Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of /2020 Case No.-S.No. Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings 3 1 2 The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafzai 1-07/12/2020 Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGIS This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2up there on 04 - 03 - 21MEMBER() 04.03.2021 Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B. READER

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. _____ /2020.

NIMAT BAHA VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

G

<u>INDEX</u>

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	Α	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE

N

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted \mathcal{M} After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. /2020

Diary No. 16174 Dated 7/2/2/2020

MST. NIMAT BAHA, SET (BPS-16) GGHS NSR KALAN NOWSHERA Personnel Number: 00140593

VERSUS

APPELLANT

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT. 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.

2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the

.

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019..... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

<u>)</u>-

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT NIMAT BAHA THROUGH: **MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI** ADVOCATE



From

Τo.

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT REGULATION WING

NO. FD/SC/SR-10/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govt, of Khyber Pathtucktwa Pinanca Department, Penhavear.

All Administrative Secretaries to Gove of Minter Pakinternitiwa. The Schlor Member, Board of Revenue, Winder Pakhtundhea The Secretary to Governey Knybel Pakitications The Secretary to Chief Minster, Knyber Pakiturkhing, The Secretary, Francial Arready, Knyber Pakalunkhan All Heads of Altaches Departurents in Knyber Pakhturktava All District Coordination Officentia Khyser Pakittankings: AE Political Agents / District & Sections Judges in Khyber Pakilaurkhwa The Registrer, Peshawar Hyn Cost, Peshawar The Charman, Public Service Contracton, Shyber Pokhunitiwa The Chairman, Servers Tabanak Kayber Bakhtunahiya

Sabject.

.

c,

-

. .

÷, 2

> REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BP5 1-19

Deal Site

The Government of Shyber Pakhterathyra has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Gove of Mayber Petchtunkhive (working in EPS-1 to EPS-15) w.e.f from) - September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in SFS+15 to BAS+15

S.NO BPS	EXISTING RATE (PH)	REVISED RATE (PM)
<u> </u>	<u> </u>	Rs.1.700/-
· <u></u> 5-10	Ps.1,500/-	Rs 1 8401-
3 11-15	Ps.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
<u> </u>	<u>Ps, 5, 000/-</u>	R\$,5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the adove rates per manth shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sansformed alficial vehicles.

Yours Faithfully

Sahibzada Saead Alimadi Secretary Finance

Fridst: NO. FD/SO/SR-IT/8-52/2012

Dated Fagnewar the 20th Decompose, 2013 A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

Associations General Randoer Politications, Pestories,

Secretaries to Commended of Punjab, Sendh & Saboration Fatarise Decenteries All Autophonious / Steri Autonemous Sectors in Payber Paktterikings

(INITIAZ AYUB) Additional Secondary (Re-

ATTESPAD

¶/]

GGHS	School	NSR	Kalan	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				- 48



Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Nowshera** Monthly Salary Statement (May-2019)

Entry into Govt. Service: 08.03.1993

Personal Information of Mrs NIMAT BAHA d/w/s of RAJA KHAN

Personnel Number: 00140593 Date of Birth: 10.10.1973

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

DDO Code: NR6095-G.G.H.S NSR KALAN

Payroll Section: 001 GPF A/C No: EDUNR02441

GPF Section: 001 Intérest Applied: Yes

CNIC: 99994184672

80003747-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

BPS: 16

NTN:

Length of Service: 26 Years 02 Months 025 Days

Cash Center:

GPF Balance:

259,393.00

Vendor Number: - . Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 23

5	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	53,870.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,081.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,180.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	789.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	4,276.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	5,387.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	5,387.00		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	0.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount	
. 3016	GPF Subscription - Rs3340	-3,340.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00	
3609	Income Tax	-100.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00	
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,089.00			0.00	

Deductions - Loans and Advances						
Loan	Description		Principal amount	Principal amount Deduction		
	- Income Tax					
Payable:	2,000.00 F	Recovered till May-2019: 1	,100.00 Exempted	: 800.00 Reco	verable: 100.00	
Gross Pay ((Rs.): 80,697	.00 Deductions: (Rs.):	-5,479.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	75,218.00	
Account N	e: NIMAT BAHA umber: 5443-7 ls: NATIONAL B	ANK OF PAKISTAN, 230382	NOWSHERA CANTT N	OWSHERA CANTI	,	
Leaves:	Opening Bala	nce: Availed:	Earned:	Balance:		
Permanent	Address: NSR				• • •	
City: NOWSHERA		Domicile: NW - H	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Housing		tatus: No Official	
Temp. Add	iress:					
City:		Email:				

ATTESTED

(50486881/28.05.2019/14:18:53) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

	M		nts Office Now	shera	HS School NS	R (col	
Personal Informati	on of Mrs N	IMAT BAHA d	l/w/s of RAJA I	CHAN			
Personnel Number:	00140593	CNIC: 999941	184672		NTN:	$C \in$	>
Date of Birth: 10.10	.1973	Entry into Go	vt. Service: 08.0)3.1993	Length of Service: 2	26 Years 05 N	10nths 025 Days
Employment Categ Designation: SENIO DDO Code: NR609	OR ENGLISH	I TEACHER		800037	47-DISTRICT GOVERNME	NT KHYBE	
Payroll Section: 00 GPF A/C No: EDU Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowance	NR02441	GPF Section: (Interest Applie Pay scale: BP	d: Yes	Cash C Pay S	enter: GPF Balance: cale Type: Civil BPS: 16	320,623.00 Pav St	tage: 23
v	Vage type		Amount		Wage type		Amount
0001 Basic Pay	ruge type		53,870.00	1000	House Rent Allowance		2,727.00
1947 Medical Allo	w 15% (16-2	2)	2,081.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013		1,180.00
2199 Adhoc Relie		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	789.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%		4,276.00
2224 Adhoc Relie	f <u>All 201</u> 7 10	%	5,387.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%		5,387.00
2264 Adhoc Relie	<u>f All 2019 10</u>	%	5,387.00				0.00
Deductions - Gener	al				١		
v v	Vage type		Amount		Wage type		Amount
3016 GPF Subscri	ption		-3,340.00	3501	Benevolent Fund		-800.00
3609 Income Tax	e	<u> </u>	-927.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK		-150.00
4004 R. Benefits &	& Death Com	<u>p:</u>	-1,089.00		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Desc	ription	tion Principal amount		i Balance
Deductions Payable:	- Income Tax 18,525.35 Recove	ered till August-2019:	1,854.00 Exempt	ed: 7409.35 Re	coverable: 9,262.00
Gross Pay ((Rs.): 81,084.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-6,306.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	74,778.00
Account Nu	e: NIMAT BAHA umber: 5443-7 ls: NATIONAL BANK	OF PAKISTAN, 230382	NOWSHERA CANTT	NOWSHERA CAN	TT,
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance	X:
Permanent	Address: NSR	~			
City: NOWSHERA		Domicile: NW - K	hyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing	Status: No Official
Temp. Add	ress:				
City:		Email:			

CATTENNED

(50486881/27.08.2019/12:40:39) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 06.08.2020

Your Obediently

NIMAT BAHA

MU

Τo

14

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar..... 24/10/

EXA

Khybe

ar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

2-4/18./1.9

ΰij

The shall be the state of the s

or Whore

Powers El Dia Pa

5

н 1 - 1

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in ALLYSTED

R/SHEWETH:

ON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees 11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Gort

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

22

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time: The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

1.472

1 🕫

N

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record.

Kb.

ANNOUNCED

Cardflert *

Peshawat

11.11.2019

VAKALATNAMA



BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

_OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

NIMAT BAHA

(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT)

__(DEFENDANT)

I/We NIMAT BAHA _______do hereby appoint and constitute **MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI**, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. _____ /___ /2020

CLIENT

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE