

1

2-

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

Court of

13230 /2020 Case No.-

Order or other proceedings with signature of judge S.No. Date of orderproceedings 3 7 The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate 28/10/2020 1may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 08-02 up there on

The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is 01.03.2021 on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.

Reader

MEMBER(J)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. ____/2020

VS

MUTAHAR KHAN

·`.	E	D	Ų	C/	١T	'IC)N	D	EP	Ť	T:

INDEX		
S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	
2.	Notification	A 4
3.	Pay slips	B & C 5- 6
4.	Departmental appeal	D 7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E 8-9
6.	Vakalatnama	10

THROUGH:

APPELLANT l

UMAR FAROOQ ADOCATE HIGH COURT CELL NO 0313-8901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 12230 / 2020 Khyher Pakhtukhiwa

Mr, MUTAHAR KHAN PST(BPS-15) GPS SULTAN KHEL, District Mohmond

Personnel Number:00103425

Diary Nd. 3407 Barca 28/10/202

.....APPELLANT

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. **RESPONDENTS**

APPEALUNDERSECTION-4OFTHEQKHYBERPAKHTUNKHWASERVICETRIBUNALACT,1974AGAINSTTHEIMPUGNEDACTIONOFTHERESPONDENTSBYILLEGALLYANDUNLAWFULLYDEDUCTINGTHECONVEYANCEALLOWANCEOFTHEAPPELLANTDURINGWINTER& SUMMERVACATIONSANDAGAINSTNOACTIONTAKENONTHEDEPARTMENTALAPPEALOFTHEAPPELLANTWITHINTHESTATUTORYPERIOD OFNINETYDAYS.AA

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any Registration of the remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH:

ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **PST (BPS-15)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from
 - BPS- 16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Copy of the Notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure...... **A**

- **3-** That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the Salary Slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure.
- 4- That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed Departmental appeal but no reply has been received so far. Copy of the Departmental appeal &is attached as annexure.......D.
- 5- That colleges of appellant of different caderapproached to this august tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its judgment no 1452/2019 titled magsadHayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019.....E.
- 6- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgment Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others:

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government,

therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.

F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.

G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.

- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

> APPELLANT MUTAHAR KHAN THROUGH: UMAR FAROOQ ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PARHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO, FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secreta	ry to Gew	t, of Eng	cen Pacht	unknwa.
Finance Dec	Jantinest,			
Penhavear		· .		

All Administrative Seguratives to Gove of Ximber Pekiturishina.
The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Knyber Pakhtunishap.
The Secretary to Governor Krigher Pakitsuskawa
The Secretary to Child Minseer, Keyber Pakatanking,
The Secretary, Pravincial Ascentary, Khyber Pakaluekhisia
All Hoods of Altached Departments in Knyher Pakhunkinia
Al District Coordination Officences Xhyper Paklitonkines.
All Political Agents / District & Sozaions Judges in Khyper Pakleterkhiwa
The Registrar, Pashawar High Cost, Peshawar
The Charman Public Service Conversion, Khyber Pokhturkiwa.
The Chairman, Berwees Tribunal, Kayper Pakhtonikhwa,

Saljear

5 4 5. ÷. 2 ŝ,

From

To:

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyte: Pakhturahwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Gove of Knyber Pathanthwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in 575415 to 665-19 will remain 🚽 urkinanged.

S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
- 1.	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u></u>	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	R\$.1,840/-
3.	11-15	1 Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
<u> </u>	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance of the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 efficient who have not been sanctioned afficial vehicles.

Yours Faithfully.

(Sahibzada Sacod Almad) Secretary Finance

Endst: NO. FD/SO/SR-ID/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20" Deveraber, 2012

- A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-
 - Abbacmani General, Kinder Pakittankima, Pesiminat
 - Secretaties to Government of Punjob, Sinch & Salbahatan, Fonditie Department
 - All Autoromous / Serie Autonomous Bodes in Kingder Pakitt, arthras

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Secondary (Real)

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20:12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 4.
 - 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
 - 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:
 - S. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

 - 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNK PROVINCIAL. **GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19**

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
/2	5-10	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	.11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

				í	-	R		
21				· · ·		\mathcal{L}		
00103425 М ЛАНАР КН. РАУМЕНТS		2140253995945 E D U C T I O N S	Desig: PRIMARY A M O U N 1		•	Grade: 15 NTN: PRINCIPAL REPAIL	Buckle No.: D BALANCE	Gazetted/Non-Gazette
0001 Basic Pay	34,740,00 301	5 GPF Subscription	2,890.00	_	CDE# N/	EDU.MND.3892	100 700 00	
1000 House Rent Allowa		0 6505 GPF Loan I	•	.000.00-			109,769.00- 256.00 2.06	
1300 Medical Allowance	-,	3501 Benevolent	•					53.60
1505 Charge Allowance	-,	3990 Emp.Edu. Fun		5.00- 5.00-	emp. Advance	.0368 192,000.00	36,000.00	156,000.00
1909 Charge Allowance	40.00	Accounts Office		5.00-				
		PAYROLL REG			B	602		
					Page :			
		For the month of	August ,2019		Dat	te: 29.08.2019		
DDO: MG6013 DEO	Primary Education	Mohmand	Payroll Section : (001 Pavroll 1				
1528 Unattractive Area		4004 R. Benefits &		52.00-				
2148 15% Adhoc Relief A	671.00	3609 Income Tax	207.0				-	
2199 Adhoc Relief Allow	@ 448.00			-				
2211 Adhoc Relief All 20	1 2,695.00							
2224 Adhoc Relief All 20	1 3,474.00							
2247 Adhoc Relief All 20	1 3,474.00							
2264 Adhoc Relief All 20	1 3,474.00							
PAYMENTS	53,865.00	DEDUCTIONS	10,874.00-		NET PAY	42,991.00 01.08.20	019 31.08.2019	
Branch Code:211384	GHALANAI	UNITED I	BANK LIMITED	GHALANAI		Accnt.No:	01010387	

ATTESTE!

†-

P

3

.,-

Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial District Accounts Office GHALANAI Monthly Salary Statement (June-2020)

Entry into Govi. Service: 01.01.1998



Personal Information of Mr MUTAHAR KHAN d/w/s of PAKISTAN Personnel Number: 00103425 CNIC: 2140253995945

NTN: Length of Service: 22 Years 06 Months 001 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Date of Birth; 01.04,1977

Designation: PRIMARY SCHOOL TEACHER 80926290-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: MG6013-DEO Primary Education Mohmand Payroll Section: 001 GPF Section: 001 GPF A/C No: Interest Applied: Yes Vendor Number: -Pay and Allowances: Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Cash Center: 31 GPF Balance:

20,869.00-

Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 15

6-C

Pay Stage: 15

Wage type		Amount	Amount Wage type		Amount
4001	Basie Pay	36.070.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500,00
1505	Charge Allowance	40.00	1528	Unattractive Area Allow	1,000,00
2148	15% Adhue Relief All-2013	671,00	2199	Adhoe Relief Allow @10%	448,131
2211	Adhise Relief All 2016 10%	2,695.00	2224	Adhoe Relief All 2017 10%	3,607,00
2247	Adhue Relief All 2018 10%	3,607,00	2264	Adhoe Relief All 2019 10%	3,607,00

Deductions - General

9

う

Wage type		Wage type Amount		Wage type	Amount	
3015	GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600,00	
3/	locome Tax	-289,00	3990	Emp.Edu, Fund KPK	-125.00	
40	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600,00	4200	Professional Tax	-1,200,00	

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descrip	tion	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal		192.000.00	-6,000.00	96,000,00
Deductions Payable:	- Income Tax 4.254.70 Recovered	l úll JUN-2020: 3,2	S0.00 Exempted:	974.70 Recovera	ble: 0.00
Gross Pay	(Rs.): 58,450.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-11,704.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 46,	746.0D
Account N	e: MUTAHAR KHAN umber: 2088002				
Bank Detai	ils: THE BANK OF KHYB	ER. 080153 IBB GHAL	ANI BRANCH IBB GH	ALANI BRANCH, MOI	IMAND
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	

Permanent Address: GHLJI KALI KHWIDAD KHEL SULTAN KHEL MOHAMMED AGENCY City: GHALLANAL Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Housing Status: No Official Temp. Address: City: Email: muttahir70@gmail.com



The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

Τo

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as PST (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R). CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the convence allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Derpartment.Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 09.0 2020

Your Obediently

MUTAHAR KHAN GPS SULTAN KHEL

UNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA BEFORE THE KHYBER PAR

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

ter en V

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS .

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND ACTION OF THE UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER OF: VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Flecte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

> R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

7-4/18.1.1.9

 ψ_{ii}

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

Khyber

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees 11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marbad Hayat vs Govt

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protractover a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Chairmán

File be consigned to the regord.

<u>(</u>]]

ANNOUNCED

Corffen -

Pesiawat

11.11.2019

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

_____ OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

MUTAHAR KHAN

(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

I/We**MUTAHAR KHAN**

do hereby appoint and constitute **UMAR FAROOQ**, **Advocate,High court**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated ____/2020

CLIENT ACCEPTED UMAR FAROOO ADVOCATE