# Form- A

# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of			
	00	• ,	
. •	135(1		
e No	1/13	/2020	 

1	- 2	
1-		3
	11/11/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Umar Farooq Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for
į		proper order please.
		REGISTRAR
<b>.</b> .		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on $1/3/2$
	* * * *	MEMBER(J)
01.	03.2021	The learned Member Judicial Mr. Muhammad Jamal Khan
	on	leave, therefore, the case is adjourned. To come up for t
	sa	me before S.B on 26.07.2021.
		Reader
		<b>85.</b>
·		
-		

# **PESHAWAR**

. APPEA	NO.		/:	2020	:		
	•						
•		VC	· ·	- FDUĆA	TIOR	u ne	DT

SABZ ALI

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	**********	1-3 %
2.	Notification	A	4.
3.	Pay slips	B & C	5- 6
4.	Departmental appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

THROUGH:

**UMAR FAROOQ** 

ADOCATE HIGH COURT
FLAT NO.4 2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR, JUMMA KHAN PLAZA
WARSAK ROAD, PESHAWAR CELL NO 0313-8901647

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 13957 /2020

Mr, SABZ ALI PST(BPS-12) GPS MANWAR CHEENA DIST MOHMAND.

Personnel Number:00110440

Diary No 4518 Dated 1111 / 209 3

#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. ....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER **SECTION-4 PAKHTUNKHWA** SERVICE TRIBUNAL **ACT. 1974 OKHYBER** AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT DEPARTMENTAL STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

# **R/SHEWETH:**

#### ON FACTS:

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as PST (BPS-12) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from

- 3- That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowances as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. Copies of the Salary Slips of working/serving month and vacations (deduction period) are attached as annexure.

  B & C.

- 6- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgment Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

APPELLANT SABZ ALI

THROUGH:

UMAR FAROOQ ADVOCATE HIGH COURT



## GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SC(SR-41)/78-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

From

The Secretary to Gowl, of Knytzer Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department. Penhayear.

Τċ:

All Administrative Septembles to Gove of Kington Pakintonismons.

The Scriot Member, Board of Revenue, Whyter Pakhius disca.

The Secretary to Governor Knyber Pakitalakawa

The Secretary to Chief Moster, Khyber Pakhankhwa ć,

The Secretary, Franchisk Ayornally, Khyber Pakallerkhisa

All Heads of Attached Departments in Knyher Pakhtunkhwa

All District Coordination Officers to Khylise Paklitunkings.

All Political Agents / Destrict & Semions Judges in Knytter Publications

The Registral Pashawar Hab Court Peshagar

The Chairman, Public Service Correnasion, Khyber Pákhtunkhwa.

The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Yelypor Pakhtonishwa.

និង២,៩៧.

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Deat Sit.

The Government of Khyber Pakhterányia has begi pleásed ig enhang ( versise the rate of Conveyance Allewance admissible to all the Provinces Civil Servantia Govid of Kimber Pashtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-16) wielf from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BFS-15 to BPS-19 will remain in the transport.

٠.		, , ,				<del></del>	
	S.NO	8P5	Ð	CISTING RATE (P	/H)	REVISED RATE (PM)	
7	1.	1-4		₹\$\$00/-		Rs.1.700/-	
٠. <del>-</del>	2,	5-10	1	Ps.1,500/-		Rs.1,840/-	
	<u> </u>	11:15		Rs.2,000/-		Rs.2,720/-	
	<u>., ,,=.</u>	16-19	1:	Rs.5.000/-		Ps.5.000/-	Į

Conveyance Allowance of the phone rates per mante shall be admissible to those SPS-17, 18 gind 19 diffeets who have not been sanctioned allicial vehicles.

curs Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Sacod Alvitad) Secretary Finance

Endsit NO. FD/SO/SR-17/8-52/2012

Dated Pegnawar the 20th December, 2012

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

- Accountant General Render Pakhtaninas, Reshawar
- Secretaries to Government of Panjab, Scraft & Saborestan, Farance Decembers
- All Augustamous / Semi Autonomous Bodies in Whyber Pakhtunkhwa

(INTIAZ AYUB)

Additional Secretary (Reset

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

NA-4

## GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

- 1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- S. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- 10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA; PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT RPS. 1-19

Dear Sir,

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/review the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

S.No.	BPS	Existing Rate (PM)	Revised Rate (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs. 1,700/-
2	5-10 ·	Rs 1.500/-	Rs. 1,840/-
3.	11-15	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs. 5,000/-	Rs. 5,000/-

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

Your Faithfully

(Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December; 2012

#### **Government of Pakistan** District Accounts Office GHALANAI Monthly Salary Statement (December-2016)





#### Personal Information of Mr SABZ ALI d/w/s of MUSAFAR KHAN

Personnel Number: 00110440

CNIC: 1610221508841

Date of Birth: 24.09.1969

Entry into Govt. Service: 29.11.1989

Length of Service: 27 Years 01 Months 004 Days

**Employment Category: Active Permanent** 

Designation: PRIMARY SCHOOL TEACHER

00000016-Min. Of K.A & N.A & S.F.R

DDO Code: MG0005-Agency Education Officer Mohmand

Cash Center:

Payroll Section: 001 GPF A/C No:

GPF Section: 001 Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

258,722.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2016

Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 12

Wage type		Amount	Amount Wage type		Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	27,140.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	1,307.00	
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	
1505	Charge Allowance	40.00	1528	Unattractive Area Allow	1,500.00	
1948	Adhoc Allowance 2010@ 50%	4,192.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	800.00	
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	535.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,714.00	
5898	Adj. Adhoc Allowance 50%	12,576.00		1.10- 110:31	0.00	

#### **Deductions - General**

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3300	GPF Other Govt.Emp	-1,851.00	3609	Income Tax	-58.00
3661	E.E.F (Exchange)	-100.00	3701	Benevolent Fund(Exchange)	-180.00 °
3704	Group Insurance(Exchange)	-115.00 ÷	371-1-	Addl Group Insuranc(Exch)	-13.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

T	D		i	
Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
		•	•	

**Deductions - Income Tax** 

Payable:

2,014.55

Recovered till December-2016:

160.00

Exempted: 1510:27

Recoverable:

344.28

Gross Pay (Rs.): 55,160.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-2.317.00

Payee Name: SABZ ALI 00

Account Number: 7504-9

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 230548 TAKHT BHAI TAKHT BHAI, MARDAN

Leaves:

**Opening Balance:** 

Earned:

Balance:

Availed:

Permanent Address: GHALLANAI GHALLANAI MOHMAND AGENCY

City: GHALLANAI

Domicile: NW - Knyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email: sabzalikhanpst@gmail.com

\* Errors & omissions excepted

#### Government of Pakistan District Accounts Office GHALANAI Monthly Salary Statement (August-2017)





#### Personal Information of Mr SABZ ALI d/w/s of MUSAFAR KHAN

Personnel Number: 00110440

CNIC: 1610221508841

Date of Birth: 24.09.1969

Entry into Govt. Service: 29.11.1989

NTN:

Length of Service: 27 Years 09 Months 004 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: PRIMARY SCHOOL

TEACHER

00000016-Min. Of K.A & N.A & S.F.R

DDO Code: MG0005-Agency F

tion Officer Mohmand F Section: 001

Cash Center:

Payroll Section: 001 GPF A/C No:

Interest Applied: Yes

**GPF** Balance:

273,899.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 20

Wage type		Amount	Amount Wage		Amount
0001	Basic Pay	32,520.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	1,307.00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	1505	Charge Allowance	40.00
1528	Unattractive Area Allow	1,500.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	800,00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	535.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,714.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,252.00			0.00

#### Deductions - General

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
3300 GPF Other Govt.Emp	-2,220.00	3609 Income Tax	-73.00
3661 E.E.F (Exchange)	-100,00	3701 Benevolent Fund(Exchange)	-180.00
3705 R. Ben & Death Comp(Exch)	-600.00		0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

<u> </u>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1				
Loan	77	Description	* **	Principal amount	Deduction	Dolonos
	<del> </del>	2 000000000		1 i meipai amount	Deduction	Balance

**Deductions - Income Tax** 

Payable:

3,500.75

Recovered till August-2017:

146.00

Exempted: 2625.55

Recoverable:

729.20

Gross Pay (Rs.): 44,168.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-3,173.00

Net Pay: (Rs.): 40,995.00

Payee Name: SABZ ALI

Account Number: 7504-9

Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 230548 TAKHT BHAI TAKHT BHAI, MARDAN

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address: GHALLANAI GHALLANAI MOHMAND AGENCY

City: GHALLANAI

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address: City:

Email: sabzalikhanpst@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/25.08.2017/09
\* All amounts are in Pak Rupees
\* Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. D=7

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as PST (BPS-12) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated. 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the convence allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Derpartment Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 20.07.2020

Your Obediently

SABZ ALI

GPS MANWAR CHEENA DIST MOHMAND

INKHWA SERVICE TRIBÛN BEFORE THE KHYBER PA

PESHAWAR APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

### **VERSUS**

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE OF OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Flecto-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

# R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondar education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficient and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servar and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dat 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dat 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employe

2-4/18/16

Appeal n/o. 145.2/2019
Maxbad Hayat is Got

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a

reasonable time.

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Kh.

Chairman

Boshawai