Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of		,	
	. 5160		
a No -	1560	/2020	

S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
- 1	2	3
1-	07/12/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafza Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learner
,		Member for proper order please.
	-	REGISTRAR
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be purely up there on $\frac{0.4-0.3-2.1}{0.0000000000000000000000000000000000$
		MEMBER(J)
·		
	•	
(4.03.2021	Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the
		case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	•	READER

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO.	· .	/2020 .
------------	-----	----------------

INAYAT MUIHAMMAD VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	Α .	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

W

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note:

Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted WAfter submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL **PESHAWAR**

APPEAL NO. 15460 /2020

MR. INAYAT MUIHAMMAD PSHT (BPS-15) GPS ALI GARH AKORA KHATTAK NOWSHERA Personnel Number: 00138980

Khyber Pakhtukhwa

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH

That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education. Department as PSHT (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.

2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- the civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
 - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

INAYAT MUIHAMMAI

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YÖUSAFZAI ADVOCATE





GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II):8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

From

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyter Pashtunityes, Finance Department, Pethawar,

To

All Administrative Septembers to Gove of Kingber Pakhtunghwa.
The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Krigher Pakhtunghwa.

The Secretary to Governor Knyber Pakhtankewa
The Secretary to Chief Mineser, Knyber Pakhtankewa
The Secretary to Chief Mineser, Knyber Pakhtankewa
The Secretary, Frankhtale Ascemby, Knyber Pakhtankewa

The Secretary, Frankhtale Ascemby, Knyber Pakhtankewa

All Heads of Altached Departments in Knyher Pakhturkhara All District Coordination Officerate Shyber Pakhturkhara

All Political Agents / Doublet & Semicos Judges in Rhyber Parlises November

The Registrat Pashawar Hart Court. Postument

The Cherman Rubic Service Corpresson, Shyber Pakhtunkinka.

The Chairman, Serves Tabunal Keyos Rakhlunahiya

Safriest

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear 5F

The Government of Khyber Pakhturahwa has been pleased to enhance of truise but rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Province Ovil Servants, Governor Navber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to BPS-19 will remain. Use hanged.

S.NO BP5	EXISTING RATE (PM) REVISED RATE (PM)
1-4	Rs.1,500/- Rs.1,700/-
<u>-</u> 2-10	95.1,500/- Rs.1,640/-
3 11-15	Ps.2,000/- Rs.2,720/-
<u> 4. 16-19 </u>	Rs.5,000/- Rs.5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the adove rates per manth shall be admissible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned dilicial vehicles.

Yours Fashfully

(Sahibzada Sacod Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endat: 80, FD/SO/SR-11/8-52/2012

Dated Pagiawar the 20th December, 2017

A Copy is forwarded for information to the

1. Accountant General Pergoet Pakitte strike Pestinder

हैं देहराधादान्तरं 10 Guyernarætt वा Punjab, किन्यों के दिन्न हेर्ना व्यक्ति किन्ना प्रकृति December की

As Algerandus / Seed Authoropous Socies in Grove Paktitankinas

(BUYA SAITM)
on 91 section of the condition of the condit

ATTESTAD

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Nowshera**

Monthly Salary Statement (May-2019) Personal Information of Mr INAYAT MUHAMMAD d/w/s of TILA MUHAMMAD N 1 (-1720)

Personnel Number: 00138980

CNIC: 1720116573555

NTN: 03339030722

Date of Birth: 10.08.1967

Entry into Govt. Service: 26.04.1992

Length of Service: 27 Years 01 Months 007 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: PRIMARY SCHOOL HEAD TEACH

80653750-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: NR6337-District Nowshera

Payroll Section: 001

GPF A/C No: EDUNS000838

GPF Section: 001

Interest Applied: Yes

Cash Center: 28

306,584.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

GPF Balance:

BPS: 15

Pay Stage: 17

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	38,730.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	857.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	575.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,031.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,873.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	. 3,873.00			0.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3015	GPF Subscription - Rs2890	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3609	Income Tax	-50.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125,00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,052.00			0,00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *			
Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal	280,000,00	-7.778.00	155 552 00

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable:

1,000.00

Recovered till MAY-2019:

550.00

Exempted: 400.00

Recoverable:

50.00

Gross Pay (Rs.):

57,644.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-12,495.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

45,149.00

Payee Name: INAYAT MUHAMMAD Account Number: 0010034504320012

Bank Details: ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250447 Akora Khattak,

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: SDEO M NOWSHERA

City: NOWSHERA

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email: kakyzai37@gmail.com

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial

District Accounts Office Nowshera

Monthly Salary Statement (August-2018) N-1 (=1770)

1657355-5

Personal Information of Mr INAYAT MUHAMMAD d/w/s of TILA MUHAMMAD 0333 9030722

Personnel Number: 00138980

GPF A/C No: EDUNS000838

CNIC: 1720116573555

NTN:

Date of Birth: 10.08.1967

Entry into Govt. Service: 26.04.1992

Length of Service: 26 Years 04 Months 007 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: PRIMARY SCHOOL HEAD TEACH

80653750-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: NR6337-District Nowshera-

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Interest Applied: Yes

Cash Center: 28

GPF Balance:

210,572.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 15

Pay Stage: 16

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	37,400.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	857.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	575.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,031.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,740.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,740.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3015	GPF Subscription - Rs2890	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3609	Income Tax	-50.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,052.00	5011	Adj Conveyance Allowance	-8,378.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal	280,000.00	-7,778.00	225,554.00

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable:

1,000.00

Recovered till August-2018:

100.00

Exempted: 400.00

Recoverable:

500.00

Gross Pay (Rs.):

53,192.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-20.873.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

32 319 00

Payce Name: INAYAT MUHAMMAD

Account Number: 0010034504320012

Bank Details: ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250447 Akora Khattak,

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: SDEO M NOWSHERA

City: NOWSHERA

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address: City:

Email: kakyzai37@gmail.com

M-SED

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER &

SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as PSHT (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible. under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance." allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 06.08.2020

Your Obe<u>di</u>ently

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Sorviso Tribunal

24/10/

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

APPELLANT

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in

Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Removed to many

Affect No. 1452/2019 Marsad Hayat is Gost

11.11,2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already: made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" - but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Henourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

AI ZESTED

Peshawas.

Cardinal

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Chairmán

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL. PESHAWAR

		OF 2020	
		(APPELLANT)	
INAYAT MUIHAMMAD		(PLAINTIFF)	
	-	(PETITIONER)	
	<u>VERSUS</u>		
		(RESPONDENT)	•
Education Department		(DEFENDANT)	٠,
	e Grand Grand Gr Grand Grand Gr		
I/We INAYAT MUIHAMMAD and constitute MUNFAT ALI YO act, compromise, withdraw of Counsel/Advocate in the above and with the authority to engage cost. I/we authorize the said Advobehalf all sums and amounts pay noted matter.	or refer to arbitra noted matter, witho e/appoint any other vocate to deposit, wit	tion for me/us as my/out any liability for his defa Advocate Counsel on my/outhdraw and receive on my/o	ead, our ault our
Dated/2020			
	, (T Mee CLIENT	,
		ACCEPTED	
	. <u>M</u>	<u>ÚNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI</u>	-

ADVOCATE