# Form-A

# FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of

Case No.-

947 12021

S.No. Date of order Order or other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings 2 1 3 The appeal presented today by Mr. Akhunzada Asad Iqbal 1-13/01/2021 Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. RÉGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2up there on 213/21MEMBER(J) Due to general strike on the call of Khyber 02.03.2021 Pakhtunkhwa Bar Counsel, learned counsel for appellant is not available today, therefore, the appeal is adjourned to 27.07.2021 on which date file to come up for preliminary arguments before S.B. (MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

# **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL**

# **PESHAWAR**

# APPEAL NO. \_\_\_\_\_ /2020.

# SAMIN GUL VS EDUCATION DEPTT:

**INDEX** 

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	A	<b>4</b> .
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	<b>D</b>	7
5	Service Tribunal judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10

# APPELLANT

THROUGH:

Adreacate High Count

AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL

ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 03459482710 SYED JAUD SHAH

Note:

Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

## **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL**

PESHAWAR APPEAL NO. \_/2020 MST. SAMIN GUL, SS (BPS-17) GIGHSSTIMERGIARA DIRLOWER

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Trikunal 906

## VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5-The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar 6-DISH encation Officer Dir lower RESPONDENTS

**APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE** ACT. 1974 AGAINST **TRIBUNAL** THE **IMPUGNED** ACTION OF THE **RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND** UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

### PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

# <u>R/SHEWETH</u> ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as **SS (BPS-17)** quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

## **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is

applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

> APPELLANT مکسٹن کی SAMIN GUL THROUGH:

AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL

**ADVOCATE** 



From

# FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department, Peshawar. To: All Administrative Socketaries to GovL of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 1 2 The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhag Ĵ The Secretary to Governor Khyber Pakhtunkowa 4 The Secretary to Chiel Misseer, Khybes Pakhtankhwa, 5 The Sacretary, Provincial Assembly, Khyber Pakhlurkhwa б All Heads of Attached Departments in Knytter Pakhbucktivia 7 An District Coordination Officensin Khyber Pakhtun, mva Е. At Political Agenta / District & Sessions Judges in Khyber Pakitunkhwa Ð. The Registrer, Peshewar High Coort, Peshawar, The Chairman, Public Service Conversion, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 10. 11. The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Khybo: Pakhtunkhwa. Subject REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. PROVINCIAL

Dechiar.

1.40	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
	1-4	Rs. 1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u>2,</u>	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
<u>3</u> .	11-15	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
4.	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	Rs.5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shell be admissible to those BPS-37, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles

Yours Faithfully, (Sahibzada Sacod Ahmad) Secretary Finance

## Endst: NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawar the 20th December, 2012

# A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

**GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19** 

- 1. Accountant General Knyber Pakhtunkhaw, Peshawar
- Secretaries to Government of Punjeb, Soch & Satorissian, Finance Department.
- I All Autonomous / Semi Autonomous Bodies in Knyber Pakhtunkhwa

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (October-2020)



110

### Personal Information of Mrs SAMIN GUL d/w/s of SAHIBUR RAHMAN

Personnel Number: 00263041 Date of Birth: 27.02.1967 CNIC: 1530208821648 Entry into Govt. Service: 16.09.1989 NTN:

B-5

Length of Service: 31 Years 01 Months 017 Days

#### **Employment Category: Active Temporary** Designation: SUBJECT SPECIALIST 80001486-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS TIMERGARA Payroll Section: 001 GPF Section: 001 Cash Center: Interest Applied: Yes **GPF Balance:** 734,977.00 GPF A/C No: EDUDA006024 Vendor Number: -Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 Pay Scale Type: Civil BPS: 17 Pay Stage: 20 **Pay and Allowances:**

	Wage type	Amount	Amount Wage type		Amount
0001	Basic Pay	76,370.00	0046	Personal Pay(Maxim Grade)	2,300.00
1000	House Rent Allowance	4,433.00	1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00
1925	UAA-OTHER 20%(17-22)	2,000.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	3,234.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,640.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	1,178.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	6,018.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	7,867.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	7,867.00	2265	Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	3,933.00

#### **Deductions - General**

Wage type		Amount	Wage type	Amount
3017	GPF Subscription	-4,270.00	3501 Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-3,513.00	3990 Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00		0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Loan		Descript	tion	Principa	al amount	Dedu	ction	Balance
<b>Deductions</b> Payable:	<b>5 - Income Tax</b> 55,708.30	Recovered	till October-2020:	13,678.00	Exempted	l: 13926.94	Recovera	able: 28,103.3
Gross Pay	(Rs.): 121,8	340.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-9,733.00	)	Net Pay: (R	s.): 112	2,107.00
Account N	ne: SAMIN GUI umber: PLS 141 ils: THE BANK	6-6	ER, 080029 TIMARC	GARA LOWEI	R DIR TIM	ARGARA LC	WER DIR	, Lower Dir
Leaves:	Opening B	alance:	Availed:	Earne	ed:	Ba	lance:	

Permanent Address: VILLAGE YAR KH	HAN BANDAPO KHUNGI BALA TEH	
City: DIR LOWER	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:		
City:	Email: ATTESTED	

(265994/26.10.2020/21:02:06) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (January-2020)



## Personal Information of Mrs SAMIN GUL d/w/s of SAHIBUR RAHMAN

 Personnel Number: 00263041
 CNIC: 1530208821648

 Date of Birth: 27.02.1967
 Entry into Govt. Service: 16.09.1989

Length of Service: 30 Years 04 Months 017 Days

- 6

NTN:

Employment Category: Active	Temporary					
Designation: SUBJECT SPECIA	80001486-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE					
DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS T	IMERGARA					
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:				
GPF A/C No: EDUDA006024	Interest Applied: Yes	<b>GPF</b> Balance:		622,146.00		
Vendor Number: -						
Pay and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 17	Pay Stage: 20		

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	76,370.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	4,433.00
1925	UAA-OTHER 20%(17-22)	2,000.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	3,234.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,640.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	1,178.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	6,018.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	7,637.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	7,637.00	2265	Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	3,818.00

#### **Deductions - General**

Wage type		Amount		Wage type	Amount
3017	GPF Subscription	-4,270.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-3,134.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00			0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

Loan		Descri	ption	Principal amount	t Deduction	Balance
<b>Deductions</b> Payable:	- Income 49,258		ed till January-2020:	21,275.00 Exempte	ed: 12314.25 Recover	able: 15,668.90
Gross Pay (	Rs.):	113,965.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-9,354.00	Net Pay: (Rs.): 104	,611.00
Payee Nam Account Nu Bank Detail	ımber: PI	LS 1416-6	3ER, 080029 TIMARG	ARA LOWER DIR TIN	MARGARA LOWER DIR	, Lower Dir
Leaves:	Open	ing Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
Dermonent	Address:		KHAN BANDAPO K	UNCIDALATEL		
City: DIR L		VILLAGE TAK		hyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Statu	s: No Official
Temp. Add				aryoor r akitalikirwa	Housing Statu	
City:			Email:			
				TTESTER		

(265994/24.01.2020/12:51:43) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

Subject:

# DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

## **Respected** Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SS (BPS-17) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. **Copy attached**. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 0? /10/2020

HILESTED

Your Obediently

SAMIN GUL

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA

PESHAWAR

# APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019

H ISTURG

500

EXAMINER

Khyber

10/201 Mr. Maqsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), APPELL GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

# VERSUS

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND THE OF ACTION UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER OF THE APPELLANT VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

# PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount Conveyance allowance which have been deducted Redte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which 0. awarded in this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be Registrar favor of the appellant. -4/18.1.19

# R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

のない。日本のないないないないないので、

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees 11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marked Hayat vs Gort

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protractover a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3162-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

1. 4/2

0.0

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record.

AI VESZ

Ð,

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

Carffert

Peshawaa

## VAKALATNAMA

## **BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR**

OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

SAMIN GUL

\_\_\_\_(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

<u>VERSUS</u>

(RESPONDENT)

(DEFENDANT)

Education Department

I/We SAMIN GUL \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ do hereby appoint and constitute **AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL**, **Advocate**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. <u>13</u> / <u>17</u> /202

CLIENT.

ACCEPTED / AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL ADVOCATE

SUED SAUD SHAH Aduacate High Court