The appellant has filed the present service appeal against the deduction of conveyance allowance of the government servant/teacher working in school/college during vacations period.

Learned counsel for the appellant stated at the bar that identical nature Service Appeal No.1452/2019 has already been disposed of by this Tribunal vide order dated 11.11.2019. Learned counsel for the appellant stressed that being an identical nature case, the present service appeal may also be disposed of in terms of the said order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal No.1452/2019.

Order dated 11.11.2019 of this Tribunal passed in Service Appeal No.1452/2019 perused. Judgment dated 03.12.2018 passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No.1888(R)CS/2016 and judgment dated 01.10.2019 of the Hon'ble Peshawar High Court Peshawar in Writ Petition No.3162-P/2019 referred to in the order dated 11.11.2019 in Service Appeal No.1452/2019, also gone through and plea taken by the learned counsel for the appellant is found genuine. Consequently the instant service appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal No.1452/2019, with the observation that the judgment of Hon'ble Peshawar High Court passed in writ petitions including Writ Petition 3162-P/2019 shall be honored and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time.

This may also be observed that perusal of the judgment of Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No.1888(R) CS/2016 reflects that in an identical nature case, the Federal Service Tribunal has held that the conveyance allowance is payable to the appellants w.e.f the vacations of the year when the departmental appeal/representation was filed by the appellants.

File be consigned to the record room.

(Muhammad Hamid Mughal) Member (J)

## Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of_				
Case No.		2000	/2019_	

1	Case No	2,009 /2019
S.No.	Date of order	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge or Magistrate
	Proceedings	
1	2	3
1	20.12.2019	The present appeal submitted today by Mr. Noor
		Muhammad Khattak Advocate, may be entered in the institution
		register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order
		please.
1.		Source
. 2		REGISTRAR
		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary
	÷	hearing to be put up there on 09.01.2020.
		CHAIRMAN
	09.01.2020	Junior to counsel for the appellant present.
¥	05.01.2020	Requests for adjournment due to general strike of
•		the Bar. Adjourned to 13.02.2020 before S.B.
•	-	
		Chairman
	•	
•	·	
i		
:		
•		
-		

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 2009 /2019

**GUL SAIFULLAH KHAN** 

**VS** 

**EDUCATION DEPTT:** 

**INDEX** 

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1- 3.
2.	Stay application		4.
3.	Notification	A	5.
4.	Pay slips	B & C	6- 7.
5.	Departmental appeal	D	8.
6.	Judgment	E	9- 15.
7.	Service Tribunal judgment	F	16- 17.
8.	Vakalat nama		18.

### **APPELLANT**

THROUGH:

NOOR MUHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE

Room No. 3 & 4, Upper Floor, Islamia Club Building, Khyber Bazar, Peshawar 0345-9383141

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the sase.

### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 2009 /2019

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunai

Diary No. 2156

Mr. Gul Saif Ullah Khan, CT (BPS-15), GHS Darora, Dir Upper. Dated 20-12-19

### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

  RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

### **PRAYER:**

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

## R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as CT (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

- **3-** That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the Salary Slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure. **B & C.**

- 6- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

### **GROUNDS:**

(

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

**APPELLANT** 

**GUL SAIFULLAH KHAN** 

THROUGH:

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK

MIR ZAMAN SAFI ADVOCATES

### GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
  - 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
  - 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
  - 8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
  - 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
  - 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
  - 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

# Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2.	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance ATTESTED

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20<sup>th</sup> December, 2012





# GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

From

The Secretary to Govt, of Knyber Pashtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peahawar.

To:

All Administrative September to Gove of Kinyber Pakhtunkhwa.

The Serior Member, Board of Revenue, Whyter Pakhtunidhaa.

The Secretary to Governor Knyber Pakhtunkawa

The Secretary to Chief Minwell. Khybe: Pakhtankhwa.

5. Tae Secretary, Provincial Aspendig. Knyber Pakitturkhwa.

All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa.

All District Coordination Officers in Khyser Paklitunkhiva.

Ali Political Agents / District & Somions Judges in Klayter Pablitunkhwa

The Registry, Peshawar High Costs, Peshawar

30 The Charman, Petilic Service Conversion, Khyber Pakhtunchway

The Chairman, Services Tribenal, Yesyos: Pakhtunkhwa.

Seit, eat

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sill.

The Government of Khylter Pakhturáhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyonce Allowance admissible to all the Provinced Civil Servants, Govt: of Khyber Pakhturáhwa (working to BPS-1 to BPS-15) wielf from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to BPS-19 will remain urchanged.

S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
2	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
≒.	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$.5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned afficial vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Sacod Atimad) Secretary Finance

Endat: NO. VD/SO(SR-ID/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2017TESTED

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Accountant General Karoter Pakilitarkling, Pesiteman

ি Georgianes to Government of Punjab, Sindh & Salbothenan দিনিকার্যাচ Depontation (

3 All Augurphous / Semi Autonomous Bodies in Knyber Pakhtankhala

(INTIAZ AYUB)

Additional Secretary (Result

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir Upper Monthly Salary Statement (August-2019)



Personal Information of Mr GUL SAIF ULLAH KHAN OF DARARO d/w/s of SHAN FAROZ

Personnel Number: 00278166

CNIC: 1570138115201

Date of Birth: 15.05.1977

Entry into Govt. Service: 28.03.2004

Length of Service: 15 Years 05 Months 005 Days

**Employment Category: Vocational Temporary** 

Designation: CERTIFICATED TEACHER

80001937-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

BPS: 15

DDO Code: DP6048-H.M GHS DARORA

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 08

309,959.00

GPF A/C No: 278166

Pay and Allowances:

Vendor Number: -

Interest Applied: Yes

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

GPF Balance:

Pay Stage: 11

Wage type 1	Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001 Basic Pay	30,750.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210 Convey Allowance 2005 31	2,856.00	1300 Medical Allowance	1,500.00
1923 UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	644.00
24991 AdhoorRelieftAllow@1.0%	436.00	2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,252.00
P224) Adhog Relief(AH72017, 10%	3,075.00	2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,075.00
2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	3,075.00	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	0.00

Deductions; t Generally: Vacation

1200 Code: DROWARE VPES D	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3015 GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600,00
3609 Income Taxics	-31.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00
4004, R. Benefits & Death Comp:				0.00

Pay and Allowances:

**Deductions - Loans and Advances** 

Loan	ivage tyge Déscri	ption	Principal amoun	t Deduction	Balance
Deductions-	ey Allowares 2005 Income Fax C 607 3520 M Recovere c Relief Allow ar 10 %	ed till August-2019:	62.00 Exempt	ed: 242.15 Rec	overable: 303.00
<b>Payl (F</b> 261 Adho	<b>Relief Ast 2012/00</b> 2 Relief Att 2019 10%	Deductions: (Rs.);	-4,698.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	46,314.00
	GUL SAIF ULLAH KI	IAN OF DARARO			
	nibere3620-8	CD 221220 D 4 D 0 D 4			
Dank Detans	HABIB BANK LIMIT	ED, 221538 DARORA,	UPPER DIR. DAROR	A, UPPER DIR., UPP	ER DIR
	Wings 1 Tre SubOpening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
3509   fre <u>on</u> 1404   R. 45a	ne fax ne fits de 15 en 1 en 12 ddress: D				
Permanent A	iddress: D				
	ORER, and Javanes	Domicile: NW - KI	nyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing S	Status: No Official
Cîtý? a	ess: n <sub>es</sub>	Email:		A Pagusing S	
zeduvilons - Payably:	Income 14., 60715   Reco		.01		
prosu Paý (R	(9.): \$1,612.06.		hall		
	GUL SAIF ULLAH			1	

Opening Balance Ecaves:

(288457/06:09:2019/13121319) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

Account Number: 3620 8

### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir Upper Monthly Salary Statement (February-2019)



## Personal Information of Mr GUL SAIF UŁLAH KHAN OF DARARO d/w/s of SHAN FAROZ

Personnel Number: 00278166

CNIC: 1570138115201

Date of Birth: 15.05.1977

Entry into Govt. Service: 28.03.2004

Length of Service: 14 Years 11 Months 002 Days

Employment Category: Vocational Temporary

Designation: CERTIFICATED TEACHER

80001937-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: DP6048-H.M GHS DARORA Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center: 08

GPF A/C No: 2781661

Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

256,442.00

Vendor Number: -Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 15

Pay Stage: 12

Wage type 1	Amount	Wage type	Amoun
0001 Basic Pay	32,080.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
300 Medical Allowance Men	1,500.00	1923 UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00
148   15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	644.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	436.00
21d Adhec Relief AH 2016 10%	2,252.00	2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,208.00
247 AdlWarRelie (1/41/2018) 10%	3,208.00	2017 1070	0.00

Date of Birth: 15.05.1977 **Deductions - General** 

Payable:

1,000.00

Gross Pay (Rts.): 40,677,00

rayee Name: GUL SAIF ULLAF Account Number: 3620-4 Bank Ocialis: HAZHB BA ALLIN

Recor

Designation: CEL Wage types Tr	Amount		Wage type		Amount
3015, GRF Subscription - Rs2890	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund		-600.00
3609 Income Tax	50.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	i	-125.00
4004 R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-1,052.00				0.00

V. ndor Number. - Deductions, Loans and Advances

Loan	Vage type	ption	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Раўаы <u>8420кы)</u> 148 [15% А.Д.	come Tax 000.00 dee Recovere noc Relie All-201	ed till February-2019:	- - 400.00 Exempted	: 400.00 Reco	overable: 200.00
	eliet Alt 2018 105	Deductions: (Rs.):	4,717.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	41,960.00
	UL SAIF ULLAH KE	IAN OF DARARO	•		
Account Numbe	er::3620-8	in to Dinonco			
B <u>ank Details: H</u>	<u>ABIB BANK LIMIT</u>	ED, 221538 DARORA, 1	JPPER DIR. DARORA,	UPPER DIR., UPP	ER DIR
	Wagelyse			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
	Opęning, Balange:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
3609 Income T					
<del>1904   P. Benefi</del> Perinanent Addi	ess: D				
Cit <mark>mi DIRPRO</mark> P	ERs and Advance	Domicile: NW - Kh	vber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing St	tatus: No Official
		The state of the s	-		iaius. No Official
	Det	Email:	_	$\Omega_{2}$	
-	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	~~ 1863963.	. TT 5		
edactions - Inc	once Tax		.470	, -	

(288457/25.02 2019/11:51:05) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted teaves: Opening is different

7 (2)

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as CT (BPS- 15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. Lam feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 28.08.2019

Your Obediently

GUŁ SAIFULLAH KHAN, CT GHS Darora, Dir Upper

### Judgment Sheet

IN THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR,

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

Writ Petition No. 3162-P/2019 Alhtar Hussain and 697 others...vs...Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

### **JUDGMENT**

Date of hearing......01.10.2019....

Petitioner(s) by Mr. Noor Mohammad Khattak, Advocate.

Mr. Mujahid Ali Khan, AAG, for respondents.

ROOH-UL-AMIN KHAN, J:- Through this common judgment we, proposed to decided the instant as well as the connected writ petitions as all having involved common question of law and facts, the particulars of which are given below.

- i. WP No. 3162-P/2019 titled Akhtar Hussain etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- ii. WP No. 3064-P/2019 titled Habeeb Ullah etc...Vs... Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.
- iii. WP No. 3084-P/2019 titled Sikandar Khan etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- iv. WP No. 3178-P/2019 titled Abdur Rehman etc...Vs.ATTESTED

  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

EXAMINER Peshawar High Court

Jodan



10

- WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- vi. WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- vii. WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.
- viii. WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khanetc...Vs...

  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- ix. WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs... Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.
- x. WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs...

  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- xi. WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs...

  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.
- xii. WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalia TTESTED etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

TESTED

EXAMINER Peshawar High Cour



xiii. WP No. 3567-P/2019 titled Husnur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 3 others.

- xiv. WP No. 3667-P/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.
- xv. WP No. 3939-P/2019 titled Syed Khurshid Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 5 others.
- xvi. WP No. 4072-P/2019 titled Subhan Ullah etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.
- xvii. WP No. 4758-P/2019 titled Sohrab Hayat etc...Vs...
  Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
  Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

As per averments of the writ petition, the

Education Department on their respective posts. On 14.7.2011 the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa enhanced the conveyance allowance to all the Civil Servants i.e. from BPS-1 to 15, including the petitioners, which was subsequently revised vide another notification dated 20.12.2012 and was further enhanced. But the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped / deducted the payment of conveyance

100 lastron

2:

ATTESTED

allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period.

- In essence, the grievance the petitioners is that they were receiving the conveyance allowance under the notifications mentioned above, which was stopped without any justifiable reason.
- 4. Since the matter pertain to grant of conveyance allowance which is part and parcel of pay. Similar controversy came before this Court in Writ Petition No. 3509-P/2014 titled (Hafiz Mohammad Ilyas etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), wherein the pay and salary were defined in the following manner.
  - "7. To resolve the controversy as to whether payment of allowances to a civil servant falls in chapter-2 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 i.e. terms and conditions of service, it is necessary to reproduce the definition of "pay" provided in section 2(e) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 which reads as under:
    - "2. (e)—"Pay" means the amount drawn monthly by a civil servant as pay, and includes special pay, personal pay and any other emoluments declared by the prescribed authority to be paid." (emphasis provided).

The word "emolument" used in the above quoted definition clause of the Civil Servants Act, 1973, according to its dictionary meaning, denotes wages and benefits received as compensation for

AITESTED

EXAMINER Peshawar High Court

TESTED

holding an office or having employment. The word emolument is basically derived from the Latin word emolumentum. It originally meant "the sum paid to a miller for grinding a customer wheat". Today, the term exists mostly as a bit of archaic legalese, but it might be within the route of expression i.e. "grinding out a living". From the above it is manifest that emoluments are essentially the benefits that one gets from the working of being employed. Emolument is the profit employment and is compensation in return of services, hence the emoluments are part and parcel of pay. Section 17 being part of chapter-2 i.e. terms and conditions of service of a civil servant provides that, a civil servant appointed to a post shall be entitled, in accordance with rules, to the pay sanctioned for the post. Likewise, Rule 9(21) of (FR/SR) provide, the definition of pay which means the amount drawn monthly by a government servant as;

(i) the pay, other than special pay or pay granted in view of his personal qualification, which has been sanctioned for the post held by him substantively or in an officiating capacity, or to which he is entitled by reason of his position in a cadre, and (ii) overseas pay, technical pay, special pay and personal pay and

(iii) any other emoluments which may be specially classed as pay by the governor general.

The legislature in its wisdom has wisely used the word "pay" instead of salary in definition clause and section 17 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973. The word 'pay' connotes

EXAMINER
Peshawar High Court



ATTESTED

(14)

payment of wages including emolument in broader spectrum while the salary is used for amount that one receives in return for work and or service provided, which is paid periodically i.e. over a specified interval of time such as weekly or most commonly monthly. The term "salary" has been dealt with at page-553 of Corpus Juris Secundem Vol. 77 as under:-

"Salary". The word "Salary" is defined has meaning fixed compensation regularly paid by the year, quarter, month or week; fixed compensation for regular work, or for continuous services over a period of time; periodical compensation for services; compensation for services rendered; per annum compensation mean in official and in some other situation, or station; legal compensation.

Salary is also defined as meaning stipulated periodical recompense; or consideration paid, or stipulated to be paid to a person on regular interval for services usually a fixed sum to be paid by the year or half year, quarter; reward or consideration paid or agreed to be paid to a person on a regular intervals by the year, month or week for services; reward of fixed or recompense for services rendered or performed; reward or compensation of services rendered or performed.

From the above mentioned definition it is manifest that the "salary" of a civil servant is a fixed amount regularly paid as compensation to the employee, whereas the pay means an amount received by a civil servant including other emoluments i.e. allowances."

Peshawar ring. Court

ATTESTED

- Besides, certain other petitions filed by the 5. Teachers /employees of the same department serving from other corners of the province which were decided by Abbottabad Bench of this Court, wherein it was held that the conveyance allowance being part of pay fall in terms and conditions of civil servant and it can adequately be claimed through an appeal by adopting the prescribed procedure under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1974.
  - For the reasons given hereinabove, the petitioners 6. are civil servants and their claim falls in terms and conditions of service enumerated in Chapter-2 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973, wherein the jurisdiction of this Court is expressly barred by Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. Resultantly, this and the connected writ petition mentioned above stand dismissed being not maintainable. However, the petitioners are liberty to approach the proper forum, if so desire.

Announced on; of October, 2019

JUDGE  $\mathcal{NDGE}$ 

Mr. Justice Rooh Ul Amin Khan & Mr. Justice Mohammad Nacem Anwar

CERTIFIED TO BE TRUE COP

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

### VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS ILLEGALLY\_ BY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE **DURING WINTER &** APPELLANT OF. VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE OF APPELLANT WITHIN DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

### PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fleate-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

> R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and esecondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

Affeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Gort

(17)

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a responsible time.

Certified -

File be consigned to the record.

Peshawar ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

E W

ATTESTED

Chairman

### **VAKALATNAMA**

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	OF 2019
Gul Saifullah Khan	(APPELLANT)(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)
VERSUS	·
Education Department	(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)
I/We Gul Saifullah Khan  Do hereby appoint and constitute NOOR  Advocate, Peshawar to appear, plead, act refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Cou noted matter, without any liability for his defau engage/appoint any other Advocate Couns authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withd behalf all sums and amounts payable or depot the above noted matter.  Dated/2019  CLI	, compromise, withdraw or nsel/Advocate in the above ult and with the authority to sel on my/our cost. I/we raw and receive on my/our osited on my/our account in

MIR ZAMAN SAFI ADVOCATES

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK

OFFICE:

Flat No.3, Upper Floor, Islamia Club Building, Khyber Bazar, Peshawar City. Mobile No.0345-9383141