

Court of

12914 \bigcirc /2020 Case No.-Order or other proceedings with signature of judge Date of order S.No. proceedings 3 1 The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate 28/10/2020 1may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member. for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2-up there on $1 - 3 \cdot o$ MEMBER(J) The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is 01,03.2021 on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021. Reader

्रञ

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. ____/2020

ALAM ZEB VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX		
S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	1-3
2.	Notification	A 4
3.	Pay slips	B & C . 5-6
4.	Departmental appeal	D 7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E
6.	Vakalatnama	. 10

THROUGH:

APPELLANT

.

UMAR FAROOQ ADOCATE HIGH COURT CELL NO 0313-8901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case. BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR APPEAL NO. 13 214 /2020 Kilyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal Mr, ALAM ZEB PST(BPS-12) GPS KASODY TAMANZAI, Mithef Nohmend Diary No. 3479 28/10/2-20

Personnel Number:00309196

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pëshawar.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any Registration other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH:

- ON FACTS:
 - 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **PST (BPS-12)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
 - 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from

- 4- That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed Departmental appeal but no reply has been received so far. Copy of the Departmental appeal & is attached as annexure......**D**.
- 5- That colleges of appellant of different caderapproached to this august tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its judgment no 1452/2019 titled maqsadHayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019......E.
- 6- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgment Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation, as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
 - That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.
 - It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO, FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govt, of Knyber F	^a ashtuaknwa.
Finance Department,	
Peahavear.	

All Administrative Sectoraties to Govi. of Kingber Pakhtunkhwa. The Sector Member, Board of Revenue, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa. The Secretary to Governey: Knyber Pakhtunkhwa The Secretary to Chief Minoser, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa. The Secretary, Provincial Aspenday, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa All Heads of Altaches Departments in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa Af District Coordination Officerson Knyber Pakhtunkhwa. All Pollacal Agents / District & Semicors Judges in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa The Register, Pashawar High-Coort, Peshawar The Chairman, Public Service Conversion, Knyber Pokhtunkhwa. The Chairman, Service Tribunal Knyber Pakhtunkhwa.

. .

3

ية ح ,

÷.

Ģ

Sinject

From

To:

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Knyber Pakhturahwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Givil Servants, Govt: of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa (violking in EPS-1 to EPS-15) w.e.f from 1^e September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in EPS-15 to EPS-15 will remain urkinanged.

S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)	į
1.	1-1	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1.700/-	
. 2,	5-1Q	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1.840/-	•
3.	11-15	Rs.2.000/-	Rs.2,720/-	
4	16-19	Rs.5,000/	R\$.5,000/-	

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officials who have not been sanctioned alfield vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Sacod Alynad) Secretary Finance

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Seconary (Rear)

Fram NO. FD/SO/SR-058-52/2012

Dated Pessawar the 20th Deventher, 2012

A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-

- 1. Anostriani General, Kinoer Pakitterkina, Pesireket
- Secretaties to Government of Punjab, Such & Sabohestan Finance Department
 All Automotions / Semi Autonomous Sucies in Karber Pakhtankhaa

A Harren indes and a nonicitaria pocies in an der a Bei en antes 2 ---

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012. Dated Peshawar the: 20,12,2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

- All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 1.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa: 8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/isvise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
·2	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	. Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

Government of Pakistan District Accounts Office GHALANAI Monthly Salary Statement (June-2018)





Personal Information of Mr ALAM ZEB d/w/s of ZUHRAB GUL

Personnel Number: 00309196CNIC: 17Date of Birth: 03.10.1975Entry into

CNIC: 1710103567235 Entry into Govt. Service: 22.11.2005

NTN:

Length of Service: 12 Years 07 Months 010 Days

Employment Categor	y: Vocatio	onal Temporary	•	
Designation: PRIMAR	Y SCHOO	OL TEACHER	00000006-Min. Of Education	
DDO Code: MG0005-	Agency E	ducation Officer Mohmand		
Payroll Section: 001		GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:	
GPF A/C No:	···· ·	Interest Applied: No	GPF Balance:	68.551.00
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	· ·	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 12	Pay Stage: 10

	Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	<u> </u>	22,920.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	1,307.00
<u>1300</u>	Medical Allowance		1,500.00		Charge Allowance	40.00
1528	Unattractive Area Allow		1,500.00		15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	481.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%		324.00		Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	1,834.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%		2,292.00		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	0.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3300	GPF Other Govt.Emp	-2,220.00	3661	E.E.F (Exchange)	-100.00
3701	Benevolent Fund(Exchange)	-180.00	3705	R. Ben & Death Comp(Exch)	-600.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description	· · ·	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
•					

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable: 0.00 Recovered till June-2018: 43.00 Exempted: 43.00- Recoverable: 0.00

Gross Pay (Rs.): 32,198.00 Deductions: (Rs.): -3,100.00 Net Pay: (Rs.): 29,098.00

Payee Name: ALAM ZEB

Account Number: 5088-1

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 231435 SHABQADAR SHABQADAR, GILGIT

Leaves: Opening Balance: Availed: Earned: Balance:

Permanent Address:

City: MOHMAND AGENCYDomicile: NW - Khyber PakhtunkhwaHousing Status: No OfficialTemp. Address:Email: alamzebkhan0343@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SAPCCSUPPORT/26.06.2018/17:00:26/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted

Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial **District Accounts Office GHALANAI** Monthly Salary Statement (August-2020)



Personstinformation of Mr ALAM ZEB d/w/s of ZUHRAB GUL

Personnel Number: 00309196 Date of Birth: 03.10.1975

CNIC: 1710103567235 Entry into Govt. Service: 22.11.2005

NTN:

Length of Service: i4 Years 09 Months 011 Days

imployment category: Active	e remporary				
Designation: PRIMARY SCHO	OOL TEACHER	80926290-DISTRICT GO	VERNMEN	NTKHVRE	
DDO Code: MG6013-DEO Prin	mary Education Mohmand		o Brangioi	() ((III))	
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:			
GPF A/C No:	Interest Applied: No	GPF Balance:		139 381 00	
Vendor Number: -	· · ·			159,001.00	
Pay and Allowances:	Interest Applied: No GPF Balance: 139,381.00				

<u> </u>	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount	
0001 Basic Pay		26,880.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	2,214.00	
	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300 Medical Allowance	1,500.00	
1505	Charge Allowance	40.00	1528 Unattractive Area Allow	1,500.00	
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	481.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	324.00	
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016-10%	, 1,834.00	2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,688.00	
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,688.00	2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,688.00	

Deductions - General

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3015 GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600:00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description			mount	Deduction		Balance
Deductions - Incom Payable: 0.0		d till AUG-2020:	0.00 E	xempted: 0.00	Rec	overable:	0.00
Gross Pay (Rs.):	45,693.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-4,215.00	Net P	ay: (Rs.):	41,478.00	
Payee Name: ALAN Account Number: 8	1010104052861						

Bank Details: MEEZAN BANK LIMITED, 428101 Meezan Bank Limited Tangi Road Meezan Bank Limited Tangi Road,

Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
---------	------------------	----------	---------	----------	--

Permanent Address: City: MOHMAND AGENCY

Temp. Address:

City:

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Email: alamzebkhan0343@gmail.com

Housing Status: No Official

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9(SERVICES/28.08.2020/18.54:03/v2.0) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

To

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as PST (BPS-12) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the convence allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Derpartment Copy attached. That I also the similar. employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter'& summer vacations.

Dated: 09.062020

Obediently ALXM ZEB GPS RASODY TAMANZAI

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA

PESHAWAR

mar 10

24/10/201

UNT

Khybe:

APPEAL NO. 1457- 12019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16),

GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND ACTION OF THE UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fleate-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

> R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

-4/18.1 (.9

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat VS Govt

11.11.2019

Cartifier

Peshawat

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

122 (F

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

12

Chairmán

ANT IN A CONTRACT OF A CONT

File be consigned to the record.

ί.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

ALAM ZEB

_(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

(APPELLANT)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

I/WeALAM ZEB_

do hereby appoint and constitute **UMAR FAROOQ**, **Advocate, High court**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated ____/ /2020

CLIENT

ACCEPTED UMAR FAROOO ADVOCATE