Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of_____

Case No.

880

/2021

2

S.No. Order or other proceedings with signature of judge Date of order proceedings 2 1 3 The appeal presented today by Mr. Mujeebuliah Advocate may 14/01/2021 1be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. **ĞISTRAR** This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2-08-02 3.21 up there on 🤦 MEMBER(J)

03.03.2021

えん

The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is under transfer, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 28.07.2021

Reader

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No....../2021

Dated:

Sami Ullah

VS

Govt of KP through Secretary E & SE) & others

INDEX OF DOCUMENTS

S.NO	DESCRIPTION OF DOCUMENTS		ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	~		1-2
2.	Copy of Notification dated 20/12/2012		Λ	3
3.	Copies of Pay slips	<u></u>	B&C	4-5
4.	Copy of Departmental appeal/representation		D ,	. 6
5.	Copy of Judgment dated 11/11/2019		E .	7-8
6.	Wakalatnama			9

Appellant

Through

M. Ashfaq KhanAkhunkhail

.

Syed Zeshan Khan &

Mujeebullah

Advocates Khalid & Law Associates 46-C, 2nd Four, Cantonment Plaza, Peshawar Saddar Cell No. 0333-8522332 Ashfaqkhan182@gmail.com

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNK7H7WA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

<u>PESHAWAR</u>

Sami Ullah

Presently serving as PST (BPS 12) in GPS MERAKAY Dir Lower

Service Tribuna)
Diary No. 1026
Dated 14/1/202

Khyber Palahtukhwa

_____(APPELLANT)

VERSUS

- 1. The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 2. The Secretary (E&SE) Department. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3. The Secretary Finance Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 4. The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 5. The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

(RESPONDENTS)

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKIITUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

<u>PRAYER:</u>

That on acceptance of this Appeal the Respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period(Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH:

FACTS:

- 1. That the Appellant is serving in the Elementary and Secondary Education department as Primary School Teacher (BPS-12) quiet efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No.FD(PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14-07-2011 was issued.

ito-dayhat later on the finance department enhanced/ revise the rate of conveyance Allowance vide Notification dated 20-12-2012 for civil servants (BPS-1-15) but Respondents have treated the Appellants under the previous notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance.

(Copy of the Notification are attached as annexure A)

- 4. That Appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the Respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. (Copies of the Salary slips of working/serving month and vacations deduction period are attached as annexure B&C)
- 5. That similar placed employees of Elementary & Secondary Education Department (hereinafter referred as E & S Education Department) approached this August Tribunal and their grievance was redressed vide judgment dated 11-11-2019. (Copy of Judgment dated 11/11/2019 is attached as annexure D)
- 6. That being aggrieved form the illegal action of deduction of conveyance allowance, the Appellant preferred departmental appeal before the competent authority but the same has not been responded by Respondents within the statutory period of ninety days. (Copy of departmental appeal is annexed as annexure E)
- 7. That feeling aggrieved from action and inaction of the Respondents and having no other remedy available, hence, the Appellant approaches this Hon'ble Court inter alia on the following grounds.

21

GROUNDS:

- A. That the action and inaction of the Respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B. That the Appellant has not been treated by the Respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the Respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C. That the action of the Respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly guaranteed by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D. That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is governed by Government Servant Revised Leave Rules,1981 while vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the Appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacation period.
- E. That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules.1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve(12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F. That as the act of the Respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal . authority and discriminatory hence, not tenable in the eye of law.
- G. That Appellant has vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the Respondents to deprive the Appellants from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H. That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules,1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind,therefore,the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I. That according to Article 38(e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan,1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the Appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J. That the Appellants seeks permission of this Hon'ble Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

In wake of above submission, it is, therefore, must humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Appeal the Respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period(Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits Or

Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems just and proper that may also be awarded in favor of the Appellant.

Through

VOCATE

M. Ashfaq KhanAkhunkhail Syed Zeshan Khan & Mujeebullah ADVOCATES

Khalid & Law Associates 46-C, 2nd Four, Cantonment Plaza, Peshawar Saddar

CERTIFICATE

As per instruction of my client prior to the present one, no such like appeal has been filed by the Appellant before this Hon'ble Court.

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

• No. FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

BETTER COPY

From

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Finance Department, Peshawar

- .oT
- 1. All Administrative Secretaries to Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 2. The Senior Member Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
 - 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
 - The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtuńkhwa
 - 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa
 - 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
 - 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 8. All Political Agents / District & Session Judge in Khyper Pakhtunkhwa
 - 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar
- Khyber Commission, Service Public Chairman. The 10. Pakhtunkhwa
 - The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa .11

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE Subject: THE KHYBER OF THE ' CIVIL 'EMPLOYEES ROT PARHTUNICHWA PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir,

The Government of Kryber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 hearing the the the the

	() (C) is the first of the second			Hal HIM
	Revised Rate (PM)	Existing Rate (PM)	BPS	1 S. No
	Re. 1700/-	- Rs! 1500/- 1	1-4	
	Rs. 1840/-	Rs 1500/-	5.10	<u> </u>
4	Rs. 2720/-	[Rs, 2000/- '	111-15	1 3
ŧ		··· Rs, 5000/-		·

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 Officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faith

(Schibzada Seeed Ahmad) ATTESTED Secretary Financa

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Pashawar the 20th December, 2012

Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (November-2020)



Personal Information of Mr SAMI ULLAH d/w/s of SAHAD WALT

Personnel Number: 00809275 Date of Birth: 01.01.1985 CNIC: 1530520997789 Entry into Govt. Service: 24.03.2016 NTN: .

Length of Service: 04 Years 08 Months 008 Days

Employment Category: Active T	emporary					
Designation: PRIMARY SCHOO	L TEACHER	80674790-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE				
DDO Code: DA6318-District Dir	Lower		I			
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	. Cash Center:	-			
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:		52,349.00		
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 12	Pay Stage: 4		

	Wage type Amount			Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	17,160.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	1,961.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00
1923	UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	350.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	226.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,194.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	1,716.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	1,716.00
2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	1,716.00		-	0.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3012	GPF Subscription	-2,220.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	iption	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Deductions Payable:	- Income Tax 0.00 Recover	ed till NOV-2020:	0.00 Exempted	l: 0.00 Recover	able: 0.00
Gross Pay (Rs.): 31,395.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-3,545.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 27	,850.00
Account Nu	e: SAMI ULLAH imber: 014400000234400 ls: THE BANK OF KHY		ambur Lower Dir. LB.Br. Earned:	Kambur Lower Dir., Lo Balance:	wer Dir
Permanent .	Address			• • •	•
	ADHERAI	Domicile: -	, ,	Housing Statu	s:¿No Official
City:	-	Email: samiullah I	5305@gmail.com	ATTEST To Be True C	ED Copy

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9(SERVICES/30.11.2020/19:35:35/v2.0) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted



Personal Information of Mr SAMI ULLAH d/w/s of SAHAD WALI

Personnel Number: 00809275 Date of Birth: 01.01.1985 NTN:

^J Length of Service: 04 Years 04 Months 009 Days

Employment Category: Ac	tive Temporary				
Designation: PRIMARY SC	CHOOL TEACHER	80674790-DISTRICT GC	VERNMEI	NT KHYBE	
DDO Code: DA6318-Distri	ct Dir Lower				
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:			
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:		40,358.00	
Vendor Number: -	•		•		
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 12	Pay Stage: 4	
				-	

1

Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (July-2020)

Entry into Govt. Service: 24.03.2016

CNIC: 1530520997789

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	17,160.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	1,961.00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	1923 UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	350.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	226.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,194.00	2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	1,716.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	1,716.00	2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	1,716.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Wage type Amount Wage type		Wage type	Amount
3012	GPF Subscription	-2,220.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan		Desci	ription	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Deductions	- Income Ta	x		,	I	
Payable:	0.00		red till JUL-2020:	0.00 Exempte	d: 0.00 Recove	rable: 0.00
Gross Pay (Rs.): 28	,539.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-3,545.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 2	4,994.00
Account Nu	e: SAMI ULI imber: 01363 s: THE BAN	003	'BER, 080144 I.B.Br. Kar	nbur Lower Dir. I.B.Br	. Kambur Lower Dir., Le	ower Dir
Leaves:	Opening	Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
	·					
Permanent /		•				
-	ADHERAI		Domicile: -		Housing State	us: No Official
Temp. Addr City: '	ess:	,	Email: samiullah 15.	305@gmail.com	TTESTED	

Annexure D

То

The Director, (E&SE) Department,

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

SUBJECT: DEPARMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE <u>DURING WINTER &</u> <u>SUMMER VACATIONS.</u>

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self-Department and is serving as PST (BPS-12) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that conveyance allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for working in BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of education department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the federal service tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the honorable service tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of education department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granted to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 16.08.2020

Yours Sincerely



6

PST (BPS 12) in GPS MERAKAY Dir Lower

1

Counsel for the appellant press Learned counsel referred to the budgment passed by learned Federal

ervice Tribunal-In-Appeal No 11888(R) CS/2016 which was handed do on 03.12.2048 miregin the said upgment the issue of antieducing summer sand winte vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already Conveyance: Allowance to a civil as made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to th judgment-by Honourable Peshawar-High/Court passed on: 01-10-2019

the case of appellant.

1.2019

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the ssue, in essence; was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and; more particularly, by the Honographe Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Pashawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

paymenticol

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of the well as Salary but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance, during, the period of vacations. It is important to hote that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above includ facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a rresh round of htigation which may protect over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liperty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a

fied the ture cops reasonable time. csha File berconsigned to the record

ليت المست جرا مد المستسل المريم الم Grout of ERP ete plin. Sami Ullah Jul (Solo where the second of the second مت رمدند مرجع موان بالإمين الني للرضيسين والسط يبرض ومحطاب دين وكل كاروا إلى متعلقة آن مقام ليتأور كيسط الخراجا قطان اخلى بحريث المن يوكيط بالي كودك كودك مقرر كيد إطاليك جاء تيركرما ي تموضحومقد كم كمارواتي كاكارل اينة بارتبجكا نبيروكل حباحب كوكريه دايمى الروآ لخرزنال والبيدار بطف مين توابد بني اوراد بال ديروي اور ليمتوز ذكري كريما براء أورو سولى جريب وروبيه اور بطري الموي اور ررخوا البيت برترم کی تقدیری ا در اس بر ترجمل کرایے کا اخلتیار کر ایس کی قرار مدیم بیروی یا داگری کم طرف یا ایل کی قرار کی امريست في المبر ما يسب الذلي تحكمان مرتفات و سريري مسب كال فليام مين المديمة وريدة متديري متعديه بأي مسكة كن يا يُتريدين ما، إذا في مست واستطر الدر وتم بل يا تشار قالون كوسابية تهرك با ابن عما التي ترمريه المعندي وترتبي با ا ورصاحه بو ففرست بط مرجبی و بی جمله مذکوره بالا اختباطت حاص بول سیم ا وراس کا بها خبته برواخته منطور بحرك مبتسار موران مقدسات جو خرجه وترمان النوا, متعاليه يم سبب سي ترا ال السبحن وتعرب مناحب متوينكوف بول سيم ميز بقايا وخرجيه كا وصول مريد في كالمعى الخاليار بيسًا أكر مولى قارائي بالتلي مظالم مدوره يريمى بأسريت المريح الدوكيل صاحب بإبنار نريحول سيح كه بسروى سركور كرتي. لمنز وكالمته تامه كمقع دماكه سندين ر المتر _____ Jam في الله الدوار للمرك في طن المرغل المولية 0333852332 63018521721