# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of			· .
Case No	16038	/2020	

S.No.	Date of order	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
	proceedings	
1	. 2	3
1	17/12/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafz
- ,		Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learne
		Member for proper order please.
		REGISTRAR .
. ·	·	This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be $\hat{\rho}$
		up there on $04/3/21$
•		
		MEMBER(J)
ļ		
	04.00.0004	Lange of Manager (7) is used to be a few thouses we then
	- 04 03 7071 - 1	l earned Member (1) is linder transfer, therefore the
	04.03.2021	
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
-	04.03.2021	
-	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
-	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
-	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	04.03.2021	
	04.03.2021	case is adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO.	/2020.
APPEAL NU.	77.07.0
AM I EMIE MOI	

**MUNEERA SULTAN** 

VS

**EDUCATION DEPTT:** 

## **INDEX**

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	A	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

**APPELLANT** 

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

**ADVOCATE** 

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. <u>/603&</u>/2020

MRS. MUNEERA SULTAN, SET (BPS-16)
GGHS CIVIL COLONY DISTRICT PESHAWAR

Personnel Number: 00051258

Û

APPELLANT

Diary No. 16019
Dated 17/12/2020

#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### **PRAYER**

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the egistral appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **SET (BPS-16)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Copy of the Notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is

applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
  - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

MUNEERA SULTAN

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE



## FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-62/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

From

The Secretary to Govt, of Khyther Paichtunkhwa, Finance Department,

Peshawar.

To:

All Administrative Sociataries to Govt. of Kityber Pakhtunkhwa. 2

The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhiunkhwa

The Secretary to Governor Khyber Pakhtunkniws 3. 4

The Secretary to Chief Minuscer Khybes Pakhlunkhwa. 5

The Sacretary, Provincial Ascendiy, Khyber Pakhturkhwa 6

All Heads of Altached Departments in Knyber Pakhtunkhiva 7

AF District Coordination Officers in Khyber Palchtunkings

All Political Agents / District & Sessions Judges in Khyber Pakistankhwa e.

8\_ The Registrier, Peshawar High Coort, Peshawar.

The Chairman, Public Service Commention, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 10

The Chairman, Services Tribunal Kiryoo Pakhunkhwa.

Subject

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. PROVINCIAL **GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19** 

Dear Sir

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enliance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servarats, Govt: of Kryber Pakhbunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain · unchanged.

S.NO	BP\$	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
<u> </u>	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u>2.</u>	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
<u>,</u> 3,	11-15	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	Rs.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Saoad Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Emdst: NO. FD/SO(SR-11)/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

Abburelant General Kinyber Pakhturkhwa, Peshawa:

Secretaries to Government of Punjob, Sindh & Solochisten, Finance Department

All Automorpous / Semi Autonomous Booles in Ringser Pakhtunkhwa

AFESTED

Salary superformed as Banaugust, 2016)

District Accounts Office Peshawar Dist. Monthly Salary Statement (August 2016)

#### Personal Information of Miss MUNIRA SULTAN d/w/s of ADD

Personnel Number: 00051258

CNIC: 14260084300

Date of Birth: 15.11.1952

Entry into Govt. Service: 18.03.1992

NTN-

Length of Service: 24 Years 05 Months 015 Day:

#### Employment Calegory: Active Permanent

Designation: SEMIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

80004301-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: PW6254-H/MISTRESS GGHS CIVIL COLONY, PESHAWAR Payroll Section: 002

**GPF Section: 001** 

Cash Center:

GPF A/C No. EDU 000147

Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

774,480,00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2016

Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 16

Pay Stage: 20

	Wage type	Ammend		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	41,480,00	1001	Husse Rent Allowance 45%	2,727.00
1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,318.00		Adhac Allowance 2010@ 50%	6,1BD.QD
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,220.00		Adhoc Relief Allow @ 10%	840.00
21.1	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	4,14 <b>8.0</b> 0		Adj. 15% Adhoc Allowance	1,382.00
1501	Adj Basic Pay	2.805.00		Adj:Adhse Relief All-2014	108.00
1964	Adj Adhoc Relief All 2015	280.00			0.00

#### Deductions - General

	Wage type	Ammu		Wage lype	Amount
J016	GPF Subscription - Rv2275	-2,275.00	1501	Benavaleni Fund	-250.00
3511	Addi Graup Insurance	-19.00	3604	Comp insurance	173.00
3609	Income Tax	00_860,1-	1	Emp.Edu. Fimd KPK	-125.00

#### Deductions - Losus and Advances

SAMPLE AND PERSONS				
1 comm	When we have a long to be a second			Control of the second section of the second
Logn	Description	Principal amount	i Deduction	Bulance
		The second secon		T The state of the

Deductions - Income Tex

Payable:

12,576,50

Recovered till August-2015:

1,568.00

Exempted: 418.30

Recoverable:

10,490.20

Gress Pay (Rs.): 63,488.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-3.892.00

Nel Pay: (Rs.): 50,596.00

Payee Name: MUNIRA SULTAN Account Number: PLS00000002701-2

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 231512 KOHAT ROAD KOHAT ROAD, Peshawar

LEBYES:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Halance:

Permanent Address: S D E O (F) PESHAWAR

City: Peshawar

Domšcile: NW - Klayher Pakhtunklova

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address: Cityo

Email: mounktk514@genzil.com

# Salary slip (00051258 January, 2017)

Montelly Salary Statement (Jenselly-2017)

#### Personal Information of Miss MUNIRA SULTAN d/wis of ADD

Personnel Number: 00051258

CNIC: 14260084300

Date of Bimb: 15.11.1962

Entry into Govi. Service: 18.03.1992

NTN:

Length of Service: 24 Years 10 Months 015 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanant

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

BOOKISON-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: FW6254-H/MISTRESS GGHS CIVIL COLONY, PESHAWAR

Payvoll Section: 002

**GPF Section: 001** 

Cash Center:

GPF A/C Not EDU 000147

Interest Applied: Yes

**GPF Balance**:

788,510.00

Vendar Number: •

Pay end Allowings:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2016

Thy Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16

Pay Stage: 21

	Wage type Amment			Wage type	Assument
00D1	Basic Pny	42,760.00	1.004	House Rent Allowance 45%	2,727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000,00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,318.00
1948	Adhoc Allowance 2010@ 50%	6,180.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief Alt-2013	1.220.00
2100	Adhoc Relief Allow @ 10%.	840.00		Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1.276.0D

#### Deductions - General

	Wage (ype	Ammust	Wage type		Ammint
3016	GFF Subscription - Rs2806	-2,805,00	3501	Benevolent Fued	-250.00
35CA	Inserne Tax	-910.00	OPPE	Emp.Edic Field KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			۵.00

#### Deductions - Laura and Advances

ı	I				
1	Logn	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Dalan
		The state of the s	a verse has aminimism	tacmerenen	Bulance (
				<u> </u>	

Deductions - Income Tex

Payables

16,888.60

Recovered till January-2017:

6,152.00

Exempted: 0191,50

Recoverable:

4,545.10

Grass Pay (Rs.): 65,321.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-4,760.00

Net Pay: (Rs.): 00,555.00

Payee Name: MUNIRA SULTAN

Account Number: PLS000000002701-2

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 231512 KOHAT ROAD KOHAT ROAD, Pentuwur

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Personnent Address: S D E O (F) PESHAWAR

City: Peshawar

Demicile: NW - Klayber Fakhtunklewa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address: City:

Email: mounktk514@gmail.com

ATMESTED

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 20.07.2020

Your Obediently

MUNEERA SULTAN

ATTESTED

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNX PESHAWAR.

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

#### **VERSUS**

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar...

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount Conveyance allowance which have been deducted wedte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

### 1.7. 1.51 / 12-R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for

Khyber

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marbad Hayet vs Got : 22 (

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Cartified t

File be consigned to the regord.

Polhawar ...

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

EV & L.wa

Chairman

, 2 (-1)

ATTESTE

 $\sim$ 

### **VAKALATNAMA**

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

	OF 2020
	(APPELLANT)
MUNEERA SULTAN	(PLAINTIFF)
	(PETITIONER)
<u>VERSUS</u>	
	(RESPONDENT)
Education Department	(DEFENDANT)
I/We MUNEERA SULTAN	ion for me/us as my/our nout any liability for his default or Advocate Counsel on my/our withdraw and receive on my/our
Dated/2020	CLIENT

**ACCEPTED** 

W\
MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI
ADVOCATE