Form- A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

	111517		
Case No	00015	/2020	•.
· · ·			

	Case No	<u></u>
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	18/11/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for
-		proper order please.
		REGISTRARU 4
2: .	68-03-0	This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put
	- 21	up there on 1-3-2021
		MEMBER(J)
01.	03.2021	The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is
		leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the
	san	ne before S.B on 26.07.2021.
		Reader

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO/202	PPEAL NO	<u> </u>	/2020
---------------	----------	----------	-------

MR. SARTAJ VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	***************************************	1-3
2.	Notification	· A	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ
ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 03138901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL **PESHAWAR**

APPEAL NO. /2020

Khyber Pakhtukhwa

MR. SARTAJ SET (BPS-16) GHS, KHADI KILLI DISTRICT MARDAN Personnel. Number: 00129030

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE **IMPUGNED** RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

<u>PRAYER</u>

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction or conveyance and make the payment vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Department as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind; therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

SARTAI

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ ADVOCATE







GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING).

NO. FD/SC(SR-41/78-52/2012 Dated Pashawarthe: 20-12-2012

From

The Societary to Govt, of Kington Pashtuplanwa Finance Department. Perhavear.

भी नेवनस्ताविद्यारिक विद्याप्तस्तिक क् Gov. च स्थित्तेन निर्माधाराम् ५.

The Sanior Member, Board of Reserve, White Pakhius Prac-

The Scordary to Governor Kryber Podraciona .

The Secretary to Chief Misseer, Keyber Pakhtarikings,

The Secretary, Province Ascerby, Kingber Palister Rina All Heads of Attaches Departments in Knyher Pakhilinkhwa

Ağ Ölstrick Cocadinapion Öfficereze Kilayde'i Pakilitenkines.

AP Political Agents / District & Semions Judges in Khyper Pakirsterkeiwa

The Registra, Peshawa: HybrCourt, Peshawa:

The Chairman, Petilit Service Ceremetrian, Khyber Pokhiunkiawa.

The Chairman, Sewise Tabunal Payber Fakhlurahwa.

Subject

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE <u>CIVIL ÉMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL</u> GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyter Pakhturāhva has basa pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provinces Civil Servantia Covid र्जि Kryber Pakhtunkhwa (vioking in EPS-1 to EPS-15) w.e.f from 1º September, 2012 वर्ष the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in EFS-15 to EPS-19 will remain — wichanged.

	*		· ·	
S.NO	BP5	EXISTING PATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)	
1.	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	RE-1,700/-	
. <u> </u>	5-10	F\$.1,500/-	Rs.1,540/-	
<u>. 3.</u>	11:15	Fs.2,COO/-	Rs.2,720/-	
. <u> </u>	16-19	Rs.5,000/	Rs.5,000/-	

Conveyance Allowance at the pippyo rates per memb shall be admassible to fhase BPS-17, 18 ආර 19 හිදිවසුම who have not been sanctioned allicial vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Sabad Alumad) Secretary Finance

Endste NO. FIVSO(SR-IT):8-52/2012

Dated Levelswan the Hold Hercipher, Illif

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

Attourbed General Kantler Pakitterkins, Pasignas

විස්ද්රක්ෂම්ප්ර මේ මිවස්ද්රත්වසේ ස් Punjab, ශියේර් දී දිනු පරේෂමකා. මිමොහර වියේමම්බන්පරේ

AN Auguromens / উভাৰ Autonomous Bodes in Whyter Paki Leikijian

Adminument Secretary IR

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNICHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20,12,2012

From-

Per

Per

Da

En

D٤

DI Pa

G.

Pa

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

Τo

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Sccretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAICHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM).	Revised Rate (PNI)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2	5-10	.Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	.11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
·4: :	.16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17.
 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully 🗽

(Sahibzada Saecd Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December; 20.12

ATIESTED

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Mardan Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019)



Personal Information of Mr SARTAJ d/w/s of KHAISTA GUL

Personnel Number: 00129030

CNIC: 1610254805027

Date of Birth: 09.03.1974

Entry into Govt. Service: 30.06.1997

NTN: 0

Length of Service: 22 Years 01 Months 003 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

80003514-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: MR6120-PRINCIPAL G.H.S KHADI KILLI MARDAN

Payroll Section: 003

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 12

486,531.00

GPF A/C No: EDUMR011437

Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

Wendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 16

Pay Stage: 12

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001-	Basic Pay	37.150.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	796.00
	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	556.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2.868.00
	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,715.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3.715.00
	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	3,715.00			0.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount	Wa	ige type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription - Rs3340	-3,340.00	3501 Benevolent Fur	nd	-800.00
	Income Tax	-203.00	3990 Emp.Edu. Fund	d KPK	-150.00
	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,089.00		•	0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

i	Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable:

4,045.15

Recovered till July-2019:

203.00

Exempted: 1617.29

Recoverable:

2.224.86

Gross Pay (Rs.):

56,742.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-5,582.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

51,160.00

Payee Name: SARTAJ

Account Number: 16592-5

Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 220472 TAKHT BAI, MARDAN. TAKHT BAI, MARDAN., MARDAN

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: FAZAL ABAD T/BHAI

City: MARDAN

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email:



Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Mardan Monthly Salary Statement (May-2020)



Personal Information of Mr SARTAJ d/w/s of KHAISTA GUL

Personnel Number: 00129030 CNIC: 1610254805027

GPF A/C No: EDUMR011437

Date of Birth: 09.03.1974

Entry into Govt. Service: 30.06.1997

NTN: 0

Length of Service: 22 Years 11 Months 003 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER

80003514-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: MR6120-PRINCIPAL G.H.S KHADI KILLI MARDAN

Payroll Section: 003

GPF Section: 001

Interest Applied: Yes

Cash Center: 12 GPF Balance:

586,633.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 16

Pay Stage: 13

Wage type		Wage type Amount Wage type		Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	38,670.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00
1560	Science Teaching Allowan	200.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	796.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	556.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,868.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,867.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,867.00
2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	3,867.00			0.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501 E	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-543.00	3990 E	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable:

7,336.75

Recovered till May-2020:

4,961.00

Exempted: 1833.45

Recoverable:

542,30

Gross Pay (Rs.):

63,918.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-5,483.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

58,435.00

Payee Name: SARTAJ Account Number: 16592-5

Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMITED, 220472 TAKHT BAI, MARDAN. TAKHT BAI, MARDAN., MARDAN

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: FAZAL ABAD T/BHAI

City: MARDAN

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email:

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 20.07.2020

Your Obediently

ESTARTAI

BEFORE THE KHYBER PESHAWAR. APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019 Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.... **VERSUS** 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER.

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Figedto-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

77. 100/12

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and esecondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marbad Hayat is Gost

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement, and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal..

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Careffer

Periawar.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

ALVEDILL

Chairman

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

			OF 2020	
		•	(APPELLANT)	
SARTAJ		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	(PLAINTIFF)	
. •		<u>versus</u>	(PETITIONER)	
<u>Education</u>	Department		(RESPONDENT)(DEFENDANT)	
constitute withdraw above not engage/apsaid Advo	or refer to arbitration for ed matter, without any liab opoint any other Advocate	me/us as my/ou pility for his defaul Counsel on my/ou and receive on m	_do hereby appoint and ear, plead, act, compromise, r Counsel/Advocate in the t and with the authority to ar cost. I/we authorize the y/our behalf all sums and above noted matter.	
			212	

ACCEPTED J UMAR FAROOO