# Form- A

# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

· courtor_			
1 -		· · · · · ·	
•			2.0
	1110	**	$\Delta$
se Na -	1476	/2020	- X

	Case No	19765 /2020 00
S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	23/11/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Shahid Hussain Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member
		for proper order please.
		REGISTRAR,
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put
		up there on
	y	
		MEMBER(J)
02.0	3.2021	Due to general strike on the call of Khyber
		Pakhtunkhwa Bar Counsel, learned counsel for
		appellant is not available today, therefore, the appeal
		is adjourned to 27.07.2021 on which date file to come
,		up for preliminary arguments before S.B.
I		
		(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
-		
-		
·		
:		

ARTIS.

and the second s

A MARKATA MILITARY

M. ...

• •

# Before the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Peshawar

Service Appeal No /20	<b>020</b>
-----------------------	------------

## MUHAMMAD IBRAHIM VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

## **INDEX**

S.N	Descriptions of Documents	Annexure	Page
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Copy of Notification dated	Α	4
3.	Copy of the salary slips of working/Serving month and vacation (deduction period)	B&C	5-6
4.	Copy of Departmental Appeal	D ·	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	, E	8-9
6.	Wakalat Nama		10

**APPELLANT** 

THROUGH:

SHAHID HUSSAIN

**ADVOCATE HIGH COURT** 

CELL NO 03003959446

Note:

Sir,

Spare Copies will be submitted

After submission of the case.

## Before the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Peshawar

Service Appeal No 1476 /2020

Service Tribural

Mr. MUHAMMAD IBRAHIM,QARI(BPS-15) GHSS DHAKKI,CHARSADDA Date 23/11/2020

	APPELL	ANT
•••••	71	711

#### **VERSUS**

- 1. The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 2. The Secretary (E&SE), Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 3. The Secretary finance Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 4. The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.
- 5. The Director (E&SE), Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar.

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION -4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT.1974 AGAINST THE INACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGAL AND UNLAWFUL DEDUCTING THE CONVENCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATION AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENT APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS

### PRAYER,

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed ato-daynot to make deduction of conveyance allowance during the winter & summer vacations and make the payment of all outstanding amount of conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

#### RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary and Secondary Education department as **QARI** (**BPS-15**) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.
- 2. That the conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 20-12-2012 whereby the conveyance Allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were

- enhance / revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance.

  Copy of Notification dated 20/12/2012 are attached as annexure......A
- 3. That appellant was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the respondents without any valid and justifiable reason stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period (Copy of the salary slips of working/ serving month and Vacation Period are Annex B&C)
- 5. That some of the colleagues of the appellant approached to this August Tribunal in different service appeal which was allowed by this Tribunal vide S.A.No. 1452/2019 judgments dated 11/11/2019 and many others cases. (copy judgments dated 11/11/2019 attached as annexure ....E
- 6. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents so far. That feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy file the instant service appeal on the following grounds:-

### **GROUNDS:-**

- a. That the action of the respondents regarding deduction of the conveyance allowance for vacations period/ months is illegal against the law, facts and norms of natural justice.
- b. That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- c. That the action of the respondent is without any legal authority discriminatory and clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to declared is null and void.

- d. That there is cleared difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the civil servant in the light Government servant revised leave rules 1989 while the vacation are always announced by the government, therefore under the law and rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance during vacation period.
- e. That the Government Servant revised leave rules 1989 clearly explained that the civil servant who avail the vacation are allowed only one leave in a month where is the other civil servant may avail 4 days leave in colander months and the same are credit to his account in this way he may to earned leave with fully pay, where is government servants to avail vacations such is appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and 12 days in a year and earned leave for 12 days in a year for credit to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance. The respondent illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from the appellant.
- f. That is the act of the respondent is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but the result of Malafiede on the part of respondents.
- g. That appellant has vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprived the appellant from the conveyance allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental right.
- h. That according to government servant revised leave rules 1989 vacations or holly days are not leave of any kind, therefore the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacation is against the law and rules.
- i. That according Article 38 (e) of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individual including person in the service of federation therefore in the light the said article the appellant is fully entitled for the grant of fully conveyance allowance during vacations.
- j. That the appellant seeks permission of this honorable to raise any other grounds at the time arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

BALILLA BABA A D. IDD A:LIKA

THROUGH:

SHAHID HUSSAIN

ADVOCATE HIGH COURT

### (REGULATION WING) FINANCE DEPARTMENT **СОУЕВИМЕИТ ОF КНУВЕВ РАКНТОИКНИД**



NO. FD/SO/SR-Hy/8-52/2912

Dated Peshawar the; 20-12-2012

MiO17

BANKINGT, Service Interest Name Kithos Pakingth Saff The Chartist Public Service Corrector, Khyber Pakhunkana, Ωē The Regular, Perinawar Hyp Cocy Postumen 8 दालप्रियम्परिक्षत् १९वर्ष्याने ता स्वर्द्धाने स्वर्कात्रकटी है दिवासप्ति । स्वाप्तकृति हिम्मादिनी अने Э Sometime Countries of the control of the second Southerness and the second southerness are second southerness and the second southerness are second southerness and the second southerness are second southerness and the second southerness and the second southerness are second southerness and the second southerness are second southerness and the cursiannial regent in animarange Despetit for the Heldinian 3 Eacherated 1924AN American American Calendrical Palatical and 9 The Secretary to Check Mineses: Knyber Pokinturitime 1. Fire Secretary to Coverney Knyber Pakingshass Ω Ξ The Senior Monther, Bostot of Revision, Khyper Publishmen An Administrative Sectionies to Govi at 1935 bet Pakitunihina 10: <u>जिल्लाम</u> Promhhéeath scrient? The Secretary to Govi, of Knyber Pakhtunshwa,

CONERNMENT BUS 1778 CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE realigns.

15 7000

"ผู้สิยินยนวัน"า

DEMON BY

the following issues. However, the conveyance allowerice for entalloyers in BPS-16 to IPPS-19 of graphic beginnings (morphise of 1-298 to 805-15) with home permission (sometimes) and the second of the second revise the rate of Conveyance Allevance actricable to all the Provincel Civil Servants. Cost: 4 sometime of beseeld proof earl awthrophilist tedyth to anomorphise foothing.

REVISED RATE (PM)	EXISTING BATE (PM)	\$aa <sup></sup>	QN'S
-/004'1'SN	7005 1 98	b-l	1
-\0 <del>1</del> 8.1.29	-/005'Y'88	2-10	7 2
~/0ZZ <sup>*</sup> Z'58	-\000; <u>c</u> 3.2	<u> 57-71</u>	'Ē
-//0601S198	-/000'S'58	<u>67.91</u>	. >

estailies laudito bereziannes neas can even orin etigolite et bris 81 , 11 -898 seculi Consequence Allowance of the above rates are many since be advantage to

Sucretary Figures (barred booss chedidas) Musch 64 anoY

Butted Perform as the 20th florestation, 2013; ATTESTE

Pupper of the advisor of the persons

A Copy is forwarded for information to the

シール

f intiFicetation에를 languith까? (BUYA SĀĪTMI)

# Dist. Govt. KP-Provincial

District Accounts Office Charsadda Monthly Salary Statement (August-2020)

# Personal Information of Mr MOHAMMAD IBRAHIM d/w/s of MAULVI AZAD GUL

Personnel Number: 00370964

CNIC: 1710211379999

NTN:

Date of Birth: 02.07.1977

Entry into Govt. Service: 26.01.2010

Length of Service: 10 Years 07 Months 007 Days

**Employment Category: Vocational Temporary** 

Designation: OARI

80001059-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: CA6039-PRINCIPAL GOVERNMENT HIGHER SECONDA SCHOOL DHAKKI CHARSADA

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center:

GPF A/C No:

Interest Applied: Yes

**GPF** Balance:

134,360,00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For -2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

**BPS: 15** 

Pay Stage: 9

Wage type	Amount	Wage type	
0001 Basic Pay	28,090.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	Amount
210 Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300 Medical Allowance	2.349.00
644 Ph.d / M.Phil Allowance	2,500.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All 2013	1,500.00
199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	386.00	2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	500.00
224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,809.00	2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	2,023.00
264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	2,809.00	5322 Adj Adhoc Relief All 2018	2.809.00
801 Adj Basic Pay	37,240.00	5990 Adj Adhoc Relief All 2017	1,064,00 2,660,00

#### **Deductions - General**

1	Wage type		γ		
2015		Amount	ļ	Wage type	Amount
	GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	
3609	Income Tax	ľ	1	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-600,00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:		3770	Emp.Edd. Fund KPK	
	e Death Comp.	-600,00			0.00

## Deductions - Loans and Advances

				•
Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal	90,000.00	-3,000.00	65,970,00

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable:

1,053.85

Recovered till AUG-2020:

72.00 -

Exempted: 263.25

Recoverable:

718.60

Gross Pay (Rs.):

89,595.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-7,287.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

82,308,00

Payee Name: MOHAMMAD IBRAHIM

Account Number: 000234336014

Bank Details: UNITED BANK LIMITED, 211480 MANDHNI MANDHNI, CHARSADA

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address:

City: cv

Domicile: -

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email: ibraheemhancefl@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9(SERVICES/28.08.2020/19:48:52/v2.0) All amounts are in Pak Rupees

\* Errors & omissions excepted

# Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Charsadda

# Monthly Salary Statement (August-2017)

Personal Information of Mr MOHAMMAD IBRAHIM d/w/s of MAULVI AZAD GUL Personnel Number: 00370964

CNIC: 1710211379999

NTN:

Date of Birth: 02.07.1977

Entry into Govt, Service: 04,02,2004

Length of Service: 13 Years 06 Months 029 Days

**Employment Category: Vocational Temporary** 

Designation: QARI

80001059-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: CA6039-PRINCIPAL GOVERNMENT HIGHER SECONDA SCHOOL DHAKKI CHARSADA

Payroll Section: 001

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center:

GPF A/C No:

Interest Applied: Yes

**GPF** Balance:

132,521.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 6

Wage type		Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	24,100,00	1000 House Rent Allowance	1,566,00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	500,00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	368.00	2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016, 10%	2,023.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	2,410.00	5011 Adj Conveyance Allowance	1,428,00

#### **Deductions** - General

Wage type		Amount Wage type		Amount		
	3015	GPF Subscription - Rs2425	-2,425.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	80,00
	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600,06

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance -
6505	GPF Loan Principal Instal	73,000.00	-6,076.00	0.00

**Deductions - Income Tax** 

Payable:

0.00

Recovered till August-2017:

0.00

Exempted: 0.00

Recoverable:

00:00

Gross Pay (Rs.): 33,895.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-9,826,00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

24,069.00 •

Account Number: 000234336014 Bank Details: UNITED BANK LIMITED, 211480 MANDHNI MANDHNI,

Payee Name: MOHAMMAD IBRAHIM

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

· Balance:

Permanent Address:

City: cv

Domicile: -

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email: ibraheemhaneefl@gmail.com

System generated document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/25.08.2017/11:32:30/v1.1)

All amounts are in Pak Rupees

Errors & omissions excepted

To:

بنجم

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

D (F)

Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED
ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY THE
ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTION, THE
CONVEYANCE, ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER &
SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self-Department and is serving as QARI (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire Satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that conveyance allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effects a notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1-/2011 dated 14/7/2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20/12/2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for the employee working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employee from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justified reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for leave period. One of the employees of education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No 1888 (R) CS/2016 before the federal service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable service Tribunal vide judgment dated 03/12/2018 that I am also the similar employee of education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the similar treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not walling to issued/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period /months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It it is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during winter & summer vacations.

Dated:04.06.2020

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRI **PESHAWAR** 

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar......

#### **VERSUS**

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER SUMMER X. VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted edte-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH:

TESTON FACTS:

21/01/14

Fige Tribunal eshaw*a*j

-1: That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondar education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficienc Killing Paking and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

> That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servant and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 date 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification date 20112.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employed

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt

£.(9)

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present...

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal. Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is dispused of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

Certified to lie ture copy

File be consigned to the record.

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Chairman