BEFORE THE HONORABLE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR CAMP COURT ABBOTTABAD.

Appeal No. 308/2022

Raja Sher Khan	Appellant
VERSUS	**************************************
Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & Others	Respondents

IOINT PARA WISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENTS NOS. 1 TO 4

INDEX

Sr.No	Description	Page Nos	Annexures	
1	Comments alongwith affidavit.	01 - 05	·	
2	Copy of Application dated 13-06-2022	06	"A"	
3	Copy of Notification of appointment of Inquiry Officer dated 13-06-2022	07	"B"	
4	Copy of Inquiry Report	8 - 10	"C"	
5	Copy of letter dated 16-09-2022	11	"D"	
6	Copy of revised / restored seniority list	12 - 13	"E"	
7	Copy of letter dated 19-09-2022	14	"F"	

District Education Officer (M)
Kohistan Upper.

(Respondent No. 2)

BEFORE THE HONORABLE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR CAMP COURT ABBOTTABAD.

Appeal No. 308/2022

Raja Sher Khan......Appellant

VERSUS

Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & Others......Respondents

IOINT PARA WISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENTS NOS. 1 TO 4

RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH:-

Comments on behalf of Respondents Nos. 1 to 4 are submitted as under:-

Preliminary objection:-

- 1. That the appellant has no cause of action to file the instant appeal against the answering respondents.
- 2. That the appeal of the appellant is time barred. Hence liable to be dismissed without any further proceeding.
- That the seniority list has been <u>restored</u> by the respondent No. 4 and the name
 of the appellant is placed at Serial No. 6 of the said list hence, instant service
 appeal has become <u>infructuous</u>.
- 4. That the appellant did not file departmental appeal against promotion order dated 25-01-2022 hence, he cannot challenge the promotion order in the instant service appeal.
- 5. That the instant appeal is not maintainable in its present form.
- 6. That the appellant has filed the present appeal just to pressurize the respondents.
- 7. That the appellant has not come to this Honorable Tribunal with clean hands.
- 8. That the appellant is estopped to sue due to his own conduct.
- 9. That the instant appeal is not maintainable due to non-joinder and mis-joinder of necessary parties.
- 10. That the instant appeal is against the Service Laws.

Factual Objections:-

- 1. That the Para No. 1, of the service appeal relates to the service record of the appellant hence, need no further comment.
- 2. That the Para No. 2, of the service appeal also relates to the service record of the appellant.
- 3. That the Para No. 3, of the service appeal relates to the service record of the appellant hence, need no further comment.
- 4. That the Para No. 4, of the service appeal relates to record.
- 5. That the Para No. 5, of the service appeal pertains to record hence, need no further comment.
- 6. That the Para No. 6, of the service appeal as composed is incorrect. Hence, denied and not admitted
- 7. That the Para No. 7, of the service appeal is correct.
- 8. That the Para No. 8, of the service appeal relates to record.
- In reply to Para No. 9, of the service appeal it is submitted that appellant was appointed as CT on 29-05-2004 whereas, he filed an appeal regarding correction in seniority on 20-09-2021 after the lapse of 17 years.
- 10. That the Para No. 10, of the service appeal as composed is incorrect hence, denied and not admitted.
- 11. In reply to Para No. 11, of the service appeal, it is submitted that appellant did not file departmental appeal against promotion order dated 25-01-2022 hence, he cannot challenge the promotion order in the instant service appeal.
- 12. In reply to Para No. 12 of the service appeal, it is submitted that appellant did not file departmental appeal against promotion order dated 25-01-2022 hence, he cannot challenge the promotion order in the instant service appeal. Further submitted that appellant submitted joint application on 13-06-2022 to respondent No. 01 stating therein that they were ignored in SST Promotion in January, 2022 while their junior teachers were promoted. Consequently, respondent No. 1 appointed an inquiry officer Mr. Lal Saeed Deputy Secretary (Board & Training) vide Notification No. SO(PE)E&SED/5-1/Inquiry/2022 dated 13-06-2022 to conduct inquiry into application of the appellant. Inquiry Officer submitted its report. In the light of the inquiry report received through letter No. SO(PE)/E&SED/5-1/Misc-Gen/IR/M.A/2022 dated 16-09-2022, the seniority list was restored by the respondent No. 4 and the name of the appellant is placed at

Serial No. 6 of the said list hence, instant service appeal has become <u>infructuous</u>. Moreover, respondent No. 04 forwarded updated seniority list alongwith working papers to respondent No. 02 regarding promotion of appellant against the post of SST (BPS-16) vide letter No. 2562 dated 19-09-2022. (Copies of the Application dated 13-06-2022, Notification of appointment of Inquiry Officer dated 13-06-2022, Inquiry Report, letter dated 16-09-2022, Revised / Restored Seniority List and letter No. 2562 dated 19-09-2022 are annexed herewith as Annexure "A", "B", "C", "D", "E" & "F" respectively)

Grounds:

- a. That ground a, as composed is incorrect hence, denied and not admitted.
 Detailed and comprehensive reply has already been given in Para No. 12 of the Factual Objections.
- b. In reply to ground b, it is submitted that the seniority list has been <u>restored</u> by the respondent No. 4 and the name of the appellant is placed at Serial No. 6 of the said list hence, instant service appeal has become infructuous.
- c. That ground c, as composed is incorrect hence, denied. Detailed and comprehensive reply has already been given in Para No. 12 of the Factual Objections.
- d. That ground d, as composed is incorrect. The respondents have not violated Article 25 of the constitution and the appellant has been dealt in accordance with law.
- e. That ground e, as composed is incorrect. The act of the respondents are as per law and rule.
- f. That ground f, as composed is incorrect. The answering respondents treated the appellant as per rule and law.
- g. That ground g, relates to record.
- h. Reply of Para h of the ground is that the notification dated 25-01-2022 was issued in accordance with law and rule.
- i. That ground i, is subject to cogent proof.
- j. In reply to ground j, it is submitted that the seniority list has been <u>restored</u> by the respondent No. 4 and the name of the appellant is placed at Serial No. 6 of the said list hence, instant service appeal has become <u>infructuous</u>.

- k. Detailed and comprehensive reply has already been given in Para No. 12 of the Factual Objections.
- Detailed and comprehensive reply has already been given in Para No. 12 of the Factual Objections.
- m. That other grounds will be agitated during arguments.
- n. That the respondents seek leave of this Honorable Court to raise additional grounds at the time of arguments.

Under the circumstances, it is humbly prayed that the instant service appeal has become infructuous, hence liable to be dismissed with cost.

Secretary (E8SED) Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Peshawar. (Respondent No. 1) Director (E&SE) Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Peshawar.

(Respondent No. 2)

Assistant Director (E&SE) Khyber

Pakhtunkhwa

Peshawar.

(Respondent No. 3)

District Education Officer (M)

Kohistan Upper

(Respondent No. 4)

BEFORE THE HONORABLE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR CAMP COURT ABBOTTABAD.

Appeal No. 308/2022

Raja Sher Khan......Appellant

VERSUS

Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & Others.....Respondents

JOINT PARA WISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENTS NOS.1 TO 4

AFFIDAVIT

I, Mr. Abdur Rehman, District Education Officer (M) Kohistan Upper, do hereby affirm and declare that contents of forgoing comments are correct and true according to the best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been suppressed from this Honorable Tribunal.



E) it itso 30100 105 De 1012, 122 bull set 200 El MICAP post (Jeal 180 19 5 July 20 5/1/5 (12) - 2 15 Will Ely we ((1) () 2/4/ (10 / 2) 10 / (2)) (10) 2/4) (200) 130 121 2139 63 CAN SOUTH OF CIND SOUTH OF C Eccemins - 60 : 1/0 / (1/2) JEDS 8-3-002 ORE JUL & Ellerar 10 & 1 :4-8 722 el el el été la juis : « Le la la la colora de la colora del la colora de la colora de la colora del la colora del la colora de la colora de la colora de la colora del la colora d (21/2) . 8 x 13010 102 levely 128 & skruth29 たらかりがりがしいこうにあったきしいっことに大型 TH29 - 2/2/2/20 was 20 2/2/2/

Annexure



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT Block-"A" Opposite MPA's Hostel, Civil Secretariat Peshawar

Dated Peshawar the June 13, 2022

NOTIFICATION

No. SO(PE)E&SED/5-1/Inquiry/2022: The Competent Authority has been pleased to appoint Mr. Lal Saeed Khattak, Deputy Secretary (Boards & Training), E&SE Department as Inquiry Officer to conduct an inquiry into the application of Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad & others of Upper Kohistan.

2. A copy of the application is enclosed with the request to conduct the requisite inquiry and submit report to this office within week time.

SECRETARY TO GOVT. OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA E&SE DEPARTMENT

Copy forwarded to the:

1. Director E&SE Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2. Mr. Lal Saeed Khattak, Deputy Secretary (Boards & Training), E&SE Department.

3. PS to Secretary, E&SE Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

SECTION OFFICER (PE)

22.07.2015 showing their seniority as 68 & 70 respectively.

6. In the final seniority list as stood on 01.06.2019, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad was shown at S.No 11. While Ajam Khan S.No 14 & Noor Ali S.No 22.

INQUIRY REPORT

Competent Authority in E&SE Department vide Notification No. SO (PE)E&SED/5-1/Inquiry/2022 dated 13.06.2022 appointed Deputy Secretary (Boards & Training) to conduct Inquiry into the application of Mr. Muhtaq Ahmad & other of Distt Upper Kohistan (Annex-I).

Charges / Allegations made by the Complainants.

Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad SCT, Mr. Raja Sher Khan SCT & Mursaleen Khan PSHT of
District Kohistan upper submitted joint application to worthy Secretary E&SE, stating therein that they
were ignored in SST promotion in January, 2022. While their junior teachers namely Ajam Khan SCT,
Mr. Noor Ali SCT and Muhammad Yousaf PSHT were promoted as SST.

PROCEDURE OF THE INQUIRY

Letter was issued to DEO (M) Kohistan Upper on 16.06.2022 with direction to keep all the record handy and make sure the availability of aggrieved teachers on 21.06.2022 (Annex-II). They were again called on 21.07.2022. In repose, Mr. Sher Mohammad DDEO (M) Upper Kohistan and one of the aggrieved teacher namely Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad SCT joined the inquiry proceedings. The complainant relied on his statement earlier delivered to inquiry officer on 14.06.2022 (Annex-III). While the DDEO (M) Kohstan upper provided copies of certain documents viz seniority lists / DPC recommendations / notification appeal of the applicant for promotion, comments / report of DEO / Director E&SE & copy of Judgment of KP Service Tribunal dated 17.09.2020 passed in the service appeal filed by Mr. Noor Ali S/O Muzzamil Khan (Annex-IV). The other two teachers viz Raja Sher Khan SCT & Mursaleen PSHT were informed by the DEO Office but they declined to join the inquiry proceedings. The undersigned also contacted them on phone but they did not appear.

FACTS OF THE CASE / FINDINGS;

- Mr. Ajam Khan S/O Ahmadlee PTC and Mr. Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad S/O Alif Said DM were appointed as CT on 29.05.2004 having score of 48.20 & 51.80 respectively.
- 2. Through court order on 23.06.2016, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad changed his name from "Seer-ul-whaj" and was notified by DEO (M) Kohistan on 04.07.2018.
- 3. Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad is older in age than Mr. Ajam Khan.
- 4. As per merit and age, Mr Mushtaq Ahmad ranked senior to Mr. Ajam Khan in the seniority list.
- 5. Both the teachers viz Mushtaq Ahmad & Ajam Khan were promoted as SCT on 22.07.2015 showing their seniority as 68 & 70 respectively.
- 6. In the final seniority list as stood on 01.06.2019, Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad was shown at S.No 11. While Ajam Khan S.No 14 & Noor Ali S.No 22.

M. C.



- 7. While in the final seniority list issued by DEO (M) Kohistan upper on 01.08.2021, Mr. Noor Ai & Ajam Khan were placed senior i.e Sr.No. 5 & 7 to Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad (Sr.No 09) in violation of rules. Though Ajam Khan had submitted application to DEO concerned in this regard on 13.08.2021.
- 8. Mr. Noor Ali and Ajam Khan being Junior to Mushtaq Ahmad were promoted as SST on 25.01.2022.
- 9. Mr. Noor Ali was promoted as SCT on 12.02.2021 and as per promotion policy, he was kept on probation for a period of one year extendable for another year. Therefore his promotion as SST 25.01.2022 during probation period is not covered under the law & relevant rules.
- Due to his willful absence w.e.f 01.05.2007/disciplinary proceedings, Mr. Noor Ali was removed from service. He was reinstated on 01.07.2018 in light of decision of the Service Tribunal. The intervening period w.e.f 01.05.2007 to 30.06.2018 was ordered as extra ordinary leave without pay. He appealed to Director E&SE / DEO for grant of seniority qualifying service & restoration of annual increments / back benefits but was not acceded to. He then challenged the order of DEO in the Service Tribunal, which was dismissed vide order dated 17.09.2020.
- 11. Despite above court order, Mr. Noor Ali was promoted as SCT and subsequently as SST in sheer violation of rules.
- 12. Seniority has not been correctly determined by the DEO, as required and specified in Rule-17 of Appointment, Promotion & Transfer Rules, 1989.
- 13. It was informed that Mr. Noor Mehmood SST has been posted by the DEO against the post of ADEO (Estab) who is working there from last more than ten years. He has also been assigned the charge of SDEO Hurban Shah by the then DEO. Similarly, some other SSTs have been posted as ADOs / ADEOs and also given additional charge of SDEOs by the DEO, which is otherwise competency of Director Elementary & Secondary Education / Administrative Department. Such orders issued by the then DEO need thorough probe.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Seniority list may be revisited & corrected accordingly as per laws.
- ii. Special DPC meeting may be called and Mr. Mustaq Mushtaq Ahmad SCT may be promoted as SST with all back benefits from the date when his junior were promoted.



- iii. Mr. Noor Ali and Ajam Khan may be demoted / reverted to their original post of SCT / CT. They may be, however, considered subsequently for promotion after ascertaining their due seniority position and availability of posts.
- iv. Mr. Noor Mehmood_may be removed from the post of ADEO and transferred / posted in school against his original post of SST.
- v. Disciplinary action may be imitated against the negligent DEO, ADEO (Estab) & dealing hand in the Directorate of E&SE under E&D Rules, 2011 for issuance of incorrect Seniority list and thereafter giving illegal promotion to junior teachers.
- vi. Instructions may be issued to the Directorate of E&SE and DEOs to invariably mention date of DPC in the promotion notifications / orders as in the existing notifications, no date of DPC mentioned.
- vii. Directorate of E&SE may be directed to strictly follow the tenure policy and shuffle the officials in offices having tenure/two (02) years or more.

(LAL SAEED KHATTAK)
Deputy Secretary (B&Trg) E&SED /
Inquiry Officer





GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT CIVIL SECRETARITE PESHAWAR (PHONE NO. 091-9223587)

SO(PE)/E&SED/5-1/Misc-Gen/IR/M.A/2022

Dated Peshawar the, September 16th, 2022

REMINDER

To

- The Director, Elementary & Secondary Education, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 2. District Education Officer (M) Kohistan Upper.

Subject: - INQUIRY REPORT

I am directed to refer to this Department letter of even No. dated 08.09.2022 regarding implementation of inquiry report conducted by Mr. Lal Saeed Deputy Secretary Board & Training in respect of Mr. Mushtaq Ahmad SCT and to remind that implement the recommendations of the inquiry within <u>THREE Days</u> under intimation of this Department, please.

Encl. As above.

(MUHAMMAD ISHAO) SECTION OFFICER (PE)

Copy forwarded to the; PS to Secretary, E&SE Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

SECTION OFFICER (PE)

wasted assisted OFFICER (MALE) DISTRICT KOHISTAN UPPER

CORRECT FINAL SENIORITY LIST OF CTISCT TEACHERS (MALE) DISTRICT KOHISTAN UPPER CONTROL OF CONTROL O															
					FINALIBEIOUI	1, 3, 3, 3, 3, 4,			I hard'at	100 7577767000		100000		3 TO	
1			5-52.757	ication	ication	Father Name	BPS	Date of Birth	Domicile	Into Govt		Place of posting.	Remarks 4		
1	SNo	Name of Teacher	Academi	Thoresa	si l			<u> </u>	Service	teacher.	1			杨	
1	70-12-2 17-76-7	uridosiii Shah	Vana -	CT/B E	Muhammadr	246%	12/10/1964	Kohistan	715/1/1983	06/04/1999	GHS LOW TO KEE				
		Muhammad Qanbullah	BA	CT	Malik Noman	16	01/12/1970	Kahislan	08/02/1992	07/04/1999	GHS Shatial				
1	2 V	M. 23.86.284.25. 21.2.25.44	FA	ст	Malik Shadat	15	10/01/1972		06/04/1999	31/03/2002	GMS Bangoo				
ŀ	<u>, 3</u>	Habib ur Rahman	BA	СТ	Sultan Khan	16	10/01/1973		06/04/1999	31/03/2002	GHS LON A	14 10 10 10 20			
ļ	3 47	Muhammad Yousal	8A	CT	Abdul Qadoos	16	09/04/1977		06/04/1999	29/01/2003	GHS Eleel			交	
	. 5	Muliammad Younas	BAS		Malik Pirzeda	16	06/05/1968	200		29/05/2004	GHS Jalkot 3			3	
i i		Raja Sher Khan Mushfad Abmed	N BA∵	4	Malik Alif Said	16	09/09/1970		04/08/1999	29/05/2004	GHS Jalkot (L. S.)				
		Seddig Hussain	BA	B,Ed/CT		16.	05/12/1970		12/08/1999	29/05/2004	GHS Kafai Banda	30.75		9) (j.	
	Ting.	Apm Khan		M.Ed/B.E	Ahmad Ree	16 ·	01/05/1971	Kohistan	21/3/1990	29/05/2004	GHS Jalkot			¥X.	
1	7.3	Növehr Van			Zereel Khan	16	08/06/1975		29/5/2004	29/05/2004	GHS Dassu	10057582			
ŀ		Mushted Ahmad	BA	CT/B.Ed	Mond Amir	16	04/09/1983	Kohistan	29/5/2004	29/05/2004	GHS Bar Bela			NA.	
ķ	47	M Sirajud Deen	MA	CT/B Ed	Madad Khan	16	13/12/1968	Kohistan	05/04/1999	06/07/2004	GHS Harbany 🔆 🦠	14.55 Sept. 18.	1047-1-196	<u> </u>	
F	13 13	Ghulam Jan	FA	CT	Akbar Khan	15	06/05/1977	Kohistan	06/04/1999	28/12/2004	GMS Mamokser				
ľ	*	Munammad Fageer	MA	M.Ed/B.E	M Qadeer Khan	. 16	01/06/1968	Kohlstan	14/5/1992	12/01/2006	GHS Chuchang/	10.5		100	
Į,		Abdul Hákeem	BA.		Abdullah Jan	16	12/12/1979	Kohistan	02/12/2006	02/12/2006	GHS Katar Banda			200	
	(S. S. S.) 1	1 Tara 129 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	MSďPak	M.Ed/CT	Lal-Khan	16	20/12/1973	Kohistan	23/1/1995	07/12/2008	GHS Bar Bela 🔾 💢	VE WEEK			
1	117	Saif-ur-Rehman	ВА	ĊT	Rasool Shah	16	01/04/1978	Kohislan	14.08 2007	14/08/2007	GHS Kafar Banda	No field	. १७३८ है। विकास सम्बद्धाः स्टब्स्टर्स	en sy. Záraje	
1	c18 /	Gui Nawaz :	BA	CT/B Ed	Sakhawat Khan	16	02/02/1984	Kuhistan	01/06/2008	06/01/2008 [/]	GHS Perco Bella :				
ľ		Muhammed Din	FA	/DE	Zoor Das Khari	15	15/6/1985	Kohistan	26/4/2008		GMS Earigoo		يام مستولستان و سدست ميام عدم مستولستان و سدستان		
1	20	Barkat Shah	ВА	CT-2nd	Zahoro	16	01/03/1986	Kohistań	24/4/2008	30/03/2010	GCMHS Dassu			· ^ ·	
	21	Fazal Mehmood	BA	CT	Mchemmad Shani	16	12/05/1986				GHS Teyal		ANDERS (AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND	i. Le k jar	
1	22.	Artavilah	- MA	CT/B.Ed	Sardar Khan	16	06/05/1962	Kohistan		30.03:2012	GHS Shale)	NUMBER OF	7200	44.5	
ľ	23	Muhammad Younas	BA	CT	Khalid Khon	16	00/03/1984				GHS Bar Bela 🖟				
-		·						·				•	-		

CERTIFICATE.

1. Certified that the senfority is final, undisputed and non judicious.

District Education Officer

Annexuna



OFFICE OF DISTRICT EDUCATION OFFICER (MALE)

KOHISTAN UPPer

No. 2562

Dated 19 1 09 12022

To,

The Director, 👵

Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.

Subject:

INQUIRY REPORT/UPDATION OF SENIORITY LIST/WORKING PAPERS.

Memo,

Reference your good office letter No. 2549-50/F,No.K-1/SST (M) Promotion Kohistan dated Peshawar the 15-09-2022, on the subject cited above.

With due reverence it is stated that please find enclosed updated seniority list/working papers attached herewith it in the compliance of your good office as referred above for your perusal and onward proceeding accordingly, please.

District Education Officer (M)
District Kohistan Upper