEDUCTION FROM SALARIES</u>

As reported by the UCMO on the day of Routine vaccination of BCG the following staff were absent from duty.

Therefore the undersigned is requested the hounarable AGPR to kindly deduct 5 days salary from the account of pay to the Govt Treasury please.

Also the undersigned warned the employees to be careful in future otherwise strict disciplinary action will be taken against them under the E&D Rules which leads to be removed from services.

The employees' names and deduted amount amount against each are as under.

S.No	Name	Designation & Facility Name	Monthly Pay	Deducted amount of 5 days.
1.	Shehnaz Tariq	LHV CHC Soorpan	31500	5250/-
2.	Tasleem Bibi	LHV CHC Said Azam Kalay	31500	5250/-
-3.	Jamsheda Gul	LHV CHC Akbar Hussain	31500	5250/-

Deputy District Health Officer
Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

C.C

- 1. The Director Health Services Merged Area Peshawar for information please.
- 2. The Officials Concerned.

Deputy District Health Officer Sug Nivision Hassan Khel Peshawar

## OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY DISTRICT HEALTH OFFICER SUB DIVISION HASSAN KHEL PESHAWAR

Towas Khan Colony near Allama Igaal p	
********	
No. <u>No. No. No. JODHO</u> Mccount	Dated: <u>/ ( ) / ( )</u> /2020 .
Tomas and the second of the se	
All Staff of CHC Akbar Hussain excep	ot Haji Sul (MT)
Subject: <b>EXPLANATION</b>	
	ad DO (27 (2020) the above mentioned
	ed 08/02/2020, the above mentioned
staff of CHC Akbar Hussain were found abse	20t.
Therefore it is hereby directed to explain	ain your position within three days
positively; in case of failure strict disciplina	ry action will be initiated against all of
you under E&D rules.	
	Deputy District Health Officer
	500 Division Hassan Khel Peshawar
Copy Forward to the:	
copy forward to the.	
1. 4: Director Health Service Merged Area Pes	häwar
2. Assistant Commissioner Sub Divisio y Hassal	r Khel Peshawar for information please
3. IMU Health Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	
	•

Deputy District Health Other Sup Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

B

# OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY DISTRICT HEALTH OFFICER SUBDIVISION HASSAN KHEL PESHAWAR

## **NOTIFICATION/WARNING:**

Vide this office letter/Notification no 974-76 AS/ADMIN/FR/PESH dated 17/07/2020, no 1009-11 AS/ADMIN/FR/PESH dated 19/07/2020 and 3058-60 DDHO/Account dated 10/02/2020. In the light of above notices/Expalantions you MST: Jamshaida Bibi (LHV) attached to CHC Akbar Hussain, still failed to submit the replies of expalantions.

Furthermore, you are regularly absent from your duties. It is hereby onece again directed to explain your position within three days positively; in case of failure stale tollicipilinary action will be intiated against you under E&D rules

Sdxxxxx

Deputy District Health Officer
Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

No. 3091-92 /DDHO/ADMIN/PESH

Pated: 12/03/2020

#### Copy to the:

- 1. Director Health Service Merged Area Peshawar
- 2. Official Concerned

Deputy District Health Officer

Sub Division Hassan Khel Peshawar

 
 Prev Pers No:
 Desig: LHV
 (00104310)

 Pate Of Birth: 04.04.1985
 Date Of Appointment: 12.07.2013

 A H D U H T D E D U C T I D H S A H D U N T
 a0196334 Janshība BIRī Grade: 12 NTH: CHIC: 1510192613686 LOAN/FUND Buckle Nn · Father Hane: null FAYNENTS 7301-7481559 HUSBand 98947. Bestort 2020 03339498 REPATO Accounts Design GG KP Peshauar PARKEL REGISTER For the month of Mag ,2020 Page : Date : Pagroll Section : 009 Pagroll 9 0045 Fixed Pag / Salare 5850 Adj Fixed Pag/Salarg 363,000.00 NET PAY 363,000.00 01.05.20203 Brauch Code: Proment through DDD Acent. No:



# OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY DISTRITCT HEALTH OFFICER SUB-DIVISION HASSAN KHEL PESHAWAR

Tawas Khan Colony, House # 2, Shinwari House, Ring Road Peshawar

No JA

, /DDHO/Admin/Hassan Khel Peshawar;

Dated: 7 /12/2020

To

The District Health Officer Kurram Tribal District, KP.

Subject:

STATUS OF MS. JAMSHEDA (LHV)

Sir,

Refer to the subject noted above and to state that Ms Jamsheda Bibi (LHV) working under the control of the undersigned at CHC Akbar Hussain. Kindly clarify the status of the above mentioned official (LHV) that whether her job was on contract basis or on regularized.

Your cooperation will be highly appreciated:

Deputy District Health Officer Hassan khel Sub – Division Peshawar THE PROPERTY OF THE ARREST OF

14/1/2 / Divershire for the 12 / Augustine

chaming her and his property of the control of the

ZALMHEZON MARISIAMCHINIXAUURI

Reference, your Caller No. 774/DDIID/Admin/Lizena-Khel/Peshavor, dated OTAL 2020 on the publical chicambaxe

li is submillad lacycusintomation that Max Jamshida Pibi Lady Health Visitonwas required on regular bosis and hologramma, vide this office order No. 2146-1970 prite dated audiolia,

Tribal District Kurran

## OFFICE OF THE DIPUTY DISTRICT HEALTH OFFICER SUB-DIVISION HASSAN LITE - FLSHA COLOR

RUCHPI STATEMENT

Omorth O.

Jameloda J. Bucha graf ... were 33447

Jankob Bibi - LHV 15101- 0337 9261368-6 9498747 Juit



o / July 2021

Orania Santana



## KHYBER PAKHTUNKWA

SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

No. 154 /s

Dated: 24/01 /2022

All communications should be addressed to the Registrar KPK Service Tribunal and not any official by name.

Ph:- 091-9212281. Fax:- 091-9213262

To

The Deputy District Health Officer, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

JUDGMENT IN APPEAL NO. 337/2020 MST. JAMSHEDA BIBI.

I am directed to forward herewith a certified copy of Judgement dated 15.12.2021 passed by this Tribunal on the above subject for strict compliance.

Encl: As above

RÉGISTRAR KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR