Learned counsel for the appellant present. Heard.

3.02.2020

The appellant has filed the present service appeal against the working in school/college during vacations period.

Learned counsel for the appellant stated at the bar that identical nature Service Appeal No.1452/2019 has already been disposed of by this Tribunal vide order dated 11.11.2019. Learned counsel for the appeal may also be being an identical nature case, the present service appeal may also be disposed of in terms of the said order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal No.1452/2019.

Order dated 11.11.2019 of this Tribunal passed in Service Appeal No.1452/2019 perused. Judgment dated 03.12.2018 passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No.1888(R)CS/2016 and judgment dated 01.10.2019 of the Hon'ble Peshawar High Court Peshawar in Writ Petition No.3162-P/2019 referred to in the order dated 11.11.2019 in Service Appeal No.1452/2019, also gone through and plea taken by the learned counsel for the appellant is found genuine. Consequently the instant in.Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in.Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed for the spheral is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in.Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated 11.11.2019 passed in Service Appeal is also disposed of in terms of order dated by the respondent of Petition 3162-P/2019 shall be honored and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time.

This may also be observed that perusal of the judgment of Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No.1888(R) CS/2016 reflects that in an identical nature case, the Federal Service Tribunal has held that the conveyance allowance is payable to the appellants w.e.f the vacations of the year when the departmental appeal/representation was filed by the appellants.

File be consigned to the record room.

13.02.2020

Member (J) (IndguM bimaH bemmaduM)

Form-A

FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

2018 /2019

Case No.___ Order or other proceedings with signature of judge or Magistrate S.No. Date of order Proceedings 2 3 1 20.12.2019 The present appeal submitted today by Mr. Noor 1 Muhammad Khattak Advocate, may be entered in the institution register and put up to the Worthy Chairman for proper order please. REGISTRAR 2 This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put up there on 09.01.2020. **CHAIRMAN** Junior to counsel for the appellant present. 09.01.2020 Requests for adjournment due to general strike of the Bar. Adjourned to 13.02.2020 before S.B. Chairman

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 2019_/2019

SALEH REHMAN

EDUCATION DEPTT:

INDEX

VS

| S.NO. | DOCUMENTS | ANNEXURE | PAGE |
|-------------|---------------------------|----------|---------|
| 1. | Memo of appeal | ••••• | 1- 3. |
| 2. | Stay application | ••••• | 4. |
| 3. ` | Notification | A | 5, |
| 4. | Pay slips | B&C | 6- 7. |
| 5. | Departmental appeal | D | 8. |
| 6. | Judgment | E | 9- 15. |
| 7. | Service Tribunal judgment | F | 16- 17. |
| 8. | Vakalat nama | ••••• | 18. |

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

NOOR MUHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE

Room No. 3 & 4, Upper Floor, Islamia Club Building, Khyber Bazar, Peshawar 0345-9383141

Note:

Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 2018 /2019

Mr. Saleh Rehman, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Darora, Dir Upper.

Berther Pakhtukhwa Berther Trikanal Mary N.2137 Dared 20-12-19

......APPELLANT

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

......RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE **RESPONDENTS BY** ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE APPELLANT DURING OF THE WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE **DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.**

PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

<u>R/SHEWETH:</u> <u>ON FACTS:</u>

- 1- That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as SCT (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil Servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

- 5- That some of colleagues of the appellant approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeal which was allowed by this august Tribunal vide its judgment dated 11.11.2019. Copy of the judgment is attached as annexure.....**F**.
- 6- That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E- That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspects and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for.

SALEH REHMAN THROUGH: NOOR MOHA MMAD KHATTAK MIR ZAMAN SAFI ADVOCATES

BETTER COPY PAGE-5

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGUALTION WING)

NO.FD/SO(SR-II)/52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20.12.2012

From

The Secretary to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Finance Department, Peshawar.

To:

1. All administrative Secretaries to Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

3. The Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

4. The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. The Secretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

6. All Heads of attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

7. All District Coordination Officers of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

8. All Political Agents/District & Session Judge in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

9. The Registrar Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.

10. The Chairman Public Service Commission, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

11. The Chairman, Service Tribunal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject: **REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE** CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL **GOVERNMENT BPS-1-19**

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance/revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1st September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain unchanged.

| S.No. BPS | | Existing Rate (PM) | Revised Rate (PM) | |
|-----------|-------|--------------------|-------------------|--|
| 1. | 1-4 | Rs. 1,500/- | Rs. 1,700/- | |
| 2. | 5-10 | Rs. 1,500/- | Rs. 1,840/- | |
| 3. | 11-15 | Rs. 2,000/- | Rs. 2,720/- | |
| 4. | 16-19 | Rs. 5,000/- | Rs. 5,000/- | |

2. Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-17, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicle.

> Your Faithfully (Sahibzada Saeed Ahmad) Secretary Finance

ATTESTED

Endst No. FD/SO(SR-II)8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PARHTUNKHWA FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

| From | |
|--------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | The Secretary to Govt, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, |
| | Finance Department, |
| | <u>Penhawar</u> |
| Tô: | |
| - | All Adavisistrative Secretaries to Gove of Firster Pakittenthwa. |
| - <u>-</u> - | The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Whyper Pakhtubidiwa |
| 5.1 | The Secretary to Governey Knyber Pakhtuakawa |
| ** | The Secretary to Chief Misseer, Khyber Pakhtankiwa, |
| <u> </u> | The Societary, Provincial Ascentry, Khyber Pakalurkhya |
| 卷. | All Heads of Atrached Departments in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| 1 | AF District Coordination Officersult Xhyber Pakhtunkhiva. |
| <u>ت</u> | Al Political Agents (District & Somions Judges in Klyber Paklitunkhwa |
| Ŧ | The Registry, Resoaws/High Costs, Peshinar ; |
| | The Chairman Public Service Conversion, Knyber Pokhturkowa. |
| . • | The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Katydar Fiskhlurakhwa |
| 网络 网络 | OCHTETON THE THE DATE OF THURSDRY NET ALLOHIANCE END |

Sobject

REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sir.

The Government of Khybe: Pakhturähwa has been pleased to enhance (revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) will from 1⁻² September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-15 to BPS-29 will remain unchanged.

| S.NO | BPS | EXISTING RATE (PM) | REVISED RATE (PM) |
|-----------|-------|--------------------|-------------------|
| 1. | 1-4 | Rs. 1, 500/- | Rs.1,700/- |
| 2. | 5-10 | Rs.1,500/- | Rs.1,840/- |
| 3. | 11-15 | Rs.2,000/- | Rs.2,720/- |
| <u></u> , | 16-19 | Rs.5,000/ | R\$.5,000/; |

2 Conveyance Allowance of the above rates per month shall be admissible to those SPS-17, 18 and 19 officies who have not been sanctioned allicial vehicles.

Yours Faithfully,

(Sahibzada Saood Alimad) Secretary Finance

Endst: NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012

Dated Pestawar the 20th December, 201 ATTESTED

A Copy is forwarded for information to thet-

- Accountant General, Kayber Paklitusiking, Pesinawar
- Secretation to Golden transit of Punjab, Solid & Salbonestan, Fénanso Department All Autoromous / Senj Autonomous Bodies, in Khyper Pakhtunkhwa

(INTIAZ AYUB) Additional Secretary (Read)

| Mo | Dist. Govt. N District Account nthly Salary Sta | nts Office Dir I | Jpper | 9) | Q Q Q | | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|------------------------|------------------|
| | 1.111.0.4.1134.4.8 | | | | D-6 | | |
| Personal Information of Mr SA | CNIC: 107721 | | SHER | NTN | | | 1 |
| Personnel Number: 00277465 Date of Birth: 04.10.1972 | | 40029 1 1. Service: 15. | 11.1999 | | | Years 03 M | onths 015 Days 📡 |
| Employment Category: Vocation Designation: SENIOR CERTIFI | | · · | 800019 | 37-DISTRICT | GOVERNMENT | KHYBE | |
| DDO Code: DP6048-H.M GHS | | | | | | | |
| Payroll Section: 001 | GPF Section: (| 002 | Cash C | enter: 31 | | | |
| GPF A/C No: EDUDP000416 | Interest Applie | d: Yes | | GPF Balanc | e: l | 83,207.00 | |
| Vendor Number: - | | | | | | | |
| Pay and Allowances: | Pay scale: BP | S For - 2017 | Pay So | cale Type: Civi | il BPS: 16 | Pay Sta | ige: 15 |
| Wage type | 1 | Amount | | w | age type | | Amount |
| 0001 Basic Pay | 1 . | 41,710.00 | 1000 | House Rent A | llowance | | 2,727.00 |
| 1924 UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G | /NG) | 1,500.00 | 2148 | 15% Adhoc R | elief All-2013 | | 940.00 |
| 2175 Medical Allowance | | 1,688.00 | 2199 | Adhoc Relief | Allow @10% | | 633.00 |
| 1221.1 Adhoe Relief All 2016 10 | 0% | 3,252.00 | 2224 | Adhoc Relief | All 2017 10% | | 4,171.00 |
| 2247 Adhoc Rehef Aff 2018 1 | 0% | 4,171.00 | | | | | 0.00 |
| Date of Birdh: 04 10.1972 Deductions - General | | | | | | | |
| Wage type | • • • | Amount | | W | age type | | Amount |
| 3016 GPF Subscription - Rs33 | | -3,340.00 | 3501 | Benevolent Fi | | | -800.00 |
| 3609 Income Tax | | -50.00 | 3990 | | · · · · | | -150.00 |
| 4004 R Benefits & Death Con | | -1,089.00 | | | | | 0.00 |
| Vendor Nambo Deductions - Loans and Advar | | 4 <u> </u> | | | | | |
| | Description | | Princi | pal amount | Deduction | | Balance |
| 6505 T GPF Loan Principal | | | | 00.00 | -10,000.00 | | 300,000.00 |
| Phyabic lenical 2000.00 | covered till FEB- ≃∼) Deducti | 2019: 40(ons: (Rs.): |).00 -15 ,42 9 | Exempted: .00 i | 400.00 Re Net Pay: (Rs.): | coverable: 45,363.0 | 200.00 90 |
| Payee Name: SAISH RAHMA) Account Number: 3437-6 Bank Details: HABIB BANK L 3016 GPT Subscription - Rs3 Leavestacome Opening Balance 1904 R. Benerits & Deatl, Con | JMITED, 22153 | 8 DARORA, U iled: | | R. DARORA, | UPPER DIR., UP Balance | | |
| Permanent Address: VILL DARORA DIR City: DIRPROPER Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Housing Status: No Official Temp?/Address: | | | | | | | |
| GIGS GPF Loan Principal | | l: salehrahmans | critægn | | | • | |
| Deductions - Income Tax Fayable: 1,000.00 Re | د. در | | | A | TESTEL |) | |
| Gross Pay (R5.): 60,792.0 | 0. | ; | | M | U | | |
| Payce Name: SALIH RAHMAN Account Number: 3437-6 System generalied document in accordance with APPM 4.6.12.9 (SERVICES/27.02.2019/16:24:33/v1.1) * All amounts are in Pak Rupees * Errors & omissions excepted Leaves: Opening Datance | | | | | | | |
| Periniment Address: VII L DA City: DIRPROPER Temp. Address. | к.J | | | | | | • • |

s.

.

City:

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial **District Accounts Office Dir Upper** Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019)





Personal Information of Mr SALIH RAHMAN d/w/s of NOWSHER KHAN

Personnel Number: 00277465 Date of Birth: 04.10.1972'

CNIC: 10772140629 Entry into Govt. Service: 15.11.1999

NTN:

Length of Service: 19 Years 08 Months 018 Days

Employment Category: Vocational Temporary Designation: CERTIFICATED TEACHER 80001937-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: DP6048-H.M GHS DARORA Payroll Section: 001 GPF Section: 002 Cash Center: 31 GPF A/C No: EDUDP000416 Interest Applied: Yes **GPF Balance:** 249,907.00 Vendor Number: -Pay and Allowances: Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 16 Pay Stage: 15

| Wage type | Amount | Wage type | Amount | |
|---------------------------------|-----------|--------------------------------|----------|--|
| 0001 Basic Pay | 41,710.00 | 1000 House Rent Allowance | 2,727.00 | |
| 1210 Convey Allowance 2005 | 5,000.00 | 1924 UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G/NG) | 1,500.00 | |
| 2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013 | 940.00 | 2175 Medical Allowance | 1,688.00 | |
| 24291 Adboo Reliet Allowi@10% | 633.00 | 2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10% | 3,252.00 | |
| 2224 AdiverReliefAH720,675 10% | 4,171.00 | 2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10% | 4,171.00 | |
| 2264 Aubre: Reliaf All 2019 10% | 4,171.00 | | 0.00 | |

Deductions & Generaly: Vocation

| Amount | Wage type | Amount |
|-----------|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| -3,340.00 | 3501 Benevolent Fund | -800.00 |
| -549.00 | | |
| -1.089.00 | | -150.00 |
| | -3,340.00 | -3,340.00 3501 Benevolent Fund -549.00 3990 Emp.Edu, Fund KPK |

Pay and Matwinees: Deductions - Lotins and Advances

| Loan Description Description | ption | Principal amount | Deduction | D . I. |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 6505 GPF Loan-Principal Instal | | 340,000.00 | -10,000.00 | Balance 250,000.00 |
| Deductions - Theome Tax All-20 Payable directions - Theome Tax Payable directions - Theome Tax Payable direction - Mig64 0510 w (Recover 2014 Adduce Relief All 2017 102 Gross Pay (Rs) direction - A69,963,00 | | 9.00 Exempted: -15,928.00 M | 4385.20 Recoverat | |
| Payee Nume: SALIH RAHMAN Account Number: 3437-6 Bank Details: HABIB BANK LIMIT 615 OFF Subscription Leaves Acoust Opening Balance: 2004 R. Bertefits & Leath Corri | ED, 221538 DARORA, U Availed: | JPPER DIR. DARORA, 1 Earned: | UPPER DIR., UPPER D Balance: | IR |
| Permanent Address: MILL DARORA City: DIRPROPER Tempilia ddress: 44 [City5] Citi 1 (200 Princip (10) City5] Citi 1 (200 Princip (10) Constitute - Sarque T). Fryable: 10(20195) Press Cross ring (Raft) Cyrad (20) Fryce Name: GAT [11 R (2004)] | Domicile: NW - Khy Email: | ATTA | Housing Status: | No Official |
| (288457/97:08:2019/12:37:11) 2) All amon Bank Demils: HABIB Brotskiller Verwes: Opening reduced | nts are in Pak Rupees 3) Er. | rors & omissions excepted | | |

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE Subject: IMPUGNED THE CONCERNED ACTION OF AUTHORITY RV ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY тне DEDUCTING **CONVEYANCE** ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER æ SUMMER VACATIONS

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SCT (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS 1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R) CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & summer vacations.

Dated: 28.08.2019

ATTESTED

r Obediently

SALEH REHMAN, SCT GHS[®]Darora, Dir Upper

Judgment Sheet

E- (9)

IN THE PESHAWAR HIGH COURT, PESHAWAR, JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

Writ Petition No. 3162-P/2019 Akhtar Hussain and 697 others..vs..Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

JUDGMENT

Date of hearing......01.10.2019..... Petitioner(s) by Mr. Noor Mohammad Khattak, Advocate. Mr. Mujahid Ali Khan, AAG, for respondents.

<u>ROOH-UL-AMIN KHAN, J:-</u> Through this common judgment we, proposed to decided the instant as well as the connected writ petitions as all having involved common question of law and facts, the particulars of which are given below.

i.

ii.

iii.

iv.

Juidan

WP No. 3162-P/2019 titled Akhtar Hussain etc..vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3064-P/2019 titled Habeeb Ullah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

WP No. 3084-P/2019 titled Sikandar Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3178-P/2019 titled Abdur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others. ATTESTED

M

EXAMINER Peshawar High Court WP No. 3233-P/2019 titled Amjid Ali etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

. . .

vi.

viii.

ix.

x.

xi.

xii.

Ø

10

WP No. 3283-P/2019 titled Gul Saeed etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

 vii. WP No. 3287-P/2019 titled Syed Israr Shah etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 7 others.

WP No. 3288-P/2019 titled Firdous Khanetc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

WP No. 3353-P/2019 titled Hafiz Inam Ur Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

WP No. 3366-P/2019 titled Jehanzeb Khan etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief

WP No. 3390-P/2019 titled Haji Rehman etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 2 others.

WP No. 3520-P/2019 titled Mohammad Khalid etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

₩ ESTED EXAMINER Peshawar High Court

ATTESTED

xiii. WP No. 3567-P/2019 titled Husnur Rehman etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 3 others.

Ð

xiv. WP No. 3667-P/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

xv. WP No. 3939-P/2019 titled Syed Khurshid Shah etc...Vs.. Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Peshawar and 5 others.

xvi. WP No. 4072-P/2019 titled Subhan Ullah etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 6 others.

XVII. WP No. 4758-P/2019 titled Sohrab Hayat etc...Vs..
Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief
Secretary, Peshawar and 4 others.

2. As per averments of the writ petition, the petitioners are serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department on their respective posts. On 14.7.2011 the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa enhanced the the second response allowance to all the Civil Servants i.e. from BPS-1 to 15, including the petitioners, which was subsequently revised vide another notification dated 20.12.2012 and was further ATTESTED enhanced. But the respondents without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped / deducted the payment of conveyance

ATTESTED

Peshawar High Court

, Par

allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period.

3. In essence, the grievance the petitioners is that they were receiving the conveyance allowance under the notifications mentioned above, which was stopped without any justifiable reason.

4. Since the matter pertain to grant of conveyance allowance which is part and parcel of pay. Similar controversy came before this Court in Writ Petition No. 3509-P/2014 titled (Hafiz Mohammad Ilyas etc...vs..Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), wherein the pay and salary were defined in the following manner.

"7. To resolve the controversy as to whether payment of allowances to a civil servant falls in chapter-2 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 i.e. terms and conditions of service, it is necessary to reproduce the definition of "pay" provided in section 2(e) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973 which reads as under:

"2. (e)—"Pay" means the amount drawn monthly by a civil servant as pay, and includes special pay, personal pay and any <u>other</u> <u>emoluments</u> declared by the prescribed authority to be paid." (emphasis provided).

The word "emolument" used in the above quoted definition clause of the Civil Servants Act, 1973, according to its dictionary meaning, denotes wages and benefits received as compensation for

at

TESTED

EXAMINER leshawar High Court

holding an office or having employment. The word emolument is basically derived from the Latin word emolumentum. It originally meant "the sum paid to a miller for grinding a customer wheat". Today, the term exists mostly as a bit of archaic legalese, but it might be within the route of expression i.e. "grinding out a living". From the above it is emoluments are essentially the manifest that benefits that one gets from the working of being employed. Emolument is the profit from employment and is compensation in return of services, hence the emoluments are part and parcel of pay. Section 17 being part of chapter-2 i.e. terms and conditions of service of a civil servant provides that, a civil servant appointed to a post shall be entitled, in accordance with rules, to the pay sanctioned for the post. Likewise, Rule 9(21) of (FR/SR) provide, the definition of pay which means the amount drawn monthly by a government servant. as; Elin na .

Ð

ATTESTED

M

VTESTED

EXAMINER Peshawar High Court

(i) the pay, other than special pay or pay granted in view of his personal qualification, which has been sanctioned for the post held by him substantively of in an officiating capacity, or to which he is entitled by reason of his position in a cadre, and (ii) overseas pay, technical pay, special pay and personal pay and

(iii) any other emoluments which may be specially classed as pay by the governor general.

The legislature in its wisdom has wisely used the word "pay" instead of salary in definition clause and section 17 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973. The word 'pay' connotes payment of wages including emolument in broader spectrum while the salary is used for amount that one receives in return for work and or service provided, which is paid periodically i.e. over a specified interval of time such as weekly or most commonly monthly. The term "salary" has been dealt with at page-553 of Corpus Juris Secundem Vol. 77 as under:-

<u>"Salary"</u>. The word "Salary" is defined has meaning fixed compensation regularly paid by the year, quarter, month or week; fixed compensation for regular work, or for continuous services over a period of time; periodical compensation for services; compensation for services rendered; per annum compensation mean in official and in some other situation, or station; legal compensation.

Salary is also defined as meaning stipulated periodical recompense; or consideration paid, for stipulated to be paid to a person on regular interval. for services usually a fixed sum to be paid by the year or half year, quarter; reward or consideration paid or agreed to be paid to a person on a regular intervals by the year, month or week for services; reward of fixed or recompense for services rendered or performed; reward or compensation of services, rendered or performed.

From the above mentioned definition it is manifest that the "salary" of a civil servant is a fixed amount regularly paid as compensation to the employee, whereas the pay means an amount received by a civil servant including other emoluments i.e. allowances."

ESTED

ATTESTED

5. Besides, certain other petitions filed by the Teachers /employees of the same department serving from other corners of the province which were decided by Abbottabad Bench of this Court, wherein it was held that the conveyance allowance being part of pay fall in terms and conditions of civil servant and it can adequately be claimed through an appeal by adopting the prescribed procedure under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1974.

Ø8

ATTESTED

6. For the reasons given hereinabove, the petitioners are civil servants and their claim falls in terms and conditions of service enumerated in Chapter-2 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973, wherein the jurisdiction of this Court is expressly barred by Article 212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. Resultantly, this and the connected writ petition mentioned above stand dismissed being not maintainable. However, the petitioners are liberty to approach the proper forum, if so desire.

Announced on; 1st of October, 2019 <u>*Jarshod*</u>

JUDGE JUDGE

(DB) Mr. Justice Rooh UI Amin Khan & Mr. Justice Mohammad Naccm Anwar

CERTIFIED TO BE TRUE COPY 2 1 QCT 2019

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
 - RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ILLEGALLY AND OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ACTION UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE SUMMER APPELLANT DURING WINTER - & THE OF VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE DEPARTMENTAL STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

KISHEWETH:

ON FACTS:

2-4/12.

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Fledte-daypreviously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which

this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

> 1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

ৰ ৰাদ্য জাতা

 EX_{A}

Khyhe

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Markad Hayat vs Gort

11.11.2019

artifien +

Peshawar

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

ATTESTED

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record. AIL ESZEL ANNOUNCED 11.11.2019 <u>p</u>r:

VAKALATNAMA

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2019

Saleh Rehman

(APPELLANT) ___(PLAINTIFF) (PETITIONER)

VERSUS

Education Department

(RESPONDENT) __(DEFENDANT)

I/We Saleh Rehman

Do hereby appoint and constitute **NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK**, **Advocate**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated.____/2019

CLIENT ACCEPTED NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK MIR ZAMAN SAFI ADVOCATES

OFFICE: Flat No.3, Upper Floor, Islamia Club Building, Khyber Bazar, Peshawar City. Mobile No.0345-9383141