BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, CAMP COURT, ABBOTTABAD.

Service appeal No. 396/2016

Date of institution ...

28.03.2016

Date of decision

24.05.2018

Muhammad Jamshid son of Aziz ur Rehman, resident of Boi, presently LHC No. 1176, Police Department, District Abbottabad. ... (Appellant)

Versus

1. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar and 5 others. ... (Respondents)

Mr. Khalid Rabbani,

Advocate

For appellant.

Mr. Muhammad Jan,

Deputy District Attorney

For respondents.

MR. SUBHAN SHER,

CHAIRMAN

MR. MUHAMMAD HAMID MUGHAL,

MEMBER.

JUDGMENT

SUBHAN SHER, CHAIRMAN:-

The appellant Muhammad Shahid has preferred the instant service appeal against the impugned orders dated 20.10.2015 passed by respondent No. 4 whereby two increments of the appellant were attached with cumulative effect and other order dated 29.02.2016 of respondent No. 3 whereby his departmental appeal was filed.

2. As per version of the appellant, he was initially appointed as constable in the Police Department. He further alleged that on the night between 18/19 August, 2015 when he was performing his duty, he was told by the people that 4 persons entered in to the house of one Iltat Hussain R/O House No. 45 Alamgir Colony, Garga, Bilal Town Abbottabad and were present on the roof of the house. That he alongwith some some people including owner of the house tactically approached the roof and on search, no dacoit/culprit was found. Lateron, owner of the house made a complaint against the appellant alongwith

the one was

other police officials alleging therein that the appellant had facilitated the culprits in fleeing the spot. On this application, proper enquiry was conducted by the enquiry officer and as per the report of the enquiry officer, no such negligence or slackness on the part of the appellant was found, so he recommended to exonerate him from the charges. On the last page of this enquiry report, respondent No. 4 (District Police Officer Abbottabad) ordered the attachment of two increments of the appellant with cumulative effect vide order dated 20.10.2015. The appellant challenged this order before the respondent No. 3 (the appellate forum), which filed his appeal on 29.02.2018. Now the appellant approached this Tribunal through the present appeal for relief.

- Come of the
- 3. Mr. Khalid Rabbani, Advocate/counsel for the appellant contended that the appellant never committed slackness or negligence in his duty particularly in the above mentioned incident and this fact has been admitted by the officials/private witnesses in the statements recorded during the enquiry. He further stated that respondent No. 4 without any documents, reasons or proof while going through the enquiry report imposed the penalty of attachment of two increments of the appellant, which was also upheld by the respondent No. 3 vide his order dated 29.02.2016. He further alleged that the respondent No. 3 did not bother to go through the enquiry report and based his opinion absolutely on wrong assumptions. At the end, he requested that on acceptance of the appeal, the impugned orders be set aside.
- 4. Mr. Muhammad Jan, learned Deputy District Attorney opposed the contentions of the learned counsel for the appellant stated that due to the negligence/slackness on the part of the appellant, culprits succeeded in running away from the spot. He requested that the appeal may be dismissed.
- 5. One would astonish to see the conduct of the respondents and particularly of respondents No. 3 and 4 as they did not take any pain to go through the enquiry report but passed orders on orders without any justification, as is evident from the discussion made below.
- 6. As stated earlier, on the receipt of complaint, departmental proceedings were initiated and Amjad Hussain, DSP respondent No. 5 was appointed as

Jun n 24,5 2018

enquiry officer who recorded statements of officials as well as private witnesses and then on the strength of evidence produced before him he did not notice any laxity on the part of the appellant, so he recommended the appellant to be absolved from the charge leveled against him. During the enquiry against the appellant, four police officials and two private persons namely Muhammad Zamin and Waseem Rasheed present at the time of occurrence throughout were examined who all categorically stated that they had neither seen the culprits in the house of complainant nor escape of any culprit from the said house. Similarly, the complainant though claimed that the culprits had injured his mother and brother but no injuries was found on their bodies. Again the alleged culprits were shown present on the roof of the house and there was no way of escape, then in the presence of such crowded gathering including owner of the house, it was impossible for the culprits to flee from the spot.

7. As discussed above, stated respondent No. 4, on the last page of enquiry report, imposed punishment of attachment of two increments but without showing any reason or justification as the enquiry officer recommended exoneration of the appellant from the charges but he i.e. even then respondent No. 4 imposed the above mentioned punishment. A serious blunder was committed by the respondent No. 3 i.e. Regional Police Officer, (the appellate authority) when he in his order passed the following remarks:-

"Proper departmental enquiry was conducted by Mr. Amjid Hussain DSP Mirpur. After conducting a detailed enquiry, the E.O <u>Proved him guilty</u>. On the recommendation of E.O, the District Police Officer Abbottabad awarded him minor penalty of stoppage of two years increments with cumulative effect."

From this conduct of respondent No. 3, this Tribunal feels no hesitation to observe that though respondent No. 3 did mention the name of the enquiry officer and quoted his findings but even then, in his remarks he stated that the enquiry officer had proved the appellant guilty which is totally against the record as well as findings of the enquiry officer as already discussed in detail.

8. In short, the impugned orders passed by respondents No. 3 and 4 are neither based on the record nor speaking one rather both the orders are badly

4

defective in the eyes of law and warrant interference by this Tribunal under its appellate jurisdiction. As such, on acceptance of this appeal, both the impugned orders dated 20.10.2015 of respondent No. 4 and 29.02.2016 of respondent No. 3 are set aside. In the circumstances, parties are left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to the record room.

Man. C.

(MUHAMMAD HAMID MUGHAL) Member

ANNOUNCED 24.05.2018

(SUBHAN SHER)

Chairman

Camp Court, Abbottabad.

24.05.2018

Appellant Muhammad Jamshaid in person alongwith his counsel Mr. Khalid Rabbani, Advocate present. Mr. Shamraiz Khan, ASI/Reader alongwith Mr. Muhammad Jan, Deputy District Attorney for the respondents resent.

Arguments heard and file perused.

Vide our detailed judgment of today placed on file, appeal is accepted, both the impugned orders dated 20.10.2015 of respondent No. 4 and 29.02.2016 of respondent No. 3 are set aside. In the circumstances of the case, parties are left to bear their own costs. File be consigned to the record room.

Chairman

Camp court, A/Abad

ANNOUNCED 24.05.2018

Counsel for the appellant and Mr. Muhammad Bilal, Deputy District Attorney alongwith Shamraiz Khan, H.C for the respondents present and written reply submitted. The appeal is assigned to D.B for rejoinder, if any, and arguments for 21.12.2017 at camp court, Abbottabad.

Chairman Camp Court, A/Abad

21.12.2017 Counsel for the appellant present. Mr. Kabir Ullah Khattak, Additional Advocate General alongwith Mr. Shamraiz Khan, Reader for the respondents present. Arguments could not be heard due to incomplete bench. To come up arguments on \$1.03.2018 before D.B at Camp Court, Abbottabad.

(Gul Zeb Khan)
Member (Executive)
Camp Court, Abbottabad.

21.03.2018

Clerk to counsel for the appellant and Mr. Usman Ghani, District Attorney for the respondents present. Counsel for the appellant seeks adjournment. To come up for arguments on 24.05.2018 before the D.B at camp court, Abbottabad.

Y Member Chairman
Camp court, A/Abad

分的. 文章 "是"之事

23.12.2016

Appellant in person and M/S. Shamraiz Khan, Reader and Malak Haroon, AAO alongwith Mr. Muhammad Siddique Sr.GP for the respondents present. Requested for adjournment. To come up for written reply before S.B on 16.03.2017 at camp court, Abbottabad.

Charman Camp court, A/Abad

17.03.2017

Appellant present in person and Mr. Shamraiz Khan, Reader alongwith Mr. Muhammad Siddique Sr.GP for the respondents present. Written reply not submitted. Requested for further adjournment. Last opportunity granted. To come up for written, reply/comments on 18.05.2017 at camp court, Abbottabad.

Charman Camp Court, A/Abad

25.05.2017

Since tour programme to camp court, Abbottabad for the month of May, 2017 has been cancelled by the Worthy Chairman, therefore, case to come up for the same on 25.08.2017 at camp court, Abbottabad. Notices be issued to the parties for the date fixed accordingly

Registrar

20.07.2016

ί

Agent of counsel for the appellant present Counsel for the appellant is not in attendance. Seeks adjournment. To come up for preliminary hearing at camp court, Abbottabad on 22.09.2016.

Chairman Camp court, A/Abad,

22.09.2016

Counsel for the appellant present. Learned counsel for appellant argued that the appellant was serving as constable when subjected to enquiry on the allegations of professional misconduct and vide order dated 20.10.2015 enquiry officer recommended him for exoneration from the charges but vide impugned order dated 29.02.2016 departmental appeal of the appellant was rejected and punishment in the shape of stoppage of 2 years increments with cumulative effect passed by Regional Police Officer and hence the instant service appeal on 28.3.2016.

That the enquiry was not conducted in the prescribed manners and moreover the appellant was exonerated from the charges by the enquiry officer despite the same the said penalty was illegally awarded.

Points urged need consideration. Admit. Subject to deposit of security and process fee within 10 days, notices be issued to the respondents for written reply/comments for 23.12.2016 before S.B at camp court, Abbottabad.

Chairman Camp court, A/Abad

Security Promo Fea

Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

court oi_	
Case No	396/2016
Date of order	Order or other proceedings with signature of judg

	Case No	396/2016
S.No.	Date of order Proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge or Magistrate
1	2.	3
1 .	13.04.2016	The appeal of Mr. Muhammad Shahid resubmitted
		today by Post through Mr. Khaled Rabbani Advocate may be
· ·		entered in the Institution Register and put up to the Worthy
2		Chairman for proper order please. REGISTRAR
۷	14,4.16	This case is entrusted to Touring S. Bench at A.Abad for
		preliminary hearing to be put up thereon <u>20.4./6</u> .
		CHAIRMAN
	20.04.2016	None is present for the appellant. Adjourned f
		preliminary hearing to 18.05.2016 before S.B at camp cou
		Abbottabad. Charman Camp court, A/Abac
	·	
	18.5.2016	None present for the petitioner. Notice be issued to
		appellant and his counsel. To come up for preliminary
•		hearing on 20.07.2016 before S.B at camp court, Abbottabad.

Camp court, A/Abad

The appeal of Mr. Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz-ur-Rehman LHC NO. 1176 Police Department A.Abad received to-day by post on 28.03.2016 is incomplete on the following score which is returned to the counsel for the appellant for completion and resubmission within 15 days.

- 1- Copy of impugned order of stoppage of two increments passed by respondent No.4 is not attached with the appeal which may be placed on it.
- 2- Copy of departmental appeal is not attached with the appeal which may be placed on it.

No. $\frac{500}{\sqrt{3}}$ /S.T, Dt. $\frac{29}{\sqrt{3}}$ /2016

REGISTRAR
SERVICE TRIBUNAL
KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
PESHAWAR.

Mr. Khalid Rabbani Adv. A.Abad.

six titled appeal is received back through officer clerk.

It is submitted in reply of objection no! That respondent No4 how not issued his separate/Isotated order but he has written/passed order on the page of finding of the ingluing at the bottom of the page No2/
which is annexed as annexure D.

As for as objection No2 is concerned, It is stated that applicant applicant applicant applicant for the applicant applied through whiten application for the applicant applied to provide the same but authorities have failed to provide the same beasen unknown the application was filed for the documents is hereby annexed with the appeal.

In the light of the facts mentioned above the appeal in hand is se-submitted after semoval of objection. Please.

Dated 11/04/2016.

Shalid Rabbani

Khalid Rabbani MA, LLB Advocate High Court 42/30po 00

درداست = در دوای عرب در 2 (2) (2) (2) (2) GTO = 1/2 1/3 / CB# 28 1/3. 当了这些地方是世 ريال دارد والوالي المركز المرك 12 1 2 13 6 33 2 2 1 5 E 1 JE · こんららりかっしつ 97, ATTESTION 3219/16 = 37 3/2/10/00/00/00/2000/ مر مالط موافظ دارے

11212/25 LHE NOLEN

JE 15-3

Sid Journaled

14 2016

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBPER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No. 396 /2016

Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz ur Rehman, resident of Boi, presently LHC No. 1176, District Abbottabad.

...APPELLANT

VERSUS

Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar & others.

...RESPONDENTS

SERVICE APPEAL

INDEX

S. #	Description	Page No.	Annexure
1.	Service Appeal along with affidavit	1 to 8	
2.	Suspension application	9 to 10	
3.	Copy of charge sheet	12-13	"A"
4.	Copy of reply	14-19	- "B"
5.	Copy of finding of inquiry report	20-21	"C"
6.	Copy of order dated 20/10/2015	21	"D"
7	Copy of impugned order dated 29/02/2016	22	"E"
8.	Wakalatnama.	23	

...APPELLANT

Through

Dated: $\frac{94/03}{2016}$

(Khalid Rabbani)

Advocate High Court Abbottabad

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBPER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR

Service Appeal No. 396 /2016

Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz ur Rehman, resident of Boi, presently LHC No. 1176, Police Department, District Abbottabad.

...APPELLANT

A.W.F Province

Corvice Tribugal

Diary Mo. 2/68

Coased 2/8-03-2/0/

VERSUS

- 1. Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar.
- 2. Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3. Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad.
- 4. District Police Officer, Abbottabad.
- 5. Amjad Hussain/Inquiry Officer, DSP, Mirpur, Abbottabad.
- 6. District Accounts Officer, District Abbottabad.

...RESPONDENTS

23/16

APPEAL UNDER SECTION 4 OF THE KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974, AGAINST-THE ORDER NO. 1229/ PA DATED 29/02/2016 ISSUED BY RESPONDENT NO. 3, WHEREBY the RESPONDENT NO. 3 UPHELD THE

&e-submitted to-day

Registration 13 | 4 | 16

ORDER OF RESPONDENT NO. 4 AND DISMISSED THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT/ PETITIONER. BOTH THE ORDERS ARE ILLEGAL, VOID, WITHOUT LAWFUL AUTHORITY, WITHOUT JURISDICTION AND SAME ARE NOT TENABLE IN THE EYES OF LAW AND ARE LIABLE TO BE SET ASIDE.

PRAYER:- ON ACCEPTANCE OF INSTANT APPEAL, THE IMPUGNED ORDERS DATED MAY 29/02/2016 AND 20/10/2015 GRACIOUSLY BE SET ASIDE AND KEEPING IN VIEW THE FINDINGS OF THE INQUIRY OFFICER/ RESPONDENT NO. 5 PETITIONER/ **KINDLY** BEMAY APPELLANT EXONERATED FROM THE CHARGES. ANY OTHER RELIEF WHICH THIS HONOURABI TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT AND PROPER IN 7 CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE.

Respectfully Sheweth: -

Brief facts giving rise to the instant appeal are as under:-

- 1. That the appellant was appointed in Police

 Department after test and interview and joined his
 duty, presently serving in the department at

 District Abbottabad.
- 2. That the appellant after receiving charge of the post continuously performed the duties with entire satisfaction of his superior.
- 3. That the respondents department having of qualification according to the law, rules and merit appellant was posted at Police Station Nawanshehr, Abbottabad as LHC.
- 4. That on 18-19/08/2015 while appellant was performing his duty some people gathered in Mohallah Garga Near Bilal Town, Abbottabad appellant/ petitioner reached at spot, and inquired about the matter where people said that there are some thieves in the house but nothing found in the said house. Thereafter said owner of house made a complaint against police officials including appellant.

- 5. That receiving the complaint appellant/ petitioner department issue a charge sheet. Copy of charge sheet is appended as Annexure "A".
- 6. That after receiving charge sheet appellant/
 petitioner submitted a reply to inquiry officer.

 Copy of reply is annexed as Annexure "B".
- 7. That after receipt of reply Inquiry Officer gave his finding recorded as no slackness on the part of officials has been proved, therefore, he may be exonerated from the charges. Copy of finding of inquiry report is attached as Annexure "C".
- 8. That after receipt of inquiry finding. Respondent No. 4 ordered for attachment of two increments of each constable on 20/10/2015. Copy of said order is attached as Annexure "D".
- 9. That feeling aggrieved of the order of respondent
 No. 4 appellant/ petitioner filed departmental
 appeal before Regional Police Officer, Hazara
 Range.

- 10. That respondent No. 3 on 29/03/2016 upheld the order of respondent No. 4 and declined the departmental appeal/ representation of appellant/ petitioner. Copy of impugned order is attached as Annexure "E".
- 11. That feeling aggrieved, the appellant seeks indulgence of this Honourable Tribunal for setting aside the impugned orders dated 20/10/2015 and 29/02/2016 issued by respondents No. 4 & 3, interalia, on the following amongst many others;-

GROUNDS:-

- a. That both the orders passed by respondent

 No. 3 & 4 are illegal, unlawful, without
 lawful authority, having no legal effects on
 the right of appellant are liable to be set
 aside.
- b. That both the orders passed by respondents

 No. 3 & 4 are against the law, facts and
 circumstances of the case, thus not tenable

 in the eye of law.

- respondents No. 3 & 4 are based on flimsy, arbitrary, unlawful, fanciful, without considering the ground reality narrated by the appellant/ petitioner, hence untenable in the eyes of law.
- d. That the act of respondents is illegal, unlawful, without jurisdiction and against the law and liable to be set aside.
- e. That the act of the respondents against the Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution, thus not sustainable under the law.
- f. That the respondent No. 5 (Inquiry Officer) exonerated the officials from the charges in his findings whereas respondent No. 4 by disagreeing with the inquiry report of respondent No. 5, awarded punishment to appellant/ petitioner without issuance of show cause notice for which respondent No. 4 was legally bound to do so. Hence, the order passed by respondent No. 4 is

발생작전설 1 untenable in the eye of law and liable to be set aside on the sole ground.

g. That further points will be submitted at the time of arguments

It is, therefore, respectfully prayed that on acceptance of instant appeal, the impugned orders dated 20/10/2015 and 29/02/2016 may graciously be set aside and keeping in view the findings of the inquiry officer/respondent No. 5 petitioner/appellant may kindly be exonerated from the charges. Any other relief which this Honourable Tribunal deems fit and proper in the circumstances of the case.

...APPELLANT

Through

Dated: $\frac{24/e_3}{2016}$

(Khalid Rabbani)

Advocate High Court Abbottabad

VERIFICATION: -

Verified on oath that the contents of appeal are true and correct as per information furnished by my client nothing has been concealed therein from this Honourable Court

Dated: <u>24/03</u> /2016

(Khalid Rabbani)

Advocate High Court Abbottabad

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBPER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR

Servic	e Appeal	No.	•	/2016

Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz ur Rehman, resident of Boi, presently LHC No. 1176, District Abbottabad.

...APPELLANT

VERSUS

Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar & others.

...RESPONDENTS

SERVICE APPEAL

AFFIDAVIT

I, Khalid Rabbani, Advocate counsel for appellant, do hereby affirm and declare that the contents of foregoing appeal are true and correct as per information furnished by my client and nothing has been concealed from this Honourable Court.

DEPONENT

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBPER PAKHTUNKHWA PESHAWAR

Service	Appeal	No.	/2016	ć

Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz ur Rehman, resident of Boi, presently LHC No. 1176, District Abbottabad.

...APPELLANT

VERSUS

Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar & others.

...RESPONDENTS

SERVICE APPEAL

<u>APPLICATION</u> FOR SUSPENSION OF OPERATION OF IMPUGNED ORDER DATED 29/02/2016 TILL FINAL DISPOSAL OF TITLED APPEAL.

Respectfully Sheweth: -

- That the titled appeal is being filed before this
 Honourable Court and contents of this application
 may please be read as an integral part of the same.
- 2. That the appellant has brought good prima facie case and balance of convenience also tilts in his favour.

That if the solicited injunction is not granted and 3. operation of impugned order dated 29/02/2016 is not suspended, the petitioner would suffer irreparable loss and purpose of filing of titled appeal will become infructuous.

It is, therefore, humbly prayed that the operation of impugned order dated 29/02/2016, may kindly be suspended and till final disposal of titled appeal.

Through

/2016

(Khalid Rabbani)

Advocate High Court Abbottabad

AFFIDAVIT:-

Dated:

I, Khalid Rabbani, Advocate counsel for appellant, do hereby affirm and declare that the contents of foregoing application are true and correct as per information furnished by my client and nothing has been concealed from this Honourable Court.

...APPELLANT

-12-

CHARGE SHEET

ANNEXURE

I, Sher Akbar PSP, S.St, District Police Officer Abbottabad, as competent authority, hereby charge you FC Shahid No 1176, as explained in the attached statement of allegations.

You appear to be guilty of misconduct under Police disciplinary rules 1975, and have rendered yourself liable to all or any of the penalties specified in the said Police Disciplinary Rules.

You are therefore, directed to submit your written defense within seven days on the receipt of this Charge Sheet in the Enquiry Officer.

Your written defense, if any should reach the Enquiry Officer with in the specified period, failing which it shall be presumed that you have no defense to put in and in that case exparte action shall follow against you.

Intimate whether you desire to be heard in person or otherwise.

A statement of allegation is enclosed.

gusied go when

SHER AKBAR

(PSP, 5.St)

District Police Office Abbottabad.

I, Sher Akbar PSP, S.St, District Police Officer Abbottabad, as Competent

Authority of the opinion that you FC Shahid No 1176,, have rendered yourself liable to be proceede against as you committed the following act/omission within the meaning of Police Disciplinary Rules

STATEMENT OF THE ALLEGATION

According to the complaint of one Iltaf Hussain S/O Magsood-ur-Rehman R/O House No 45 Alamghir Colony, Garga, Bilal Town Abbottabad, which he submitted before worthy RPO/Hazara, on the night between 18/19 August 2015 at 02:15 hrs, 04 persons intruded into his house. The culprits subjected the inmates to physical violence and took away some cash and other valuable households. Upon hue and cry of the inmates, the neighbourers of complainant rushed to his house. Out of four culprits two managed their escape while two ascended the roof of the house. In the meanwhile you alongwith Constable Jamshid No 276 reached there. The complainant informed you about the presence of two culprits on the roof top of the house. You both shown cowardice and unprofessionalism due to which the hidden culprits succeeded to make their escape good.

This a	ict of yours earne	d bad name for th	ie department bef	ore the general	. public
· .	For the purpo	se of scrutinizing	your conduct wit	h reference to	the above,
Mr. 050/1	hapmar	is depu	ted to conduct for	rmal Departme	ntal Enquiry
against you FC Shahi	d No 1176. The	Enquiry Officer s	hall in accordance	with the prov	rision of the
rules, provide reason	able opportunity	of hearing to you	, record finding ar	nd make with t	hirty days of
the receipt of this o	rder , recommen	dation as to pun	ishment or other	appropriate ac	tion against
you				- States in August	
	You should at	tend the proceed	ings on the date, t	ime and place	fixed by the
Enquiry Officer.			,		·

SHER AKBAR (PSP, S.St) **District Police Office** Abbottabad.

1975.

/PA, Dated Abbottabad the OI - OG /2015.

Copy of above is forwarded to:-

(Enquiry Officer) for initiating proceedings against the defaulter officer under provisions of the Police Disciplinary Rules 1975.

quested as 1. Non

منا عال مشمو بهار بر ننیف. و سیمنری ایکن شیش منبر <u>هم می میروم</u> الم معروض خومت ميون كر شب درسان على الم الله من شاعب 176 مي الله من شاعب 176 مي 176 176 معم ورايمور بمشيد 276 كم بغرض وبائل 11 عشت قان لؤال شيرجانب عاؤن شب دره ، اماعی ، چرمز کاری ، گذاری او این اون جاری دع ميم في ندو الركا بينيا بربت قريب ٥٥: ٤ نه رات عالميكير كالان كراك مشور شرکیای اوازیں آر ہی تھیں جس ہر شور شاہ کی اوازوں کا تعین کیا اور اسپیشل گشت را مرد رکوجو که بلال افاؤن میں گفت کا ها کو داقع بزای نسبت اس کاه سرک دین فرف بالیا اور خود موقع کیلوف معُ إِن مبوسيا توميّان منير 45 مرّ زان الطاف مسين وله مدّمه والرحمُن ى كليبر كالونى ترم ك درواز ع ك بابر متعدد مرد ، وزن كمرا في جوت به من ما و علی معلومات کی تو مزرواب ک زبانی كم يم لوگ تشور شريد بيوجم سا أيض بول أو جد ون مسلم ع چھ میم رمس بھینٹر سے اندر مفان میں داخل میونے تو مفان کے صحن اور سراموس میں بی احد مرد، دن عرب ان میں العاق بی موجود خاجس ع نباك مار محرك أو بدواسا كر مى دوازاد سحو واكورسة يرغالى شايا سواسه اور منر دوره واكووس كه باس جدیداسکه هی جوو و قدعه بزائی بایت فلعفود قاینه میں بزریعه موبائل الملاع دی اور مان که ا ترر حمن اور سرا مده میس موجود مرد ذن محو منان سے فور یا بر نفاع کی بدا بت کی جو اسی انتخار میں دامتے مرا واصف خان برودور معرس مين درادر وده بر آيا منكو بمراه م تعدد منان من بالان مندل مى طرف كي بهارس عيب سعدد المان المان المرابع أو برائع جو نبأنت مكت على سواء و

سری ماجهان بیرمنه ول وا و قادر بنه بن ول برهال قاادرن مى اس مبد سے اد صداً د صراف كا أو فى داسته قاجواس دوران موبائل 2 كا انسرا غادج كوصف نشاه ish ما عب عن معه كنز ناهر مع استرامی نے مری الفاف سے و قوعم بنائی نسبت دریانت كى لدر ميره د كل ينع مكان كى طول كن الدرته المعلمة مكانات میں معزمان کی تالا تھی کی مگر کوئ مزمراجو اصف شاہ is Asi فے مدعی کی رہورے کھی میں میں منربورہ الفانی نے ملزمان نے ببرغاليون فمزهيل ببنوق اش والره اور اعاز اهم سرورمرى و بیستول کے بیٹوں سے مارنا بیان کیا جو زوجہ مامب کے استفسار ہر كم انكوكياك كياك زفات آئے ميں تا نكرانكا بذركيم نتشمنرر على مالجد بسيال سے سُرايا مِلْتُ تُومِزُورِه نِهُ الله كري تسمريا رُلَ نظات خدشات منه دع كا تبه كرمسينال بنه جا بنيكى كامارى كى اور ندان برنماييون جوك مُحرك ينبي والمع كمرا فيل موجود في كسى من من توزخى مير بنيكا كبااور بنر ببي كسى ملاعظ والعرى كبيدا م مادی کی جو زوج صاحب نے العان کی ربورٹ کی اور دیگر ابل علم كو ربين البيا تعرف كوما بنها كبا اور بهم موبائل للوال اور را نمیدر کو این مشت ماری رکین کا حکم دیا لور میلی دیا. حصنوروالا . سرى ك النوامات مسرا سرعه إور جموث كا بلنده معیں بہارے موتع برالینے بیرمتعرد انداد کا کھر کے اندر ادر بابر موجود فی میں کسی ڈائو کا موجود رینا اور مرقع بر بعی رہا مجيداز تسياس اورنائك يه ادرمه بي مدى كى والده مينون

P. T-0

است ما صبه اس واقع نی بادید بینی سے جمان بین مرف اور منائق معلی کرندامات مرف اور منائق معلی کرندامات مرف اور منائل مرف اور منائل می فرست دید جا نیما استها می قرمایا جا سر جارج منیما داخل و منتر فرائ جارب اور معلمی سے بحال فرط یا جار میں دائل مائل نے این ویون نیانت امن فریقر سے محال میں بول و مساب دی میں ما تحت پرودی ہول .

المدقوم المان الم

ب ن ازان و سم ر شد ولد عبدار شد حال بلال عادن را س

سروران انگوارگی ب ن کیب که میں بروز و مؤور رہے کفر دا مع بلال ماردن سی سویا میوا نفا. کہ تھے سور سٹرا ہے کی آواز آئی نو میں بایر العل آیا۔ باہر دیکھا کہ تنام بھنے کے لوگ الطام حمارا برادسی سے ١٠ سی کے نفر سی . هم ایس عبی و نا ب حبلا کیا ۱ در معلومات تر نے پر بہت جلا جار جور الطان کے نقر موی گفتی آ سے بیل. تفریب ۱۵/۱۰ سنگ بعد) بوسی موباش مینج آی . قبون تصط نے مان سی جو شده دگون با برنفالا اسی ادران مورسا کیل بر در در در سی دا سے ادرائے اور وه معی اندرمکان میں جید گئے۔ می نے محرسی المفاران تھیٹ برما تے اور کور سے د پکھا، محلے کے بورشرا ہے سے مبن مور نعات کتے جبکہ بوبسی نفر میں دیاں عبی سی الهان ہے بھی را نے کے ملاق در با من کب جی نے

العلایا کہ 40 عدد آری انرر داخل ہونے ہے۔ بہت برخان سایا اور ہم سے رئم رساسان کے کرفرار ہو گئے۔ بیکن میں نے نزو کوئی میں ایر خل میو شے دبکھا نہ ہی فرار ہو ہے۔ دبکھا۔ میرا تبی سیان سے .

و بیم ر غیر دلد عبوالرسید ماکنه حال گرگ بلال نارس ۱3)016 - 491511-9

بلال ٹاؤن

برربان بی ن کی مورف م¹⁸/₁₉ کی درسانی شب میں اسے گفرواقع کرمًا میں سویا مہوا تفا کر احیانک سور شراسے کی آدار سی . میں باہر نُفلا تو سمی العان حبی جو که سیرا پرورسی سے کے نقرکے باہر منعدد تعداد می مردرز ن ۔ ہے گئے ۔ جواس عبیر میں بعی کب تو بہت جلا کہ ا دعومفان میں کوئی ما خفہ میرا سے . معلومات امر نے ہر ہت مولا کہ بہاں تو تی جور دعبرہ ہے کامنی جو اسی اثنا، میں پوسی کی طائش آئی جو سلازمان نے واقع کی نب معلومات کہی و اور سکان کے برآمدہ صحی میں مردرزن عقے ر عفیی با برنفلنے کا کیما اور دو پولیس والے اور را میرور بعی ا دھرآگئے مکان کی تلاسی کی جماں برکوئی جور وسری نہ تھا اور نہ ہی نکی نے ا ڈھرسے سی کو کھا گئے دیکھا ، تھڑی دیر العد ایک موائل اورآ نگی جو ASI ما مب نے ادرائره معامات بین تلاین میکن تو ی

وسات نہ ہو! اکا مامب نے ہے نبرہ لوگوں کو دا ہی گارجا ہے کانکیا اور میں بعی گھروا ہی آیا

میرانبی بپان

مگرزری ولد مگرفر بر 7-1 44-180-10 131

30 h 2 Just la 18/9 po la interprie is phops of with I photo said with court in 18 03 6 13/5 Rul 10/2 /3 the Oler Stay UNISE Si Swiceb. Mr. Ello of Joy 23 Ellois I) It was population of the Asi of wed of 115h, 36,38 Www. 1/1/10/2 Asial Asia Asilied Wills of Sold of the series of the s Horse wall in who of the said with the said 2 in Color of the seich contra for Sir! 2/1 /2/20 Myins and asque i where !

بمن ازان ولف عنر عدد السركر شف عان والاسر 93 / civilion is Edw of 1819 Resouth in inter-تنا على المعلى الموائم إلى مع المال مع الموسى المول المعرادي م ورشراسی اور ارجی هر ارجو ای ارجو ارجو ارجو ای ماند ماند ور الما المعرب المورك المراس المعرب المراس الماس Asi ohier as in the selection of the fields is a a fate Gent of by Son de son to the contraction of وافع 1332 رسر ورسم عما)

-20- ANNEXURE C"

FINDINGS OF DEPARIMENTAL ENQUIRY AGAINST FC SHAHID NO.1176

BACKGROUND:-

FC Shaid No. 1176 was charge sheeted by the Worthy District Police Officer Abbottabad vide Office End: No. 462/PA dated 01-09-15 and undersigned had been deputed to conduct formal enquiry for purpose of scrutinizing the conduct of the said official as per following statement of allegations.

BRIEF OF ALLEGATIONS:-

"According to the complaint of Altaf Hussain s/o Maqsood ur Rehman r/o House No. 45 Alamgir Colony Bilal Town Abbottabad, which he submitted before worthy RPO Hazara Region, on the night between 18/19 August 2015 at 02:15 hrs, 04 persons intruded into his house. The culprits subjected the inmates to physical violence and took away some cash and other valuable household. Upon hue and cry of the inmates, the neighbors of complainant rushed to his house. Out of four culprits two managed their escape while two ascended the roof of the house. In the meanwhile you along with constable Jamsheed No. 276 reached there. The complainant informed you about the presence of two culprits on the roof top of the house. You both shown cowardice and unprofessionalism due to which the hidden culprits succeeded to make their escaped good. This act of yours earned bad name for department before general public."

ENQUIRY PROCEEDINGS:-

Subsequently on the receipt of enquiry papers, undersigned conducted proper enquiry proceeding and recorded the statements of following officials and also pursued the record.

- 1. FC Shaid No. 1176
- 2. FC Jamshid 276
- 3. FC Nasir No. 159
- 4. FC Wasif No. 1332
- 5. Muhammad Zareen s/o Muhammad Fareed r/o Bilal Town
- 6. Waseem Rasheed s/o Abdul Rasheed r/o Bilal Town

Brief of Official's Statement:-

In his statement official urged that during patrolling in Bilal Town area they heard voices and rushed to Alamghir Colony Bilal Town and also informed rider on duty in the area. When they reached the colony, they saw 50/40 persons gadiered in and outside the house of complainant Altaf Hussain. They were told by the complainant that two persons of his house were kept hostages by the culprits on the second floor. Subsequently they removed the people and official informed Police Station about the situation. At that moment rider Wasif No. 1332 and Gunner Dilawar also reached the spot. The officials searched the upper floor of the house however neither there were any hostages nor any culprit. Moreover there was no escape route from the upper story of the house. During this ASI Asif Shah (Officer Mobile I) also reached the spot and they all searched the neighboring houses however no culprit has been found. ASI Asif Shah drafted the report of complainant and also recorded the statements. Complainant in his

1176 Detin -2

dement mentioned about the injuries of his family members however neither there were by wounds nor the complainant assented for Medical checkup. Official in his statement denied the allegations leveled by the complainant and further stated that in such rush in the house the hiding of culprits in the house was impossible

CONCLUSION:-

In order to record the statement of complainant, he has been called to the office of undersigned however as per statement of his brother complainant is not present in the country and presently is in Dubai. Likewise brother of the complainant has been called however he failed to appear.

Complainant in his application urged that culprits injured his mother and brother however no injuries has been found on their bodies. Similarly complainant also did not agree for medical checkup. Similarly it seems impossible that culprits remained present on the upper storey during bedlam for such a long time and where is no way of escape. Statements of two PWs has also been recorded which supports the version of the officials.

FINDINGS:-

Keeping in view the above mentioned circumstances and available record no slackness on the part of official has been proved, therefore he may be exonerated from

the charges. NNEXURE Submitted please. by Superintendent of Police, Mirpur Abbottatad.

Abiootiabad

ANNEXURE

ORDER

This is an order on the representation of LHC Shahid No.1176 of Abbottabad District against the order of minor punishment i.e. stoppage of two years increment with cumulative effect awarded by the District Police Officer, Abbottabad vide his OB No.253 dated 20-10-2015.

Facts leading to his punishment are that according to the compliant of Altaf Hussain s/o Maqsood-ur-Rehman r/o House No.45 Alamgir Colony Bilal Town Abbottabad, which he submitted before Worthy RPO Hazara Region, on the night between 18/19 August 2015 at 2:15 hrs, 4 persons intruded into his house. The culprits subjected the inmates to physical violence & took away some casn and other valuable household. Upon hue and cry of the inmates, the neighbors of complainant rushed to his house. Out of four culprits two managed their escape while two ascended the roof of the house. In the meanwhile he along-with FC Jamsheed No.276 reached there. The complainant informed him about the presence of two culprits on the roof top of the house. He both shown cowardice and unprofessionalism due to which the hidden culprits succeeded to make their escaped good.

Proper departmental enquiry was conducted by Mr. Amjid Hussain DSP Mirpur. After conducting a detailed enquiry, the E.O proved him guilty. On the recommendation of E.O, the District Police Officer Abbottabad awarded him minor of stoppage of two years increment with cumulative effect.

He preferred an appeal to the undersigned upon which the comments of the DPO Abbottabad were obtained. He was heard in OR where he offered no cogent reason in his defence to prove his innocence. After thorough probe into the enquiry report and the comments of the DPO Abbottabad, it came to light that the putuishment awarded to him by the DPO Abbottabad i.e. stoppage of two years increment with cumulative effect is genuine, hence his appeal is filed.

1429

Dated Abbottabad the

Hazara Region Abbottabad /2016.

Copy of above is forwarded to the District Police Officer, Abbottabad for information and necessary action with reference to his Memo: No.440 dated 11-1-2016. The Service Record containing enquiry file of the appellant are returned

herewith.

REGIONAL POLICE OFFICER

Hazara Region Abbottabad

BEFORE THE HONORABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL K.P.K, PESHAWAR.

Service Appeal No. 396/2016.

Muhammad Shahid son of Aziz-ur-Rehman Resident of Boi, Presently LHC No. 1176 District Abbottabad.

.....(Appellant)

VERSUS

- 1. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs Department, Peshawar.
- 2. Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3. Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad.
- 4. The District Police Officer, District Abbottabad.
- 5. Amjid Hussain /Inquiry Officer, DSP Mirpur, Abbottabad.
- 6. District Account Officer, District Abbottabad.

.....(Respondents)

Para wise comments on behalf of Respondents No. 1 to 5.

Respectfully Sheweth

Preliminary objections.

- That the appellant has no cause of action.
- That the appellant has not come to this Tribunal with clean hands.
- 3. That the appeal is bad for misjoinder and non joinder of necessary parties.
- 4. That the appellant is estopped by his own conduct.
- 5. That the appeal is barred by law.
- 6. That the appellant has suppressed the material facts from this honourable Tribunal, hence not entitled for any relief.
- 7. That the authorities passed the orders after fulfillments all the requisite formalities hence appeal is liable to be dismissed on this score alone.

ON FACTS

Para No.1 Pertains to record.

Para No.2. Pertains to record.

Para No. 3. Pertains to record.

Brief facts leading to punishment to the appellant are that as per complaint of one Altaf S/O Masood-ur-Rehman R/O House No. 45, Alimgir Colony, Girga, Bilal Town, Abbottabad between the night 18-19 August, 2015 at 02:15 hours, 04 persons entered into his house and subjected the inmates to torture and took away some cash and other valuable house holds. On their hue and cry the neighbours rushed there. Out of 04 culprits 02 managed their escape while the other 02 were ascended to the roof of the house. Meanwhile, the appellant alongwith his companion reached there and was also informed by the residents but the appellant showed cowardice instead taking action against the culprits. The culprits succeeded to make their escape good. Therefore, he was charge sheeted and after enquiry was awarded with the penalty of stoppage of 02 increments with cumulative effect by the then District Police Officer, Abbottabad, vide OB No. 253 dated 20.10.2015.

Para No.5. As explained above.

Para No.6. As explained above.

Para No.7. As explained above.

Para No.8. As explained above.

Para No.9. Correct.

Para No. 4.

Para No.10. The appellant was heard in the Orderly Room by the worthy Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad but he could not offer cogent reasons in his defence nor he proved himself innocent. Therefore, his representation was rejected.

Para No.11. The orders dated 20.10.2015 of the then District Police Officer,
Abbottabad and dated 29.02.2016 of worthy Regional Police
Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad were fully justified, in
accordance with law and are liable to be maintained.

GROUNDS.

- A. Incorrect, both the orders of the then District Police Officer,
 Abbottabad and worthy Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region,
 Abbottabad have been passed in accordance with law/ rules
 and are liable to be maintained.
- B. Incorrect, as explained above.

- C. Incorrect, the order of punishment as well as rejection of representation were based on facts, lawful, hence tenable in the eyes of law.
- D. Incorrect, as explained above.
- E. Incorrect, both the orders were passed under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Police Rules 1975 with amendments 2014.
- F. Incorrect, the appellant was heard in Orderly Room while giving ample opportunity of personal hearing but he could not advance cogent reasons in his defence. Therefore, under the law/rules the authority was constrained to award the punishment to the appellant, which is fully justified.
- G. That the respondents seeks permission for further point at the time of hearing.

It is therefore, humbly prayed that on acceptance of parawise comments the service appeal of the petitioner may graciously be ordered to be dismissed.

Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar (Respondent No.1&2)

e Officer,

Region, Abbottabad.

(Respondent No.B)

District Police Office Abbottabad.

(Respondent No.4)

Amjid Hussain/Inquiry Officer, DSP Mirpur, Abbottabad. (Respondent No. 5)

BEFORE THE HONORABLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL K.P.K, PESHAWAR.

Service Appeal No. 396/2016.

Muhammad	Shahid	son	of	Aziz-ur-Rehman	Resident	of	Boi,	Presently	LHC	No.	1176
District Abbot	tabad.							,		1	·
,	•				******			.(Appellan	t)		
• •							•		•		

VERSUS

- Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, through Secretary Home & Tribal Affairs
 Department, Peshawar.
- 2. Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3. Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad.
- 4. The District Police Officer, District Abbottabad.
- 5. Amjid Hussain /Inquiry Officer, DSP Mirpur, Abbottabad.
- 6. District Account Officer, District Abbottabad.

...... (Respondents)

AFFIDAVIT.

We, do hereby affirm on oath that the contents of written reply are true to the best of our knowledge & belief and nothing has been concealed from the honorable Service Tribunal.

Submitted please.

Inspector General of Police, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar (Respondent No.1&2)

ra Region, Abbottabad.

(Respondent No.3

District Police Officer, Abbottabad. (Respondent No.4)

Amjid Hussain/Inquiry Officer, DSP Mirpur, Abbottabad. (Respondent No. 5)

REGIONAL POLICE OFFICER, ce of the:

HAZARA REGION, ABBOTTABAD

Ph. #; 0992-9310516, 9310021-22, Fax. #: 0992-9310023

Dated:

To:

The District Police Officer, Abbottabad.

APPLICATION. Subject:

Mr. Altaf Hussain S/o Maqsood-ur-Rehman R/o House No. 45, Memorandum: Alamgir Colony Garga, Bilal Town, Abbottabad appeared before the undersigned and submitted an application vide this office Endst: No.

After having gone through the application/version of the petitioner, 1844/C dated 21/08/2015. the undersigned is satisfied that constable Shahid No. 1176 and Jamshed No. 276 had approached the house of petitioner soon after the crime. If they had acted in professional and timely manner, it was possibility that the culprits would have been apprehended red handed.

Please place them under suspension, close to police lines and initiate proper departmental action for their act of cowardice, inefficiency and lack of professionalism. The application is forwarded for further necessary/legal action in the matter.

Regional Police Officer, Hazara Region, Abbottabad

محرست صناب رجنل پولاسی آفسیس اران انجن ایست آنا د ع. به ایست ما سال ما طلیر کا وی گری المل کا وی کری المل کا وی می مراد ال سیمر کا ريا نشي ٢٠ - شب درياني ١١٩/١٩ أكسي 2015 بوعد وو بح مر بيزره منك المعلى الم مسلم جار افراد بهاب طهر س كلس اور ميم يه بهنوني مسمى عد هيل فان سائد مير ور وله ممان كور من ممان آلايواف الع بانزه كر أس ك برس مع بين براريخ برك المراس ك بحرا يسي مزل وم في وي مال من داطر مور جمال من ادر ميري والره سورة مورة عوم ميري سندير المح رك كر مان في بني ير ليسول رك اور عادوش اين كالي، اسی اشاری دو سرب معری میری والره کا منه بر یا هو ده کر ان کا سر سي يستول كم برح مارك - بورس عبرا فيهو لا كلان الحد و كم ساه می هر سرا طرح می سری می وای دالره کا متر و فیامی میران کرم مين آيا و اسع عي آيمون مارن سروج كري وه سرادر رسرير دفني مهو (اور يه سي مهو كريك - سرى دالده به مان هدد ا مر يا به بعل سرستوريال ادر ايل علم بيرار بهور موتع في آيي ملزم الله ليب ناپ، اللهوراس فون انسم أكد فون 4 اور بين بمرار روسيم مد كر المرا مين عاميان مركيات ر مد در دار مان المحال في وسي المورد بما مع المورد بما ما در الراران ا بونس دانوں کے ساتھ قوت دا کیے کیسی اس وقت ڈانو رو پوش ہوگا، المعرفة و فوق هذا في الارث تفاله نوال تشهر من وقوع عمر قوراً بور ردج كرواتي صد استرها به كرمان كو جله كرمتا، كرنا اور كيفر كردادي بينجاع كا

العان مسين ولر معقبود الرحمل سار سمان بركه) عاطير كاوي اركا، بلال على المان المركاء بلال