FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

Court of 146 92 Case No.-/2020 S.No. Order or other proceedings with signature of judge Date of order proceedings 2 1 ٦ e ± The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafzai 18/11/2020 1-Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register, and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2up there on _____Y 121 MEMBER(J) Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the case is 04.03.2021 adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B. ₩£ READER

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. _____ /2020.

KHALID MEHMOOD VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

· 1

<u>INDEX</u>

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	A ·	· 4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	Ε	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

-1

Spare copies will be submitted \mathcal{N} After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

4699/2020 **APPEAL NO.**

MR. KHALID MEHMOOD PST (BPS-12) GPS BANDA SHEIKH ISMAIL DISTRICT NOWSHERA Personnel Number: 00754879

Khyber Pakhtakhwa Service Tel

Diary No. 148

VERSUS

APPELLANT

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT. 1974 AGAINST THE **IMPUGNED** ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL <u>APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY</u> DAYS.

<u>PRAYER</u>

20

i Ca

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be edto-day directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment ew strar of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

<u>R/SHEWETH</u> **ON FACTS:**

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as PST (BPS-12) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is

applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

ĩ.

E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.

F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.

- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise.any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE

KHALID MEHMOOD Khalod



From

To:

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

a - 4

NO. FD/SO(SR-10/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govil of Khyter Pachtuskova Finance Department Peshawar.

All Adamstebative Secretaries to Gove of Mixter Pakitumstwa. The Sector Member, Board of Revenue, Rilyber Pakitumstwa. The Secretary to Genericar Knyber Pakitumstwa. The Secretary to Chief Minster, Kilyber Pakitumstwa. The Secretary to Chief Minster, Kilyber Pakitumstwa. An Secretary for Chief Minster, Kilyber Pakitumstwa. All Heads of Altsched Departments in Kinyber Pakitumstwa. All District Coordination Officeredo Xinyber Pakitumstwa. All District Coordination Officeredo Xinyber Pakitumstwa. All District Coordination Officeredo Xinyber Pakitumstwa. All Pakitum Coordination Officeredo Xinyber Pakitumstwa. All Pakitum Pakitum Coord. Peshawa: The Registrar Pashawar Hyn Coord. Peshawa: The Chairman, Secure Thomas Kinyber Pakitumstwa.

200.00

Dear SH

.

۰C.,

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT 8P5 1-19

The Government of Khyber Pakhturähwe has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Gover of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1^e September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in SPS-15 to BPS-15 will remain urchanced.

S.N	Ó BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM) REVISED RATE (PM)
· . <u>- 1</u>	1-4	Rs.1.700/-
2	5-10	Rs.1,500/- Rs.1,640/-
	11-15	R\$.2,000/
- -	16-19	Rs.5,000/- Rs.5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per manth shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 effects who have not been sanctioned efficial vehicles.

Yours Fashiully,

Sahibzada Sacad Ahmadi Secretary Finance

Endst: NO. FDISOKSR-IT/8-52/2012

12012 Dated Paymwar the 20" Deventher, 2013

- A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-
 - Accountral General Kayae Pakhteriana, Pesinakar Secretaries is Galerinaties of Punjab, Soch & Sabatasan, Feransis, Department
 - Au Aurepannus / Start Auronaurous Bades in Winder Pakitanithag

 $2\bar{z}$ (INTIAZ AYUB) incalification Secondary (Race

ATTESPAD

ŴÌ

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (April-2016)



Personal Information of Mr KHALID MEHMOOD d/w/s of FAZAL MEHMOOD

Personn Number: 00754879
Date of Birth: 01.05.1979

CNIC: 1720172890061 Entry into Govt. Service: 01.09.2015 NTN:

Length of Service: 00 Years 08 Months 001 Days

Employment	Category: A	ctive Ten	iporary	
Designation:	PRIMARY S	CHOOL 1	ſEACHER	

80003682-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

0.00

BPS: 12

, wrig- "

DDO Code: NR6010-DY:	DIST	T OFFICER (M) NSR	
Payroll Section: 001	,	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:
GPF A/C No:		Interest Applied: No	GPF Balance: 0
Vendor Number: -			
ay and Allowances:		Pay scale: BPS For - 2015	Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 0

	• Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	9,055.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	1,306.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300 Medical Allowance	1,500.00
1973	Adhoc Allowance 2011@ 50%	2,177.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,050.00
2174	Adhoc Relief Allow-2014	700.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	905.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount Wage type		Wage type	Amount
3501	Benevolent Fund	-180.00	3511	Addl Group Insurance	-13.00
3604	Group Insurance	-115.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-100.00
4200	Professional Tax	-100.00			0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan		Description	Principa	al amount 、	Deduction	Balance
Deductions - Payable:	Income Tax 0.00	Recovered till April-2016:	0.00	Exempted: 0.0)0 Recover	able: 0.00
Gross Pay (I	Rs.): 19,549	.00 Deductions: (Rs.):	-508.00	Net	Pay: (Rs.): 19,04	1.00

Payee Name: KHALID MEHMOOD

Account Number: 08537100122503

Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 220853 AKBARPURA, NOWSHERA. AKBARPURA, NOWSHERA., NOWSHERA

Leaves: Opening Balance: Availed: Earned: Balance:

Permanent Address:	· ·	
City: NOWSHERA	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		
City:	Email: khalidrashid6677@gmail.com	

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/01.05.2016/17:25:54/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (July-2016)





Personal Information of Mr KHALID MEHMOOD d/w/s of FAZAL MEHMOOD

Personnel Number: 00754879 CN Date of Birth: 01.05.1979 En

CNIC: 1720172890061 Entry into Govt. Service: 01.09.2015 NTN:

Length of Service: 00 Years 11 Months 001 Days

KHYBE

Pay Stage: 0

WOUED

Employment Category: Active		80003682-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT
Designation: PRIMARY SCHO	OOL TEACHER	80003682-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT
DDO Code: NR6010-DY: DIS Payroll Section: 001 GPF A/C No:	TT OFFICER (M) NSR GPF Section: 001 Interest Applied: No	Cash Center: GPF Balance: 0.00
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2016	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 12

	Amount	Wage type	Amount
Wage type		1000 House Rent Allowance	1.307.00
0001 Basic Pay		1973 Adhoc Allowance 2011@ 50%	2,178.00
1300 Medical Allowance	1,5	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	226.00
2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1.114.00		0.00
2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,114.00		

Deductions - General

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	<u>Amount</u>
3501 Benevolent Fund	-180.00	3511 Addl Group Insurance	-13.00
3604 Group Insurance	-115.00	3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-100.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

		Deduction	Balance
Loan Description	Principal amount	Deduction	

Deductions - Income TaxPayable:0.00Recovered till July-2016:0.00Exempted:0.00Recoverable:0.00

Gross Pay (Rs.): 17,815.00 Deductions: (Rs.): -408.00 Net Pay: (Rs.): 17,407.00

Payee Name: KHALID MEHMOOD

Account Number: 08537100122503

/ looodile / laine		- NEIWNEEKA. INU WOL	ILINA
Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 220853 AKE	ARPURA, NUWSHERA. ANDAM UNA	, no nomina i, no mai	
Bank Details: HABIB BANK Elimited, 220000 The	,	, ,	-

				Delencer	
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Permanent Address: City: NOWSHERA	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address: City:	Email: khalidrashid6677@gmail.com	

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/04.08.2016/05:46:42/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees

* Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

D-7

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as **PST (BPS-12)** quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 20.07.2020

Your Obediently

KHALID MEHMOO

TUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKH

PESHAWAR

4/10/201

18:05-4

APPEL

EXA

Khy

ATTESTED

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND ACTION OF THE UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER SUMMER 84 APPELLANT OF THE VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN тне DEPARTMENTAL STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Flecte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which

this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant. 2-4/10/10

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

125

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and essecondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees 11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marbad Hayat vs Govt

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter Vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

2-2

140.00

Chairman

NIESTEM

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings:

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

1.42

File be consigned to the regord. AIZESZED

E Kh

POSILGWAR

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

Certified

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

KHALID MEHMOOD

(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

<u>VERSUS</u>

Education Department

(RESPONDENT)

__(DEFENDANT)

I/We KHALID MEHMOOD _______ do hereby appoint and constitute **MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI, Advocate, Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. _____ /2020

Khalic

ACCEPTED

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE