Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

| | | | | N 50 33 | | |
|-------|-----|---|-----|---------|------|-----|
| | . 1 | 0 | 1 | | ٠. | 9 . |
| se No | | |) 4 | . / | 2021 | 1 |

| | Case No | /2021 |
|------------------|---------------------------|--|
| S.No. | Date of order proceedings | Order or other proceedings with signature of judge |
| 1 | 2 | 43 |
| · | | |
| 1- | 29/01/2021 | The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari |
| , ₁ , | | Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned |
| | | Member for proper order please. |
| | | |
| | | REGISTRAR, |
| | | This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put |
| | 08-02-21 | |
| | | up there on 01-03-21 |
| ** * . | | |
| 10 | | $\langle a \rangle$ |
| - , | | MEMBER(J) |
| 1. | | |
| | | |
| Λ1 | 02.2021 | The leaves of Morehov Judicial Mr. Muhamanad Janaal Kha |
| UI. | 03.2021 | The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Kha |
| | on | leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for |
| ,· , | san | ne before S.B on 26.07.2021. |
| | | \$ |
| | | Reader |
| | | |
| , | | ña. |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| : | | |
| | | |
| ٠. | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| · - | l l | |
| | | |
| | - | |
| | | |
| | , | |
| • | 1 | |

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

| APPEAL NO /202 |
|----------------|
|----------------|

FARZAND ALI

VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

| S.NO. | DOCUMENTS | ANNEXURE | PAGE |
|-------|---------------------------|----------|------|
| 1. | Memo of appeal | | 1-3 |
| 2. | Notification | A | 4 |
| 3. | Pay Slips | B&C | 5-6 |
| 4. | Departmental Appeal | D | 7 |
| 5. | Service Tribunal judgment | E | 8-9 |
| 6. | Vakalat nama | | 10 |

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR

Note:

Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

APPEAL NO. 1704 /2021

Khyber Palchtukhwa Service Tribunal

MR. FARZAND ALI, **DM (BPS-15)** GMS, KHESHGI PAYAN DISTRICT NOWSHERA

...........

APPELLANT

Diary No. 2088

Dated 29/1/2021

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 6. The District Education Officer, (Male), Nowshera.

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **DM** (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D-That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
 - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT

قرررعا**ي** FARZAND ALI

THROUGH:

SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR



FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

MO. FD/SO/SR-11/18-52/2012 Diffed Feshawar the: 20-12-2012. 4

From

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department.

Penhawar.

To:

All Administrative Sections to Sovic of Klayber Pakintunkhwa.

I The Service Probar, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhaya

The Secret to Governor Syber Pakhunka

The Secretary to Chief Minester, Khyber Pakintursidawa.

5 The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakirlunkhwa

6 All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyber Pakhunkhwa.

7 At District Coordination Officers in Khyper Pakhtunkhum.

6. At Political Agents / District & Sessions Judges in Kryber Pakistrikhwa

7. The Registrar, Postinium High Court Peshawar.

10. The Chairman, Public Service Compasson, Khyber Pashtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Kaysor Pukhturanwa.

Sphiest

TISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of Knyour Pakhtunkhwa (working in 895-1 to 895-15) w.e.f. from 1° September, 2012 at the conveyance allowance for employees in 895-16 to 895-19 will remain uncongreed.

| S.NO BPS | EXISTING PATE (PM) | REVISED RATE (PH) |
|------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
| 1, 1-4 | Rs 1.500/- | Rs.1,700/- |
| 2. 5-10 | Rs.1,500/- | Rs.1,840/- |
| 3. 11- 15 | Rs.2,000/ | Rs.2,720/- |
| 15-19 | Rs.5,000/- | Rs.5,000/4 |

2 Conveyar: Allowance of the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Saood Ahmad) Secretary Finance

SR-IMS-SPECIES Dated Perhavior the 20th Precember, 2017

Endate NO. FOR KASH-INM-SHOAL

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Accountant General Kinyoer Pakittanshwa, Patulawar.

2 Secretaries to Constructed of Punjob, Scale & Solochesten Ference Department.

I All Aurenomous / Semi Auronamous Becies a Kingos Pakhtunkhwa

STIP IN

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)





Personal Information of Mr FARZAND ALI d/w/s of

Personnel Number: 00138784

Date of Birth: 10.10.1970

CNIC: 99994025541

Entry into Govt. Service: 11.11.1990

NTN:

Length of Service: 28 Years 10 Months 021 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: DRAWING MASTER

80003789-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code, NR6079-D O.SECONDARY (M) NSR

GPU A C No: FDU NSR/000427 Interest Applied: Yes

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 15

GPF Balance:

317,312.00

Nonder Number -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 22

| Wage type | Amount | Wage type | Amount |
|-----------------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|----------|
| cour! Basic Pay | 45,380.00 | 1000 House Rent Allowance | 2,349.00 |
| -210 Convey Allowance 2005 | 2,856.00 | 1300 Medical Allowance | 1,500.00 |
| , 118 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013 | 1,055.00 | 2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10% | 705.00 |
| 2211. Adhoc Relief All 2016 10% | 3,591.00 | 2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10% | 4,538.00 |
| 2247 Adhoc Refief All 2018 10% | 4,538.00 | 2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10% | 4,538.00 |

Deductions - General

| <u> </u> | Wage type | Amount | | Wage type | | Amount |
|----------|---------------------------|-----------|------|-------------------|---|---------|
| 3015 | GPF Subscription | -2,890.00 | 3501 | Benevolent Fund | | -600.00 |
| 37019 | Income Tax | -628.00 | 3990 | Emp.Edu. Fund KPK | | -125.00 |
| 1001 | R. Benefits & Death Comp. | -600,00 | | | • | 0.00 |

Deductions - Loans and Advances

| Loan Description | Principal amount | Deduction | Balance |
|---------------------------------|------------------|-----------|----------|
| (2505 UPL Loan Principal Instal | 80,000.00 | -5,000.00 | 5,000.00 |

Deductions - Income Tax

Pavable:

12,272,95

Recovered till SEP-2019:

1,714.00.

Exempted: 4908.93

Recoverable:

5,650.02

Gross Pay (Rs.):

71,050.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-9,843.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

61,207.00

Pavec Name: FARZAND ALI

Account Number: 0010059147370013

Bank Details: ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250286 CAVALRY ROAD CAVALRY ROAD,

Leavest

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

imment Address SDFO MINSR

G. NOWSHERA

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

are Address

Email: farzandali4179@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/27.09.2019/16:32:42/v1.1) All amounts are in Pak Rupees

From & omissions excepted

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Nowshera** Monthly Salary Statement (August-2019)



Personal Information of Mr FARZAND ALI d/w/s of

Personnel Number: 00138784

Date of Birth: 10.10,1970

CNIC: 99994025541

Entry into Govt. Service: 11.11.1990

NTN: Length of Service: 28 Years 09 Months 022 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: DRAWING MASTER

80003789-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: NR6079-D.O.SECONDARY (M) NSR

Payroll Section, 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 15

309,422.00

GPF A C Nov LDU NSR 000427 Interest Applied: Yes

Vandor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil **BPS: 15**

GPF Balance:

Pay Stage: 22

| Wage type | Amount | Wage type | Amount |
|--------------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|----------|
| 0001 Basic Pay | 45,380.00 | 1000 House Rent Allowance | 2,349.00 |
| 1300 Medical Allowance | 1,500.00 | 2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013 | 1,055.00 |
| 199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10% | 705.00 | 2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10% | 3,591.00 |
| 2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10% | 4,538.00 | 2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10% | 4,538.00 |
| 2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10% | 4,538.00 | | 0.00 |

Deductions - General

| | Wage type | Amount | | Wage type | Amount |
|-------|---------------------------|-----------|---------|-------------------|---------|
| 3015 | GPF Subscription | -2,890.00 | 3501 | Benevolent Fund | -600.00 |
| Sais | Income Lax | 543.00 | 3990 | Emp.Edu. Fund KPK | -125.00 |
| 19004 | R. Renefits & Death Comp. | -1.052.00 | <u></u> | , | 0.00 |

Deductions - Loans and Advances

| 1 | <u> </u> | | | |
|-------|---------------------------|------------------|-----------|-----------|
| 1.oan | Description | Principal amount | Deduction | Balance |
| 6505 | GPF Loan Principal Instal | 80,000.00 | -5,000.00 | 10.000.00 |

Deductions - Income Tax

Pavable:

10,844.95

Recovered till AUG-2019:

1,086.00

Exempted: 4337.15

Recoverable:

5,421.80

Gross Pay (Rs.);

68,194.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-10,210.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

57,984.00

Payee Name: FARZAND ALI

Account Number: 0010059147370013

Bank Details, ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250286 CAVALRY ROAD CAVALRY ROAD,

Leavest

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Balance:

Perpanent Address; SDFO M NSR

City NOWSHERA

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp Address:

Email: farzandali4179@gmail.com

Sestem generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/27.08.2019/16:18:04/v1.1)

* 311 imounts are in Pak Rupees * 1 (1998) & omissions excepted

To

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as DM (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Date 23/10/20

Your Obediently

بحرز زر ی ای FARZAND ALI

STIESTICO.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERV PESHAWAR /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar...

VERSUS

1-The Government of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Korber Pakhtun Ciwa, Peshawa

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

Khybe: Fif

APPECT JONER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY OF UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

στα**ΥΈ<u>R:</u> .**

That or acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fredto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in gistrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

9.3. 1.50/1

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and essecond ary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14:07:2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Margad Hayat vs Go.

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement, and the deduction already. made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01:10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and. more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary", but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formicable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a

ান্ত reasonable time:

File be consigned to the record.

ANYCOUNCE

Chairman

CO

Certified !

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

| · | • • | |
|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------------------------|
| | ; ?• | OF 2021 |
| • | ;÷ | |
| | r G | |
| | • | (APPELLANT) |
| | | |
| • | . [| 50 C |
| FARZAND ALI | | (PLAINTIFF) |
| | .j | (PETITIONER) |
| | 7 | i i |
| · | VERSUS | |
| | VERSOS | |
| • | | (RESPONDENT) |
| Education Department | | (DEFENDANT) |
| | • | |
| | | |
| I/We FARZAND ALI | · · | do hereby |
| | | UKHARI, Advocate, Peshawar to |
| | | refer to arbitration for me/us as |
| | ~ | natter, without any liability for his |
| • | | nt any other Advocate Counsel on |
| • • | , | o deposit, withdraw and receive on |
| • • | nounts payable or o | deposited on my/our account in the |
| above noted matter. | • | |
| · | · . | |
| | • | (141),0 |
| | 2 | CLIENT |

SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR