# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

. Court of\_

16150

	Case No	16150 12020
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1 .	2	3
1-	18/12/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafzai Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned
		Member for proper order please.
~		REGISTRAR ,
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on $4/3/24$
		MEMBER(J)
•		
	04.03.2021	Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the case is
	•	adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
		s. B
		READER
•		

# **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL**

# **PESHAWAR**

APPEAL NO. \_\_\_\_\_ /2020.

# NASRUMIN ALLAH VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

## **INDEX**

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	Α	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama	- ·	10

### APPELLANT

# THROUGH:

**MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE**/

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

# Spare copies will be submitted ${\cal M}$ After submission of the case.

### <u>BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL</u>

PES	SHAWAR_
APPEAL NO.	16/50/2020

MR. NASRUMIN ALLAH, SET (BPS-16) GHS AMANGARH NOWSHERA Personnel Number: 00137955 Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribuaul Diary No. 16696 Dated 18/12/2020

#### VERSUS

APPELLANT

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### **PRAYER**

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the uppellant.

# R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **SET (BPS-16)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019..... E.
- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981
- while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANA Atta 1 NASRUMIN ALLAH THROUGH: M) **MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE** 

# FINANCE DEPARTMENT

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/2-52/2012

The Secretary to Gov	t. of H	(hýber	Pak	htunk	nwa,
Finance Department,	. :	: .	•.		•
Peshawar.			•	•	
			• •		

- All Administrative Scotteraries to Gov. of Writer Pakhtunkhiva.
- The Senior Member, Soad of Revenue, Knyber Pakhius/diale The Secretary to Governor Knyber Pakhius/Mise
- The Secretary to Chief Minoster, Khyber Pakhankhwa,
- The Secretary, Provincial Arcembly: Khyber Pakhlurkhwa
- All Heads of Attached Department's in Knyber Pakhoinkiywa.
- Al District Coordination Officerson Kityber Patchtunkhurp.
- All Political Agents / Destict & Stations Judges in Khyber Pakiturikhwa
  - The Registrer, Peshawar Ligh Coort. Peshawar,
- The Chelman, Public Service Commession, Khyber Pakhtun Khwa,
- The Chaimen, Services Tribundi, Kinyoo: Pakhiunkhwa

Subject.

Fran

Tp:

こう

4 5

ñ

7

8. 91

70

**Zer** N

#### REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of thyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) will firch 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain suschanged.

S.NO	8PS-	TX TA	EXISTING RATE	(PM) REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4		Rs.1,500/+	Rs.1,700/-
.2,	5-10		Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
j.	11-15	'	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
द.	15-19		Rs.5,000/-	Rs:5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctoned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Sacod Ahmad) Socretary Finance

vocate

CODY

#### A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

- 1. Accountant General Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawa
- 2 Secretarios to Government of Punjac, Sinch & Solochiasan, Finance Department
- All Autocommus / Semi Autonomous Booles in Khyoer Pakhtunkhwa

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (May-2017)

# Personal Information of Mr NASRUMIN ALLAH d/w/s of KHAN ULLAH

Personnel Number: 00137955 CNIC: 1720121906637

Date of Birth: 12.12.1970 Entry into Govt. Service: 01.01.2001

Employment Category: Vocational Temporary

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

DDO Code: NR6031-Principal GHS Amangarh Nowshera

GPF A/C No: EDUMKD 3733 Interest Applied: Yes

Vendor Number: 80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

GPF Balance: 666,719.00

GFT A/C NO. LDOMARD 5755	y scale: BPS For - 2016	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16 Pay	Stage: 23
T ay and they are	Amount	Wage type	Amount
Wage type	45.320.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	1,818.00
0001 Basic Pay 1210 Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1947 Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,396.00
1948 Adhoc Allowance 2010@ 50%	6,390.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,340.00
1948 Adnoc Anowance 2010kg 5076	892.00	2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	4,532.00

ductions - General Wage type	Amount	-	Wage type	Amount
16 GPF Subscription - Rs2806	-2,806.00	3501 Benevo	lent Fund	-800.00 .
09 Income Tax	-1,059.00	3990 Emp.E	du. Fund KPK	-150.00
04 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00
ductions - Leans and Advances Loan Description		Principle amo	unt Deductio	on Balance

Gross Pay (Rs.): 67,688.00 Deductions: (Rs.): -5,465.00 Net Pay: (RS.): 62,223.00 Account Number: 4643-6 Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 230566 SADDAR BAZAR NOWS

ATTESTED

Length of Service: 16 Years 05 Months 001 Days

(140122/26.05.2017/10:47:58) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Nowshera** Monthly Salary Statement (August-2017)

Entry into Govt. Service: 01.01.2001



#### Personal Information of Mr NASRUMIN ALLAH d/w/s of KHAN ULLAH

CNIC: 1720121906637

Personnel Number: 00137955 Date of Birth: 12.12.1970

NTN:

Length of Service: 16 Years 08 Months 001 Days

onal Temporary				$\Gamma \sim I$	
H TEACHER	80003685-DISTRICT GO	OVERNME	NT KHYBE	C 0	2
ANGARH				-	
GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:				
Interest Applied: Yes	<b>GPF</b> Balance:		675,137.00		
Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 23		
	Interest Applied: Yes	I TEACHER80003685-DISTRICT GOIANGARHGPF Section: 001Cash Center:Interest Applied: YesGPF Balance:	I TEACHER   80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNME     IANGARH   GPF Section: 001     Cash Center:   Interest Applied: Yes     GPF Balance:   GPF Balance	I TEACHER80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBEIANGARHGPF Section: 001Interest Applied: YesCash Center:GPF Balance:675,137.00	H TEACHER 80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE   IANGARH   GPF Section: 001 Cash Center:   Interest Applied: Yes GPF Balance: 675,137.00

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	53,870.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	1,818.00
1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,396.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,340.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	892.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	4,532.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	5,387.00			0.00

#### **Deductions - General**

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription - Rs2806	-2.806.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-1,189.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Deductions - Income Payable: 23,781.9 Gross Pay (Rs.): 70, Payee Name: NASRU Account Number: 464	0 Recovered 235.00	till August-2017: Deductions: (Rs.):	2,379.00 Ex -5,595.00	empted: 9512.7 Net Pa	70 Recoverable: y: (Rs.): 64,640.00	11,890.20
Payee Name: NASRU		Deductions: (Rs.):	-5,595.00	Net Pa	y: (Rs.): 64,640.00	
-	MINALLAH					
	3-6	PAKISTAN, 230566	SADDAR BAZAI	R NOWS SAD	DAR BAZAR NOWS	δ,
Leaves: Openin	ng Balance:	Availed:	Earned:		Balance:	

City: NOWSHERA Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Housing Status: No Official Temp. Address: City: Email: its.nasr.kahn@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/25.08.2017/11:17:09/v1.1) \* All amounts are in Pak Rupees \* Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.



<u>Subject:</u>

### DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

#### **Respected Sir**,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as **SET (BPS-16)** quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 06.08.2020

Your Obediently

Nagu Hlay

NASRUMIN ALLAH

ATTESTED

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

4/10/201

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), APPELLANT GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary,
- Khyber Pakhtunkhwa; Peshawar. 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may PRAYER: kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fledte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in 780egistrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

6.7

ŧ∥

2-4/18/19

12

EXAMINER Khyber

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants. and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyince allowance for employees

be true copy Advocate

Counsel for the appellant present.

11.11.2019

Appeal No-1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Giost

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal. Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12:2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case-the respondents are required to execute the. judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ-Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3152-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a ng. reasonable time.

c ~

Chairmán

to be the copy

All

File be consigned to the record. ESZEL  $A_1$ 

> ÷E Kh.

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

Cartifier

Pesnawat

## **VAKALATNAMA**

### **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR**

OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

NASRUMIN ALLAH

\_\_\_(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

(RESPONDENT)

(DEFENDANT)

#### <u>VERSUS</u>

#### **Education Department**

I/We NASRUMIN ALLAH \_\_\_\_\_\_\_do hereby appoint and constitute **MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI**, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. \_\_\_\_\_ /2020

K la u **CLIENT** 

<u>ACCEPTED</u>  $\mathcal{M}$ **MUNFAT ALLYOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE**