Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

163

Case No.-_____821____2021_21

Order or other proceedings with signature of judge S.No. Date of order proceedings 3 1 2 The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari 29/01/2021 ¹ 1-Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2- 1 08-02-21 up there on 01 - 03 - 21

01.03.2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



MEMBER(J)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. _____ /2021.

ZAIR ULLAH KHAN

EDUCATION DEPTT:

<u>INDEX</u>

VS

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	Α	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

<u>11</u>

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

<u>I LJIIAWAN</u>
10941

APPEAL NO. <u>| | 人</u> /2021

MR. ZAIR ULLAH KHAN, **SET (BPS-16)** GHS, KANDI TAZA DIN DISTRICT NOWSHERA

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

Diary No. 2060 Dated

......APPELLANT

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

6. The District Education Officer, Male, Nowshera.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT. **1974 AGAINST** THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE <u>RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND</u> UNLAWFULLY **DEDUCTING** T<u>HE</u> **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

<u>PRAYER</u>

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been we deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

<u>R/SHEWETH</u> <u>ON_FACTS:</u>

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **SET (BPS-16)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019..... E.
- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

2

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the respondents to act of the deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

>APPELLANT. ز البر السُّرة أن ZAIR ULLAH KHAN

THROUGH:

shut SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI

ADVOCATE PESHAWAR

把日

3



OVERNMINET OF KHYEGER PAKHTUNKHWA BNANCE CORARTMENT (RECULATION WING)

NO. FD/30(8R-II)/8-62/2012 Onted Pushewar the: 20-12-2012

Ŷ

From

		The Sectionary to Gove, of Knyber Paintunkhwa, Finance Department, Peatoreman
• • * *	1	All Armanistrative Seamanise to Gover of Palepoor Palebartchwa
	2	The soniar Member, Stand of Revenue, Kingber Pakhtuniowe
	5	The secretary to Gondation Khyber Paidhankinen
	4	The Becretery to Chuck Minesler, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa,
	6	The Secretary, Provincial Aprilminity, Kingber Pakistunkhwa
	6.	All Heads of Attacted Departments in Knyther Pakingindtwa.
	7	Chatriol Coordination Officies in Kityber Pakhlunkings
	a .	Political Agence / District & Secolana Judges in Khyter Pakteunidme
•	a. C	The Registrant Transver Figh Coza, Peshawar
		The Charmer - rubic Sennos C: Commission, Khyber Politsunking.
		The Charge , Services Tribuilly Khyper Pakithan Junes.
Sut/	- 160	RECORD IN THE RATE OF CONVENINCE ALLOWANCE FO

SI OR THE CIVIL SHELOWEES OF THE KNYSER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT IPS 1-19

Door Bit.

The Covernment of Knyber Polybunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / Livise the rate of Lonveyance Alternance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Gove: of Knyber Palitionkhwa (working in BPS-1 to EPS-15) wielf from 1st September, 2012 at the following subes. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in GPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

BPS	EXISTING RATE (PH)	REVISED RATE (PH)
1. 1-4	Rs.1.500/-	Rs.1,700/-
2. 5-10	Rs.1,500/•	Rs.1,840/-
3. 11-1	Rs.2,000/-	R4.7.720/-
4. 15-19	R: 5,000/-	Rs.5,000/-

Companies Allowance at the above rates per month shall be eximatible to

Yours Faithlully, (Sahibzada Seeed Ahmad)

Secretary Finance

*Enep: _____ J: FD/SONGR-11/72-52/1013

Datest Peskewar the 20th December, 2017

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

Accountant Ceneral Knyber Politicstane, Pestawar.
 Secretation to Government of Punjab, Sindh & Belochstan. Finance Department
 All Autonomous J Sami Autonomous Booles. In Knyber Paliticstane

(INTIAT AYUB) Additional Scientiane (Ren/1

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019)



В

5

Personal Information of Mr ZA	AIR ULAH KHAN d/w/s of		
Personnel Number: 00135952	CNIC: 99991531551	NTN:	
Date of Birth: 10.40.1967	Entry into Govt. Service: 12.09.1987	Length of Service: 31 Yes	ars 10 Months 021 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

ļ

Designation: SENIOR ENGL	SH TEACHER	80519567-DISTRICT GOVERNM	ENT KHYBE
DDO Code: NR6253-Govt. H	igh School Kandi Tazadin Nowsh	era	
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center: 18	
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	503,892.00
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 20

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	49,310.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00	
1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,095.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,140.00	
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	763.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,892.00	
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	4,931.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	4,931.00	
2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	4,931.00			0.00	

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription - Rs3340	-3,340.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-736.00	3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,089.00	5011 Adj Conveyance Allowance	-2,500.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	ption	Principal amount	Deduction	B alance
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal		217,000.00 -6,0		78,540.00
Deduction Payable:	is - Income Tax 14,706.95 Recover	ed till July-2019: 73	36.00 Exempted	5882.10 Recover	able: 8,088.85
Gross Pay	y (Rs.): 74,720.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-14,635.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 60,	,085.00
Account 1	me: ZAIR ULAH KHAN Number: 4321193218 ails: NATIONAL BANK C	F ÞAKISTAN, 230572 F	PABBI PABBI Nowshera	, Nowshera	
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
City: NO	nt Address: EDUCATION S WSHERA	DEO (M) NOWSHERA Domicile: NW - Kh		Housing Statu	s: No Official
Temp. Ad City:	Idress;	Èmail:	HEAD MASTER HEAD MASTER GHS Kandi Taza Nowshera	Din	
			GHS Nowshere		HEAL

(50486881/29.07.2019/10:31:33) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)



Personal Information of Mr ZAIR ULAH KHAN d/w/s of

Personnel Number: 00135952CNIC: 99991531551NTN:Date of Birth: 10.80.1967Entry into Govt. Service: 12.09.1987Length of Service: 32 Years 00 Months 020 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: SENIOR ENGLE	Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER 80519567-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT K			
DDO Code: NR6253-Govt. Hi	gh School Kandi Tazadin Nowsh	era		
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center: 18		
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	586,190.00	
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 20	

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	49,310.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,095.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,140.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	763.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,892.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	4,931.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	4,931.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	4,931.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amóunt		Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-886.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	iption	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance	
6505	GPI ⁷ Loan Principal Instal		217,000.00	-6,020.00	66,500.00	
Deduction Payable:	as - Income Tax 17,206.95 Recover	ed till September-2019:	2,358.00 Exempted	: 6881.97 Recovera	ble: 7,966.98	
Gross Pay	y (Rs.): 79,720.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-11,846.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 67,8	374.0 0	
Account l	me: ZAIR ULAH KHAN Number: 4321193218 ails: NATIONAL BANK (DF PAK IST ÂN, 230572 PA	ABBI PABBI Nowsher	a, Nowshera		
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:		
Permaner	nt Address: EDUCATION S	SDEO (M) NOWSHERA	• 			
City: NOWSHERA		Domicile: NW - Khy	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa		Housing Status: No Official	
Temp. Ac	idress:					
City:			AD MASTER			
			Kandi Taza Din Nowshera	\sim	K IN	

(50486881/27.09.2019/12:02:57) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted



Scanned with CamScanner

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

<u>Subject:</u>

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Date 23/10/20

62

Your Obediently

زايرالله خار ZAIR ULLAH KHAN

TUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL BEFORE THE KHYBER

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.

VERSUS

Fried APPELLAN

EXARCHIP

Khybe

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 - 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 - 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 -RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRUBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY THE ACTION OF UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE SUMMER DURING WINTER 8. APPELLANT THE OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN THE ON APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE DEPARTMENTAL STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER.

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Theate-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which

this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant. 7-11-101/12-5

R/SHEWETH:

ON FACTS:

ΰŲ

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt

11111.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No: 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

i. *N*B

File be consigned to the rewrd.

K)-

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

ertije^{n e}

poshawa(



and retu

- - -

Chairmán

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

_____OF 2021
(APPELLANT)
ZAIR ULLAH KHAN______(PLAINTIFF)
(PETITIONER)
VERSUS
(RESPONDENT)
Education Department _____(DEFENDANT)

|. r.

<u>|</u>

.

CEPTED **SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR**

[1]

15