Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

781 /2021 Case No.-

S No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
. • .	proceedings	
1	2	3
1-	29/01/2021	The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned
		Member for proper order please.

REGISTRAR

MEMBER(J)

This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put

U

08-02-21

2- 1

163

01.03.2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.

1



BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO._____

/2020

Gul Naz

VS Education Deptt:.

P -

<u>INDEX.</u>

S.NO	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-4
2.	Copy of notification dated 20.12.2012	A	05
3.	Copy of pay slip of vacation	В	06
4.	Copy of pay slip working	C	07
5.	Copy of departmental appeal	D	08
6.	Copy of High Court Judgment	E	09-15
7.	Copy of tribunal judgment	· F ·	16-17
8.	Vakalatnama		18

APPELLANT

THROUGH (SYED NOMAN AI BUKHARI) **ADVOCATE HIGH COURT**

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 178/ /2020

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal Diary No. 2141

Mst. Gul Naz QARI GGHS ASC Center NRS.

.....APPELLANT

VERSUS

- 1. The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2. The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3. The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4. The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5. The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 6. District Education Officer (F) Nowshehra (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. District account officer Nowshehra (Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

.....RESPONDENTS



KHYBER OF THE <u>APPE</u>AL SECTION-4 UNDER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY DEDUCTING THE AND UNLAWFULLY **ILLEGALLY** OF THE APPELLANT ALLOWANCE CONVEYANCE **DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST** NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

THAT	ON	ACCEP	TANCE	OF	THIS	APPE	AL	THE
RESPO	NDEN'	TS MAY	KIND	LY BE	DIRE	<u>CTED</u>	NO	<u>г то</u>
MAKE	DED	UCTION	OF C	<u>ONVE</u>	YANCE	ALI	<u>IOW</u>	ANCE
DURIN	G VA	CATION	NS PER	LIOD	(SUME)	<u>R &</u>	WI	<u>NTER</u>
VACAT	IONS)	AND	MAKE	THE	PAYM	<u>IENT</u>	OF	ALL

OUTSTANDING AMOUNT OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE WHICH HAVE BEEN DEDUCTED PREVIOUSLY WITH ALL BACK BENEFITS BIENG SIMILAR PLACED EMPLOYEE. ANY OTHER REMEDY WHICH THIS AUGUST TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT THAT MAY ALSO BE AWARDED IN FAVOR OF THE APPELLANT.

R/SHEWETH:

ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No.FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.7.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the precious notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Copy of the notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure A.
- 3. That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the salary slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure B & C.
- 4. That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed departmental appeal on 15.04.2020 but no reply has been received so far. Copies of the departmental appeal is attached as annexure-D.
- 5. That it is pertinent to mentioned here that feeling aggrieved some colleagues of appellant filed writ petition no.3162-P/2019 before the Peshawar High Court, Peshawar which was disposed of vide judgment dated 1.10.2019 with the direction to approach the proper forum i.e. service tribunal. Copies of the judgment is attached as annexure E.
- 6. That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august tribunal in different services appeal which was allowed by this august tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure F.

7. where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

<u>GROUNDS</u>

- A. That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B. That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C. That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D. That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E. That the Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same aer credited to this account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period,the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F. That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.

- G. That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H. That according to Government Servants Revised leave rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I. That according to Article 38 (e) of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J. That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honourable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

APPELL

THROUGH

(SYED NOMAN AI BUKHARI) ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

From

To:

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govil of Knyber Pachtusknwa Finance Department, Peshawar,

All Administrative Secretaries to Govi. of Kingber Pakhturishiwa. The Secretary to Governor Kingber Pakhturishiwa. The Secretary to Chief Minsker. Kingber Pakhturishiwa. The Secretary. Provincial Ascerby: Kingber Pakhturishiwa. The Secretary. Provincial Ascerby: Kingber Pakhturishiwa All Heads of Anacheo Departments in Kingber Pakhturishiwa All Heads of Anacheo Departments in Kingber Pakhturishiwa All Heads of Anacheo Departments in Kingber Pakhturishiwa All District Coordination Officerson Xingber Pakhturishiwa. As Political Agents / District & Secolors Judges in Kingber Pakhturishiwa The Registrar. Peshawar High Coord. Poshawar

The Chairman, Public Sender Conversion, Knyber Pokhiunkiswa, The Chairman, Services Tribenal, Krydor Pakhiunkhwa)

Subject

Dear Sir.

3

ċ.

5

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

The Government of Knyber Pakhturáhwa has been pleased to enhance / ruvisc the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provinces Civil Servanta Govt: of Voybur Pakhtunkhvia (Working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1^e September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to BPS-19 will remain urchanged.

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·	
S.NO	825	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)	1
1.	1-1	25.1,500/-	Rs.1.700/-	ļ
2.	5-10	1 Ps.1,500/-	Rs.1.840/-	
3	11-15	1 Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2.720/-	<u>.</u>
<u></u>	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$.5,000/-	_ :
	S.NO 1. 2. 3. 4.	1. 1-1	1. 1-4 Rs.1,500/- 2. 5-10 Ps.1,500/-	1. 1-4 Rs.1.500/- Rs.1.700/- 2. 5-10 Ps.1.500/- Rs.1.840/- 3. 11-15 Rs.2,000/- Rs.2,720/-

Conveyance Allowance of the prove rates per menth shall be admissible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned alficial vehicles.

Yours Fashfully,

(Sahibzada Sacod Ahmad) Secretary Firance

Endst: NO. FD:SO(SR-ID)3-52/2012

Dated Pestawar the 20" December, 2007

12.4 44.

- A Copy is forwardod for information to the:-

Acordinant General Kinter Pakitanking, Pesinang

 Secretaties to Government of Punjab, South & Salboratian, Finance Dyperiment 3 All Automotives / Secret Automotivous Ecoles in Kinjoer Fakirtunkhwa

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Sociation (Rect)

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject:

From

To:

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain un-

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Revised Rate (PM) Rs. 1,700/-
2.	5-10	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

l ph?	Dist. Govt. NWFP-Frovincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019)
.,	41



Personal Information of Miss GUL NAZ d/w/s of MURAD ALI

Personnel Number: 00692545	CNIC: 1720182405348	the second construction of the second s
Date of Birth: 15.03.1984	Entry into Govt. Service: 26.05.2012	2 Length of Service: 07 Years 02 Months 007 Days

Employment Category: Vo	cational Temporary					
Designation: QARI		80003760-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE				
DDO Code: NR6108-GOV	F. GIRLS HIGH SCHOOL ASC CH	ENTRE				
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:				
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	163,351.00			
Vendor Number: -			,			
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS:	15 Pay Stage: 4			
	· · · ·	• •				

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	21,440.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	425:00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	291.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,514.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,144.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,144.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,144.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3015	GPF Subscription - Rs2890	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,052.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description		Principal amount Deduction		Balance
Deductions Payable:	- Income Tax 0.00 Recove	ered till July-2019:	0.00 Exempted	l: 0.00 Recov	erable: 0.00
Gross Pay ((Rs.): 36,807.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,667.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	32,140.00
Account Nu Bank Detai	e: GUL NAZ 1mber: 11608-6 ls: THE BANK OF KH OWSHERA	YBER, 080008 NOWSHEI	RA BRANCH SAAD P	LAZA NOWSHERA E	BRANCH SAAD
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
					·
Permanent . City: nowsh		Domicile: NW - Kh	vber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Star	tus: No Official
Temp. Addi			, 		

City:

Email:

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (August-2019)



Personnel Number: 00692545%	CNIC: 1720182405348	Sec. See Second	NTN:	The state of the second st	and the second
Date of Birth: 15.03.1984	Entry into Govt. Service:	26.05.2012	Length of Service: 07	Years 03 Months 007 E	Days

Employment Category: voo	cational Temporary			·	
Designation: QARI	80003760-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE				
DDO Code: NR6108-GOVT	. GIRLS HIGH SCHOOL ASC CE	ENTRE	•		
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:			
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	-	° 187,2 11:06	
Vendor Number: -			-		
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 15	Pay Stage: 4	

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	21,440.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300 Medical Allowance	1,500.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	425.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	291.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,514.00	2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,144.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,144.00	2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,144.00

Deductions - General

1

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3015 GPF Subscription	-2,890.09	3501 Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990 Emp.Edu, Fund KPK	-125.00	4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,052.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Desc	ription	Principal amoun	nt Deduc	tion	Balance
Deductions	- Income Tax			•		-
Payable:	0.00 Recove	red till August-2019:	0.00 Exempt	ted: 0.00	Recoverable:	0.00
Gross Pay (Rs.): 36,807.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,667.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 32,140.0	00
Pavee Name	e: GUL NAZ		•		-	
•	umber: 11608-6					
Account Ni		BER, 080008 NOWSHE	RA BRANCH SAAD	PLAZA NOWS	HERA BRANC	H SAAD
Account Nu Bank Detail		/BER, 080008 NOWSHE	RA BRANCH SAAD	PLAZA NOWS	HERA BRANC	H SAAD
Account Nu Bank Detail	Is: THE BANK OF KHY	BER, 080008 NOWSHE	RA BRANCH SAAD Earned:		HERA BRANC	H SAAD
Account Nu Bank Detail PLAZA, NO	Is: THE BANK OF KHY OWSHERA				· · · ·	H SAAD

Permanent Address:		
City: nowshera	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		
City:	Email:	

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)



Personal Information of Miss GUL NAZ d/w/s of MURAD ALI

Personnel Number: 00692545 CNIC: 1720182405348 NTN: Date of Birth: 15.03:1984 Entry into Govt: Service: 26.05.2012 Ength of Service: 07 Years 04 Months 006 Days

Employment Category: Vo	cational Temporary		· , ·
Designation: QARI		80003760-DISTRICT GOVE	RNMENT KHYBE
DDO Code: NR6108-GOV	T. GIRLS HIGH SCHOOL ASC CH		
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:	
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	190,101.00
Vendor Number: -		- · ·	
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BI	PS: 15 Pay Stage: 4
<u></u>	• •	a. 1	

Wage type		Amount	Amount Wage type		Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	21,440.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00	
<u>1210</u>	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	425.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	291.00	
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	··· 1,514.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,144.00	
2247.	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,144.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,144.00	

Deductions - General

-	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3015	GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	iption	Principal amount	Deduction	B	alance
Deductions Payable:	s - Income Tax 0.00 Recover	ed till September-2019;	0.00 Exempted	i: 0.00 Rec	overable:	0.00
Gross Pay	(Rs.): 36,807.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,215.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	32,592.00	#.
Account N Bank Detai	ne: GUL NAZ jumber: 11608-6 ils: THE BANK OF KHY OWSHERA		A BRANCH SAAD P	LAZA NOWSHER	A BRANCH SA	AAD
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:		
Permanent	Address:					
City: nows	hera	Domicile: NW - Khy	/ber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing	Status: No Offi	rial -

City: nowshera	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		-
City:	Email:	

(50486881/27.09.2019/11:49:58) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E & SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,

as

To

Subject:

DEPARTMENTALAPPEALAGAINSTTHEIMPUGNEDACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITYBYILLEGALLYANDUNLAWFULLYDEDUCTINGTHECONVEYANCEALLOWANCE DURING WINTER AND SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self department and work with full zeal and zest and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. it is stated for kind information that conveyance allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14-7-2011 was issued . latter on vide revised notification dated 20-12-2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance while employees from BPS -16 to 19 have been treated under the previous notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance . Respected sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of education department in Islamabad filed service appeal No. 1888 (R) CS/2016 before the federal service tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the honorable service tribunal vide its judgment dated 3.12.18 and also allowed by the Peshawar High court Peshawar in writ petition. That I also the similar employee of education department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue the same conveyance allowance which is granting to others employees . Copy attached . I am feeling aggrieved from the action of concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period preferred this department appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated : 23.10.2020

تمل کار Your Obediently

Chul Nat

Judgment Sheet

IN THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

Writ Petition No. 3162-P/2019 Akhtar Hussain and 692. others..vs.. Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

<u>JUDGMENT</u>

Date of hearing......01.10.2019.....

Petitioner(s) by Mr. Noor Mohammad Khattak, Advocate.

Mr. Mujahid Ali Khan, AAG, for respondents.

ROOH-UL-AMIN KHAN, J:-

i.

iii.

iv.

dwe Down

Through this common

E-(9)

H COT

judgment we, proposed to decided the instant as well as the connected writ petitions as all having involved common question of law and facts, the particulars of which are given below.

> WP No. 3162-P/2019 titled Akhtar Hussain etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3064-P/2019 titled Habeeb Ullah etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

WP No. 3084-P/2019 titled Sikandar Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3178-P/2019 titled Abdur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

KAMINER war High Court

WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs.. vii. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

viii. WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khanetc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs., Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.

WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalid etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

STED EXAMINER Peshawar High Court

xii.

Sor

ix.

x.

xi.

wP No. 3567-P/2019 titled Husnur Rehman etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 3 others.

xv.

xiv. WP No. 3667-P/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3939-P/2019 titled Syed Khurshid Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 5 others.

xvi. WP No. 4072-P/2019 titled Subhan Ullah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

xvii. WP No. 4758-P/2019 titled Sohrab Hayat etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

2. As per averments of the writ petition, the petitioners are serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department on their respective posts. On 14.7.2011 the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa enhanced the conveyance allowance to all the Civil Servants i.e. from BPS-1 to 15, including the petitioners, which was subsequently revised vide another notification dated 20.12.2012 and was further enhanced. But the respondents without any valid and justiffable reasons stopped / deducted the payment of conveyance

TESTED XAMINER Peshawar High Court

allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period.

3. In essence, the grievance the petitioners is that they were receiving the conveyance allowance under the notifications mentioned above, which was stopped without any justifiable reason.

4. Since the matter pertain to grant of conveyance allowance which is part and parcel of pay. Similar controversy came before this Court in Writ Petition No. 3509-P/2014 titled (Hafiz Mohammad Ilyas etc..vs. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), wherein the pay and salary were defined in the following manner.

"7. To resolve the controversy as to whether payment of allowances to a civil servant falls in chapter-2 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 i.e. terms and conditions of service, it is necessary to reproduce the definition of "pay" provided in section 2(e) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 which reads as under:

"2. (e)—"Pay" means the amount drawn monthly by a civil servant as pay, and includes special pay, personal pay and any <u>other</u> <u>emoluments</u> declared by the prescribed authority to be paid." (emphasis provided).

The word "emolument" used in the above quoted definition clause of the Civil Servants Act, 1973, according to its dictionary meaning, denotes wages and benefits received as compensation for

fested

EXAMINER Peshawar High Court holding an office or having employment. The word emolument is basically derived from the Latin word emolumentum. It originally meant "the sum paid to a miller for grinding a customer wheat". Today, the term exists mostly as a bit of archaic legalese, but it might be within the route of expression i.e. "grinding out a living". From the above it is emoluments are essentially the manifest that benefits that one gets from the working of being employed. Emolument the profit is from employment and is compensation in return of services, hence the emoluments are part and parcel of pay. Section 17 being part of chapter-2 i.e. terms and conditions of service of a civil servant provides that, a civil servant appointed to a post shall be entitled, in accordance with rules, to the pay sanctioned for the post. Likewise, Rule 9(21) of (FR/SR) provide, the definition of pay which means the amount drawn monthly by a government servant às :

(i) the pay, other than special pay or pay granted in view of his personal qualification, which has been sanctioned for the post held by him substantively or in an officiating capacity, or to which he is entitled by reason of his position in a cadre, and (ii) overseas pay, technical pay, special pay and personal pay and

(iii) any other emoluments which may be specially classed as pay by the governor general.

The legislature in its wisdom has wisely used the word "pay" instead of salary in definition clause and section 17 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973. The word 'pay', connotes

TED

EXAMINER

payment of wages including emolument in broader spectrum while the salary is used for amount that one receives in return for work and or service provided, which is paid periodically i.e. over a specified interval of time such as weekly or most commonly monthly. The term "salary" has been dealt with at page-553 of Corpus Juris Secundern Vol. 77 as under:-

<u>"Salary"</u>. The word "Salary" is defined has meaning fixed compensation regularly paid by the year, quarter, month or week; fixed compensation for regular work, or for continuous services over a period of time; periodical compensation for services; compensation for services rendered; per annum compensation mean in official and in some other situation, or station; legal compensation.

Salary is also defined as meaning stipulated periodical recompense; or consideration paid, or stipulated to be paid to a person on regular interval for services usually a fixed sum to be paid by the year or half year, quarter; reward or consideration paid or agreed to be paid to a person on a regular intervals by the year, month or week for services; reward of fixed or recompense for services rendered or performed; reward or compensation of services rendered or performed.

From the above mentioned definition it is manifest that the "salary" of a civil servant is a fixed amount regularly paid as compensation to the employee, whereas the pay means an amount received by a civil servant including other emoluments i.e. allowances."



6..

5. Besides, certain other petitions filed by the Teachers /employees of the same department serving from other corners of the province which were decided by Abbottabad Bench of this Court, wherein it was held that the conveyance allowance being part of pay fall in terms and conditions of civil servant and it can adequately be claimed through an appeal by adopting the prescribed procedure under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1974.

6. For the reasons given hereinabove, the petitioners are civil servants and their claim falls in terms and conditions of service enumerated in Chapter-2 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973, wherein the jurisdiction of this Court is expressly barred by Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. Resultantly, this and the connected writ petition mentioned above stand dismissed being not maintainable. However, the petitioners are liberty to approach the proper forum, if so desire.

Announced on; 1st of October, 2019 <u>*Jarihad</u>*

JUDGE

 $\mathcal{N}'\mathcal{D}GE$

CERTIFIED TO BE TRUE COPY

2 1 QGT 2019

aday Order

(DB) Mr. Justice Rooh UI Amin Khan & Mr. Justice Mohammad Nacem Anwar

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND ACTION OF THE UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted redto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

24/10/19 **R/SHEWETH:**

I ESTON FACTS:

HERE R

لاحات

-1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

Peshewag 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat VS Govt

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Chairmái

11.11.2019

Certified () he ture copy

ESTANES

Μ

VAKALAT NAMA NO /20 IN THE COURT OF Kp Sexur Ce TR' hund yel Na (Appellant) (Petitioner) (Plaintiff) VERSUS Gdn Peft (Respondent) (Defendant) Soul Nar. I/We,

Do hereby appoint and constitute **SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI Advocate High Court Peshawar**, to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate/Counsel on my/our costs.

I/We authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter. The Advocate/Counsel is also at liberty to leave my/our case at any stage of the proceedings, if his any fee left unpaid or is outstanding against me/us.

Dated /20

(CLIENT

ACCEPTED

The Ko

SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI Advocate High Court Peshawar.

Cell: (0306-5109438)