### Form- A

### FORM OF ORDER SHEET

	Court o	f
	Case No	204C /2021
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Worthy Cha	
		proper order please.
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put
		up there on
		CHAIRMAN
	· · · · · · · · ·	
•		
	· · · · ·	
·* .		•
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
		. 33

۰.

\_\_\_\_\_

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

9

Mian Muhammad

VS

Govt of KP through Secretary E & SE) & others

#### **INDEX OF DOCUMENTS**

S.NO	DESCRIPTION OF DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Menio of appeal		1-2
2.	Copy of Notification dated 20/12/2012		3
3.	Copies of Pay slips	B&C	4-5
4	Copy of Departmental appeal/representation	D	6
5.	Copy of Judgment dated 117/172019	E	7-8
6.	Wakalatnama		9

ber ellant

Through

M. Ashfaq KhanAkhunkhail

Syed Zeshan Khan

&

Mujeebullah

Advocates Khalid & Law Associates 46-C, 2<sup>nd</sup> Four, Cantonment Plaza, Peshawar Saddar Cell No. 0333-8522332 Ashfaqkhan182@gmail.com

Dated:

### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNK7H7WA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR Khyber Pakatukhwa Service Tribunal

Mian Muhammad

Ę

Presently serving as PSHT (BPS-15) in GPS SHATALNO 1Dir Lowered 14/

(APPELLANT)

Diary No. 725

#### VERSUS

- 1. The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 2. The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3. The Secretary Finance Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 4. The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

5. The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

(RESPONDENTS)

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS **<u>BY</u>** ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF <u>APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.</u>

#### **PRAYER:**

That on acceptance of this Appeal the Respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period(Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

#### **R/SHEWETH:**

FACTS:

- 1. That the Appellant is serving in the Elementary and Secondary Education department as Primary School Teacher (BPS-15) quiet efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No.FD(PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14-07-2011 was issued.

That later on the finance department enhanced/ revise the rate of conveyance Allowance vide dto-daytification dated 20-12-2012 for civil servants (BPS-1-15) but Respondents have treated the Appellants under the previous notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. gistra(Copy of the Notification are attached as annexure A)

- 7)214. That Appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the Respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. (Copies of the Salary slips of working/serving month and vacations deduction period are attached as annexure B&C)
  - 5. That similar placed employees of Elementary & Secondary Education Department (hereinafter referred as E &S Education Department) approached this August Tribunal and their grievance was redressed vide judgment dated 11-11-2019. (Copy of Judgment dated 11/11/2019 is attached as annexure D)
  - 6. That being aggrieved form the illegal action of deduction of conveyance allowance, the Appellant preferred departmental appeal before the competent authority but the same has not been responded by Respondents within the statutory period of ninety days. (Copy of departmental appeal is annexed as annexure E)
  - 7. That feeling aggrieved from action and inaction of the Respondents and having no other remedy available, hence, the Appellant approaches this Hon'ble Court inter alia on the following grounds.

#### <u>GROUNDS:</u>

£

- A. That the action and inaction of the Respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B. That the Appellant has not been treated by the Respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the Respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C. That the action of the Respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly guaranteed by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D. That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is governed by Government Servant Revised Leave Rules,1981 while vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the Appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacation period.
- E. That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules,1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve(12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F. That as the act of the Respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and discriminatory hence, not tenable in the eye of law.
- G. That Appellant has vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the Respondents to deprive the Appellants from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H. That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- 1. That according to Article 38(e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the Appellant is fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J. That the Appellants seeks permission of this Hon'ble Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

In wake of above submission, it is, therefore, must humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Appeal the Respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period(Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits Or

Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems just and proper that may also be awarded in favor of the Appellant.

Through

Appellant

ADVOCATE

#### M. Ashfaq KhanAkhunkhail Syed Zeshan Khan & Mujeebullah ADVOCATES

Khalid & Law Associates 46-C, 2nd Four. Cantonment Plaza, Peshawar Saddar

#### CERTIFICATE

As per instruction of my client prior to the present one, no such like appeal has been filed by the Appellant before this Hon'ble Court.

3

### OVERNEENTOF KHYLEE CARTENTING FINANCE DEPERTMENT REGULATION

O FOSCISR-IN - ANO pararate. - Dilo 

Finance Des and the i .... charvar

īċ :

er destruit.

÷.,

المحاج فالمحاج والمحاج و The Earlor Mans Str. Douter  $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{v} +$ الم الله المعتادة والمعتادة وحجاجة A Police I Agente (Disting the Capacity in Agent States) AL CONSELLASSING LUCING A CONSELLASSING AND A CONSELLASSING A REVISTON IN THE PATE OF COMPANCE ALLOWANCE

CTWIL EMPLOYEES DELINE DOVEDNMERTIPES

היין יביטן זבראי האיניאי פינאיניאי פינאיניאי האיניאי היין איניאי האיניאי האיניאי האיניאיניאי האיניאי האיניאי ה היין איניאין היינאין איניאין אינ

ינטוטיטירט רצוצש. אמייוביאבוטירוא אבחיישובטכא שווטייביבט בריפירהטאסיבבב וח

BPS TEMOSTING PLITE (PH) REASED PLATE (PAN) ्रियो जिल्ला स्टिनिय 1. <u>101</u> S.NO <u>, < 1 640</u> F.S. 2. 7.20/--200 2 GBID - E.S. 5, LOCA :

יחשוני של אפרבי החדשתו זמני נשינה מישנה מישנה שנה שווא יבטחב ובאידשור באיניין איני איני איני איניין איני

٢ منابع ٢ منابع

4 adat SC FD SOGSTERED STREET

ישוֹדַתְּהַ בּוֹחוֹהַ פוּייָסַפּשָּרַבָּאָבָסו ביי עסט ג

sin The Stat Drack men وجنبة تاران ملأرميه 

ينفره ووالعاجر وا

PAGE.5

# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

Prom

### NO,FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar,

Ter

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa,

#### Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17 2. 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

THE

PROVINCIAL

Arrea D

The Director, (E&SE) Department,

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

### SUBJECT: DEPARMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE <u>DURING WINTER &</u> <u>SUMMER VACATIONS.</u>

#### **Respected Sir**,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self-Department and is serving as SCT (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that conveyance allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for working in BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of education department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the federal service tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the honorable service tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of education department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granted to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is, therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 16.08.2020

**Yours Sincerely** 

SCT (BPS 16) in GHS Shehzad No. I Dir Lower.

То

Appeal No 1452/2019 Markad Hayat Ve Gart

Counsellifor the appellant present Learned counsel referred to the JUdgment passed by learned. Federals Service: Tribunation: Appeal: No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which Was thanded down on 03 12 2018. Through the said JUdgment the issue of spayment of on 03 12 2018. Through the said JUdgment the issue of spayment of conveyance: Allowance. to a civil servant during summer rand Lwinter. Vacations was held to be within his environment and the deduction already was held to be within his environment and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made: to the judgment by Honourable: Peshawar High Court passed on 01 10:2019 Jun

the case of appellant.

51120.19

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence; was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "eay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance. Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of fitigation which may protract over a formidable period, the 'appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

ANNOUNCED

File be consigned to the red

heture cops

shawa

BETTER COPY

# Counsel for the Appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the Judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal an Appeal No. 1888 (R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a Civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Hon'ble Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of Appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Hon'ble Peshawar High Court in the case of Appellant, stated that in case the Respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the Appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant Appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the Appellant, the Hon'ble High Court not only expounded the definition of "Ray" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the conveyance allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the Respondents were represented before high court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the Appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Hon'ble Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P No.3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the Respondents within shortest possible time. The Appellant shall however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the Respondents within a reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

Chairman

لعرالت جرين فرز ترتونون 95 Appellant مل بخر وزخه Govforkp rt. Rothers مقذمه دعوكي باعت ترريا نكه مقدمه مندرجه عنولا الماين اين طرف سے داسطے بيردي د جوايب د الطوکان کا روائي متعلقة آن مقام بر المحمر ...... كيلي محرب الله مقرركر بحياقراركما جايتا ہے۔ كەمىنا حب مصوف كومقد مەكى كل كاردائى كا كۈل اختيار ، دگا نىيز و میل ساحب کوراضی نا سه کرنے دتقرر رثالت ہ نیسلہ بر حلف دیتے جواب دہی اورا قبال دعویٰ اور بعسورت ذم کری کرنے اجراءا درصولی چیک در دیپیار عرضی دعوی ادر درخواست ہرتسم کی تقسد یق زرایس بردستخط کرانے کا اختیار ہوگا۔ نیز صورت عدم پیردی یا ذکری یکطرفہ یا اپیل کی برایدگی ادرمنسوخی <sup>\*</sup> میز دائر کرنے اپنیل حکمرانی د<sup>نظ</sup>مر ثانی د پیروی کرنے کا اختیار ہوگا۔ از بصورت ضرورت مقدمہ مذکور کے کل پاجزوی کا روائی کے داسطے اور دکیل پا مخارقا نونی کواپنے ہمراہ پااپنے بجائے تقرر کا اختیار **موگا \_ا**ورمها حب مقرر شده کو<sup>نی</sup>می دای جمله ندکوره بااختیارات حاصل جون سمح ا دراس کا ساخت<sup>ن</sup>ر · برواختة منظور قبول بوگاردوران متندمه مين جوخريندد مرجاندالتوات مقدمه برسب سے ديون -کوئی تاریخ پیشی مقام دورہ پرہو یا حدے باہر ہوتو وکیل صاحب پابند ہوں کے کہ پیردی **م**یکورکریں۔لہذاوکالت نا میکھدیا کہ سندر ہے ۔ 1, 20 21 \_ (SUg2 .1 المرتوم \_\_\_\_\_ NO کے لئے منظور ہے۔ بمقام Alexend Rummer