Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

163

S.No.

2

Date of order

Case No.-

U /2021 Order or other proceedings with signature of judge

| · · · | proceedings | |
|----------|-------------|--|
| 1 | 2 | 3 |
| | | |
| 1- | 29/01/2021 | The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari |
| ۰. | | Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned |
| · · · · | | Member for proper order please. |
| | | REGISTRAR |
| • . - | | This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put |
| | 08-02-21 | up there on |
| | | $\begin{pmatrix} & & \\ & & \\ & & \end{pmatrix}$ |

01.03.2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



MEMBER(J)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. _____ /2021.

VS

SAEEDA TUN NISA

ډ

EDUCATION DEPTT:

3

.

INDEX

| DOCUMENTS | ANNEXURE | PAGE |
|---------------------------|---|---|
| Memo of appeal | | :1-3 |
| Notification | A | . 4 , |
| Pay Slips | B&C | 5-6 |
| Departmental Appeal | D | 7 |
| Service Tribunal judgment | E | 8-9 |
| Vakalat nama | | 10 |
| | Memo of appealNotificationPay SlipsDepartmental AppealService Tribunal judgment | Memo of appealNotificationAPay SlipsB&CDepartmental AppealDService Tribunal judgmentE |

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

í,

si a

SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

<u>PESHAWAR</u>

APPEAL NO. 1747 /2021

ber Pakhtukhwa rvice Tribunal Diary No. X/9

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 6. The District Education Officer, (Female), Nowshera.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

<u>R/SHEWETH</u> ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **CT (BPS-16)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

2

D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

3

- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
 - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT سحري مساد

SYED NÁÚMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR

SAEEDA TÚN NISA

THROUGH:

(REGULATION WINC)

NO. FD/SO(SR-11)8-62/2012 Dated Fechawar the: 20-12-2012.

| • | |
|---------------|---|
| From | |
| : | The Secretary to Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department, Peshawar. |
| To: | |
| F. | All Additionaries Sectoraries to Cover of Kingbor Pasteroniching. |
| | The Senior Anabar Socol of Reserve, Knyles Pakhundhas |
| 5 | The Secret to Consider Styber Psichus 201 |
| | The Secretary to Chief Mineseer, Kingbes Pakintanidawa |
| 5. | The Secretary, Provincial Ascentary, Knyber Pakitunichwa |
| よた3・ 5 | All Heads of Altached Departments in Knyber Pakhunkhwa. |
| 7 | At District Coordination Officers in Klyser Pathtunkhun |
| E. | All Political Agents / District & Stations Judges in Khyber Paklaunkhwa |
| A. | The Registrin, Postinivar High Coord, Peshawar |
| | The Charmen, Public Service Compression, Khyber Pakhiunkhwa. |
| Ì: '≤¶. | The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Kiyeor Pakhuananwa |
| Subject | THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE |
| • | CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PARATUNKHWA PROVINCIAL |
| | GOVERNMENT EPS 1-19 |
| | |

Doar Sit.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of X-votor Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f. from 1⁻⁶ September, 2012 at the following rates. - owever, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain - unknonged.

| ١. | SNO | BPS | 18-8 <i>6</i> 31 | | TING RATE (| 'PM) | REVISED RATE (PM) |
|----|----------|-------|------------------|---|-------------|--|-------------------|
| | <u> </u> | 1-4 | | | Rs 1,500/- | an ti anna tra | Rs.1,700/- |
| | 2. | 5-10 | | | Rs.1,500/- | | Rs.1,840/- |
| • | 3 | 11-15 | | | Rs.2,000/- | •••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••• | Rs 2,720/- |
| | · | 16-19 | 1 | • | Rs.5,000/- | | Rs.5,000/- |

2. Conveyar: Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officials who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully, Sahibzada Saood Ahmadi Socretary Finance

ATTESTER

Andst: NO. FECK.6R-IBB-522012

Dirich Perhawar the 20th December, 2017

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

- 1. Accountant General Kinyber Pakilbanchen, Pashawar.
- 2 Secretaties to Covernment of Punjpt, Scelit & Salachesan France Department.
 - All Autonomous / Sent Autonomous Bocies in Kingber Pakhtunking

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Nowshera** Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019) 42.00



Personal Information of Mrs SAEEDA TUN NISA d/w/s of FAZLE KARIM

Personnel Number: 00141215 Date of Birth: 10.10.1972

CNIC: 1720120132560

Entry into Govt. Service: 13.12.1999

NTN:

Length of Service: 19 Years 07 Months 020 Days

| Employment Category: Vocati | onal Temporary | | · · · |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Designation: SENIOR CERTIFI | ED TEACHER | 80003749-DISTRICT GC | VERNMENT KHYBE |
| DDO Code: NR6097-G.G.H.S S | SHAIDU NSR | | |
| Payroll Section: 001 | GPF Section: 001 | Cash Center: | |
| GPF A/C No: EDUNR003872 | Interest Applied: Yes | GPF Balance: | 540,016.00 |
| Vendor Number: - | | | |
| Pay and Allowances: | Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 | Pay Scale Type: Civil | BPS: 16 Pay Stage: 19 |

| Wage type | | Wage type Amount Wage type | | Amount |
|-----------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------|
| 0001 | Basic Pay | 47,790.00 | 1000 House Rent Allowance | 2,727.00 |
| 1300 | Medical Allowance | 1,500.00 | 2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013 | 1,100.00 |
| 2199 | Adhoc Relief Allow @10% | 737.00 | 2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10% | 3,764.00 |
| 2224 | Adhoc Relief All 2017 10% | 4,779.00 | 2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10% | 4,779.00 |
| 2264 | Adhoc Relief All 2019 10% | 4,779.00 | | 0.00 |

Deductions - General

| Wage type. | | - Amount | | . Wage type | Amount |
|------------|---------------------------|-----------|------|--------------------------|-----------|
| 3016 | GPF Subscription - Rs3340 | -3,340.00 | 3501 | Benevolent Fund | -800.00 |
| 3609 | Income Tax | -653.00 | 3990 | Emp.Edu. Fund KPK | -150.00 |
| 4004 | R. Benefits & Death Comp: | -1,089.00 | 5011 | Adj Conveyance Allowance | -2,500.00 |

Deductions - Loans and Advances

| Loan | Descrip | tion | Principa | al amount | Dedu | uction | | Balance |
|---|-----------|--------------------|-----------|-----------|-------------|--------|-----------|----------|
| Deductions - Income Payable: 13,047 | | till JUL-2019: | 653.00 | Exempted | : 5218.55 | Recov | erable: | 7,176.40 |
| Gross Pay (Rs.): | 71,955.00 | Deductions: (Rs.): | -8,532.00 |) | Net Pay: (R | s.): | 55,423.00 | |
| Payce Name: SAEEI Account Number: 33 | | | | | • • | • | · · | |
| Bank Details: NATIO | | PAKISTAN, 231520 | AKORA KH | АТТАК АК | ORA KHAT | TAK. | | |

Leaves: Opening Balance: Availed: Earned: Balance:

Permanent Address: NR City: NOWSHERA Temp. Address:

City:

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Housing Status: No Official

Email: saeedatunnisact@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/27.07.2019/16:21:36/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted



Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (September-2020)



- 6

Personal Information of Mrs SAEEDA TUN NISA d/w/s of FAZLE KARIM

| Personnel Number: 00141215 | CNIC: 1720120132560 | NTN: | | · · · | |
|---|---------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|--------|
| Date of Birth: 10.10.1972 | Entry into Govt. Service: | 13.12.1999 Length | n of Service: 2 | 0 Years 09 Months 01 | 9 Days |
| Employment Category: Active | Temporary | | | | |
| Designation: SECONDARY SC | HOOL TEACHER | 80003753-DISTRICT G | OVERNMEN | ТКНҮВЕ | |
| DDO Code: NR6101-D.O.SECC | ONDARY (F) NSR | | | | |
| Payroll Section: 001 | GPF Section: 001 | Cash Center: | | • | |
| GPF A/C No: EDUNR003872 | Interest Applied: Yes | GPF Balance: | | 726,959.00 | |
| Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances: | Pay scale: BPS For - 201 | 7 Pay Scale Type: Civil | BPS: 16 | Pay Stage: 22 | i |

| Wage type | Amount | Amount Wage type | |
|--------------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|----------|
| 0001 Basic Pay | 52,350.00 | 1000 House Rent Allowance | 2,727.00 |
| 1210 Convey Allowance 2005 | 5,000.00 | 1300 Medical Allowance | 1,500.00 |
| 2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013 | 1,100.00 | 2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10% | 737.00 |
| 2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10% | 3,764.00 | 2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10% | 5,235.00 |
| 2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10% | 5,235.00 | 2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10% | 5,235,00 |

Deductions - General

| Wage type | Amount | Wage type | Amount |
|--------------------------------|-----------|------------------------|---------|
| 3016 GPF Subscription | -3,340.00 | 3501 Benevolent Fund | -800.00 |
| 3609 Income Tax | -1,233.00 | 3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK | -150.00 |
| 4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp: | -650.00 | | 0.00 |

Deductions - Loans and Advances

| Loan | Descri | ption | Principal amount | Deduction | Balance |
|------------|---|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| Deduction | s - Income Tax | | | | |
| Payable: | 19,729.75 Recovere | d till SEP-2020: 3,7 | 01.00 Exempted: | 4932.38 Recovera | ble: 11,096.37 |
| Gross Pay | (Rs.): 82,883.00 | Deductions: (Rs.): | -6,173.00 | Net Pay: (Rs.): 76, | 710.00 |
| Account N | ne: SAEEDA TUN NISA Jumber: 3310343010 nils: NATIONAL BANK OI | ² PAKISTAN, 231520 A | KORA KHATTAK AK | ORA KHATTAK, | |
| Leaves: | Opening Balance: | Availed: | Earned: | Balance: | |
| Permanent | Address: NR | | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | | ······································ |
| City: NOV | VSHERA | Domicile: NW - Kh | vber Pakhtunkhwa | Housing Status | No Official |
| Temp. Add | dress: | <u>-</u> | | Housing Status | . No Official |
| City: | | Email: saeedatunnis | act@gmail.com | | |
| - ма аноин | rated document in accordance is are in Pak Rupees missions excepted | with APPM 4.6.12.9(SERV. | ICES/30.09.2020/17:44:56, | ^ν ν2.0) | |



The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

Τo

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as CT (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effecta Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Date 23/10/20

Your Obediently

SAEEDA TUN NISA

ATTENTED

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

1) ~ (*)

10/2019 Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar...

VERSUS

1- The Government of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Kin ber Pakhtunkhwa; Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPENL JONER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT: 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

9.1. 1.01/

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted acdte-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in sistrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

533 Khybe:

ATTESTER

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vice revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

U)

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Gio

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the subgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protractover a formicable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record. /

E? Khyll Chairman

second

ANNOUNCED

STOP OF

goshawar

11.11.2019

| V | A | <u>K</u> | AI | <u>.</u> A | T | <u>N</u> | <u>A</u> | <u>M</u> | A |
|---|---|----------|----|------------|---|----------|----------|----------|---|
| | | | | | | | | | |

| BEFORE THE KHYBER F | AKHTUNKHWA SERV | VICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | на. 19 |
| | * 4 * * | OF 2 021 |
| <u> </u> | ž - | |
| | F. | (APPELLANT) |
| | | |
| SAEEDA TUN NISA | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | (PLAINTIFF) |
| | | (PETITIONER) |
| | | |
| | VERSUS | |
| | • . | (RESPONDENT) |
| Education Department | | (DEFENDANT) |
| - · · · | | \! |

I/We SAEEDA TUN NISA _______ do hereby appoint and constitute SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

CLIENT

ACCEPTED SYED NAUMAN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR