FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

Court of /2020

Date of orderOrder or other proceedings with signature of judgeproceedings

1- 04/11/2020

S.No.

.1

2-

Case No.

2

The appeal presented today by Mr. Shahzaullah Yousafzai Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please.

2

REGISTRAR

MEMBER(J)

This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put

up there on 01/3/21

1.10

01.03.2021

The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

5.5

APPEAL NO. ____/2020

SAID GHULAM VS EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

INDEX

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	•••••	1-3
2.	Notification	A	5
3.	Pay slips	B & C	6-7
4.	Service tribunal judgment	D	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

SHAHZULLAH YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE

Flat no 4, Upper Floor, Juma khan plaza near FATA secretariat, Warsak road, Peshawar 0302-8578851

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

appeal no.<u>13726</u>/2020

Diary No. 141

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary E&SE Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director E&SE Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary Education Department as senior English teacher (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of his superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS- 16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by

- 4- That some employee of E&SE department approached to this august Tribunal against illegal deduction of conveyance allowance in different service appeal which were allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure......**D**.
- 5- That the appellant filed departmental appeal against the illegal action of deduction of conveyance allowance, but the same has not been responded by respondents within statutory period of ninety days. Copy of departmental appeal is annexed as annexure......**E**.
- 6- That feeling aggrieved from action and inaction of the respondents and having no other remedy the appellant filed the instant appeal on following grounds inter alia.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is governed by Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail

04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.

- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and discriminatory hence not tenable in the eye of law.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

APPELLANT

ndelen Said Ghulam

THROUGH: Shahzullah yousafzai & Kamran khan advocates BETTER COPY PAGE-

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 8. Ali Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: <u>REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE</u> <u>CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL</u> <u>GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19</u>

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1^{a} September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate	(PM)
1.	114	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-	· · · ·
2.	5-10	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,840/-	
3.	11-15	Rs. 2.000/-	Rs. 2.720/-	
4.	16-19	Rs. 5.000/-	Rs. 5,000/-	 -

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012.

A - (

t i i

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PARHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT REGULATION

NO. FEISCISR-IIka-5212212 Dated Roshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Gove of Knybor Pachusiawa, Finance Department. Peanawar.

און אמושרואביבווער פרמעבאיאט ש פטיי בי אבינים אמושביוער The Serior Llember, Good of Reverse Direct Posteur Pasteur יויביביאקראוס בייוידי איזייבי איזיאריביציאון איז איזיינייבי איזיינייבי איזיינייבי הי שמומברי ום בישוווראבר איזבי אמומבור איזבי איז אמומבי איז The Secretary, Bernow Argens , Knizer Palaterstana את ליוצואית כסיישור בביר וואידיבה אוידבו סביוובילאיייב. A. Policical Agents, District & Samions durges in Kinster Publicishing The Replaced Restaur Han Coord Pashann

The Chairman Public Service Contractor, singler Potheunitana. Ine Charman, Gember Tribund, Kirpon Parhiseking.

REVISION IN THE PATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PROVINCIAL SOVERNMENT BPS 1-12

Dear Sh.

抑 From:

The Government of Yhvier Patheestive has been cheased to enhance revise the nete of Conveyance Allowance admiced deviced inter Provinces Ovil Servanial Service a houser personanchure (vionance & eps-1.10 eps-15) welt nom 15 Sectember - and 2 st the following rates. However, the conveysince allowance for employees in SPA-15 to 605-19

hall remain with angles.

· · ·		FOTSTING RATE (PH) REVISED RATE (PH)-
S.NO	625	EXISTING RATE (PH) REVISED RATE (PM)-
	1	KS L. NUO
		Rs.1.840
ŕ	5-10	
		RS. 2. 600
2.		RS.5,000/-
· · · · ·	6-19	200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200 - 200

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates out month shall be screasible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not the maintimest effectal waring

捉SIED

Yours Fathiult.

Sahibada Saod Ahmad Sacralan Facance

> INTEAZ AYCE! מהדיפצ וכיווי אין

Datel Person the 20" Trees her, 21-3

Findate NC: FD:SOXSR-ID-8-522012 A Copy is loswarded for information to the

ran: General Within Pakiting Paring האיזאר האיזאר איז איזארא איז איזאר איזאר איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא איזארא

Dist. Govt.	NWFP-Prov	incial
District Accoun	ts Office Dir at '	Timargar
Monthly Salar	y Statement (Ju	ly-2020)
	#	.



Personal Information of Mr SAID GHULAM d/w/s of ISMAIL KHAN

Personnel Number: 00724486	CNIC: 1530398656753
Date of Birth: 04.09.1985	Entry into Govt. Service: 01.05.2014

NTN:

يرجع المرجع المحد

Length of Service: 06 Years 03 Months 001 Days

Employment Category: Act	tive Permanent		
Designation: SENIOR ENG	LISH TEACHER	80001426-DISTRICT GOVERNME	NT КНҮВЕ
DDO Code: DA6031-GHSS	SAMAR BAGH		۰.
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:	
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: No	GPF Balance:	43,420.00
Vendor Number: -			
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 3
<u>_</u>			

	Wage type	Amount			Amount
0001	Basic Pay	23,470.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1924	UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G/NG)	1,500.00	1974	Medical Allowance 2011	1,136.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,588.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,347.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,347.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,347.00

Deductions - General

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3016 GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00	4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	iption	Principal amount		Deduction		Balance	
Deductions - In Payable:		ed till July-2020:	0.00 E	Exempted: 0.	00 Rec	coverable:	0.00	
Gross Pay (Rs.):	37,462.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,940.00	Ne	et Pay: (Rs.):	32,522.00		
	er: 17447900223503	fed, 221744 Samar e	BAGH SAMAR	BAGH, SAN	AAR BAGH			
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:		Balance	:		

Permanent Address:Domicile: -Housing Status: No OfficialCity: SAMARBAGHDomicile: -Housing Status: No OfficialTemp. Address:Email:

STED

(265994/23.07.2020/15:02:59) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors'& omissions excepted

	Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (August-2020)		
Personal Information of Mr S Personnel Number: 00724486	SAID GHULAM d/w/s of ISMAIL KHAN CNIC: 1530398656753	NTN:	$C - \gamma$
Date of Birth: 04.09.1985	Entry into Govt. Service: 01.05.2014	,,	rvice: 06 Years 04 Months 001 Days
Employment Category: Activ	e Permanent		

Employment Category. At	arve i el manene						
Designation: SENIOR ENC	LISH TEACHER			80001426-DISTRICT GO	OVERNMEI	NT KHYBE	
DDO Code: DA6031-GHS8	S SAMAR BAGH	÷,					
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	<u>,</u> ,	۰	Cash Center:			
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: No	1		GPF Balance :		46,760.00	
Vendor Number: -							
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For	- 2017	7.	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 16	Pay Stage	e: 3
	4						

				•	
	Wage type •.	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	23,470.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2.727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1560	Science Teaching Allowan	200.00
1924	UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G/NG)	1,500.00	1974	Medical Allowance 2011	1,136.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,588.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,347.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,347.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%*	2,347.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description		Principal amount		Deduction		Balance	
Deductions - Payable:	Income Ta 0.00		red till August-2020:	0.00	Exempted: (0.00 R	Recoverable:	0.00
Gross Pay (R	s.): 42	,662.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,940.00) N	let Pay: (Rs.):	37,722.00)

Payee Name: SAID GHULAM

Account Number: 17447900223503

Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 221744 SAMAR BAGH SAMAR BAGH, SAMAR BAGH

Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:
		· •		
Permanent	Address:			
City: SAM	ARBAGH	Domicile: -		 Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Add	ress:		ATTESTED	
City:		Email:	ALCOLD	
			6	
			84	
			\sim	
			. *	

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRUENN PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPELLAN

- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

24/10/19

EXAMPLER

Pece Tribunal. Deshawar

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fledte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ATTESTON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency Kittle Pakkrunkhwe and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 Whereby, the conveyance allowance for employees LJICL

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat VS Giovt

Ø. 9

Counsel for the appellant present.

11.11.2019

Certified () he ture copy

Peshawar

hturkhwe

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal. Service TribunaL in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already, made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01:10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract, over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Chairmár

File be consigned to the record Sici

11.11.2019

ANNOUNCED

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTM	IENTA	<u>L AP</u>	PEAL	AGAIN	ST TH	<u>E IMPU</u>	GNED
ACTION	OF	THE	CON	CERNE	D AU	FHORITY	<u>/ BY</u>
ILLEGAL	LY A	ND U	JNLAV	VFULLY	DED	UCTING	THE
CONVEYA	ANCE	ALL	OWAN	CE D	URING	WINTE	CR &
SUMMER	VACA	FIONS					•

E-10

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I was the employee of your good self. Department and is serving as SET (BPS- 16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance : Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance , as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leaves period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service. appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I am also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: .01.08.2020

iestei

Your Obediently - Labellan

Said Chulam SET, GHSS Samar Bagh, Dir lower.

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

stud Ghulen

(APPELLANT) (PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

(RESPONDENT)

____(DEFENDANT)

VERSUS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

I/We <u>Said Ghilan</u> Do hereby appoint and constitute **SHAHZULLAH** YOUSAFZAI, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated.____/2020

SonidBohuler CLIENT(S)

ACCEPTED SHAHZULLAH YOUSAFZAI **KAMRAN KHAN ADVOCATES**