Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

Case No.;

2021

Order or other proceedings with signature of judge. S.No. Date of order proceedings -.... 2 1 · 3 The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate may 1-14/06/2021 be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2. up there on 18.06.2021. 45 a clubbed case with appeal no.12889/2020. CHAIRMAN

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. ____/2021

Arif Shah

VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX					
S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE		
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3.		
2.	Notification	A	4.		
3.	Pay slips	B & C	5-6.		
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	· · 7 ·		
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E E	8-9.		
6.	Vakalat nama	••••			

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND ADVOCATE

PPELLANT

Flat No. 4, 2nd Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901647

Note:

_, Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 61 45 /2021

Mr. **Arif Shah**, SS(BPS-1), GHSS,Batagram, District Charsadda.

yber Pakhtukhwa Service Tripubal 19

APPELLANT

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

<u>R/SHEWETH:</u> ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as SS(BPS-17) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from

- 4- That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeal which was allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure**D**.
- 5- That appellant preferred departmental appeal before the respondents under the rule of consistency against the unlawful action of deducting the convince allowance, but no response has been given by the respondent department till the expiry of statutory period of ninety days. Copy of the departmental appeal is attached as annexure.....E.
- 6- That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of mala fide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, and therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

PELLANT

Arif Shah

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOO MOHMAND

& KAMRAN KHAN

ADVOCATES

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

ARIF SHAH EDUCATION DEPTT:& OTHERS VS

AFFIDAVIT

Stated on oath that the contents of the accompanying service appeal are correct to best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Service Tribunal.



DEPONENT

CERTIFICATE:

Ð,

Certify that no earlier service appeal has been filed by the appellant in the instant matter before this Honorable Service Tribunal.

AStat

CERTIFICATION

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

From

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

7. , All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: <u>REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE</u> <u>CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL</u> <u>GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19</u>

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No. BPS		Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)	
<u> </u>].	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-	
2.	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-	
3	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-	
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-	

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PARHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-10/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

C		
From		
· · ·	The Secretary to Govi, of Knyber Pakhtuskhwa	.1
	Finance Department,	
· .	Peshawar	42
Tether		• :
Ţ	All Adamsteative Secretaries is Gave of Kington Pakhtunikhwa.	
-	The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Rhyber Pashtuckhan	
· - 5	The Secretary to Genericer Kriyber Pakhtumkawa	;
	The Secretary to Chief Minseer, Klipper Pakhtankawa'	
2	The Secretary, Provincial Arrantic y Khyber Pakalershiwa	
÷.	All Heads of Alrached Departments in Knyber Pakhunkhwa	
	An District Coordination Officers(in Allysia) Paishtunkäma.	
· <u>·</u> ·	Ar Polinial Agents / District & Soundary Judges in Kityper Public shows	
÷	The Redistor, Reshavar High Cost Peabation	
1 1	The Chairman Public Service Conversion, shyber Poshtuckswa	
· · · · ·	The Chairman Services Tabanal Kaydar Pakhiuskawa.	:
The second	REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE F	ÓR 1
的现在分词	REVISION OF THE MALL VI WORTS DANHTINKHWA PRO	VINC

Dear Shi

THE PROVINCIAL CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

The Government of Khyle: Pakhturkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rafe of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Gove of struber Pathtenshive (working MEPS-1 to BPS-1) wielf from 1" September, 2012 of the following rates. However, the conveyance allowships for employees in 6PS-15 to 6PS-19 will remain erronniged.

S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
. <u> </u>	1-4	<u>Rs.1,500/-</u>	Rs 1,700/-
2.	5-10	Ps.1.500/-	Rs.1,840/-
3,	11.15	Rs.2,000/	R\$,2,720/-
	16-19	R≤.5,000/	R\$.5,000/-

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to thuse SRS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned afficial vehicles

(Sahibzada Saoad Ahmad) Secretary Finance

'ours Fashiuliv,

Dated Person of the 20th December, 2012 Ends:: NO. FDESO(SR-15)8-52/2012

A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-

- Acostrant General, Parger Paking forme, Pesiderer
- Secretaries to Government of Punjab, Section Soborestant Foreisse Debotterient. All Augoromous / Seni Augonomous Bacies in Kayor Pakturakhija

STED

 $\gamma_{J_{i}}$ UNTIAZ AYUB . Indillianal Selgman /Raad

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Charsadda Monthly Salary Statement (August-2019)





Personal Information of Mr ARIF SHAH d/w/s of MUHAMMAD ZAHIR SHAH

Per inel Number: 00718730	
Date of Birth: 15.02.1989	

CNIC: 1710190047313 Entry into Govt. Service: 02.05.2014 NTN:

Length of Service: 05 Years 04 Months 000 Days

TESTED

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: SUBJECT SPECIALIST 80001054-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: CA6034-HEAD MASTER GOVERNMENT HIGH SCHOOL BATAGRAM CHARSADDA Payroll Section: 001 GPF Section: 001 Cash Center: GPF A/C No: Interest Applied: Yes **GPF Balance:** 217,205.00 Vendor Number: -**Pay and Allowances:** Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil Pay Stage: 0 BPS: 17

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	30,370.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	4,433.00	
1974	Medical Allowance 2011	1,847.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	540.00	
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	375.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,544.00	
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,037.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,037.00	
2265	Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	1,518.00			0.00	

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount	
3017	GPF Subscription	-4,270.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00	
3990	Emp.Edu, Fund KPK	-250.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00	

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan		Desc	ription	Principal amoun	t Deduction	Balance
Deductions Payable:	- Income 0.00		- red till AUG-2019:	0.00 Exempt	ed: 0.00 Recov	verable: 0.00
Gross Pay (1	Rs.):	47,701.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-6,220.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	41,481.00
Payee Name Account Nu Bank Detail	mber: 21:	5852034	IITED, 210364 UMERZA	AI UMERZAI,		
Leaves:	Openi	ng Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
Permanent A	Address:					
City: D			Domicile: -		Housing Sta	atus: No Official
Temp. Addr	ess:					
City:			Email: shaharif52@	gmail.com		
			-			
	-					

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/27.08.2019/16:29:14/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees

'Errors & omissions excepted

The Director, (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

R

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self-Department and is serving as SS(BPS-17) guite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which-was-accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 25.02.2021

Your Obediently

Arif Shah AStat

AITESTED

To,

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO: 1452 /2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.. APPELI

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

- 2- The Secretary (ESE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar,RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST, THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

; the

yber

owing

ain un

hose: BI

EXA

Khybe

ALLESIT

GINER

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

Y IN OCCORDING WITH

respondents

is the time The

nourse and

2-4/10/19

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and esecondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees 11.11.2019

(1

N

5

_ م

ţ,

ŕ

STATE TO A

Peshawat

Counsel for the appellant present.

Apleal No 1452-12011 Markad Hayat VS Gort

-In war

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period; the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar. High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

6.4/3

Chairmán

ATTESTED

File be consigned to the record.

A

<u>ا ا</u>

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2021

Arif Shah

(APPELLANT) (PETITIONER)

(PLAINTIFF)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

I/We Arif Shah

Do hereby appoint and constitute UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND, Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. / /2021

CLIENT

ACCEPTED UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND &

KAMRAN KHAN **ADVOCATES**

OFFICE. Flat No. 4, 2nd Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901674