25.07.2016

Counsel for the appellant and Mr. Daud Jan, Superintendent alongwith Mr. Ziaullah, GP for respondents present. Arguments heard and record perused.

Vide our detailed judgment of today in connected service appeal No. 1443/2013 tilted "Shahid Rehman-vs-Agency Education Officer, FR, Lakki Marwat and others", this appeal is also dismissed as per detailed judgment referred above. Parties are, however, left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to the record room.

ANNOUNCE 25.07.2016 ber

(A)

Member

 10
 12:05:2015
 Counsel for the appellant, M/S Daud Jan, Supdt (for respondent value) and the supervised of the sup

and the second second

and the second second

ALC STRUCT CONTRACTORY AND

2.4. <u>-</u>

计 "你有些人。

12 H. Marca

3 . 1

Sec. 27.2.28

4-41.13

 (\cdot)

100

Charman

nner

Member

Member

04.05.2016 Counsel for the appellant and Mr. Daud Jan, Supdt additional and Mr. Daud Jan, Supdt Mr. Muhammad Jan, GP for respondents present. Arguments could not be heard due to leaned Member (Judicial) is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned to 25.07.2016 for arguments. 15.09.2014

Counsel for the appellant and Mr. Muhammad Adeel Butt, AAG with Daud Jan, Head Clerk for respondents present. The learned Member (Judicial) is not working due to a recent order of the Hon'ble Peshawar High Court affecting his status as District i& Sessions Judge. To come up as before on 26.11.2014.



26.11.2014

8-

Junior to counsel for the appellant and Mr. Muhammad Jan, GP with Daud Jan, Head Clerk for the respondents present. The Tribunal is incomplete. To come up for the same on 10.2.2015.

ŔEADER

Chairman

a 10.02.2015

Agent of counsel for the appellant and Assistant A.G for respondents present. Written reply not submitted. Requested for adjournment. Adjourned for written reply before S.B to 12.05.2015.

08.01.2014

Counsels for the appellant, present. Preliminary arguments heard and case file perused. Counsel for the appellant contended that the appellant has not been treated in accordance with law/rules. Against the impugned order dated 11.06.2013, the appellant filed departmental appeal on 28.06.2013, which has not been responded within the statutory period of 90 days, hence the present appeal on 22.10.2013 Points raised at the Bar need consideration. The appeal is admitted to regular hearing subject to all legal objections. The cted to deposit the security amount and process fee appellant is dire within 10 days. Thereafter, Notice be issued to the respondents for submission of written reply on 01.04.2014.

meet No.1441/2013

lember 08.01.2014 NOG - This case be put before the Final Bench for further proceedings. Chairman

1.4.2014.

for the appellant and AAG with Fayaz Ali, AEO Coun is iterated clerk for the respondents present and requested and Daud Jai for time. To come up for written reply on 25.6.2014.

MEMBE

25.6.2014.

Counsel for the appellant and Mr. Muhammad Jan, GP with Daud Jan, H.Clerk for the respondents present. Respondents need further time. To come up for written reply on 15.9.2014

MEMBER

MEMBER

Form-A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of_

1441 /2013

Case No._ Order or other proceedings with signature of judge or Magistrate S.No. Date of order Proceedings 3 2 1 28/10/2013 The appeal of Mr. Faisal Ahmad resubmitted today by 1 Mr. Saadullah Khan Marwat Advocate may be entered in the Institution register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for preliminary hearing. 30-10-20 2 This case is entrusted to Primary Bench for preliminary 1 - 20/4hearing to be put up there on _ 8-CHAIRMA

The appeal of Mr. Faised And son of Taj Ali Khan Ex-Mali GPS Kotka Bahadar FR Lakki Marwat received today i.e. on 22.10.2013 is incomplete on the following scores which is returned to the counsel for the appellant for completion and resubmission within 15 days.

- 1- Law under which appeal is filed is not mentioned.
- 2- Annexures A & B of the appeal are illegible which may be replaced by legible/better one.

No 1501 /S.T. <u>[D</u>/2013.

SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR.

Mr. Saadullah Khan Marwat Adv. Pesh.

şı, Repubnices after completion. As report the anaciment. the append is filed user section 407 STACE, 1974 for hisposed by

. .:

s a ir s

BEFORE THE KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

S.A. NO. 1441 /2013

Faisal Ahmad Versus

Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki, & others

S.No	Documents	Annex	P.No.
1.	Memo of Appeal		1-2
2.	Creation of Posts, 07.01.2013	``A″	3
3.	Appointment Order, 21.01.2013	``В″	4
4.	Termination Order, 11.06.2013		5
5.	Representation, 28.06.2013	"D"	.6-7

INDEX

Dated.22.10.2013

Through

Appellant the klun

Saad Ullah Khan Marwat Advocate. 21-A Nasir Mension,

Shoba Bazar, Peshawar.

Ph: 0300-5872676

BEFORE KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Faisal Ahmad S/O Taj Ali Khan

R/O Kotka Zafar Khan, Ex Mali,

ppellant

. . Respondents

S.A No.1441 /201:

GPS Kotka Bahadar Khan FR, Lakki Marwat... ..

Versus

Agency Education Officer, FR, Lakki Marwat. 1---

Director of Education FATA, Q -.

FATA Secretariat, Peshawar.

Secretary Education FATA,

FATA Secretariat, Peshawar

APPEAL U/S 4 AGAINST THE OFFICE ORDER NO 2027/33 DATED 11-06-2013 OF R. NO. 1 WHEREBY SERVICES OF THE APPELANT WERE TERMINATED W.E.F DATED OF APPOINTMENT FOR NO LEGAL REASON.

⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔

⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔<=>⇔

1.

Respectfully Sheweth;

That on 01-01-2013 Finance Department, FATA Secretariat, Ac-submitted to-day.

and filed. T10/13, 2.

Warsak Road, Peshawar circulated/issued letter whereby 1, 797 posts of various nature were created in the schools, etc. including posts for FR Lakki too at serial No. 11. Copy as annex "A"

That as per the due procedure, appellant was appointed as such vide order dated 21-01-2013 by Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki Marwat. Copy as annex "B"

That appellant used to perform duties in the said school with 3. great deal and zeal when on 11-06-2013, the same authority

issued order of termination of the appellant from service for no legal reason. Copy as annex "C"

That on 28-06-2013, appellant submitted appeal before R.NO. 2 for reinstatement in service which met dead response till date.
 Copy as annex "D"

Hence this appeal, inter alia, on the following grounds:-

<u>GROUNDS:</u>

Dated. 27, 10.2013

- That admittedly Finance Department of FATA Secretariat created the posts of various nature for appointment as such.
- b. That appellant, being land doner and by adhering to law and rules, he was appointed as such.
- c. That no complaint was ever made against the performance of duties of appellant.
- d. That no reason was ever given in the order of termination by Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki Marwat.
- e. That no Executive order could be passed retrospectively.
- f. That appellant had assumed the charge of the post without any complaint.
- g. That the impugned order is not per the mandate of law as neither appellant was served with any notice nor any inquiry was conducted, so the order is ab-inito void and illegal and based on malafide.

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of the appeal, order dated 11-06-2013 of Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki Marwat, respondent No. 1 be set aside and appellant be reinstated in service with all back benefits.

&

Through

Saad Ullah Khan Marwat Arbab⁄ iful Kamal Miss Rubina Nàz, Advocates.

FATA SECRETARIAT (*finance Department*) <u>Warsak road Peshawar</u>

No.SO(FII)FD/FA/SNE/2010-II/Vol-III Dated Peshawar the 7th January 2013

The Additional Accountant General, Pakistan Revenue, Sub Office, Peshawar.

Subject:-

То

CREATION OF 1797 POSTS FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF PUBLIC SCHOOLS, HIGH SCHOOLS, MIDDLE SCHOOLS, IT LABS IN HIGH SCHOOLS AND WOMEN TEACHER HOSTELS UNDER SECONDARY EDUCATION FATA IN AGENCIES / FRS.

Dear Sir,

I am directed to convey sanction of Finance Division, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad, received vide UO No. 5(1)/2011 – DFA (S), dated 21-06-2012 for creation of 1797 for Establishment of 05 Public Schools, 52 High Schools, 115 Middle Schools, 140 IT Labs in High/Middle Schools and 14 Women Teacher Hostels in FATA with the following Agency/FR-wise break up of Educational Institutions with immediate effect:-

· · ·							. 1
S	Name of	Posts for	Total				
. No	Agency/FR	Public	High	Middle	IT Labs	Women	
		Schools	Schools	Schools		Teacher Hostels	
1	Bajaur Agency	30	82	98	24	15	249
2	Mohmand Agency		55	21	28		104
3	Khyber Agency		54	129	36	20	239
4	Orakzai Agency		37	36	18	10	101
5	Kurram Agency	30	54	35	30	05	154
6	NW Agency		35	122	34	10	201
7	SW Agency		36	65	30		. 131
8	FR Peshawar		09	. 37	14		60
9	FR Kohat		18	29	16	·····	63
10	FR Bannu		27	108	30	02	167
11	FR Lakki	30	18	36			······································
12	FR Tank	30	27	71	14	05	147
13	FR D.I.Khan	27	20	35	10	05	97
	Total	147	472	822	284	72	<u>. </u>

Alleste

OFFICE OF THE AGENCY EDUCATION OFFICER FR LAKKI DISTRICT COMPLEX TAJAZAI

APPOINTMENT ORDER

Consequent upon the nomination by APA FR Lakki, the following candidate of FR Lakki are hereby appointed under the Government recruitment Policy, against the newly created Class-IV posts in the Schools noted against their name in BPS-01 @ Rs. 4800/- per Month usual Allownaces on regular contract basis with effect from the Date of their taking over Charge in the schools, in the interest of public service.

	Y			
S.No ⁻	Name of Candidate	Post	Name of School	Remarks
1	Adnan Khan s/o Taj Ali Khan village	Lab Att:	Public School Kotka	APA FR Lakki No.
	Talib Khel Betani FR Lakki		Bahadar Khan FR Lakki	dated 21-01-2013.
2	Shahid Rehman S/O BAhadar Zaman village Talib Khel Betani FR Lakki	N. Qasid	-do-	-do-
3 -	Abdullah Khan S/O Bahadar Khan village Talib Khel Betani FR Lakki	Chowk:	-do-	-do-
4	Faisal Ahmed S/O Taj Ali Khan village Talib Khel Betani FR Lakki	Mali	-do-	-do-i
5	Muhammad Kamran Khan S/O Bahadar Khan village Talib Khel Betani FR Lakki	Sweeper	, -do-	-do-

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

- 1. That appointments made purely on temporary basis and is subject to the term and condition framed by the Government time to time. The appointments can be with drawn and liable to termination without any notice OR assigning any reason.
- 2. If He/She/They resign from service they will give on month's prior notice OR one month full pay will be forfeited and lieu thereof.
- 3. He/She/They will produce their Health and Age Certificate from M/Supdt: DHO Hospital Lakki Marwat.
- 4. He/She/They will not be handed over charge if they below 18 years Or above 45 year of age.
- 5. He/She/They failed to resume the charge within 15 days, their appointment will be consider as cancelled.
- 6. Charge report should be submitted in duplicate to all concerned.
- 7. If He/She/They have any other Government Service their appointment will be stand cancelled and disciplinary action will be taken against the defaulters.

(HAJI GHAZI KHAN)

AGENCY EDUCATION OFFICER FR LAKKI

Dated the 21/1/2013

Copy to the:-

Endst No. 1698-1702/FR Lakki

- 1. Director Education (FATA) Secretariat Peshawar.
- 2. Deputy Commissioner District Lakki Marwat.
- 3. Assistant Political Agent FR Lakki.
- 4: District Accounts Officer Bannu.
- 5. AAEO Concerned.
- 6. Candidate concerned.

Allest

OFFICE OF THE AGENCY EDUCATION OFFICER FRONTLER REGION LAKKI. TERMINATION ORDER. /

 (\overline{c}^{*})

Consequent upon the orders of the worthy Director Education FATA, Peshawar vide his No: 8244 dated 31/05/2013, The following Class IV servants of GMRS, Bahader Khan (Sargrah Muhammad Khan) F.R. are hereby terminated with effect from the date of their appointments.

S.No: Name with Fathers	Apptt: No:	Date of Perminat
1. Adnan Khan S/O, Taj Ali Khan Lab: Att:	1698-1702	21/01/2013
2. Muhammad Kamran S/O, Bahader Khan (Sweeper)	- 69 -	~ ġ@-
3. Faisal Ahmad S/O, Taj Ali Kha (Mali)	n - do -	- đ 0
4. Abdullah Khan S/O, Bahader Kh (Chewkider)	ab -05-	-do-
5. Shahid Rehman S/O, Bahader Za (Naib Qasid)	nan - do-	-de- //
	Agency Educa Frontier Re	ation Officer, egion Lakki.
Endst: No 2037-33 / Dated	the	<u>////</u> 013.
Copy to the :-	(
1- Director Education FATA, cited above.		
2. Deputy Conmissioner Lakki	. Merwat./APA FR	Lekki.
3.8 Candidate Concerned.		

Ali

ency Education Officer, rontier Resion Lakki.

11 - 6 - 13

The Director Education, FATA, FATA Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar

Subject: APPEAL AGAINST OFFICE ORDER NO. 2027-33 DATED 11.06.2013 OF THE AGENCY EDUCATION OFFICER, FR LAKKI WHEREBY SERVICES OF APPELLANT WERE TERMINATED W.E.F. THE DATE OF APPOINTMENT FOR NO LEGAL REASON.

1

Respected Sir,

. .

To

- That on 07.01.2013, Finance Department, FATA Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar circulated/issued letter whereby 1,797 posts of various nature were created in the schools etc. including posts for FR Lakki too at S.No.11.
- 2. That as per the due procedure appellant was appointed as such vide order dated 21.01.2013 by Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki.
- That appellant used to perform duties in the said school with great deal and zeal when on 11.06.2013, the same authority issued order of termination -of--appellant from service for no legal reason.
- 4.

Hence this departmental appeal, inter alia, on the following grounds.

<u>G R O U N D S:-</u>

a. That admittedly Finance Department of FATA Secretariat created the posts of various nature, with the department.

- b. That appellant, being land donner and by adhering to law and rules, he was appointed as such.
- c. That no complaint was ever made against the performance of duties of appellant.
- d. That no reason was ever given in the order of termination by Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki.
- e. That no Executive order could be passed retrospectively.
- f. That appellant had assumed the charge of the post without any complaint.
- g. That the impugned order is not per the mandate of law as neither appellant was served with any notice nor any inquiry was conducted, so the order is ab-inito void and illegal.

It is, therefore, most humbly requested that order dated 11.06.2013 of Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki be set aside and appellant be reinstated in service with all back benefits.

Dated 28.06.2013

No. 384 28-6-13

Appellant ilde Faisor Ahmad Slo Taj Ali Khum RIO Kothen Zafarkhun Exc. Mali, PS Kotha Pahader Khn, FR, Lobiti

(20,00 13 5 read man INTERP Marine 2 M Kle mpjor m15 the start for a 11/000 כל איי אני שיניאו באיין . ترج سر المحرية مرج المرب من أسماك ترع محد من المسالية المعالية ورديد المشيخ مرارع المرفع المنف المحف المنافع المحفة المنت والمتبية محق والقابسين طر لايون ميسيم من اول کرج رتابی می و ال محرد در بد اس منابع الجمال مناور کر عبت کرچ رک منع مدن که مدند رک بی مالا کر کر کر بی ت نى كىلىندىتى الىبية تتسول كورسال ماط كى كوك كاليكذا لا وي تد يا كاري ويشكر ويشاك كم يسالك ما المرتب المناكل محمد المردين والموض محرك ممالة ملتظ والدعما للسباء لتتبط للمالك بالمراد يتحذوا للمخر الأركيال مجلود فركية ورديمة لسروي في من المرار الدو الرجس المريس المنا في المريس المريس المريس المريس المريس ا به الم الحد الفيد الم الم الم على على الله المعلى المنا المن الله المالية المناسلة المسلمة المحسير مال القرار القامة ولألفي الركيز روم ببدايع والحريمة ومسالم ويستسف كردنوا ريد الإدرا محتوية ساريته 5,55) 1-4 end ind internet

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHAWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Appeal No. 1441/2013 Mr. Faisal Ahmad S/O Taj Ali Khan r/o Kotka Zafar Khan Ex-Mali GPS Kotka Bahadur Khan FR Lakki Marwat

.....Appellant

.....VERSUS......

- 1. The Agency Education Office FR Lakki Marwat.
- 2. Director Education FATA, FATA Secretariat Peshawar.
- 3. Secretary Education FATA, FATA Secretariat PeshawarRespondents

PRELIMINARY OBJECTIONS.

- 1. That the appellant has got no cause of action/locus standi to file the instant appeal.
- 2. That the appellant has not come to this Honorable Tribunal with clean hands.
- 3. That the appellant has concealed materials facts from this Honorable Tribunal.
- 4. That the appeal is not maintainable in its present form.
- 5. That the appeal is bad due to non-joinder and mis-joinder of necessary parties.
- 6. That the appellant is estopped by his own conduct to bring the present appeal.



PARAWISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENT NO. 1 AND 2 IN APPEAL NO. 1499 2013.

Respectfully Sheweth.

- 1. No Comments pertains to record.
- 2. No Comments pertains to record.
- 3. The service of the appellant has been terminated by the Competent Authority i.e, Agency Education Officer FR Lakki in the interest of Public Service as the school concerned was not functional. It is further pointed out that no any salary has been drawn by the appellant from the Government treasury. As reported by the Agency Education Officer FR Lakki (copy of the letter is attached as Annexure-A).
- 4. Incorrect. The departmental appeal of the appellant is not available on the record of the respondent's offices.

Grounds.

- A. No comments pertain to record.
- B. Incorrect. No such revenue record has been submitted by the appellant which shows that the appellant is the land owner of the said school. Further stated that appointments of land doner has been declared illegal by Supreme Court of Pakistan in various judgments.
- C. No comments pertain to record.
- D. As explained in Para-B above.
- E. Incorrect. As the school was not functional therefore the Competent Authority issued the termination order of the appellant.
- F. Incorrect. There is no any other option with the Competent Authority except termination of the appellant.

In the light of above facts it is most humbly prayed that the appeal may be dismissed in favor of the respondents with cost throughout.

Respondent No1.

ency Education Officer FR Lakki

Lunay

Director Education (FATA) FATA Secretariat Peshawar

Respondent No.2

AFFIDAVIT

We, the above respondents do hereby declare and affirm that the above comments are true and correct to the best of our knowledge and belief that nothing has been concealed from this Hon'ble Tribunal.

Respondent No1.

ncy Education Officer FR Lakki

Respondent No.2

ann Junal Education (FATA) Direct

FATA Secretariat Peshawar

OFFICE OF THE AGENCY EDUCATION OFFICER, FRONTIER REGION LAKKI (TOWN SHIP TAJAZAI) No. 3483 / Dated $\leq 7.(-12015)$.

The Director Education, (FATA) Peshawar.

Subject:- COMMENTS REGARDING TERMINATION/APPOINTMENT OF GOVT: MODEL PUBLIC SCHOOL KOTKA BAHADER KHAN FR LKI.

Meno :-

Reference your telephonic massage on dated 5/5/2015.

1. It is stated for your kind informations that Class IV Servants have been appointed by this office vide No.1698-1722 dated 24/4/2013 (2013) in the said Model Public School Bahader Khan Sargrah Muhammad Khan F.R. Lakki

- 2. After that Asstt: Director Syed Manzar Jan Sajid issue a letter vide No: 8244 dated 31/5/2013 and call Explanation from the Ex-AEO Mr. Ghazi Khan to why the Said Model School Post filled without any antimation of this Directorate
- 3. On dated 10/6/2013 vide your No: 8675 dated 10/6/2013 issue by Syed Manzar Jan Sajid4A.D. Estab:) issue another letter regarding the above subject.

4. The said five (5) Class IV) have been terminated vide this office order Endst No: 2027-33 dated 11/6/13.
5. It is further stated that no Salary have been drawn to be Hence report is submitted.

Enclosure

- 1. Appointment Order.
- 2. Termination Order.
- a. Directorate letters.

4. Service Books in original

Education Officer, Agence Frontier Region Lakki.

To

BEFORE THE KPK, SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

1

S.A No. <u>1441</u>/2013

Faisal Ahmad 👘

Versus

A.E.O & Others

<u>REPLICATION</u>

Respectfully Sheweth,

PRELIMINARY OBJECTION.

All the (06) preliminary objections are illegal and incorrect. No reason in support of the same is ever given as to why the appellant has no cause of action, he has not come to the Hon'ble Tribunal with clean hands, concealment of material facts from Hon'ble Tribunal, not maintainable in its present form, appeal is bad for mis and non-joinder of necessary parties and estopped by his own conduct to bring the present appeal.

<u>ON FÀCTS</u>

- 1-2. Para No. 1 & 2, regarding creation of 1797 posts and order of appointment was not commented upon by the Prespondents, so are admitted correct by them.
- 3. Not correct. The reason given in the para of the comments, regarding none functional of the school nowhere bore in the order of termination dated 11.06.2013. It is not understood that when the schools were not functional then why order of appointment of appellant was issued by the competent authority, Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki.

As far as letter dated 05.05.2015 of the Agency Education Officer, FR Lakki is concerned, the same is after thought while appeal was filed before the Hon'ble Tribunal on 22.10.2013.

 Not correct. Departmental appeal was filed on 28.06.2013 vide Registry No. 384 alongwith connected representations addressed to Director of Education FATA, FATA Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar.

GROUNDS:

- a. As above in para No. 1 & 2 of the facts, regarding creation of posts and issuing of order of appointments.
- b. Not correct. The ground of the appeal is correct. Respondents failed to show that who donated the land for the construction of the school building. Moreso, the Supreme Court also held that land owner be appointed at the school as the land was donated to the Government for school building in lieu of appointment.
- c. As above in para No. 1, regarding performance of duties in the school.
- d. Not correct. Order of termination is without any reason.
- e. Not correct. The ground of the appeal is correct, regarding issuing of order of termination with retrospective effect. Here a question arises that why order of appointment of appellant was issued when the school was none functional. The school is functioning till date. Order of termination bore no reason of none functional of the school.
- f. Not correct. If order of termination from service was required, then the same should have been as per the mandate of law by holding full-fledged enquiry.
- g. Not replied by the respondents, so the ground of the appeal is admitted correct by the respondents regarding none service of notice, none holding of enquiry, etc.

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal be accepted as prayed for.

Through

Dated: 27.10.2015

Appellant llah up. Saadullah Khan Marwat Arbåb Saif UÍ Kamal pin Man hina Naz Advocates.

BEFORE THE KPK, SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

S.A No. <u>1441</u>/2013

Faisal Ahmad

Versus

A.E.O & Others

AFFIDAVIT

I, Faisal Ahmad, Appellant do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that contents of the **Appeal** & **replication** are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief while that of the reply are illegal and incorrect.

I reaffirm the same on oath once again to be true and correct as per the available record.

DEPONENT