FORM OF ORDER SHEET

/2021

Form-A

Court of_____

Case No

Order or other proceedings with signature of judge Date of order S.No. proceèdings 3 2 The appeal presented today by Syed Noman Ali Bukhari 18/03/2021]-Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2 up there on $\underline{2}$. $0\dot{b}$. 21MEMBER(J)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. _____ /2021.

SYED MIR ALI SHAH

الم. محمد الملي .

VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	·	1-4
2.	Copy of notification dated (20.12.2012	A	05
3.	Copy of pay slip of vacation	В	06
4.	Copy of pay slip working	С	07
[·] 5.	Copy of Departmental appeal	D	08
6.	Copy of High Court Judgment	· E	09-15
7.	Copy of Tribunal Judgment	F	16-17
8.	Vakalatnama		18

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

(SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI) ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

ł

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PES	SHAWAR
APPEAL NO.	3986 /2021

MR. SYED MIR ALI SHAH, **TT (BPS-15)** GHSS, SHABQADAR CHARSADDA

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal Diary No S APPELI

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 6. District Education Officer, Male, Charsadda. (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. District Account Officer, Charsadda Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

DIE MPRAYER

THAT ON ACCEPTANCE OF THIS APPEAL THE RESPONDENTS MAY KINDLY BE DIRECTED NOT TO MAKE DEDUCTION OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING VACATIONS PERIOD (SUMMER & WINTER VACATIONS) AND MAKE THE PAYMENT OF ALL OUTSTANDING AMOUNT OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE WHICH HAVE BEEN DEDUCTED PREVIOUSLY WITH ALL BACK BENEFITS. ANY OTHER REMEDY WHICH THIS AUGUST TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT THAT MAY ALSO BE AWARDED IN FAVOR OF THE APPELLANT.

<u>R/SHEWETH</u> <u>ON FACTS:</u>

1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **TT (BPS-15)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.

- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. **Copy of the Notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure A.**
- 3. That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. **Copies of the Salary Slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure B&C.**
- 4. That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed Departmental appeal but no reply has been received so far. **Copy of the Departmental appeal is attached as Annexure D.**
- 5. That it is pertinent to mentioned here that feeling aggrieved some colleagues of appellant filed writ petition No. 3162-P/2019 before the Peshawar High Court Peshawar which was disposed of vide Judgment dated 15.04.2020 but no reply has been received so far. Copies of the Judgment as attached as Annexure E.
- 6. That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august Tribunal in different services appeal which was allowed by this august Tribunal vide its Judgment dated 11.11.2019. **Copy of the Judgment is attached as Annexure F.**
- 7. where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied
 by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
 - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

PPELLANT null? SYED MIR ALI SHAH

THROUGH:

SYED NOMÁN ALI BUKHARI ADVOCATE PESHAWAR



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WIND)

NO. FD/SO(8R-II)/8-62/2012 Dated Pashewar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govt, of Khyber Paintunkiwa, Finance Department. Peakamer.

To:

2

Frank

- All Administrative Secretaries to Covt. of Knyber Painturschwa.
- The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Knyber Pakhunitwe-
- Ĵ. The Secretary to Governor Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 4 The Secretary to Chiel Minuter, Knyber Pakhankiwa
- 6 The Societary, Provincial Astemicly, Khyber Pakhtunichwa
- £. All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyber Pakinainthwa. T,
 - All District Coordination Officers at Khyber Patchindulnes.
- All Political Agents / Clethict & Secsions Judges in Khyber Politikuldwe b. 8.
- The Registry, Peshawar High Coort, Peshawar 10
- The Chairman, Public Sennes Conversion, Khyber Pakhrunktwe. • 1
 - The Chairman, Services Tribunal Klopper Pekintunktives.

Subject

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE GIVEL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTURKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Oear Si:

The Government of Knyber Palutunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1" September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in GPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain <u>" unchonged,</u>

S.NO	8 P 5	EXISTING RATE (PH)	REVISED RATE (PH)
1.	1-4	Rs.1.500/-	Rs-1,700/-
<u> </u>	_5-10	Rs.1,500/-	R4.1.840/-
<u> </u>	<u>11-15</u>	Rs.2,000/-	R4.2.720/-
4	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	Rs.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be estimatible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Fashlully,

(Sahibzada Saaod Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Ender: NO. FD/SO(6R-10/8-52/1011

Dated Pestawar the 20th Recember, 2017

- A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-
- Accounting Clement Knyber Politications, President
- Secretaries to Government of Punjso, Sirch & Salochetan, Finance Department
- 3 Al Autonomous / Sami Autonomous Bedies in Khyper Palifications

(INTIAZ AYUB)

Additional Sacratary (Rec)

• Dis	trict Accou	NWFP-Prov nts Office Cha Statement (Ju	rsadda				
	NIC: 99993			NŤ	N: . igth of Selvice: 29 Yea	ars 02 N	1onths 025 Day
GPF A/C No: EDUCH002758 Int Vendor Number: -	ER OVERNMI PF Section: (erest Applie	ENT HIGHER S 001	SECOND Cash C	A SCHOOL enter: GPF Balan		CHAR	SADDA
		· · ·				r	
~ Wage type		Amount			Vage type		Amount
0001 Basic Pay		36,070.00	1000	House Rent			2,349.00
1300 Medical Allowance		1,500.00	2148		Relief All-2013		810.00
2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%		546.00			f All 2016 10%	i	2,807.00
2224Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%5011Adj Conveyance Allowance		3,607.00 1,428.00	2247	Adnoc Relie	f All 2018 10%	- , 	3,607.00
Deductions - General	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	<u>i 1,428.00 </u>	<u>.</u>		<u>\.\</u> *	1	0.00
Wage type		Amount		۱	Vage type	-	Amount
3015 GPF Subscription - Rs2890	,	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent l	Fund		-600.00
3609 Income Tax _	· · ·	-50.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fu	ind KPK		-125.00
4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:		-1,052.00		· · ·			0.00
Deductions - Loans and Advances	iption	T	Duta of	mi amount	Deduction	•	Balance
Deductions - Income Tax	ed till JUN-	2019: 600 ons: (Rs.):		Exempted	: 400.00 Recove	erable: 48,007.0	0.00
Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI SHAI Account Number: 4240-9 Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK C		AN, 231435 SH	ABQAD	AR SHABQ/	ADAR,		
Leaves: Opening Balance: Availe		iled:	Earned:		Balance:		;
Permanent Address: SDEO (M) CH City: CHARSADDA Temp. Address:		cile: NW - Khyl	oer Pakht	unkhwa	Housing Sta	tus: No	Official
City:	Email	: sýedmiralishal	ntt@grna.	l.com			
					I.IATTE	ST	ED
· · ·							

n da ser de la companya de la company	Dist. Govt District Acco Monthly Salary S	. NWFP-Prov ounts Office Chr Statement (Septe	ursadda		\ \ ¥	New York	
Personal Information of M.	« even ain					چې	
Personal Information of Mr Personnel Number: 0014748	r SYED MIR ALI	I SHAH d/w/s of	ZUHOOR	SHAH			
Date of Birth: 07.04.1970				NTN:			2
Date of Dirtil: 07.04.1970	Entry into G	fovt. Service: 07	.04.1990	Length	of Service: 29	Years 05 M	lonths 025 D;
Employment Category: Voc	cational Permana	** *					,
Designation: THEOLOGY T	FACHER	fit .	(1000-100-1	~			
DDO Code: C'A6066-PRINC	IPAL GOVERNA	AENT RICHED (80001086 25000108	-DISTRICT GO	OVERNMENT	КНҮВЕ	
DDO Code: CA6066-PRINC Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section:	· OAL	SECONDA Curlio	SCHOOL SHA	BQADAR FO	RT CHAR	SADDA
GPF A/C No: EDUCH00275	58 Interest Appl		Cash Cen		,		
Vendor Number: -	:		- (GPF Balance:	5	78,349.00	
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: B	BPS For - 2017	Priv Seal	e Type: Civil	- DOC 16		
			ray otar	•	BPS: 15 ጊ	Pay Sta	ige: 15
Wage type	e	Amount		Wage	tyne '		
0001 Basic Pay		36,070.00	1000 H	ouse Rent Allow	* + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +		Amount 2,349.00
1210 Convey Allowance 20		2.856.00	4 1	edical Allowan			1,500.00
2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-		810.00	1 1	thoc Relief Alle			546.00
2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016		2,807.00		lhoc Relief All			3,607.00
2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018	10%	3,607.00		lhoc Relief All			3,607.00
Deductions - General		•		-			- 3,007.00
Wage type		Amount	Ţ	Wage			
015 GPF Subscription		-2,890.00	3501 Be	nevolent Fund	type		<u>Amount</u>
609 Income Fax		-233.00		ip.Edu. Fund K	DIZ		-600.00
004 R. Benefits & Death Co	omp:	-600.00		p.Dad. I and R		··	-125.00
							-0.000200
eductions - Loans and Adv:	ances		- <u>t</u>				<u>0.00×.</u>
eductions - Loans and Adv:	ances Description		Principal	amount	Deduction		
Deductions - Loans and Adv: Loan Deductions - Income Tax Dayable: 4,369.75 Ro				amount Exempted: 1747	Deduction .54 Reco	verable:	0.00*: Balance 2,094.21
eductions - Loans and Adv Loan eductions - Income Tax 'ayable: 4,369.75 Ro	Description	2019: 528.0		Exempted: 1747		-	Balance
Ioans Loans and Adv: Loan	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.):	00 E -4,448.00	Exempted: 1747 Net P	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	verable: 53,311.00	Balance
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI account Number: 4240-9 tank Details: NATiONAL BA	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA	00 E -4,448.00	Exempted: 1747 Net P	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	-	Balance
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI account Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATiONAL BA	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH NK OF PAKISTA	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA	00 E -4,448.00	Exempted: 1747 Net P	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	-	Balance
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI ecount Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATiONAL BA raves: Opening Balance	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR I	Exempted: 1747 Net P	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	-	Balance
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI ecount Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATIONAL BA aves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M	Description ecovered till SEP- DO Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA led:	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned:	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	-	Balance
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI ecount Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATIONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA	Description ecovered till SEP- DO Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned:	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance:	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI ecount Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATIONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA emp. Address:	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.):	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI ecount Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATiONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA emp. Address:	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): AN, 231435 SHA led:	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax ayable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 ayee Name: SYED MIR ALI account Number: 4240-9 ank Details: NATiONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA emp. Address:	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI vecount Number: 4240-9 Bank Details: NATIONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA emp. Address:	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
Deductions - Loans and Adv: Loan Peductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
Deductions - Loans and Adv: Loan Peductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21
Deductions - Loans and Adv: Loan Peductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21 ficial
Deductions - Loans and Adv: Loan Peductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 4,369.75 Payable: 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI Vaccount Number: 4240-9 Bank Details: NATIONAL BA	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	0 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh @gmail.cor	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21 ficial
eductions - Loans and Adv: Loan eductions - Income Tax Payable: 4,369.75 Ro ross Pay (Rs.): 57,759.0 Payee Name: SYED MIR ALI vecount Number: 4240-9 Bank Details: NATIONAL BA eaves: Opening Balance ermanent Address: SDEO (M ity: CHARSADDA emp. Address:	Description ecovered till SEP- 00 Deduction SHAH ANK OF PAKISTA ce: Avai 0) CHARSADDA Domic	2019: 528.0 ons: (Rs.): NN, 231435 SHA led: ile: NW - Khyber	00 E -4,448.00 BQADAR Earned: Pakhuunkh	Exempted: 1747 Net P SHABQADAR	.54 Reco ay: (Rs.): Balance: Housing Sta	53,311.00	Balance 2,094.21 ficial

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as TT (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 03/12/2020

Your Obediently SYED MIR ALI SHAH

Тο

Judgment Sheet

-(q)

HCOT

E

IN THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

Writ Petition No. 3162-P/2019 Akhtar Hussein and 69% others..vs..Govt of Khyber Pakhtuakhwa

<u>JUDGMENT</u>

Date of hearing......01.10.2019..... Petitioner(s) by Mr. Noor Mohammad Khattak, Advocate. Mr. Mujahid Ali Khan, AAG, for respondents.

<u>ROOH-UL-AMIN KHAN, J:-</u> Through this common judgment we, proposed to decided the instant as well as the connected writ petitions as all having involved common question of law and facts, the particulars of which are given below.

> WP No. 3162-P/2019 titled Akhtar Hussain etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3064-P/2019 titled Habeeb Ullah etc...Vs..
 Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
 Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

iii.

iv

Jur Garard

WP No. 3084-P/2019 titled Sikandar Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3178-P/2019 titled Abdur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others. WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

viii. WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khanetc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

> WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

> WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.

WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalid etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

TESTED

EXAMINER hawar High Court

. ר

vi.

vii.

ix.

x.

xi.

xii.

poles on

Ŵ

WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs... Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

D

WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khanetc...Vs..
 Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
 Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.

WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalid etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

FESTED

High Court

Kolem / xii.

vi.

vii.

ix.

х.

xi.

xiii. WP No. 3567-P/2019 titled Husnur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 3 others.

WP No. 3667-P/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

xiv.

χv.

xvi.

WP No. 3939-P/2019 titled Syed Khurshid Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 5 others.

WP No. 4072-P/2019 titled Subhan Ullah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

xvii. WP No. 4758-P/2019 titled Sohrab Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

2. As per averments of the writ petition, the petitioners are serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department on their respective posts. On 14.7.2011 the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa enhanced the conveyance allowance to all the Civil Servants i.e. from BPS-1 to 15, including the petitioners, which was subsequently revised vide another notification dated 20.12.2012 and was further enhanced. But the respondents without any valid and justiffable reasons stopped / deducted the payment of conveyance

TESTED

KAMINER war High Court

LΤ

allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period.

3. In essence, the grievance the petitioners is that they were receiving the conveyance allowance under the notifications mentioned above, which was stopped without any justifiable reason.

4. Since the matter pertain to grant of conveyance allowance which is part and parcel of pay. Similar controversy came before this Court in Writ Petition No. 3509-P/2014 titled (Hafiz Mohammad Ilyas etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), wherein the pay and salary were defined in the following manner.

"7. To resolve the controversy as to whether payment of allowances to a civil servant falls in chapter-2 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants' Act, 1973 i.e.¹ terms and conditions of service, it is necessary to reproduce the definition of "**pay**" provided in section 2(e) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 which reads as under:

> " 2. (e)—"Pay" means the amount drawn monthly by a civil servant as pay, and includes special pay, personal pay and any <u>other</u> <u>emoluments</u> declared by the prescribed authority to be paid." (emphasis provided).

The word "emolument" used in the above quoted definition clause of the Civil Servants Act, 1973, according to its dictionary meaning, denotes wages and benefits received as compensation for

ATTESTED

war High Court

EXAMI

Pesh

holding an office or having employment. The word emolument is basically derived from the Latin word emolumentum. It originally meant "the sum paid to a miller for grinding a customer wheat". Today, the term exists mostly as a bit of archaic legalese, but it might be within the route of expression i.e. "grinding out a living". From the above it is emoluments are essentially the manifest that benefits that one gets from the working of being Emolument is the profit from employed employment and is compensation in return of services, hence the emoluments are part and parcel of pay. Section 17 being part of chapter-2 i.e. terms and conditions of service of a civil servant provides that, a civil servant appointed to a post shall be entitled, in accordance with rules, to the pay sanctioned for the post. Likewise, Rule 9(21) of (FR/SR) provide, the definition of pay which means the amount drawn monthly by a government servant as :

(i) the pay, other than special pay or pay granted in view of his personal qualification, which has been sanctioned for the post held by him substantively or in an officiating capacity, or to which he is entitled by reason of his position in a cadre, and (ii) overseas pay, technical pay, special pay and personal pay and

, (iii) any other emoluments which may be specially classed as pay by the governor general.

The legislature in its wisdom has wisely used the word "pay" instead of salary in definition clause and section 17 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973. The word 'pay' connotes



ATTESTED БХ∲М₿

5

payment of wages including emolument in broader spectrum while the salary is used for amount that one receives in return for work and or service provided, which is paid periodically i.e. over a specified interval of time such as weekly or most commonly monthly. The term "salary" has been dealt with at page-553 of Corpus Juris Secundem Vol. 77 as under:-

<u>"Salary"</u>. The word "Salary" is defined has meaning fixed compensation regularly paid by the year, quarter, month or week; fixed compensation for regular work, or for continuous services over a period of time; periodical compensation for services; compensation for services rendered; per annum compensation mean in official and in some other situation, or station; legal compensation.

Salary is also defined as meaning stipulated periodical recompense; or consideration paid, or stipulated to be paid to a person on regular interval for services usually a fixed sum to be paid by the year or half year, quarter, reward or consideration paid or agreed to be paid to a person on a regular intervals by the year, month or week for services; reward of fixed or recompense for services rendered or performed; reward or compensation of services rendered or performed.

From the above mentioned definition it is manifest that the "salary" of a civil servant is a fixed amount regularly paid as compensation to the employee, whereas the pay means an amount received by a civil servant including other emoluments i.e. allowances."



STES

.

5. Besides, certain other petitions filed by the Teachers /employees of the same department serving from other corners of the province which were decided by Abbottabad Bench of this Court, wherein it was held that the conveyance allowance being part of pay fall in terms and conditions of civil servant and it can adequately be claimed through an appeal by adopting the prescribed procedure under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1974.

6. For the reasons given hereinabove, the petitioners are civil servants and their claim falls in terms and conditions of service enumerated in Chapter-2 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973, wherein the jurisdiction of this Court is expressly barred by Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. Resultantly, this and the connected writ petition mentioned above stand dismissed being not maintainable. However, the petitioners are liberty to approach

the proper forum, if so desire.

Announced on; Ist of October, 2019 <u>*Jawhad</u>*

Ġ $\mathcal{N} \cup \mathcal{G} \mathcal{E}$

CERTIFIED TO BE TRUE COPY

2 1 OCT 2019

SESTE

JUDGE

(DB) Mr. Justice Rooh UJ Amin Khan & Mr. Justice Mohammad Nacem Anwar

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUN PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452_/2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16),

GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPELL

- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE & · . SUMMER THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted

Fledte-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

24/10/19

R/SHEWETH:

ALTESTON FACTS:

TERR

eshaway

-1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. fg)ce Tribunal

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt

11.11.2019

Jertified () he ture copy

peshawa

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shail, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Flie be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNĆED

1.11.2019

Chairmán



VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2021

(APPELLANT)

SYED MIR ALI SHAH

__(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT)_

_(DEFENDANT)

I/We SYED MIR ALI SHAH ________ do hereby appoint and constitute SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHARI, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

CLIENT

ACCEPTED	•
SYED NOMAN ALI BUKHA	<u>RI</u>
ADVOCATE HIGH COU	<u>RT</u>
2 Shell	