

Form-A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of\_\_\_\_\_

15127 /2020 Case No.-\_\_ S.No. Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings 1 2 3 The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate 25/11/2020 1may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 08-02-21 **2**- up there on 1-3-2021 MEMBER(J)

01.03 2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

.

# APPEAL NO. \_\_\_\_/2020

## SHAGUFTA

## VS

TNDEV

## **EDUCATION DEPTT:**

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	•••••	1- 3.
2.	Notification	Α	· 4.
3.	Pay slips	B&C	5-6.
4.	Service Tribunal judgment	D	7-8.
5.	Departmental Appeal	E	9.
6.	Vakalat nama		

PPELLANT

THROUGH:

# UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND ADVOCATE

Flat No. 4, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

# APPEAL NO. 15727- 12020

Mst. Shagufta , PST (BPS-13), GGPS, ummat kor, District Mohmand.

Kbyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribupal Diary No. APPEL) \_ANT

## VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

**PRAYER:** 

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

## <u>R/SHEWETH:</u> <u>ON FACTS:</u>

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as PST (BPS-13) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from

- 4- That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeal which was allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure .....D.
- 5- That appellant preferred departmental appeal before the respondents under the rule of consistency against the unlawful action of deducting the convince allowance, but no response has been given by the respondent department till the expiry of statutory period of ninety days. Copy of the departmental appeal is attached as annexure.....E.
- 6- That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

## **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.

F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of mala fide on the part of respondents.

G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.

H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, and therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.

I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.

J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

APPELLANT

Shaqufta

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND

& San KHAN

**ADVOCATES** 



From

Tor

## GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

#### NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govf. of Khyber Pachtuskhwa. Finance Department, Peahavear,

All Administrative Secretaries to Gove of Kinter Pakhturkhwo. The Schlor Member, Board of Revenue, Knyber Posticualities. The Secretary to Generican Krigher Parkturations The Secretary to Chief Minster, Khyber Pakhunkhwa The Secretary, Francial Arcentary Knyber Pakhlunkhisa All Heads of Altachec Decarcatelis in Knyber Pakhionkinka At District Coordination Officersus Xingder Paklitunkhore. All Pollucal Agents / District & Semicirs Judges in Khyter Pakternkhwa The Registry, Peshawar Hyb-Coot, Peshawa The Chairman, Public Service Commession, shyber Pakhlur.cowa. The Chairman, Bernses Tribunal, Kayoo, Pakhiunkhwa.

Sinject

Ъ

4

ς.

#### REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyler Pakhturahwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allewance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants; Gove: of Knyber Pernumphwa (working in EPS-1 to EPS-15) wielf from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in 675416 to 695-19 will remain with hanged.

.:	S.NO	BP5	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
•.	1.	1-1	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
	2,	5-10	Ps.1,500/	Rs.1.840/-
•	3.	11-15	1 Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
•		16-19	Rs.5,000/	R\$.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the appropriates per month shall be admassible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 efficient who have not been sandtioned official vehicles

Yours Fashfully,

Sahiozada Sacod Ahmad Secretary Finance.

Dated Festiowar the 20" December, 2017 Endate NO. FDISONSR-ITES-52/2012

- A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-
  - Antornant General Kayaer Pakingkons, Pesisika
  - Secretaries to Galerathant of Punjab, Schah & Salbürwiten, Féreise Department All Auguregnatus / Senti Autonomous Bodies, in Khyper Pakhtankijaa

ATTESTED

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Secondary (Rea

#### BETTER COPY PAGE-5

#### GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT 1.4 (REGUALTION WING)

#### NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012

### Dated Peshawar the: 20,12,2012

#### From

To:

#### The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2 The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar. 

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:

#### REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE Subject: CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL **GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19**

#### Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/retrievente rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber -Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (FMI)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs 1,700/-
·2	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

> (Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Your Faithfully

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

JATTED

· ·		00 3012 GPF Subscription 2,220.00- 2,091.00 3501 Benevolent Fund 600.00-	GPF#: IV.EDU.MND.4369 INCOME TAX 686.28	379,184.00 8.00 629.09
	1300 Medical Allowance1,11528 Unattractive Area1,5	,856.00   3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK   125.00-     500.00   4004 R. Benefits & Death C   600.00-     500.00   3609 Income Tax   58.00-     25.00   25.00   59.00-		
A	·	Accounts Office GHALANAI PAYROLL REGISTER For the month of July ,2020	Page : 582 Date : 23.07.2020	
	2211 Adhoc Relief All 201   2,1     2224 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,1     2247 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,1	ucation Mohmand Payroll Section : 001 Payrol 421.00 54.00 06.00 06.00 06.00	11	
	PAYMENTS 51,525.0 Branch Code:231435 SHABQAD		NET PAY 47,922.00 01.07.2 HABQADAR A	2020 31.07.2020 ccnt.No: 5356-6
				ATTE
$\mathcal{A}$				73
		•		

DDD:   MG6049   GGHS Umat Khan   Payroll Section: :001 Payroll 1, PAYMENTS   PAYMENTS   A M O U N T   DE D U CT I O N S   A M O U N T   LOAN/FUND   PRINCIPAL   REPAID   BALANCE     0001 Basic Pay   35,630.00   3015 GPF Subscription   2,890.00-   GPF#:   IV.EDU.MND.4722   249,311.00     1000 House Rent Allowance   1,500.00   3030 Benevolent Fund   800.00-   INCOME TAX 3,420.00   377.00   3,043.60     1300 Medical Allowance   1,500.00   3060 Income Tax   305.00-   1302 Mattractive Area A   1,550.00   3050 Bio Solo Income Tax   305.00-     2114 Albic Relief All 201   2,471.00   2244 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00   2247 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00     2244 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00   2244 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00   2244 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00     2244 Adhoc Relief All 201   3,563.00   DEDUCTIONS   5,234.00-   NET PAY   50,466.00   0.108.2019 31.08.2019     Branch Code:221202   SHAKH NO.6, CHARSADDA   HABIB BANK LIMITED   SHAKH NO.6, CHARSADDA   Accnt.No: 7900221303	· · ·	PAYROLL REG For the month of		Page : 1,196 Date : 29.08.2019		•
0001 Basic Pay 35,630.00 3015 GPF Subscription 2,890.00- GPF#: IV.EDU.MND.4722 249,311.00   1000 House Rent Allowance 2,727.00 3501 Benevolent Fund 800.00- INCOME TAX 3,420.00 377.00 3,043.60   1300 Medical Allowance 1,500.00 3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK 150.00- 1000 House Rent 1,500.00 3090 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK 150.00-   1528 Unattractive Area 1,500.00 4004 R. Benefits & Death C 1,089.00-   2148 15% Adhoc Relief All 705.00 3609 Income Tax 305.00-   2199 Adhoc Relief All 2,471.00 2,471.00 -   2224 Adhoc Relief All 201 3,563.00 - -   2247 Adhoc Relief All 201 3,563.00 - -   2264 Adhoc Relief All 201 3,563.00 - -   2264 Adhoc Relief All 201 3,563.00 - -   2264 Adhoc Relief All 201 3,563.00 - -   PAYMENTS 55,700.00 DEDUCTIONS 5,234.00- NET PAY 50,466.00 01.08.2019 31.08.2019				DAN/FUND PRINCIPAL	REPAID BALANCE	
	0001 Basic Pay 1000 House Rent Allov 1300 Medical Allowan 1528 Unattractive Are 2148 15% Adhoc Relie 2199 Adhòc Relief Allo 2211 Adhoc Relief Allo 2224 Adhoc Relief Allo 2247 Adhoc Relief Allo	wance   2,727.00   3501 Benevolen     ice   1,500.00   3990 Emp.Edu. Fu     ia A   1,500.00   4004 R. Benefits &     if All   705.00   3609 Income Tax     iow @   478.00   201     201   3,563.00   3,563.00	t Fund 800.00- ind KPK 150.00- Death C 1,089.00-	INCOME TAX 3,420.00		۱ ۰ ۰
				,		No: 7900221303
		·				0
				,		7.2
			•	,		L'
				,		A CTF

SERVICE TRIBUNAL JNKHWA BEFORE THE KHYBER PA PESHAWAR APPEAL NO. 1452 / 2019 500 Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), APPE GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar..... VERSUS 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED OF THE RESPONDENTS BY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE SUMMER APPELLANT DURING WINTER & VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE OF THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS. That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may PRAYER: kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Flecte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant. 2-4/18/1.9 R/SHEWETH: EXA Khybel ON FACTS: 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary Ser まいい education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency ن د بر د د بر د Ń and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 5 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 中国大省自治的国家总统行为合合有"同时期的"的 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees  $\cdot$  n'TESTED

11.11.2019

Certifien

Postawar

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452-/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a ny. reasonable time.

ere cost

-2 3

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record. ATT/ESTED

ATTEST

e×∙N

### The Director, (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

## Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self department and is serving as PST (BPS-13) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the convevance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 9.07.2020

ATTES .---

Shagufta

**Your Obediently** 

To,

## VAKALATNAMA

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

\_\_\_\_\_ OF 2020

Shagufta

(APPELLANT) (PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

## **VERSUS**

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

I/We\_Shagufta\_

Do hereby appoint and constitute **UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND**, **Advocate, Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated.\_\_\_/\_\_/2020

CLIENT

ACCEPTED **UMAR FAROOO MOHMAND** &

CU KAMRAN KHAN ADVOCATES

OFFICE: Flat No. 4, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901674