Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

163

S.No.

1

1-

ĊΛ. Case No. /2021 Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings 2 3

29/01/2021 T Advocate ma

08-02-21

The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please.

REGISTRAR

This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on -2

MEMBER(J)

01.03.2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO.____/2020

Sarwat Jehan

VS

Education Deptt:.

INDEX.

S.NO	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	<u> </u>	1-4
2.	Copy of notification dated	A	05
•	20.12.2012		
· 3.	Copy of pay slip of vacation	В	06
4.	Copy of pay slip working	С	07
5.	Copy of departmental appeal	D	· 08 ·
6.	Copy of High Court Judgment	E	09-15
7.	Copy of tribunal judgment	F ·	16-17
8.	Vakalatnama		18

APPELLANT

THROUGH 7

(SYED NOMAN AI BUKHARI) ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1784 /2020

Khyber Palshtukhwa Service Tribunal
Diary No. 236
Dated 29/1/2021

Mst. Sarwat Jehan IPE GGHS Nizam Pur NRS .

.....APPELLANT

VERSUS

- 1. The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2. The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3. The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4. The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5. The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 6. District Education Officer (F) Nowshehra (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. District account officer Nowshehra (Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

......RESPONDENTS



APPEAL <u>UNDER SECTION-4 OF</u> THE KHYB<u>er</u> PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY **DEDUCTING** THE <u>CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF</u> THE APPELLANT **DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST** NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD **OF NINETY DAYS.**

PRAYER:

<u>THAT ON ACCEPTANCE</u> OF THIS APPEAL THE **RESPONDENTS MAY KINDLY BE DIRECTED NOT TO** MAKE **DEDUCTION OF** CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING VACATIONS PERIOD (SUMER **WINTER** & VACATIONS) AND MAKE THE PAYMENT OF ALL

OUTSTANDING AMOUNT OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE WHICH HAVE BEEN DEDUCTED PREVIOUSLY WITH ALL BACK BENEFITS BIENG SIMILAR PLACED EMPLOYEE. ANY OTHER REMEDY WHICH THIS AUGUST TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT THAT MAY ALSO BE AWARDED IN FAVOR OF THE APPELLANT.

<u>R/SHEWETH:</u>

ON FACTS:

5

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No.FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.7.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the precious notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Copy of the notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure A.
- 3. That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the salary slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure B & C.
- 4. That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed departmental appeal on 15.04.2020 but no reply has been received so far. Copies of the departmental appeal is attached as annexure-D.
- 5. That it is pertinent to mentioned here that feeling aggrieved some colleagues of appellant filed writ petition no.3162-P/2019 before the Peshawar High Court, Peshawar which was disposed of vide judgment dated 1.10.2019 with the direction to approach the proper forum i.e. service tribunal. Copies of the judgment is attached as annexure E.
- 6. That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august tribunal in different services appeal which was allowed by this august tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure F.

7. where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

<u>GROUNDS</u>

- A. That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B. That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C. That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D. That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E. That the Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same aer credited to this account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period,the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F. That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.

À7 10

G. That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.

- H. That according to Government Servants Revised leave rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I. That according to Article 38 (e) of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.

J. That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honourable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

لروت چران APPELLANT

THROUGH

(SYED NOMAN AI BUKHARI) ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

From

To:

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar ths: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govil of Knyber Pathtuskhwa. Finance Department. Penhawar,

All Administrative Secretaries to Gov. of Knyber Pakhturikhwa. The Sector Member, Board of Revense, Knyber Pakhturichwa. The Secretary to Governor Knyber Pakhturichwa. The Secretary to Chail Minoter, Khyber Pakhturichwa. The Secretary, Frontinial Arctically, Knyber Pakhturichwa. All Heods of Attaches Departments in Knyber Pakhturichwa.

At Disking Coordination Officereds Xhyser Pakhtankings.

Al Policical Agents / District & Secoloris Judges in Rhyper Pokterrikhwa

The Report Peshawar HymCost, Poshawar

The Chalaman, Rubic Service Conversion, Knyber Pokhiunkawa,

The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Kayber Pakhluckhwa,

Si și est

5.

ź.

ç,

Б.

Ţ

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear St.

The Governmant of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provinces Civil Servants Gover of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa (Working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1^e Sectember, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to BPS-39 will remain Urkhanged.

SNO BPS	EXISTING RATE (PH)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1 1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
2, 5-10	Ps.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
3, 11-15	1 Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2.720/-
4. 16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	R\$.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance of the above rates per month shall be admassible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 efficient who have not been sanctioned alfield vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzədə Sadod Ahmad) Secretary Finance

(INITIAZ AYUB)

Endste ND. FD:SO(SR-ID:S-52/2012

Dated Personan the 20" December, 2017

Car 64.

A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-

- Aboution: General Kinder Pakiturking, Pesicana
- Secrossies to Government of Punjab, Secth & Saboresian Francisco Dependitions All Augurennous / Serri Autonomous Bodies in Abroper Pakiturativa

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Subject:

From

To:

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2.	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2.720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshern Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)



Personal Information of Ms SAR	WAT JEHAN d/w/s of
Personnel Number, 00138444	CNIC: 99994020591
Date of Hinh: 10,10,1973	Entry into Govi, Service: 26.10.1993

NIN:

Length of Service: 25 Years 11 Months 006 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: INSTRUCTOR PHYSICAL EDUCA

80003765-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: NR6174-HEAD MISTRESS GGHS NIZAM PUR NOWSHERA Payroll Section: 001 GPF Section: 001 Cash Center: GFF A/C No: EDUNR 2079 Interest Applied! Yes GPF Balance:

537,604,60

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil BIS: 17

Pay Stage: 6	l
--------------	---

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pav	44,170.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	4,433.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00		Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	1.846.00
214S	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	940,00		Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	633.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,252,00	_	Adhoe Relief All 2017 10%	4,417.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	4,417.00		Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	2,208,00

Deductions - General

City:

Vendus Nundser. -Pay and Allowances:

Wage type	Amount	Wage (ype	Amount
3017 GPF Subscription	-4,270.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-800 00
3609 Income Tax		3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00		0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Lonn	Descrip	stion	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Luan Principal Instal		300,000,00	-10,000.00	120,000,00
Deductio Poyshic:	ns - Income Tay 11.871.58 Recovere	d till September-2019:	2,374,00 Exempted	k 0.67– Reco	venible: 9,498_24
Gross Pa	y (Rs.): 71.316.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-17,276.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	54,040.00
Account	ame: SARWAT JEHAN Number: 4816-9 tälls: NATIONAL BANK Öl	PPAKISTAN, 230382 N	OWSHERA CANTT N	SOWSHERA CANTI	г.
Leno:	Opening Balance;	Availed:	Earned;	Balance;	
Permane	ni Address: DEO F SECRY DWSHERA	NSR Doquicile: NW - Kb	nyber Pakhtuakhwa	Housing St	taux: No Official
Temp: A	delress	Emailt			

(SOAS6881727.09.2019/12.05:44) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupers 3) Errors & omissions excepted

Scanned with CamScanner

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)



Personal Information of Ms SARWAT JEHAN d/w/s of Personal Number: 00135444 CNIC: 99994020591 Date of Birth: 10.10.1973 Entry Into Govt. Service: 26.10.1993

NTN:

Length of Service: 25 Years 11 Manifes (06 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: INSTRUCTOR PHYSICAL EDUCA 80003765-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: NR6174-HEAD MISTRESS GGHS NIZAM PUR NOWSHERA Cash Center: Paynull Section: 001 GPF Section: 001 GPF A/C No, EDUNR 2079 GPF Batance: 537,604.00 Interest Applied: Yes Vealur Number: -Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 17 Pay Suger: 6 Pay and Allowances:

	Wage type	Animat	Waget	type Amount
0001	Basic Pav	44,170.00	000 House Rent Allow	ance 4,433.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5.000.00	947 Molicel Allow 15	N (16-22) 1.546.00
2145	15% Adhoe Relief All-2013	940.00	199 Adhoe Relief Alla	• @10% 633.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,252.00	224 Achoe Relief All 2	5017 10% 4.417.00
2247	Adhec Refiel All 2018 10%	4,417.00	265 Adhoc Relief AB	19 05% 2.208.00

Defacilizas - General

3

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Anacquet
3917	GPE Salescription	-4.270.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	_\$\$0 m
3609	lecome Tas	-1.056.00	3990 Emp Eds. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Compc	-900.00		0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Long	Descri	ptian	Principal amount	Deflaction	Balance
6905	GPF Loan Principal Instal		300,000.00	+10,000.00	120,000.00
Destaurt Loan	s - Income Tax				
Payable:		si till September-2019:	2,374.00 Exempted	: 0.66- Rocover	uble: 9,498.24
Gross Pay	(Rs.): 71,316.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-17,276.09	Net Pay: (Rs.): 54	48.84 G
Account N	ne: SARWAT JEHAN Sømber, 4816-9 Els: NATIONAL BANK O	F PARISTAN, 230382 N	OWSHERA CANTT N	OWSHERA CANTI.	
Account N	Samher; 4S16-9	F PARISTAN, 230382 N Availed:	OWSHERA CANTT N Earned:	OWSHERA CANTT. Belance:	
Account ? Bank Deta Leaves:	fember: 4816-9 Els: NATIONAL BANE O	Availed:			
Account ? Bank Deta Leaves:	Sember: 4816-9 sils: NATIONAL BANE O Opening Balance: 1 Address: DEO F SECRY	Availed:	Earned:		n: No Official
Account N Benk Deta Lenves: Permanen	Sember: 4816-9 Els: NATIONAL BANE O Opening Balance: Address: DEO F SECRY WSHERA	Availed; NSR	Earned:	Balance;	n: No Official

(SORSSSS)/27.09.2019/72:05:44) 2) All amounts are in Pall Report J) Errors & amissions excepted

Email:

The Secretary (E & SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,

as

Subject: <u>DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED</u> <u>ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY</u> <u>AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE</u> <u>ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER AND SUMMER VACATIONS.</u>

Respected sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self department and work with full zeal and zest and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. it is stated for kind information that conveyance allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14-7-2011 was issued . latter on vide revised notification dated 20-12-2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance while employees from BPS -16 to 19 have been treated under the previous notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance . Respected sir , I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of education department in Islamabad filed service appeal No. 1888 (R) CS/2016 before the federal service tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the honorable service tribunal vide its judgment dated 3.12.18 and also allowed by the Peshawar High court Peshawar in writ petition. That I also the similar employee of education department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue the same conveyance allowance which is granting to others employees . Copy attached . I am feeling aggrieved from the action of concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period preferred this department appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Your Obediently Saxwat Tehon.

Dated : 23.10.2020

Judgment Sheet

E-(9)

HCOD

IN THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

Writ Petition No. 3162-P/2019 Akhtar Hussain and 694, others..vs..Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

<u>JUDGMENT</u>

Date of hearing......01.10.2019..... Petitioner(s) by Mr. Noor Mohammad Khattak, Advocate. Mr. Mujahid Ali Khan, AAG, for respondents.

ROOH-UL-AMINKHAN, J:- Through this common judgment we, proposed to decided the instant as well as the connected writ petitions as all having involved common question of law and facts, the particulars of which are given below.

> WP No. 3162-P/2019 titled Akhtar Hussain etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3064-P/2019 titled Habeeb Ullah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

WP No. 3084-P/2019 titled Sikandar Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3178-P/2019 titled Abdur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

AMINER ar High Court



70 We Son

iï.

iii.

iv.

WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

vi.

ix.

X:

xi.

xii.

vii. WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

viii. WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khahetc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.

WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalid etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

STED AVINER ar High Court

xiii. WP No. 3567-P/2019 titled Husnur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 3 others.

3

WP No. 3667-P/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat etc...Vs.. xiv. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

> Syed Khurshid Shah WP No. 3939-P/2019 titled etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 5 others.

WP No. 4072-P/2019 titled Subhan Ullah etc...Vs.. xvi. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

xv.

xvii. WP No. 4758-P/2019 titled Sohrab Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

As per averments of the writ petition, the 2. petitioners are serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department on their respective posts. On 14.7.2011 the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa enhanced the conveyance allowance to all the Civil Servants i.e. from BPS-1 to 15, including the petitioners, which was subsequently revised vide another notification dated 20.12.2012 and was further enhanced. But the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped / deducted the payment of conveyance

ESTED

RAMINER Peshawar High Court

allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period.

3. In essence, the grievance the petitioners is that they were receiving the conveyance allowance under the notifications mentioned above, which was stopped without any justifiable reason.

4. Since the matter pertain to grant of conveyance allowance which is part and parcel of pay. Similar controversy came before this Court in Writ Petition No. 3509-P/2014 titled (Hafiz Mohammad Ilyas etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), wherein the pay and salary were defined in the following manner.

"7. To resolve the controversy as to whether payment of allowances to a civil servant falls in chapter-2 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 i.e. terms and conditions of service, it is necessary to reproduce the definition of "pay" provided in section 2(e) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 which reads as under:

"2. (e)—"Pay" means the amount drawn monthly by a civil servant as pay, and includes special pay, personal pay and any <u>other</u> <u>emoluments</u> declared by the prescribed authority to be paid." (emphasis provided).

The word "emolument" used in the above quoted definition clause of the Civil Servants Act, 1973, according to its dictionary meaning, denotes wages and benefits received as compensation for

STED

EXAMINER hawar High Court holding an office or having employment. The word emolument is basically derived from the Latin word emolumentum. It originally meant "the sum paid to a miller for grinding a customer wheat". Today, the term exists mostly as a bit of archaic legalese, but it might be within the route of expression i.e. "grinding out a living". From the above it is emoluments are essentially the manifest that benefits that one gets from the working of being employed. Emolument profit is the from employment and is compensation in return of services, hence the emoluments are part and parcel of pay. Section 17 being part of chapter-2 i.e. terms and conditions of service of a civil servant provides that, a civil servant appointed to a post shall be entitled, in accordance with rules, to the pay sanctioned for the post. Likewise, Rule 9(21) of (FR/SR) provide, the definition of pay which means the amount drawn monthly by a government servant as ; '

(i) the pay, other than special pay or pay granted in view of his personal qualification, which has been sanctioned for the post held by him substantively or in an officiating capacity, or to which he is entitled by reason of his position in a cadre, and (ii) overseas pay, technical pay, special pay and personal pay and

, (iii) any other emoluments which may be specially classed as pay by the governor general.

The legislature in its wisdom has wisely used the word "pay" instead of salary in definition clause and section 17 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973. The word 'pay', connotes

ESTED

EXAMINER

payment of wages including emolument in broader spectrum while the salary is used for amount that one receives in return for work and or service provided, which is paid periodically i.e. over a specified interval of time such as weekly or most commonly monthly. The term "salary" has been dealt with at page-553 of Corpus Juris Secundern Vol. 77 as under:-

6

<u>"Salary"</u>. The word "Salary" is defined has meaning fixed compensation regularly paid by the year, quarter, month or week; fixed compensation for regular work, or for continuous services over a period of time; periodical compensation for services; compensation for services rendered; per annum compensation mean in official and in some other situation, or station; legal compensation.

Salary is also defined as meaning stipulated periodical recompense; or consideration paid, or stipulated to be paid to a person on regular interval for services usually a fixed sum to be paid by the year or half year, quarter, reward or consideration paid or agreed to be paid to a person on a regular intervals by the year, month or week for services; reward of fixed or recompense for services rendered or performed; reward or compensation of services rendered or performed.

From the above mentioned definition it is manifest that the "salary" of a civil servant is a fixed amount regularly paid as compensation to the employee, whereas the pay means an amount received by a civil servant including other emoluments i.e. allowances."



5. Besides, certain other petitions filed by the Teachers /employees of the same department serving from other corners of the province which were decided by Abbottabad Bench of this Court, wherein it was held that the conveyance allowance being part of pay fall in terms and conditions of civil servant and it can adequately be claimed through an appeal by adopting the prescribed procedure under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1974.

6. For the reasons given hereinabove, the petitioners are civil servants and their claim falls in terms and conditions of service enumerated in Chapter-2 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973, wherein the jurisdiction of this Court is expressly barred by Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. Resultantly, this and the connected writ petition mentioned above stand dismissed being not maintainable. However, the petitioners are liberty to approach the proper forum, if so desire.

Announced on; 1st of October, 2019 <u>*Jarchad*</u>

JUDGE NDGE

CERTIFIE

TO BE TRUE COP

DCT 2019

(DB) Mr. Justice Roob UI Amin Khan & Mr. Justice Mohammad Nacem Anwar

F- (16

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE & SUMMER APPELLANT DURING WINTER THE OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted

Fledto-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant. 24/10/19

R/SHEWETH: TESTON FACTS:

estawag

-1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency euucation department as Certified Teacher (BPS See Tribanal and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat VS Govt

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Chairm

Certified in he ture copy Exclusion although the Khyler Takinughtwe Service Fribunal Peshawar

	VAKAL	AT NAMA		
	NO.		- 	
	IVU	/20		
IN THE COURT OF	Kp Sex	vice Trib	unal	
Saxwat	Jehan			(Appellant)
	VER	SUS	1	(Petitioner) (Plaintiff)
Edu (Deptt		(F	Respondent) Defendant)
I/We, Saxwal Jo	chan			

Do hereby appoint and constitute **SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI Advocate High Court Peshawar,** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate/Counsel on my/our costs.

I/We authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter. The Advocate/Counsel is also at liberty to leave my/our case at any stage of the proceedings, if his any fee left unpaid or is outstanding against me/us.

Dated _____ /20

CLIEN

<u>ACCEPTED</u>

SYED'NOMAN ALI BUKHARI Advocate High Court Peshawar.

