BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No. 1309/2023

BEFORE:	MR. SALAH-UD-DIN	•••	MEMBER (J)
	MISS FAREEHA PAUL	•••	MEMBER (E)

Shehnaz Begum W/O Abdul Nasir R/O Haidershah Banda P.O Khujaki Killa, Tehsil Takht-e- Nasrati District Karak. (Appellant)

Versus

- 1. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar.
- 2. Secretary Elementary and Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 3. Director Elementary and Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Mr. Safdar Iqbal Khattak

Advocate ... For appellant

Mr. Assad Ali Khan, ... For official respondents

Assistant Advocate General

Mr. Nasir Mehmood ... For private respondent No. 4

Advocate

Date of Institution	13.06.2023
Date of Hearing	06.09.2023
Date of Decision	06.09.2023

Service Appeal No. 1312/2023

BEFORE: MR. SALAH-UD-DIN ... MEMBER (J)
MISS FAREEHA PAUL ... MEMBER (E)

Mst Riffat Bano, SDEO (Female), Town-III Peshawar. (Appellant)

Versus

- 1. The Chief Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar.
- 2. The Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, E&SE Department, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar.
- 3. Mst. Shehnaz Begum (Management Cadre) BPS-17 SDEO (F) Takht-e-Nasrati, Karak. (Respondents)

Mr.

Syed Numan Ali Bukhari

Advocate ... For appellant

Mr. Assad Ali Khan ... For official respondents

Assistant Advocate General

Mr. Safdar Iqbal Khattak ... For private respondent No. 3

Advocate

 Date of Institution
 14.06.2023

 Date of Hearing
 06.09.2023

 Date of Decision
 06.09.2023

CONSOLIDATED JUDGMENT.

FAREEHA PAUL, MEMBER (E): Through this single judgment, we intend to dispose of the instant service appeal as well as connected service appeal No. 1312/2023 titled "Mst. Riffat Bano Versus the Chief Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Civil Secretariat Peshawar and others", as in both the appeals common questions of law and facts are involved.

- 2. The service appeal No. 1309/2023 has been instituted by Mst. Shehnaz Begum under Section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Act, 1974 against the transfer order dated 26.05.2023, whereby she was transferred from SDEO (F) Takht-e-Nasrati Karak to SDEO (F) Town-III Peshawar. It has been prayed that on acceptance of the appeal, the impugned order dated 26.05.2023 might be set aside and the appellant might be restored to her prior position as SDEO (F) Takht-e-Nasrati, District Karak, alongwith any other remedy which the Tribunal deemed fit and appropriate.
- 3. Brief facts of the case, as given in the memorandum of appeal, are that the appellant was appointed as SDEO (F) in the year 2011 at District Karak. On 06.12.2022, she was transferred from Sarai Naurang Lakki Marwat and posted as SDEO (F) Tehsil Takht-e-Nasrati, District Karak. Again on 04.05.2023, she was transferred from Takht-e-Nasrati to Sarai Naurang but the

order was withdrawn on the same day. She was once again transferred from Takht-e-Nasrati to Town-III, Peshawar as SDEO (F) vide order dated 26.05.2023 with malafide intention and personal grudges of the Caretaker Education Minister. Feeling aggrieved, she preferred a departmental appeal before the competent authority, which was regretted vide order dated 12.06.2023; hence the present appeal.

- 4. The connected service appeal No. 1312/2023 has been instituted by Mst. Riffat Bano, under section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Act, 1974 against the impugned transfer order dated 26.05.2023 whereby she was transferred from SDEO (F) Town-III, Peshawar to SDEO (F) Jehangira, Nowshera and against the order dated 12.06.2023 whereby her departmental appeal was rejected. It has been prayed that on acceptance of the appeal, both the impugned orders dated 26.05.2023 and 12.06.2023 to the extent of appellant might be set aside and the respondents might be directed not to transfer the appellant prematurely and in violation of posting and transfer policy, alongwith any other remedy which the Tribunal deemed fit and appropriate.
- 5. Respondents were put on notice who submitted their written replies/comments on the appeals. We heard the learned counsel for the appellants, learned counsels for the private respondents as well as the learned Assistant Advocate General for the official respondents and perused the case file with connected documents in detail.
- 6. Learned counsel for the appellant in Service Appeal No. 1309/2023, after presenting the case in detail, argued that the appellant, being a woman and resident of District Karak, was transferred to Peshawar which not only

affected her family life but also her performance. He further argued that the impugned transfer order was passed during the interim caretaker government by the concerned Minister of Education in sheer violation of repetitive administrative orders of the interim government banning the transfer and posting in the said period. According to him the impugned order was the outcome of personal grudges and particular influence of the concerned Education Minister. He further argued that the appellant was transferred thrice in a short span of six months which was against the posting/transfer policy of the provincial government. He requested that the appeal might be accepted as prayed for.

- 7. Learned counsel for the appellant in Service Appeal No. 1312/2023, after presenting the case in detail, argued that the appellant's tenure at Town-III Peshawar was only 10 months and according to posting/transfer policy of the provincial government, normal tenure for posting was two years, hence the impugned order was premature. He further argued that the impugned transfer order was passed during the period in which already complete ban was imposed on all kinds of postings and transfers by Election Commission of Pakistan, therefore, the impugned order was illegal and against the law and liable to be set aside on that score alone. He requested that the appeal might be accepted as prayed for.
- 8. Learned Assistant Advocate General, while rebutting the arguments of learned counsels for the appellants, argued that respondents were empowered under Section 10 of the Civil Servants Act 1973, for placing the services of the appellants throughout the province in the best public interest and the appellants were duty bound to serve anywhere throughout the province wherever they

were posted in public interest. He further argued that the competent authorities always acted with the intention of best administration and in best public interest and that there was no malafide or ill-will on the part of the respondents. He requested that both the appeals might be dismissed.

- 9. From the arguments and record presented before us, it transpires that the appellant Shahnaz Beum in Service Appeal No. 1309/2023 as well as the private respondent No. 4, Mst. Farhat Yasmeen, remained in the southern districts of Karak and Lakki Marwat throughout their service career. They were never given posting out of these two districts. As regards the transfer/posting history given by the learned counsel for private respondent No. 4, the learned counsel for the appellant did not raise any objection or observation. Through the order impugned before this Tribunal, the appellant has been transferred as SDEO (F) Town-III, Peshawar and the respondent No. 4 has been transferred in her place at Takht-e-Nasrati, Karak. Through the same order, Mst. Riffat Bano, appellant in Service Appeal No. 1312/2023, has been transferred from the post of SDEO (F) Town-III, Peshawar to SDEO (F) Jehangira, Nowshera. In case of Mst. Riffat Bano, from the arguments and record presented before us, it is clear that she served in Peshawar for most of the time in her service career.
- 10. In both the appeals, the grounds taken by both the appellants is that their transfers were premature and that there was a ban imposed by the Election Commission of Pakistan on postings/transfers. A fact is clear and undisputed that had there been any posting/transfers done by the provincial government during ban period, the ECP could have intervened, but as it was not done, therefore, the grounds taken by the appellants is baseless. As far as the other

plea that they had been transferred prematurely, which, according to them, is a violation of the posting/transfer policy of the provincial government, is concerned, attention is invited to Section 10 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act 1973 which empowers the provincial government to transfer the civil servants anywhere in the province in the best public interest. In the light of the Act, provincial government and its competent authorities are fully empowered to transfer a civil servant at any place, as and when required, and no one should interfere in their authority as far as such action is taken in the best public interest. In case of both the appellants, it has been observed that they stayed in one district for quite a long time. It is felt that the civil servants holding such positions should be posted on rotation in such a way that they get experience of different districts, which would be helpful in gaining a meaningful experience.

- 11. In view of the above discussion, both the service appeals are dismissed, being groundless. Costs shall follow the event. Consign.
- 12. Pronounced in open court in Peshawar and given under our hands and seal of the Tribunal this 06th of September, 2023.

(FAREEMA PAUL) Member (E)

(SALAH-UD-DIN) Member (J)

Fazle Subhan, P.S

S.A 1309/2023

06th Sept. 2023 01. Mr. Safdar Iqbal Khattak, Advocate for the appellant present.
Mr. Asad Ali Khan, Assistant Advocate General for the official respondents present. Mr. Nasir Mehmood, Advocate for private respondent No. 4 present. Arguments heard and record perused.

- 02. Vide our detailed judgment consisting of 06 pages, the service appeal in hand is dismissed, being groundless. Costs shall follow the event. Consign.
- 03. Pronounced in open court in Peshawar and given under our hands and seal of the Tribunal this 06th day of September, 2023.

(FAREEHA PAUL) Member (E)

(SALAH-UD-DIN Member (J)

Fazle Subhan, P.S



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT Block-"A" Opposite MPA's Hostel, Civil Secretariat Peshawar Phone No. 091-9223588

Dated Peshawar the, October 07th, 2021

NOTIFICATION

No/SO(S/F) E&SED/4-16/2021/POSTING/TRANSFERS/MC: The Competent authority, in/compliance with the decision of the Provincial Cabinet, is pleased to order the posting / transfers of the following Sub Divisional Education Officers (SDEOs BS-17) of the Elementary &-Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, in the public interest, with immediate effect:

/F		Nama 8 designation			
	r.	Name & designation	From	То	
1					
\mathbb{L}	1	Mst. Shahida Parveen	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
\mathbb{K}	//	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Peshawar	Officer (Female) Tangi	
₩ <u> </u>	7	NA-4 7	Town-IV vice No-15	Charsadda	
17	2.	Mst. Zeenat Begum	Sub Divisional Education		
	;	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Tangi Charsadda	Officer (Female) Town-I Peshawar.	
	3.	Mst. Maryam Rashid	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Town-I	Officer (Female) Jehangira	
_			Peshawar.	Nowshera.	
'	4.	Mst. Syeda Nasra Azam	Sub Divisional Education		
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Jehangira		
<u> </u>	 5.	Mst. Naila Naz	Nowshera.	Tanawal Abbottabad.	
	J.	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Swabi.		
		(1 cmale 20-11)	Officer (Female) Swabi.	Officer (Female) Chitral Lower.	
	6.	Mst. Musarat Jamal	Sub Divisional Education		
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Chitral		
_	<u></u>		Lower.	Mulkhow Chitral Upper	
	7.	Mst. Arifa Bibi	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Torkhow		
	8.	Mst. Nancy Begum	Mulkhow Chitral Upper Sub Divisional Education	Kohistan Upper AVP.	
	v.	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Topi Swabi		
	9.	Mst. Surriya Taj	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
ŀ		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Haripur	Officer (Female) Pabbi	
_				Nowshera	
	10.	Mst. Nazia Anjum	Sub Divisional Education		
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Pabbi	Officer (Female) Abbottabad.	
-	11.	Mst. Adeela Rani	Nowshera Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional 51 0	
	- • •	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Balakot	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Ghazi	
			Mansehra	Haripur.	
	12.	Mst. Saeeda Bano	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Ghazi	Officer (Female) Darband	
<u> </u>	4.5		Haripur.	Mansehra.	
	13.	Mst. Sajida Sakhi	Sub Divisional Education	Sub Divisional Education	
		SDEO (Female BS-17)	Officer (Female) Darband	Officer (Female) Pattan	
-	14.	Mst. Fozia Parveen	Mansehra.	Kohistan Lower AVP.	
	. 7.	SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Serai	Sub Divisional Education	
		++20 (i ciliale bo-17)	Officer (Female) Serai Naurang Lakki Marwat.	Officer (Female) NMAs Lakki	
				Marwat against the newly created post.	
_			<u></u>	Lordated post.	



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT Block-"A" Opposite MPA's Hostel, Civil Secretariat Peshawar
Phone No. 091-9223588

>	15.	Mst. Shahnaz Begum SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Takhti Nusrati Karak	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) NMAs Jandola Tank against the newly created post.
	16.	Mst. Bibi Arifa SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Mansehra	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Serai Naurang Lakki Marwat.
	17.	Mst. Mehar Sani SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Gaggra Buner.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Havellian Abbottabad
	18.	Mst. Farhat Yasmeen SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Karak	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Takhti Nusrati Karak.
	19.	Mst. Bibi Ayesha Naz SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Lower Tanawal Abbottabad.	Sub Divisional Education
	20.	Mst. Malak Taja . SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Mardan.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Adezai Dir Lower.
	34	Mst. Shabnam Bibi SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Adezai Dir Lower.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Timergara Dir Lower.
	22.	Mst. Shaheen Bibi SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Battagram	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Kalkot Dir Upper AVP.
	23.	Mst. Shamshad Bibi SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Tank	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Pharpur DI Khan
	24.	Mst. Sonia Nawaz SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Pharpur DI Khan	
	25.	Mst. Naheed Fazal SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub h Divisional Education Officer (Female) Abbottabad.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Sheringle Dir Upper AVP.
	26.	Mst. Anisa Jamshed SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Lora Abbottabad.	Sub Divisional Education
	27.	Mst. Nageena Bibi SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Havellian Abbottabad	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Kundai Kohistan Upper AVP.
	28.	Mst. Zahida Khanum SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Lakki Marwat.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Alai, Battagram AVP.
	29.	Mst. Nazma Shaheen SDEO (Female BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Khanpur Haripur	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Barawal Dir Upper AVP.
>	30,	Mst. Sobia Tabassum (MC BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) DI Khan	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Domel Bannu.



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT Block-"A" Opposite MPA's Hostel, Civil Secretariat Peshawar

Phone No. 091-9223588

			
31.	Mst. Farhat Yasmeen (MC BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Domel Bannu.	The President Education
32.	Mst. Rizwana Pari (MC BS-17)	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Khadu Khel Buner	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Karak
33.	Mst. Shagufta Noreen (MC BS-17)	Assistant Director, Directorate of E&SE KP	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Garhi Kapoora Mordon AVD
34.	Mst. Naseem Bukhari (MC BS-17)	Waiting for posting in Directorate of E&SE KP	Kapoora, Mardan AVP. Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Khyber AVP.
35.	Mst. Azra Afridi, ASDO (BS16)	Assistant Sub-Divisional Education Officer (Female) Daggar Buner	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Daggar Buner in OPS.
36.	Mst. Salma ASDEO (BS-16)	Assistant Sub- Divisional Education Officer (Female) Batkhela.	Sub Divisional Education Officer (Female) Thana Baizai Malakand in OPS.

SECRETARY TO GOVT: OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA E&SE DEPARTMENT

Endst: of Even No & date

Copy forwarded for information to the: -

- 1. Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- Director E&SE Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 District Education Officers (Female) concerned.
- District Accounts Officers concerned.
- 5. Director EMIS, E&SE Department with the request to upload the posting/ transfer notification on the official website of the department.
- 6. PS to Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. PS to Minister for E&SE Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 8. PS to Secretary, E&SE Department, Khyper Pakhtunkhwa
- Officers concerned.

10. Master file.

(HAREEZ UR REHMAN SHAH)
SECTION OFFICER (SCHOOLS FEMALE)