Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of		·	
	1/15		
e No	10.125	/2020	

5.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	· 2	3
1-	18/12/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafza Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learner
		Member for proper order please.
		REGISTRAR
<u>?</u> -		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be pu up there on $\frac{4/3/21}{}$
:		
		MEMBER(J)
ø		
	04.03.2021	Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the case is
		adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
,		\$
	4 .	READER
		1
)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL N	VO.	/2020
		 •

AMIR ZEB VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	A	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	. 8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI

ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. <u>/6/ 53</u>/2020

MR. AMIR ZEB, SCT (BPS-16)
GHS AMANGARH NOWSHERA
Personnel Number: 00133207

Khyher Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunul

APPELLANT

Dated 18/12/20 20

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education edito-day Department as SCT (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.

That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981
- while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

THROUGH:

APPELL/ANT

AMIR Ž

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE



FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-itys-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012 (4)

From

The Secretary to Govt, of Khyber Pakhtunkhiwa

Finance Department

Peshawar.

To:

All Administrative Scotteries to Gove of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

The Senior Member, Goad of Revenue, Khyber Pakhium draip

3 The Secretary to Governor Whyber Pakhaunkows

4 The Secretary to Chief Minuster, Khyber Pakinardiwaa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Agreembly, Knyber Pakiflunkhwa

All Heads of Altached Departments in Knyber Pakhainkhwa.

7 All District Coordination Officers in Khybert Pakintunkhun.

B. Als Political Agents / District & Sassions Jeoges in Khyber Pakhtankhwa

3. The Registrer, Peshawat High Court Peshawar.

10. The Chairman, Public Sarvise Consession, Khyber Pakhtuckhwa.

The Chairman, Services Tribunill, Khypor Pakhtonkhwa.

Subject.

REVISION IN THE BATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhturkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise presste of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provinced Civil Servants, Governor Pathtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain __urrchanged.

S.NO	8P\$		EXISTING RATE	(PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4	$\overline{}$	Rs.1,500/-		R5.1,700/-
2.	5-10		Rs.1,500/-		Rs.1,840/-
3.	11-15		Rs.2,000/-		Rs.2,720/-
<u>c1</u>	15-19	,	Rs.5,000/-		Rs.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-97, 18-and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Fasthfully,

[Sahibza Ja Saued Alemadi Secretary Finance

Lindso NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/2.80/2012

Bosed a redimensional and all all combers 20%

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Accountant General Kinyber Pakhtunkhwa: Peshewat

3 Secretarios to Government of Punjab, Sindh & Solochistan, Finance Deportment

P All Autoromous & Send Autonomous Bodies in Engine Pakhtunthwa

ATTESTED

to be true copy
Advecate

Dist Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (August-2019)

Personal Information of Mr AMIR ZEB d/w/s of

Personnel Number: 00133207

CNIC: 99990841918

Date of Birth: 10.10.1969

Entry into Govt. Service: 15.05.1989

Length of Service: 30 Years 03 Months 018 Days

Employment Category: Vocational Temporary

Designation: SENIOR CERTIFIED TEACHER

80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: NR6031-G.H.S AMANGARH

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001 Cash Center: 4

GPF A/C No: EDU 038362

Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

876,923.00

Vendor Number. -Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

		TY	, ***********************************	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 23
٠.	0001 Basic Pay	Wage type	Amount	Wage		
	1947 Medical Al	low 15% (16-22)	53,870.00	1000 House Rent Allows	ance	Amount
	2199 Adhoc Reli	ef Allow @10%	2,576.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief	All-2013	2,727.00 1,260.00
	2224 Adhoc Reli	ef All 2017 10%		2211 Adhoc Relief All 2	016 10%	4,276.00
ı	2264 Adhoc Relie	et All 2019 10%	5,387.00	2247 Adhoc Relief All 20	018 10%	5,387.00
. 1	Deductions C-					0.00

Deductions - General

•	Word			·		
Ì	3016 GPF Subscription	type	Amount	777	······································	·
ŀ	3600 L		1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Wage type		Amount
ł	3609 Income Tax		13001	Benevolent Fund		-800.00
٠	4004 R. Benefits & Deat	h Comp:		Emp.Edu. Fund KPK		
			1,089.00	<u></u>		
· 7	Deditations r					0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Deductions - Income Tax	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Payable: 18,746.15 Recovered till August-2019: 1,	876.00 Exempted	: 7497.65 Recoverat	
ayee Name; AMIR ZEB account Number: 280400-0 ank Details: THE BANK OF KHYBER, 080008 NOWSHERA LAZA, NOWSHERA			35.00 NCH SAAD
aves: Opening Balance: Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
ty: NOWSHERA mp. Address: ty: Email:	r Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: N	o Official

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Nowshera Monthly Salary Statement (May-2019)



Personal Information of Mr AMIR ZEB d/w/s of

Personnel Number: 00133207

CNIC: 99990841918

Date of Birth: 10.10.1969

Entry into Govt, Service: 15.05.1989

Length of Service: 30 Years 00 Months 018 Days

Employment Category: Vocational Temporary

Designation: SENIOR CERTIFIED TEACHER

80003685-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: NR6031-G.H.S AMANGARH

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 4

GPF A/C No: EDU 038362

Interest Applied. Yes

GPF Balance:

760,000.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 23

<u>.</u>	Wage type	Amou	nt	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pav	53,870.0	00 1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.0	0 1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,318.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,260.0	0 2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	840.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	4,276.0	0 2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	5,387.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	5,387.0	0	,	0.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	An ount
3016	GPF Subscription - Rs3340	-3,340.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-100.00	3990 Emp.Edu Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,089.00		0;00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Deddetions - Loans and Advances	•	•	
Loan Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Deductions - Income Tax Payable: 2,000.00 Recovered till May 2019: 1,10	00.00 Exempted: 8	300.00 Recover	able: 100.00
Gross Pay (Rs.): 81,065.00 Deductions: (Rs.):	-5,479.00 N	et Pay: (Rs.): 75	,586.00
Payce-Name: AMIR ZEB Account Number: ::80400-0			
Bank Details: THE BANK OF KHYLER, 080008 NOWSHER	A BRANCH SAAD PLA	ZA NOWSHERA BR	ANCH SAAD
PLAZA, NOWSHERA Leaves: Opening Balance: Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
	,		

Permanent Address: SDEO M NSR

City: NOWSHERA

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address

Email:

K

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE **DURING WINTER &**

SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SCT (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 06.08.2020

Your Obediently

WISTED

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019 Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), APPELLANT GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar... VERSUS 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3. The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.RESPONDENTS APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST, THE IMPUGNED OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND ACTION UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE

STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter-Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fredto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in egistral favor of the appellant.

-11/10/66. R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

EXAMINE.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14:07:2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

betrue copy A'dvocate

Appeal No-1452/2019 Markad Hayat is Gost

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12:2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement, and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10,2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary", but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not regressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Carffled

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

F

Chairmai

₩

to be thule copy Advocate

Pesnawar

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

			OF 2020
	••		. *
		•	(APPELLANT)
		· -	
MIR ZEB		<u> </u>	(PLAINTIFF)
÷			(PETITIONER)
	•		
		<u>VERSUS</u>	
			(RESPONDENT)
ducation Dep	partment	·	(DEFENDANT)
vithdraw or bove noted i ngage/appoi aid Advocate	YOUSAFZAI, Advocated refer to arbitration matter, without any other Advocated to deposit, withdray	ate, Peshawar to for me/us as my liability for his de ate Counsel on my aw and receive or	hereby appoint and constict appear, plead, act, compronglour Counsel/Advocate in fault and with the authority/our cost. I/we authorized my/our behalf all sums the above noted matter.
)ated	//2020		Mob
· , · · · · · ·			CLIENT

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE