

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

SERVICE APPEAL NO. 11824 /2020

DR. SADAF JAMIL

V/S

HEALTH DEPARTMENT & OTHERS

<u>INDEX</u>

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	••••	1 – 6
2.	Appointment order dated 05-10-2007	Α	6 – 9
3.	Arrival report & Posting order dated 23.10.2007	В	10 – 11
4.	Order dated 04.04.2009	C	12
5.	Application dated 02.08.2011 & Notification dated 27.11.2011	D	13 – 14
[*] 6.	Posting Order dated 13.05.2013 & Arrival Report dated 13.05.2013	Е	15 – 16
7.	Request for Regularization & Approval Order dated 25.06.2013	F	17 – 18
8.	Application, forwarding letter dated 16.06.2016 & Notification dated 11.07.2014	G	19 – 21
9.	Order date 27.03.2015, address receipt along with other relevant documents	Н	22 – 25
10.	Impugned order dated 29.07.2015	Į	26
11.	Application	. J	27
12.	Fact finding inquiry report	K	28 – 31
13.	Objection dated 03.11.2016	L	32 – 36
14.	Medical reports	М	37 – 84
15.	Departmental Appeal dated 02.06.2020	N	85
16.	Application dated 31.08.2020	0	86
17.	Wakalatnama	*******	87

Dated: 29-09-2020

Through:

MUHAMMAD MAAZ MADNI ADVOCATE

FLATE NO. 04, 2ND FLOOR, JUMA KHAN PLAZA, NEAR FATA SECRETARIAT, WARSAK ROAD, PESHAWAR

0345-9090737, 0314-9965666.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR Khyber Pakhtukhy Service Tribunal

SERVICE APPEAL NO. 11824 /2020

Diary No. 10808

Dr. SADAF JAMIL d/o Muhammad Jamil Khan, WMO (BPS-17)
H# 322, St# 49, Sector-F, Safari House, Phase-8, Behria Town, Rawalpindi.

APPELLANT

VERSU**S**

- 1. GOVT. OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar.
- 2. THE SECRETARY, GOVT. OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, Health Department, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar.
- 3. THE DIRECTOR GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES,
 Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, FATA Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar.
 RESPONDENTS

SERVICE APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE INACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY NOT. ADJUSTING/ISSUING PROPER POSTING ORDER IN RESPECT OF THE APPELLANT& BY NOT RELEASING MONTHLY SALARY OF THE APPELLANT STOPPED SINCE AUGUST 2015 AND **AGAINST** NOT TAKING ANY ACTION ONTHE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL DATED 02-06-2020 APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF 90 DAYS

PRAYER:

29) Re-submitted to Registrate

That on acceptance of the instantservice appeal the inaction of the respondent by not adjusting/issuing proper posting order in respect of appellant& stopping the monthly salary of the appellant may very kindly be declared as illegal and proper posting order be issued with release of monthly salaries stopped since August 2015 with all consequential back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favour of the appellant.

Respectfully Sheweth:

FACTS:



Brief facts which give rise to the instant appealare as under:-

- 1. That, the appellant is the Law abiding, peaceful & bonafide citizen of Pakistan having domicile of District Mohmand (erstwhile FATA) and is the employee of the respondent Department.
- 2. That appellant is appointed as Women Medical Officer (BPS-17) on the proper recommendation of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Service Commission at Serial No. 70 of appointed order dated 05/10/2007 and placed the services of the appellant at the disposal of Ex-Director Health Services FATA.

3. Thatappellantsubmitted her arrival report before Director Health Services FATA on 18/10/2007 and accordingly the appellant was further posted and placed her services in Agency Headquarter Hospital Khar Bajaur Agency now District Bajaur vide order dated 23/10/2007.

4. That the appellant after working for sufficient time was allowed to work as Assistant Director (Technical) in Population Welfare Department of FATA with further direction that the appellant will draw her salary from her original place of posting vide order dated 04.04.2009.

5. That appellant was awarded scholarship from Australian Development Scholarship program for Master in Public Health (Epidemiology) in Australia 2012 when the appellant was working as Assistant Director in EPI Cell which was for a period of One Year from January 2012 to December 2012, hence, the appellant submitted application for NOC on 02/08/2011 which was allowed/approved vide notification dated 27/11/2011.

Copy of Application & Notification dated 27.11.2011 is attached as ANNEXURE............D.

6. That after successful completion of the training course the appellant came back and submitted her arrival report in Ex-DHS FATA for further posting and as such the appellant was posted as Assistant Director (EPI) FATA with immediate effect vide order dated 13/05/2013 and in response thereof the appellant

submitted her arrival report on the post of Assistant Director EPI FATA.

7. That the appellant submitted a request for regularization of her gap period w.e.f 01/03/2013 to 13/05/2013 which was approved and the gap period between 01/03/2013 to 13/05/2013 was regularized vide notification dated 25/06/2013.

8. That the appellant has to attend Graduation Ceremony in Australia therefore, the appellant moved an application for Ex-Pakistan Leave from 15th June 2014 to 31st August 2014, which was forwarded vide letter dated 16/06/2014 and was finally approved vide respondent no. 2 notification dated 11/07/2014.

9. That astonishingly monthly salary of the appellant was stopped from August 2015 by the then Director Health Services FATA vide letter dated 29/07/2015 without showing any cogent/plausible reason or any intimation letter of stopping monthly salary and inquiring the appellant was informed that inquiry has been started against the appellant in a frivolous and ambiguous charge from the office of respondent no. 3 and one Dr. Muhammad Asif (BS-19) Coordinator of (PH) DHO Office Peshawar is nominated as inquiry officer for fact finding inquiry vide order dated 27/03/2015 when the appellant approached the office DHS FATA the appellant was informed that your home address is incorrect that's why not contacted well in time hence the appellant submitted her complete home address along with contact no. to the concerned official in the office of Director Health Services FATA and also informed the official that I have neither changed my contact no. nor closed my email address through which I can easily be contacted.

10. That the appellant was made a pendulum between the office of respondent no. 2 & the then DHS FATA office and finally

received a copy of the fact finding inquiry from the office of respondent no. 2 when the appellant submitted a request for meeting with respondent no. 2 vide application dated 05/08/2016.

Copy of the Application & fact finding inquiry report is attached as ANNEXURE J & K.

11. That the appellant after receiving the fact finding inquiry report also submitted an objection/observation report vide dated 03/11/2016 which was allotted with proper dairy no. 19336 from the office of respondent No. 2 and perused the same by visiting different office including the office respondent no. 1 till March 2017 but no fruitful or any reasonable result has been received to the appellant that deteriorated the mental and physical health of the appellant which lasted recently when the appellant recovered for Fibroid and Uterine Artery Embolization surgery.

12. That when the appellant get a little bit health the appellant filed Departmental Appeal dated 02/06/2020 before respondent no. 2 against not issuing proper posting/adjustment order and stoppage of monthly salaries stopped since August 2015 which was allotted a proper dairy no. 5888, and after laps of 90 when the appellant did not received any response also filed a request for providing a copy of order (if any) passed in response to the departmental Appeal dated 02/06/2020 vide request dated 31/08/2020 but till date no response has been received so far.

13. That the appellant having no other efficacious, adequate and alternate remedy but to approach this Honourable Tribunal on the following grounds amongst others:

GROUNDS:

- A. That act and omission of the respondents by not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is against the Law, Rules, Fact & material available on record hence not tenable in the eye of Law and needs interference of this Honourable Tribunal.
- B. That the appellant has not been treated by the respondents in accordance with Law and Rules on the subject noted above and

- as such the respondents are clearly violating Article 4, 9, 10-A and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C. That the respondents have not acted in accordance with Law and the rules governing on the subject matter by not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015which is illegally stopped since August 2015.
- D. That only a fact finding ex-parte inquiry has been initiated against the appellant upon which objection/observation has been raised over the inquiry conducted but that too was not responded with any fruitful result.
- E. That acts and omission of the respondents while not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is nothing but just to harass the appellant by one way or the other.
- F. That monthly salaries of the appellant has been stopped since August 2015 vide the impugned order dated 29.07.2015 which is highly been deprecated by the Apex Supreme Court of Pakistan in its various judgment that salary could not be stopped in anyway and even then the salary of the appellant has not been released.
- G. That, acts and omission on the part of the respondents while not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is neither in the public interest nor in the exigencies of service.
- H. That acts and omission of the respondent while not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is nothing but performed a misconception of law and under a wrong law hence it had vitiated entire proceedings, which could not be sustained under the law and is liable to be struck down.
- 1. That the act and omission on the part of the respondents by not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is clear violation of Article- 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic republic of Pakistan which states that:

"to reduce disparity in the income and earning of the individual including the persons in Service of Pakistan".

J. That act and omission on the part of the respondents while not adjusting/issuing proper posting order to the appellant and also

not releasing monthly salary stopped since Aug 2015 is also against the Natural Justice and hence liable to be struck down.

C. That any other grounds will be raised at the time of arguments with prior permission of this Honourable Tribunal.

It is, therefore most humbly prayed thatthe appeal of the appellant may very kindly be accepted as prayed for.

Dated: 29-09-2020

Appellant 09/2020

DR. SADAF JAMIL

Through

MUHAMMAD MAAZA

Advocate,

High Court, Peshawar.

(POWER OF ATTORNEY)



PESHAWAR

•	Ser	vice Appeal No	/2020
DR. SADAF JAMIL	VS	HEALTH DEP	TT: & Others
I, <u>Dr. Sadaf Jamil</u> MUHAMMAD MAAZ MADN the above matter for me/us and c	I. Advocate, High	reby nominated and Court, Peshawar, to last agreed to appear, p	be counsel in
answer in the above court or any transferred in the above matter statements, accounts, exhibits, connection with the said matter and occuments or copies of document and other writs or subpoena and other execution, warrants or orde out; and to apply for and receive to arbitration, and to employ an power and authorities hereby cor	appellate court of as and is agreed compromises or rising there from is, depositions etc to apply for and r and to conduct payment of any of other legal practit	to sign and file petit other documents whand also to apply for a and to apply for and is get issued any arrest, a any proceedings that merall sums or submit the	tion, appeals, hatsoever, in and receive all ssue summons attachment or hay arise there above matter to exercise the
AND to do all acts legally respects whether herein specified of AND I/WE hereby agree to ratify under or by virtue of these prese always that I/WE undertake at authorized agent shall inform the may be dismissed in default, it be responsible for the same. All costs his nominee, and if awarded again IN WITNESS WHERE OF I contests of which have been explanation.	or not, as may be y and confirm all ent or of the usual the time of call advocate and male proceeded expans awarded in favoust shall be payablowle bereunto set	proper and expedient. Iawful acts done on rail practice in such mattering of the case by the him appear in the content of the said counsel shour shall be the right of MY/OUR hand to the said to the	my/our behalf; er. PROVIDED ne court I/MY ourt, if the case, all not be held the counsel or se presents, the
of <u>Sep</u> 2020.	09/2020		
EXECUTANT (Dr. Sadaf Jamil)			
(2000)		•	· ·

Accepted subject to the terms regarding fees:

MUHAMMAD MAAZ MADNI, 28/9/2020

ADVOCATE HIGH COURT,

PESHAWAR BC No. (BC-11-1460) CNIC No. 17101-9263898-1

BEFORE THE HONORABLE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

SERVICE APPEAL NO. 11824 OF 2020

Dr. Sadaf Jamil	Appellant
Versus	:
Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and others	Respondents
Respectfully Sheweth:	
PARAWISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENTS	
Preliminary Objections:-	1

- 1. That the appellant has got neither cause of action nor did locus standi to file
 - 2. That the appellant has filed the instant Appeal just to pressurize the respondents.
 - 3. That the instant appeal is against the prevailing Law and Rules.
 - 4. That the appeal is not maintainable in its present form and also in the present circumstances of the issue.
 - 5. That the appellant has filed the instant appeal with mala-fide intention hence liable to be dismissed.
 - 6. That the appellant has not come to the Tribunal with clean hands.
 - 7. That the appeal is time barred.

the instant appeal.

- 8. That the Honorable Tribunal has no Jurisdiction to adjudicate upon the matter.
- 9. That the instant appeal is bad for mis-joinder of unnecessary and non-joinder of the necessary parties.

ON FACTS:

- 1. Pertains to record, hence no comments.
- 2-7 Correct.
- 8. Correct. However, it is pertinent to mention here that: *
 - i. The appellant was granted 76 days Ex-Pakistan Leave w.e.f. 15/06/2014 vide Notification dated 11/07/2014 (*Annex-A*).
 - ii. The appellant was bound to resume her official duties after expiry of her leaves on 30/08/2014 but the appellant did not submit her arrival report.
 - Director (Technical) Population Welfare Department FATA for the purpose of pay vide order No. 14451-55/DHS/FATA/Admn dated 04/08/2014 (*Annex-B*) and surprisingly the appellant

- came on the same date to the office of Assistant Director (EPI) who was on leave and handed over the charge.
- iv. The appellant unlawfully retained the official vehicle in her possession for five months and returned the vehicle on 17/01/2015 but without log book.
- v. Willful absence of the appellant from official duty was reported to Health Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa vide letter dated 05/03/2015 (*Annex-C*).
- 9. Correct. The appellant did not submit her arrival after expiry of Ex-Pakistan Leave on 30/08/2014 and received salary without performing duty upto 2015. When the matter was pointed out, her willful absence was reported to Secretary Health Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and her salary was stopped vide letter dated 29/07/2015 already attached with the Appeal as annexure-I and enquiry was also initiated against the Appellant vide order dated 27/03/2015 already attached with the appeal as annexure-H. The then DHS FATA and enquiry office issued proper notices at her home address vide letters (Annex-D) but the appellant failed to report.
- 10. Pertains to record, hence no comments.
- 11. Pertains to record, hence no comments.
- 12. Pertains to record, hence no comments.
- 13. Incorrect. In light of the above factual position, the appellant has no right to file the instant appeal.

ON GROUNDS:

- A. Incorrect. The act of the Respondents is not against the law and rules because during her Ex-Pakistan Leave, the appellant was posted against the post of Assistant Director (Technical) Population Welfare Department FATA for the purpose of pay vide order dated 04/04/2009 but the appellant did not submit her arrival report after expiry of Ex-Pakistan Leave and absented herself from official duty without further prior leave. Therefore, her salary was stopped.
- B. Incorrect. The Respondents did not violate the Article of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 as already explained in preceding para.
- C. Incorrect. Detailed reply has already been given in preceding para.
- D. Incorrect. The notices were issued at her home address but the appellant failed to report.
- E. Incorrect. Reply has already been furnished in Para-A.
- F. Correct to the extent of stoppage of her salary due to her willful absence from duty.
- G. Incorrect as already explained in Para-A.



- H. Incorrect as already explained in preceding paras.
- 1. Incorrect as already explained in preceding paras.
- 1. Incorrect as already explained in preceding paras.
 - K. The replying respondents also seek prior permission of this Honorable Court to adduce additional grounds at the time of arguments.

PRAYER:

It is therefore humbly prayed that on acceptance of the comments, the instant Appeal of the Appellant may very graciously be dismissed with costs.

Characteristic Core J Kharacteristic Core J Respondent No. 91

Secretary to Govt, of

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Health Departmen

Respondent No. 02 - 1

Director General Health Services, Khyber Rakhtunkhwa.

Passandant No. 02

Respondent No. 03

A



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA HEALTH DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the 11th July, 2014

MOTIFICATION

No.SO(H)E-II/1-5/2013: The Competent Authority is pleased to grant 76-days, Ex-Pakistan Leave, w.e.f. 15.06.2014 or from the date of availing, in respect of · Dr. Sadaf Jamil, Assistant Director (BS-17), EPI FATA, Peshawar.

Furthermore, this department has no objection over proceeding abroad of the doctor cancerned.

Secretary Health. KHYBER PÅKHTUNKHWA

Endst. No. & date even.

Copy to the:

1. Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

⇒ 3. DHS FATA Peshawar.

4. PS to Secretary Health.

5. PA to Special Secretary Health.

6. Deputy Director (IT), Health Department.

7. Officer concerned.

(Misbah Riez). Section Officer(E-il)



DIRECTORATE OF HELATH SERVICES FATA FATA SECRETARIAT WARSAK ROAD PESHAWAR.

OFFICE ORDER

As approved by the competent authority, the following posting/adjustment of doctors is hereby ordered in the best interest of public service with immediate effect.

S#	Name	From	To	Remarks
1	Dr. Sahibzada	Waiting for	Assistant Director	Vice No. 2 below
; ;	Khalid, M.O	posting	EPI FATA	
2-	Dr. Sadaf	Assistant	Assistant Director	Against the vacant
August 1	Jamil. WMO	Director EPI	Technical	post for the
		FATA	Population	purpose of pay.
			Welfare FATA	0. U

Director Health Services FATIA, Peshawar

No. 14457-55 /DHS/FATA/Admn Dated: 4

Copy forwarded to the:-

- 1- AGPR Sub Office Peshawar.
- 2- Assistant Director EPI FATA.
 - 3- Deputy Director Population Welfare FATA.
 - 4- PA to Secretary AI&C, FATA.
 - 5- Officers concerned.



DIRECTORATE OF FEALTH SERVICES

FATA SECRETARIAT, WARSAK ROAD, PESHAWAR

्रास्त्रे 091-921C212. Pdx + 091-9212110.

Dated: 5_/03/2015.

The Secretary Health, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

WILLFUL ABSENCE FROM DUTY.

Dear Sir.

It is to inform your good office that Dr. Sadaf Jamil was appointed as Woman Medical Officer (WMO) through Public Service Commission vide Notification No. SOH (E-II)/3-18/2007 dated 05-10-2007 and her services were placed at the disposal of Directorate of Health Services FATA for further posting. She was initially posted against the vacant post of WMO at Agency Headquarter Hospital, Bajaur on 23-10-2007. She was, later on, posted as Assistant Director EP; ride Office Order No. 7770-75/DHS/FATA/Admn, dated 13-05-2013.

She forwarded an application for 76 days Ex-Pakistan leave w.e.f 15-06-2014 which was subsequently granted vide Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Health Department Notification No. 50(H)F-II/1-5/2013, dated 11-07-2014. She was bound to resume her official duties after expire the leave on August 30, 7014 but she did not submit her arrival report till date.

Assistant Director (Technical), Population Welfare Department FATA for the purpose of payinde Office Order No. 14451-55/DHS/FATA/Admn, dated 04-08-2014, and surprisingly, she came on the same date to the office of Assistant Director EPI though was on leave and handed over the charge and, thereafter did not visit the EPI section of this Directorate as stated by the newly upsted Assistant Director EPI in his Note for Record addressed to the Director Health Services FATA. Furthermore, she unlawfully retained the official vehicle in her possession for five months and returned it on 17-01-2015 without Log Book.

The aforementioned factual status clearly advocates that she has deliberately made herself absent from her legitimate official duties till date and, hence the case is forwarded to your good office for further necessary action in the matter, phase.

6597 - 6600

_/DHS/FATA/Admn. dated 5 /03/2015

Copy forwarded for information to:

1. Secretary Social Sectors, FATA Secretariat, Peshawar.

2. Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3. Deputy Director (Admn), DHS FATA, Peshawar.

4. Deputy Director, Population Welfare Department, FATA, Pestjawar.

Director Health Services,

Director Health Services.

FATA, Peshawar.

3.4.5

DIRECTORATE OF HEALTH SERVICES FATA

FATA SECRETARIAT WARSAK ROAD PESHAWAR

No 20359/DHS/FATA/Admin

Dated:

7 09 72015

Dogist

Dr. Sadaf Jamil WMO, H. No. 90, Street #9, Sector L-1, Phase-3 Hayat Abad Peshawar.

Subject- APPEAL FOR JUSTIFICATION PROVIDED IF JUSTIFICATION STILL EXISTS IN THIS SYSTEM.

Enclosed please find herewith a letter of Director General Health Services.

Knyber Pakhtunkhwa along with its enclosure on the subject noted above.

You are directed to appear before the inquiry committee on 06.10.2015 at 10.00AM in the office of Director Administration. Director General Health Services, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.

39

Director Health Services, FATA Peshawar

3

10360-61 /DHS/FATA/Admin

Copy to the:-

》,有的Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Health Department Khyber 中Peshawar.

Director General Health Services, Khyber Bakhtunkhwa w/r.to his letter No. 15748-50/E-I dated 17.09.2015.

Bar ece

J Director Health Services
FATA Peshawar

\$ 17



KHYBER PAKHTUNKWA

SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

No. <u>640 18</u>

Dated: 7 - 3 - 12022

All communications should be addressed to the Registrar KPK Service Tribunal and not any official by name.

Ph:- 091-9212281 Fax:- 091-9213262

То

The Director General Health Services, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

JUDGMENT IN APPEAL NO. 11824/2020. SADAF JAMIL.

I am directed to forward herewith a certified copy of Judgement dated 26.01.2022 passed by this Tribunal on the above subject for strict compliance.

Encl: As above

REGISTRAR

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR