

S.No.

1

2-

Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of_____

14084 Case No

Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings

01

-03-21

11/11/2020 1-

2

The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please.

3

2020

REGISTI

This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on



01.03.2021 The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan is on leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for the same before S.B on 26.07.2021.



BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. /2020

EDUCATION DEPTT:

ANJU	JMAN	ARA	• .	 VS
		· :		•
•	· · ·	•		
	· •	•	•	

<u>INDEX</u>		
S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE
1.	Memo of appeal	1 3
2.	Notification	A 4
3.	Pay slips	B & C 5-6
4.	Departmental appeal	D 7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E 8-9
6.	Vakalatnama	10
· · · .		

APPELLANT

:u

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ ADOCATE HIGH COURT FLAT NO.4 2ND FLOOR, JUMMA KHAN PLAZA WARSAK ROAD, PESHAWAR CELL NO 0313-8901647

Note:

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

Sir,

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 14084/2020

Khyber Pakhtukhwa

APPEL

1/11/202

Mr, ANJUMAN ARA PST(BPS-15) GGPS BAZ MUHAMMAD DIST MOHMAND. Personnel Number:00110336

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar:
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 -RESPONDENTS

APPEAL • : UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, OKHYBER 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY **ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE** ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON . THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any Filedto-dayother remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also ew be awarded in favor of the appellant.

1000 egistrar

11 11 ~ <u>R/SHEWETH:</u>

ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as PST (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from
 - BPS- 16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Copy of the Notification dated 20.12.2012 are attached as annexure.....

- 4- That appellant feeling aggrieved from the action of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months filed Departmental appeal but no reply has been received so far. Copy of the Departmental appeal &is attached as annexure......**D**.
- 6- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgment Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.
- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government,

therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT **ANJUMAN ARA THROUGH:** UMAR FAROOO ADVOCATE HIGH COURT



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO, FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

From

. - P

d

ς.

÷.

To:

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pachtunkhwa, Finance Department, Penhawar,

All Administrative Secretaries to Govi of Kiryber Pakintunkhive. The Sector Member, Board of Revenue, Knyber Pakintunkhive. The Secretary to Chief Minster, Knyber Pakintunkhive. The Secretary to Chief Minster, Knyber Pakintunkhive. The Secretary, Provincial Ascembly, Knyber Pakintunkhive. All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyber Pakintunkhive. All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyber Pakintunkhive. All District Coordination Officerson Xhyber Pakintunkhive. All Political Agents / District & Secondors Judges in Knyber Pakintunkhive. All Political Agents / District & Secondors Judges in Knyber Pakintunkhive. The Registrar, Peshawar High Coord, Peshawar The Chairman, Seconder Theoret, Knyber Pakintunkhive. Ine Chairman, Seconder Theoret, Knyber Pakintunkhive.

Sibject

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear SF

The Government of Khyter Pakhtisthwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of Xinyben Pekhainkhwa (violking in EPS-1 to EPS-15) with from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in EPS-15 to EPS-19 will remain unchanged.

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1.700/-
2,	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
3.	11-15	Fs.2,000/-	Rs 2,720/-
., 🛋	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$.5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned afficial.vehictes.

Yours Fashfully

(Sahibzada Saood Alumad) Secretary Finance

Dated Pergawar the 20" December, 2012

Endst: NO. FD:SO(SR-II)-8-52/2012-

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

- Accountant General, Kingber, Pakinsushinas, Pesinaasi
- Secretaties to Goldmanzert of Punjab, Sinch & Sabarseign Fandron Dypertment All Automomous / Servi Abtonetrous Bodies in Kayast Pakiturahiwa
 - a Mällmedilla (255.5 Laterstrans coors) in veries (200 m

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Secondary (Roa

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

0-4

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 2012.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa:

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: <u>REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE</u> <u>CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA: PROVINCIAL</u> <u>GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19</u>

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
. 2.	5-10	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2.720/-
·4	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17. 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahriad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December; 20.1



001 Basic Pay 37,	400.00 3015 GP	F Subscription	2,890.00)	GPF#:	IV.EDU.MŃC	.2326	379,14	9.00
000 House Rent Allowance	2,349.00 35	01 Benevolent Fund		600.00-	. IN	COME TAX 4,	207.15	2,812.00	1,395.
210 Convey Allowance 20	-	90 Emp.Edu. Fund KF		125.00-				•.	
300 Medical Allowance		4 R. Benefits & Death	י C 6	500.00-					
505 Charge Allowance	40.00 3609 1	ncome Tax	466.00)-	•	•			
528 Unattractive Area A	1,000.00			•				·,	
148 15% Adhoc Relief All	775.00							•	
199 Adhoc Relief Allow @	519.00	· ·		· ·	-				•
211 Adhoc Relief All 201	2,634.00	•	•		1	:			
224 Adhoc Relief All 201	3,740.00	· .				• . •			
247 Adhoc Relief All 201	3,740.00	· .				•			
	•			• •					
264 Adhoc Relief All 201	3,740.00								
PAYMENTS 60,	293.00 DE	•	4,681.00- NK OF PAKI		NET PAY BOADAR	55,612.	-	.2020 31.03 Accnt.No: 52	
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	DUCTIONS NATIONAL BA	•		NET PAY BQADAR	55,612.	-	.2020 31.03 Accnt.No: 52	
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612.	-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612.	-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612 . ۲	-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612. (-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612.	-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612.	-		
PAYMENTS 60, ranch Code:231435 SHA	293.00 DE BQADAR	NATIONAL BA	•		-	55,612.	-		

2

(7)

 \cap

0001 Basic Pay		00 GPF Other Govt.Emp			SPF#: IV.EDU.MN		313,708.00 784.85	
1000 House Rent All 1300 Medical Allowa	ance 1,500.00	00 3661 E.E.F (Exchange 3701 Benevolent Fund((Excha 600.00		INCOME TAX 030.	20 /2.00	704400	
1505 Charge Allowar 1528 Unattractive A		3705 R. Ben & Death Con 3609 Income Tax	mp(E 600.00- 72.00-			•		
2148 15% Adhoc Rel	lief All 775.00	· · · ·	•	•		• •		
2199 Adhoc Relief A 2211 Adhoc Relief A					· · ·			•
2224 Adhoc Relief A	ll 201 3,607.00				, 			•
2247 Adhoc Relief A 2264 Adhoc Relief A		•		·			`	
ri i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i			, ,		: 			, · · ,
PAYMENTS Branch Code:231439	55,708.00 SHABQADAR	DEDUCTIONS NATIONAL B	4,262.00- BANK OF PAKISTAN	NET PA SHABQADAR	-	0_01.07.2019 SADDA	31.07.2019 Accnt.No: 528	9-8
······································		•	• •	•	· .	1	1	
	. '.		· · ·	1 - C C C C C C C C				
0.0					÷.,	· ·	•	
	· . · · .		`			•		
Q M			•	•		· · · ·	2	
				•			\sim	
Q 11 11			•	•			\sum	2
C M U			•					the fear
C M U			•					1
N N								17 1 m 1 m 1
C M M								17 m 1 m 1

- **K**.K.

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject: DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as PST (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated. 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the convence allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Havat versus Education Derpartment. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached, I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 20.07,2020.

Your Obediently

121

ANJUMAN ARA



-	
	CEDUICE TRIBUNAL
•	BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL
•	PESHAWAR (12)
	Service Tribuint
:	APPEAL NO. 1452 / 2019 1500
÷ .	APPEAL NO.
1	24/10/2
Ê	Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16),
	GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar
ş	GH2 Hashe cog-in
200	VERSUS
i i	
i.	1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary,
	1- The Government of Knyber Fundament
	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
	2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
	3- The Secretary Finance Department, Knyber Pakilunkinwa, residence
	 3- The Secretary Finance Deparament, Rhyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
	5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Knyber Later RESPONDENTS
÷	***************************************
	THE KINDED DAKHTINKHWA
	APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
.	
	THE RECOMPENS BY ILLUMENT
	ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS DIE ALLOWANCE
	ACAINST NU ACTION TOTAL
	THE ADTRACTION APPEAL OF ATTREES
	STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.
· ·	STATUTURT PERCOD
	승규는 사람이 가지 않는 것 같아. 이 말한 것 않는 것 확장한 가지 않는 것 같아. 이 가지 않는 것 같아.
	PRAYER: That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may
	That on acceptance of this appear the response kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance Winter
	kindly be directed not to make deduction or control
	kindly be directed not to make deduction of sale Winter allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter
ŀ	allowance during vacations period (Summer a Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount
•	Vacations) and make the pay which have been deducted
	Vacations) and make the payment of an outset of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted of Conveyance allowance which have other remedy which
	of Conveyance allowance which have been which have been which it was also be awarded in this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in All AS
	The shoust internet and the state of the sta
	Registrar favor of the appellant.
	2-4/12/19
	R/SHEWETH:
	ON FACTS:
	1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondar
	education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficience education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficience
	and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
	and up to the chart and up to the
	2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servar
	2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to an une critical dat and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dat
	and to this effect a Notification NO. FU (FICC) a standard
	and to this effect a Notification No. TD (TRC) a first on dat 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dat
	14.07.2011 the conveyance allowance for employe
•	14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised received for employe 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employe
-	
-	

11.11.2019

Appleal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribuñal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

, *N*B

File be consigned to the record.

K1

Chairman

ANNOUNCED

Cartific

S CELLAN AL

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

ANJUMAN ARA

(APPELLÁNT)

_(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) (DEFENDANT)

I/WeANJUMAN ARA

do hereby appoint and constitute **UMAR FAROOQ**, **Advocate, High court**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated.___/__/2020

CLIENT

