Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

BUN Case No.-2020 S.No. Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceèdings 2 The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate may 02/11/2020 be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on _

01.03.2021

146

1

1-

2-

The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



MEMBER(J)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. ____/ 2020

SHAHIN SHAH VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX				an an an Arlanda Arra. Na Santa S
S.NO.	DOCUMENTS		ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal			1-3.
2.	Notification		Α	4
3.	Pay slips		B&C	5-6.
4.	Service Tribunal j	udgment	D	7-8.
5.	Departmental App	peal	Ε	9.
6.	Vakalat nama			

APPELLANT

THROUGH:



Flat No. 4, 2nd Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 13447/2020

Mr.Shahin Shah,DM (BPS-15), GMS,Amry kor, District Mohmand.

Mary No.

ΑΡΡΓΙΙ ΔΝΤ

Khyher Pa

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

Ŕ**ʹ**/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as DM (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employeesworking in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while

employees from

4- That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeal which was allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure.....**D**.

5- That appellant preferred departmental appeal before the respondents under the rule of consistency against the unlawful action of deducting the convince allowance, but no response has been given by the respondent department till the expiry of statutory period of ninety days. Copy of the departmental appeal is attached as annexure.....E.

6- Thatappellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, and therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.
 - It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

APPELLANT Shahin Shah THROUGH: MAR FAROOO MOHMAND 8 KAMRAN KHAN **ADVOCATES**

	GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)
· · ·	NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Pashawar the: 20-12-2012
From	
	The Secretary to Govil of Knytker Pakhtupkhwa
	Finance Department
-	Penhawar.
Tō:	
	All Administrative Secretaries to Gove of Knyber Pallitunitives.
÷	The Secretary to Generican Knyber Pakituskawa
-, ·	
5 · 4 ·	The Secretary to Chiat Minoser, Khyser Pakhtanidiwa.
ت 4 2	The Secretary, Readman Averagy Knyber Pakhlankhwa, ' The Secretary, Readman Averagy Knyber Pakhlankhwa
	The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyse: Pakhtunkhwa, The Secretary, Francisz Ascensiy, Knyset Pakhturkhwa All Heads of Altaches Departments in Knyther Pakhturkhwa
	The Secretary to Chief Minorer, Khyser Pakhtankiwa, The Secretary, Frankinal Arcentary, Khyser Pakhtarkiwa Ali Heads of Altached Departments in Knytjer Pakhtarkiwa Af District Coordination Officerson Anyber Pakhtankiwa.
	The Secretary to Chiat Minoter, Khyser Pakhtankiwa, The Secretary, Fravincial Averativy, Khyset Pakhtankiwa All Heads of Altaches Departments in Knyfter Pakhtankiwa Af District Coordination Officerson Stryber Pakhtankiwa As Policital Agents / District & Somicos styppes in Khyser Pakhtankiwa
	The Secretary to Chief Minorer, Khyser Pakhtankiwa, The Secretary, Frankinal Arcentary, Khyser Pakhtarkiwa Ali Heads of Altached Departments in Knytjer Pakhtarkiwa Af District Coordination Officerson Anyber Pakhtankiwa.

Dear Sif.

CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

The Government of Shyber Pakhtutahwa has been pleased to enhance (ruvise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Gover of Xinyber Pakhtunkhwa (viorking in BPS-1 to BPS-15) will from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to EPS-15 will remain Unchanged.

SNO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1	1-1	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u> </u>	5-10	Ps.1,500/	Rs.1,840/-
÷ 3.	11-15	85.2,000/-	Rs:2,720/-
. <u>+</u>	16-19	Rs.5,000/	R\$.5,000/- 11

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be odmissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 others who have not seen sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Saood Ahimad) Secretary Firzarea

ţ٧

Dated Feature at the 20" December, 2011

72

HINTIAZ AYUB) Mindai Samadin (Roam

Endst: NO: FD:SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012

A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-

Accourtant Général, Köyzer Pokhusikársa, Peshasisi Seorgasies is Golennizzi of Punjab, Szich & Soborizian, Pinaisco Dezeletteni Al Augusamous / Senij Autonologus Socies, n. Shyber Pakhusikhaa

BETTER COPY PAGE-

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKH FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

I.

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar,

To:

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
 The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
 The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in KLyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar. •
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHW **GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19**

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Klivber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following) rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

<u>S.No.</u>	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (FM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2.	5-10	Rs. 1.500/-	Rs. 1,340/-
3. ·	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17. 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

> Your Faithfully (Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20th December; 2012



. slip

BJ

GHALANAI	
S#: 1	P Sec:001 Month:July 2019
Pers #: 00102145 Buckle: Name: SHAHIN SHAH DRAWING MASTER CNIC No.0014270114497 GPF Interest Applied	MG0004 -Agency Education Officer M Education Schools NTN: GPF #: 1794/CSS Old #: 001427011449
15 Active Permanent	MG0004 -
PAYS AND ALLOWANCES:	•••
0001-Basic Pay	33,410.00
1000-House Rent Allowance 1300-Medical Allowance	2,349.00
	1,500.00
1528-Unattractive Area Allow 2148-15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	-1,700.00
2199-Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	740.00
2211-Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	501.00
2224-Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,583.00
2247-Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,341.00
	3,341.00
Gross Pay and Allowances DEDUCTIONS:	52,806.00
IT Payable 385.88 Deducted GPF Balance 426,100.00	36.00 TAX:(3609) 141.00
3661-E.E.F (Exchange)	Subrc: * 2,890.00
3701-Benevolont Eurod (Bushawa)	100.00
3701-Benevolent Fund(Exchange)	600.00
3705-R. Ben & Death Comp(Exch)	600.00
	•

Total Deductions

4,331.00

48,475.00

3

		D.O.B		
		.•	01.01.1960	
31	Years	07 Months	001 Days	

LFP Quota: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKSHABQADAR 6156-6

ATTESTED GHALANAI

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office GHALANAI Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)





0.00

Personal Information of Mr SHAHIN SHAH d/w/s of SULTAN KHAN

Personnel Number: 00102145	CNIC: 0014270114497
Date of Birth: 01.01.1960	Entry into Govt. Service: 01.01.1988

NTN:

Length of Service: 31 Years 09 Months 001 Days

Employment Category: Active Temporary

Designation: DRAWING MAS	STER	80926292-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE		
DDO Code: MG6015-Governm	ment Middle Schools Mohmand			
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:		
GPF A/C No: 1794/CSS	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:	431,880.00	
Vendor Number: -				

3,341.00

GPF A/C No: 1794/CSS Interest Ap Vendor Number: -		Interest Appli		the second s			
		Pay scale: B	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017		cale Type: Civil BPS: 15		
	Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amo	unt
0001	Basic Pay		33,410.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.	00
1210	Convey Allowance 20	05	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.	00
1528	Unattractive Area Allo	w	1,700.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	740.0)0
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @	10%	501.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,583.	00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017	10%	3,341.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,341.	00

Deductions - General

2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3015 GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3609 Income Tax	-293.00	3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00
4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00		0.00
Deductions - Loans and Advances	•		

Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
	· .			
Deductions - Inco	me Tax			

Payable:	3,111.55	Recovered till SEP-2019:	479.00	Exempted: 0.49-	Recoverable:	2,633.04
----------	----------	--------------------------	--------	-----------------	--------------	----------

Gross Pay (Rs.): Net Pay: (Rs.): 55,662.00 **Deductions: (Rs.):** -4,508.00 51,154.00

Payee Name: SHAHIN SHAH

Account Number: 6156-6

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 231435 SHABQADAR SHABQADAR,

Leaves: Open	ing Balance: A	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:
--------------	----------------	----------	---------	----------

Permanent Address: GHALLA	NAI MOHMAND AGENCY	
City: GHALLANAI	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		
City:	Email: shahinshahdm@gmail.com	
	TOT-STED	
	(A mer	

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/29.09.2019/13:50:52/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA

APPELLANT

Khyle

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY. AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE APPELLANT DURING WINTER SUMMER 3. OF THE VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE APPEAL OF DEPARTMENTAL $\mathbb{H}^{\mathbb{N}}$ STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Vocto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other 'remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant. 7-4/18/19

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

s ç

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) [1-1/2011 dated 14,07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for temployees 11.11.2019.

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019. Markad Hayat vs Gort

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence; was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

> --

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record.

。 影わ

ANNOUNCED

der firt

a colorivation

The Director, (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as DM(BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 15.07.2020

Your Obediently Shahin Shah CTED

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

Shahin Shah_

____(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department (RESPONDENT)

_(DEFENDANT)

I/WeShahin Shah_

Do hereby appoint and constitute **UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND**, **Advocate**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated/2020	$\langle \mathcal{A} \rangle$
	CLIENT
	ACCEPTED UMAR FAROOQ MOHMAND
	KAMRAN KHAN ADVOCATES

OFFICE: Flat No. 4, 2nd Floor, Jumma Khan Plaza, Warsak Road, Peshawar 0313-8901674