# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

Court of

j.

	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1		
L .	2	3
1- <sub>.</sub>	13/01/2021	The appeal presented today by Mr. Akhunzada Asad Iqba Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned
		Member for proper order please.
		Soor SAMS
		<b>REGISTRAR</b>
2-		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put
	*	up there on $02/03/1$
• .		
		MEMBER()
02.0	B.2021	Due to general strike on the call of Khyber
02.0		
		Pakhtunkhwa Bar Counsel, learned counsel for
		appellant is not available today, therefore, the appeal
	• ·	is adjourned to 27.07.2021 on which date file to come
`		up for preliminary arguments before S.B.
	۵	h
÷		
	•	1 m
	- 	(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN)
		(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
		(MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
•		(MUHAMMAÐ JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
- - -		(MUHAMMAÐ JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)
		(MUHAMMAÐ JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

## **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL**

# PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. \_\_\_\_\_ /2020.

# SAFIA NAZ VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

<u>INDEX</u>

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal	·	1-3
2.	Notification	Α	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10.

APPELLANT THROUGH:

AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL

ADVOCATE CELL NO. 03459482710

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO	937	_/2020

Klyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

MST. SAFIA NAZ, CT (BPS-15)	
GGHSS DTIMERGARA, DIR LOWER	

Diary No. 899 Dated 13/1/2021

### VERSUS

....APPELLANT

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar 6-Dist education offices Dis lower RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE 1974 TRIBUNAL ACT, AGAINST THE IMPUGNED OF ACTION RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY **DEDUCTING** THE **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

### <u>PRAYER</u>

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during Filectron dayacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been Registrar deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

# <u>R/SHEWETH</u> ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as CT (BPS-15) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated

- That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

# **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is

applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

THROUGH:

**APPELLANT** SAFIA NA **SAFIA NAZ** 

**AKHUNZADA** ØBAL **ADVOCATE** 



# FINANCE DEPARTMENT

(REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012.

4

THE CIAL

From

	The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa,
	Finance Department
	Peshawar.
To:	
ï	All Administrative Secretaries to Govt. of Klypter Pakhtunkhwa.
2	The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtuskhwa
3	The Secretary to Governor Khyber Pakhsunking
4	The Secretary to Chief Mirveter, Khyber Pakhiunkhwa,
· 5	The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Knyber Pakhturkhwa
6	All Hoods of Altached Departments in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa
7	All District Coordination Officers in Khyder Pakhtunkinva
8.	At Political Agents / District & Sessions Judges in Khyber Pakhankhwa
9.	Registrar, Poshawar High Coon. Poshawar.
10	To Chairman, Public Service Commession, Khyber Fakhlunkhwa,
11.	The Chairman, Services Tribunol, Knybar Pakhuakhwa.
Subject	REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR
	CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINC
	GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provideral Civil Servants, Govt: of Knyber Pakhtunxhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) wielf from 1<sup>et</sup> September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain - Unchanged.

S.NO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
· · · *	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840
، ڊ	11-15	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
4	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	Rs.5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-37, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully, a de. (Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

## Endst: NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

# A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

- Accountant General, Knyber Pakhtunthara, Peshawat
- Secretaries to Government of Punjab, Sinch & Solochistan, Finance Department ÷.
- E All Autonomous / Semi Autonomous Bodies in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa.

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (October-2020)



## Personal Information of Miss SAFIA NAZ d/w/s of AMAN ULLAH

 Personnel Number: 00264185
 CNIC: 10977147640

 Date of Birth: 26.10.1977
 Entry into Govt. Service: 01.03.2000

NTN:

B-5

Length of Service: 20 Years 08 Months 001 Days

Employment Category: Active	Temporary			
Designation: CERTIFICATED T	EACHER	80001486-DISTRICT GC	VERNME	NT KHYBE
DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS TI	IMERGARA	•		
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:		
GPF A/C No: EDUDA012200	Interest Applied: Yes	<b>GPF Balance:</b>		. 320,070.00
Vendor Number: - Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 15	Pay Stage: 14

Wage type		Amount Wage type		Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	34,740.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,349.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	2,856.00	1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00
1923	UAA-OTHER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00	2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	705.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	476.00	2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,448.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,474.00	2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,474.00
2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	3,474.00		•	0.00

#### **Deductions - General**

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount `
3015	GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00
3609	Income Tax	-244.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00		· · · ·	0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Loan		Descri	iption	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
6505	GPF Loan	Principal Instal		250,000.00	-8,000.00	130,000.00
<b>Deductio</b> r Payable:	n <b>s - Incom</b> e 3,754.7		ed till October-2020:	869.00 Exempted	l: 938.07 Recovera	ble: 1,947.68
Gross Pay	y (Rs.):	56,496.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-12,459.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 44,0	037.00
Account I Bank Det	VER., TIME	A 182-8 DNAL BANK C	OF PAKISTAN, 232010 T Availed:	FAIMARGARA BAZAI Earned:	R, DIR LOWER. TAIMA Balance:	RGARA BAZAR,
Permaner	nt Address:	VILL.MIAN BA	NDA			
City: DIR	R LOWER		Domicile: NW - Kł	1yber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status	: No Official
Temp. Ac	ddress:			$\wedge$		-
City:			Email:	ATTEST	ED.	

(265994/26.10.2020/21:02:06) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted





#### Personal Information of Miss SAFIA NAZ d/w/s of AMAN ULLAH

Personnel Number: 00264185 Date of Birth: 26.10.1977 CNIC: 10977147640 Entry into Govt. Service: 01.03.2000 NTN:

C- 6

Length of Service: 19 Years 11 Months 001 Days

Employment Category: Active	Temporary			
Designation: CERTIFICATED	TEACHER	80001486-DISTRICT GO	OVERNME	NT KHYBE
DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS T	IMERGARA			
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:		
GPF A/C No: EDUDA012200	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:		196,619.00
Vendor Number: -				
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 15	Pay Stage: 14

Wage type		Amount Wage type		Amount	
0001	Basic Pay	34,740.00	1000 House Rent	Allowance	2,349.00
1300	Medical Allowance	1,500.00	1923 UAA-OTH	ER 20%(1-15)	1,000.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	705.00	2199 Adhoc Reli	ef Allow @10%	476.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,448.00	2224 Adhoc Relie	ef All 2017 10%	3,474.00
2247		3,474.00	2264 Adhoc Reli	ef All 2019 10%	3,474.00

#### **Deductions - General**

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount	
3015	GPF Subscription	-2,890.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-600.00	
3609	Income Tax	-146.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-125.00	
	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-600.00			0.00	

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Loan	Description		Principal amount		Deduction		Balance		
6505 ·	GPF Loan Principal Instal		250,000.00		-8,000.00		202,000.00		
Deductio Payable: Gross Pa	ns - Incom 2,465. y (Rs.):		ed till January-2020: Deductions: (Rs.):	1,121.00 <b>-12,361.</b> (	Exempted	: 616.10 Net Pay: (Rs.	Recoverat ): 41,2	ole: 2 <b>79.00</b>	728.60
Payee Name: SAFIA NAZ Account Number: C/A 182-8 Bank Details: NATIONAL BANK OF PAKISTAN, 232010 TAIMARGARA BAZAR, DIR LOWER. TAIMARGARA BAZAR, DIR LOWER., TIMERGARA									

Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:
	opening zeneree.			

*		
Permanent Address: VILL.MI.	AN BANDA	
City: DIR LOWER	Domicile: NW - Khyper Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		
City:	Email:	
	ESTER	
	TTEV	

(265994/24.01.2020/12:51:43) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

 $\mathbf{v}$ 

# DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

#### **Respected Sir**,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as CT (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: S / 2020

Your Obediently

SAFIA NAZ

#### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA

1. (1)

Conust H

APPELL

8 F 4

Khyber

PESHAWAR

# APPEAL NO. 1452 12013

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

# VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

#### APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ILLEGALLY AND RESPONDENTS ΞY . THE OF ACTION ALLOWANCE UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE. THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

# PRAYER:

2-4/18.1.1.9.

2 X R

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted dedto-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

# R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance or employees 11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appeilant.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Govt :: 12-2

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

1. M3

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record. ALKEN

ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019

Carffient

Pestawa

# VAKALATNAMA

## **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR**

\_OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

SAFIA NAZ\_

(PETITIONER)

(PLAINTIFF)

## **VERSUS**

(RESPONDENT)

(DEFENDANT)

Education Department

I/We SAFIA NAZ \_\_\_\_\_\_do hereby appoint and constitute **AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL**, **Advocate**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. 17 / 12 /2020

-IANA **CL**IENT <u>АССЕРТ</u> AKHUNZADA ASAD IOBAL 469487710 ADVOCATE