Counsel for appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Hon'ble Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and more particularly, by the Hon'ble Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar high Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Hon'ble High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Hon'ble Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honored and implemented by the respondent within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record room.

Atiq-Ur-Rehman Wazir Member (E)

ANNOUNCED 13.10.2020

## Form- A

## FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of		
	10	
se No	6775 /2020	•

	Case No	/) / /) /2020
1S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	10/07/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafzai Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please.
;		REGISTRAR ,
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on $\frac{13/10}{2}$
		CHAIRMAN
	•	
* '*		

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. <u>6975</u>/2020

KAMAL KHAN VS

**EDUCATION DEPTT:** 

#### **INDEX**

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	Α .	4
3.	Pay slips	B & C,	5- 6
4.	Departmental appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E gray	8 <u>-</u> .9
6.	Vakalatnama		10

THROUGH:

NUNFAT ALT YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE

CELL NO 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted. After submission of the case.

# BEFORE THE KHY#BER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 6975/2020

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

Mr.KAMAL KHAN,SPST(BPS-14)

GPS SHUNTALA DIST DIR LOWER.Personnel Number:00260546

ated <u>(0 / / 2</u>920 16

#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa; Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

  RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYHBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### **PRAYER:**

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during yacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

# R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **SPST (BPS-14)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from

\*

- **3-** That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but tFhe respondents without any valid and justifiable reasonsF stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the Salary Slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure. **B** & **C**.

- 6- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgment Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government,

therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights:
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the rederation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Courtito raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

Salah Barata Barata

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appear of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT

KAMAL KHAN

THROUGH:

MUNFATALIVOSAFEAL

ADVOCATE

There is a very more is seed to promission of this company of Contito raise so other is build as a sable and to take of any over its if the contito of the c

of the regard a fell of the Library growther.

tina orien lude e filo ludición la fromesiona de le origine de fagis fixó de descriptiva persante la color de La cultura de la color de la calenda de color de partes tou é la color de color de descriptiva de descriptiva La certanea la color de la color de color de forma de color de la color de color de color de descriptiva de c



### GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT. (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-11)-8-52/2012 Dated Pashawar the: 20-12-2012

From

The Secretary to Govi. of Knylger Pashtuplanya. Finance Desgropped. Penhawar.

To:

All Administrative Secretalies to Gove of Kryter Pakhturphies.

The Schlor Member, Board of Revenue, Whyber Parking Items.

The Secretary to Governor Kriyber Pakhtunkawa The Secretary to Chief Misseer, Keyber Pakhteritania,

The Secretary, Provincial Asimpley, Khyber Palaturkhaa

All Heads of Allaches Departments in Knyher Pakhttakkhva Af District Coordination Officerade Khyber Pakhtenkhys.

År Poliscal Agents / District & Somions Jugges yr Khyper Paktikuniöwa

Hite Registrar Pesnawar HypinCocci, Goshawa

The Charman Rubic Service Commession, Khyber Pakhtentiano. The Charman, Services Tabunal Kayos: Pakhtentiana.

Sibject

REVISION IN THE PATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA: PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear St.

The Government of Khylle: Politicarithmic has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servanting Gover of Navyber Pashbunishwa (Working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 15 September, 2012 at ... the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in SPSALS to Epicies will remem-· wikhanged.

ร์.พิต	BP5	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM).
1	1-4	₹\$.1,\$00/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u></u>	5-10	Ps.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/
,ځ.	11.15	Fs.2,600/	Rs.2,720/-
<u> </u>	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$:5,000/-

Gomissiance Allowance at the above rates perturbation shall be admissible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned afficial vehicles:

Yours Fashiully,

(Sahibarda Sadod Alimad) Secretary Finance

Ender NO. FDFSO(SR/JD/8-52/2012

Dated Passawar the 20th Decomber, 20th

A Copy is lonyarded for information to thet-

Atotombní General, řígiber říjklice (dime. Pesipibis)

Secretaries to Goldentrad of Punjab, South & Sabothetan Faration Depositified As Automotives & Seed Automotives Scotes in Whitee Pakit Leskinss

GMTIAZ AYUBI winimas Samasa (Ram)

# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No	. BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/
2.	5-10	.Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17
 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012



#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (February-2020)





Personal Information of Mr KAMAL KHAN d/w/s of MUHAMMAD ROZ KHAN

Personnel Number: 00260546

CNIC: 10890154940

NTN:

Date of Birth: 11.04.1970

Entry into Govt. Service: 22.10.1995

Length of Service: 24 Years 04 Months 009 Days

**Employment Category: Active Temporary** 

Designation: SENIOR PRIMARY SCHOOL TEA

80001409-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: DA6140-GOVT. PRIMARY SCHOOLS (M) SAMARBAGH

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 03

GPF A/C No: EDUDA012339

Interest Applied: Yes

**GPF Balance:** 

420,516.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 14

Pay Stage: 17

	Wage type	Amount	<u> </u>	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	35,070.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,214.00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	1923	UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00
2148		. 766.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	515.00
	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,644.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,507.00
	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,507.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	3,507.00

#### **Deductions - General**

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3014	GPF Subscription	-2,620.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
	Income Tax	-170.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00
	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00			0.00

#### Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance

**Deductions - Income Tax** 

Payable:

2,871.70

Recovered till FEB-2020:

1,475.00

Exempted: 717.70

Recoverable:

679.00

Gross Pay (Rs.):

54,230.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-4,115.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

50,115.00

Payee Name: KAMAL KHAN

Account Number: C/A 205 1:06

Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 221744 SAMAR BAGH SAMAR BAGH, SAMAR BAGH

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: VILL.SHONTALA

City: DIR LOWER

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email: mrkamalkhan.70@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9(SERVICES/16.03.2020/13:25:15/v2.0)

\* All amounts are in Pak Rupees \* Errors & omissions excepted

Errors & amissions encepted



Ś



The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE

**DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS** 

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SPST (BPS-14) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the convence allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Derpartment. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 28.02.2020

Your Obediently

KAMAL KHAN

GPS SHUNTALA DIST DIR LOWER.



YBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar...

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar...

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED BY ILLEGALLY RESPONDENTS THE ACTION OF UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER APPELLANT THE VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted weeto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

2-14/10/19

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated .20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Gost

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on .03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Ev. H

Chairman

POSITIONAL\_

11.11.2019

O. A. B. Care

KU! Şe

e Springer MANAGERIAN MANAGERANA MANAGERANA

Musicat all Pougaezai

ADVOCATE

#### **VAKALATNAMA**

may at the deal of the property

: 大野岛 经收益额

#### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

		OF 2020	
KAMAL KHAN			(APPELLANT) (PLAINTIFF)
**************************************			(PETITIONER)
	VERS	<u>us</u>	
Education Department		(	(RESPONDENT) DEFENDANT)
I/We <b>KAMAL KHAN</b>			
do hereby appoint and <b>Peshawar</b> to appear, properties as my/our: Collability for his default Advocate Counsel on my withdraw and receive deposited on my/our according to the country of	olead, act, compro ounsel/Advocate in and with the au y/our cost. I/we a on my/our behal	mise, withdraw the above note ithority to enga uthorize the said f all sums and	or refer to arbitration d'matter; without any ge/appoint any other devocate to deposit,
Dated/202	<b>!0</b>		
	₩.\$-1	CLIENT	
n de la propieta de la companya de La companya de la co			