

## FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

2020

3713

Court of

Case No.

Order or other proceedings with signature of judge Date of order S.No. proceedings 3 2 1 The appeal presented today by Mr. Shahzaullah Yousafzai 04/11/2020 1-Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 0.1 - 0.3 - 2.12up there on MEMBER(J) -The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is 01.03.2021 on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021. Reader 4<sup>3</sup>

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

## APPEAL NO. \_\_\_\_/2020

## TASNEEM AKHTAR VS EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

#### **INDEX**

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	<b>PAGE</b>
1.	Memo of appeal	*********	1-3
2.	Notification	Α	÷ <b>5</b> .
3.	Pay slips	B&C	6-7
4.	Service tribunal judgment	D.	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

#### **APPELLANT**

THROUGH: 5 SHAHZULLAH YOUSAFZAI ADVÓCATE

Flat no 4, Upper Floor, Juma khan plaza near FATA secretariat, Warsak road, Peshawar 0302-8578851

#### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, Khyber Pakhtul PESHAWAR

# APPEAL NO. 13713/2020

Diary No. 1409

#### VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary E&SE Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director E&SE Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
  - RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

### R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary Education Department as secondary school teacher (BPS-17) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of his superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS- 16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by

- 4- That some employee of E&SE department approached to this august Tribunal against illegal deduction of conveyance allowance in different service appeal which were allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure......D.
- 5- That the appellant filed departmental appeal against the illegal action of deduction of conveyance allowance, but the same has not been responded by respondents within statutory period of ninety days. Copy of departmental appeal is annexed as annexure......E.
- 6- That feeling aggrieved from action and inaction of the respondents and having no other remedy the appellant filed the instant appeal on following grounds inter alia.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is governed by Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail

**\$** 

- 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and discriminatory hence not tenable in the eye of law.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

APPELLANT

Schol

Tasneem Akhtar

THROUGH: Shahzullah yousafzai & Shahzullah yousafzai & Kamran khan advocates

## GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

#### NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

#### To;

From

BETTER COPY PAGE-

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhumkhwa.

2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhunkhwa
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- S. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 9. Tro. Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

#### Subject: <u>RFVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE</u> <u>CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL</u> <u>GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19</u>

Dear Sir, ·

The Government of Khyber Pakhunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from  $1^{\alpha}$  September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)	1
<u>l.</u>	1-4	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,700/-	1
 2.	5-10	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,840/-	1.
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-	ť
4.	16-19	Rs. 5.000/-	Rs. 5,000/-	

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

TASNEEM AKHTAR Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial 00266770 District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar 00266770 Munifily Salary Statement (June-2020) Personal Information of Miss TASNEEM AKIITAR d/wA of HABIBULLAR President Number (RI2667710 CNIC: 10989140180 NFN. Date of Bush 11,10 1969 Entry 1810 Covi, Service, 01,07,1990 Length of Service: 30 Years (0) Months (0) Eksys Employment Calegory: Active Temporary Designation: SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHER A0697039 DISTRICT COVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: DA6312-Dir lower Payroll Section (0)1 GPP Section (0)1 Cash Center: GPF & C No. EDUDA007788 GPF Bulance: Interest Applied Yes 90,000 Vendor Number: -Pay Scale Type Civil 8PS: 17 Pay Stage: 18 **Pay and Allowances:** Pay scale BPS For = 3017

Wage type		Amuunt		Wuge type	Amount
ind):	Havic Pin	71,770.00	10401	House Rent Allos ance	a,413 (iii)
1210	Convey Allowance, 2005	S, CONTLED	1925	UAA-OTHER 20%(17/22)	<u>1,000.00</u>
1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	1.02510	2148	15% Adhas, Relief All-2013	1.550.00
2144	Adux Relief Allow with	E Hest Céli	2211	Adhoe Relief All 2016 10%	< 1 TV ()()
2224	Adhoc Reliet All 2017 10%	7,177,141	2217	Ailhoc Relief All 2018 10%	7,177 (h)
2265	Addas Relief All 2019 06%	3,558.00			13 (43

#### Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3117 (1	PF Sabserinan	-4,270.003	1401	Henevolem Fund	-5600-644
36619 10	contre Tax	- 1 (m/s (#))	34441	Engr Edu Forst KPK	-250.00
41014 12	lienchity & Death Comp	-960 (0)	47(4)	Professional Tax	-1_NI(1))

#### Deductions - Loans and Advances

t.uzita	tlescr	ljitlaa	Principal amount	Deduction	Halame
6818	GIPF Lixin Principal Instat		_BREEK() (A)		171,122 (0)
Deduction Poyable:	n <mark>s - Income Tax</mark> 42,26330 - Recover	et ult 11/N+2020 34.	9500 Averynest	10565 Ht - Romera	irde (Fili)
Gross Pay	y (R.s.): 112,328,00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-24,120.00	Net Pay: (R.s.): 88,	200.00
Alcount ;	ane: TASNEEM AKIITAR Number: PLS 1987-4 mb/ NATBINAL HANK C		ihp Chakdara dir 1	Shp Chakdara Dir,	
l.cares;	Opening Balance.	Availed	Harned	Halance.	
Perniance	n Address VILL SIHSAD/	MCHACKDARAJTEH A	DENZALDIK		
Cuy, tHR	LOWER	Domicile: NW - Kh	yber Paklitunkhwa	Heatung States	No Official
Temp Ad City DI		Email sunremakter		بد میں کم لز تمہو	الروز
			- 0- 0,		

RENTER FERTRETESSIONER IN ALL OF DALLER WER DER ALTER ALLER VERSLEES, DEM 2020 AS 44, 1552 AU MATERMANNEN DER IN PAR RENTER TRENTER ALTMETERMETEN (DEM D

•	Dist. Govt. KP-Provin istrict Accounts Office Dir at Munthly Salary Statement (Ji	Timbrear	C-7	
Personal Information of Mice	TANNEEM AKIITAR d'#6 o			-
Personal Number 09264770	CNR, 10989146156	NIN		
Dair of Binb. 11.10 (969	Entry and Gova Service, 01	(17,1964) Length	of Service: H	) Years 01 Months (RH Days
Employment Category: Active	Temporary			
Designation SECONDARY SC	HOOL TEACHER	80697039 DISTRICT G	OVERNMEN	T KHVBE
DDD Code: DA6312-Dir kiner				
Paytod Section: 001	GPF Sectard: 001	Cash Center:		
GPF A.C No. EDUDA007785	Interest Applied: Ves	GPF Balance;		417,41110
Vender Number, -	• •			-
Puy and Allowances:	Pay wate, BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type, Civil	BPS 17	Pay Stage, 15

. .

Wage type		Amentant	Amminit Wage type		Amount
	Hasii Pay	71.770100	1(**)	Henne Rom Alkin and	4.477(1)
1425	UAA-OTHER 208(17-22)	2.0603.663	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	3 (1945-131)
145	15% AREA Relief All 2013	( <u>NR(</u> ) (k)	2100	Albert Rebel Alben Willin	1,061,00
2211	Adhie Relief All 2016 10%	4.199(6)	2224	Addes, Relief All X017 105	7,177(0)
2247	Adhes: Relief All 2018 10%	7,177.00	1:05	Adva Rebet All 2010 05%	3,585,00

#### Deductions - General

· · ·

Wage type	Amenzent		Wage type	Amount	
3017 GPF Subscription	-4 270 EVA	1501	Benevident Fund	-866 (0)	
Ardin Jin onne Tax	-2.425 (8)	1441)	Emr. Eds. Fund KPR	-250.00	
40014 R. Benefits A. Death Comp."	-96433.003			(I) (II)	

#### Deductions - Loans and Advances

Lean	Descrip	ption	Principal amount	Deduction	Dalance
A414	6444 GPF Examplifying Instal		440.4661.00	.11,312(0)	159,988 (0)
Deductiu Payahle	m - Incume Tax 43,764-48 — Recovere	d 60.074+2(020	2,425 (8) Exempted	969 13 Kovisera	bb. Indakie
Gross Pag	y (Rs.i: 107_520,00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-21,979,00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 85.	341.00
Account	me: TASNEEM AKHTAR Number: PLS 1957-4 aily: NATIONAI, HANK OF	- PAKISTAN, 23133	i NRP CHARDARA DIR N	SHP CHAKDARA DIR,	·
Leaves:	Opening Balance.	Avariat	Lamet	,Halance:	
Prinance	n Address VILLSHISAFIA	CHACKDARA(FE)	I ADESZALDIR	- <u></u>	
City: DIR		Danade, NW -	Khyper Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status	Nu Official
Temp. A.	klasiv				
Cuy		Email, usneenul	thurse & great com		
			Ś	ITESTED	د د
			RI.	ILSIED	
				· · · · ·	1 1 - QV
Nation gene	i ristrið iku sement som up i verðiski v 194 iger sír Mal Rugive s verði som er við sjörið	sahatra sasiswa	RVICEN 2987,292413-14-18	63 d4	*

and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PKC) 1772011 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

. . . .

¢

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat VS Grout

11.11.2019

fied to be ture copy

Prakaturakhwa vice Anbural Poshawar Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service TribunaL in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement, and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01:10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance. Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract: over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record,

ANNOUNCED

#### The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

rovi To

DEPARTM	<u>ENTAL</u>	APPE	<u>AL A</u>	<u>GAINS</u>	<u> </u>	<u>IMPUC</u>	<u>NED</u>
ACTION	OF T	HE (	CONCI	ERNED	AUTH	IORITY	BY
ILLEGALL	Y AN	D ÜN	LAWF	ULLY	DEDU	CTING	THE
CONVEYA	NCE A	ALLOV	VANĆ	E DUH	RING	WINTER	8
SUMMER V	ACATI	<u>ONS</u>		· · · · ·	1	· .	

E-16

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I was the employee of your good self . Department and is serving as SST (BPS- 17) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19. have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service, appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I am also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: .01.08.2020

Your Obediently This number Tasneem Akhtar SST,GGCMS Sehsadda, Dir lower.



## VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

\_\_ OF 2020

(APPELLANT) asneam Akhtar \_(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

## **VERSUS**

## EDUCATION DEPTT:

I/We <u>Jagneen Allh tax</u> Do hereby appoint and constitute **SHAHZULLAH YOUSAFZAI, Advocate, Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated.\_\_\_\_/2020

ikho

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

CLIENT(S)

ACCEPTED SHAHZULLAH YOUSAFZAI KAMRAN KHAN **ADVOCATES**