FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Form- A

Court of

Case No.-S.No. Date of order Order of other proceedings with signature of judge proceedings 1 2 3 The appeal presented today by Mr. Akhunzada Asad Iqbal 13/01/2021 1-Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learned Member for proper order please. REGISTRAR This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be put 2up there on _O h MEMBER(J) Due to general strike on the call of Khyber 02.03.2021 Pakhtunkhwa Bar Counsel, learned counsel for appellant is not available today, therefore, the appeal is adjourned to 27.07.2021 on which date file to come up for preliminary arguments before S.B. ſ (MUHAMMAD JAMAL KHAN) MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL

PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. /2020.

SAMINA JABEEN VS

EDUCATION DEPTT:

<u>INDEX</u>

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE ,
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	· A	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat nama		10
	· · ·		

APPELLANT THROUGH:

AKHUNZADA ASAD IOBAL

ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 03459498 710

Note: Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted After submission of the case.

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE	TRIBUNAL
PESHAWAR	
APPEAL NO. 929 /2020 MST. SAMINA JABEEN, SET (BPS-16) SET IMERGARA APPELLANT	Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal Diary No. <u>895</u> 18/112021
	Dated

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar 6-Distleducation officer Dis lower RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE <u>1974</u> OF TRIBUNAL ACT. AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION THE **RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY** DEDUCTING тне **CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER** VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during -Clavacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been

Fagededucted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

<u>R/SHEWETH</u> ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-1 to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-16 to 19 have been treated

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

GROUNDS:

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is

applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981 while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.

- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
- J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

THROUGH:

APRELLANT . sole Samina SAMINA JABEÉN AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL

ADVOCATE



FINANCE DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NO. FD/30(SR-IIN8-62/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012.

From

	The Secretary to Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department, <u>Peshawar</u> .
Tó:	
ĩ	All Administrative Sockearies to Govi of Kiryter (Pakhtunkhwa,
Ξ	The Servor Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
	The Secretary to Generican Khyber Pakhiunkawa
4	The Secretary to Chief Minister, Khybes Pakhtunkhwa,
- 5	The Secretary, Provincial Ascembly, Knyber Pakhturikhwa
6	All Hoods of Altached Departments in Knyteer Pakhtunkhwa
7	AF District Coordination Officerson Khyber Palchtunkhura
8.	At Political Agents / District & Savalons Judges in Khyber Pakivunkhwa
9.	The Registrue, Peshawar High Coopl. Peshawar.
10.	The Chairman, Public Service Conversion, Khyber Pakhunkhwa,
11.	The Chairman, Services Tribunal, Knybor Pakhtunkhwa.
Subject	REVISION IN THE RATE OF CONVEYATICE ALLOWANCE FOR THE
	CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA, PROVINCIAL
_	GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear Sin

The Government of Khyber Pakhturkhwa has been pleased to enhance / revise the rate of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provincial Civil Servants, Govt: of Knyber Pakhbinkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) wielf from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain - usochanged.

SNO	BPS	EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PM)
1.	1-4	Rs 1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
<u>2</u> ,	5-10	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
<u>3</u> .	11-15	Rs.2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
÷	16-19	Rs.5,000/-	R\$.5,000/~

Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to 71 those BPS-37, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles.

Yours Faithfully, (Sahibzada Saced Ahmad) Socretary Finance

Endst: NO. 10/SO(SR-11)/8-52/2012

Dated Peshawan the 20¹⁹ December, 2017

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

; · •

- 1. Accountant General Knyber Pakhtur Minro, Peshawat
- Secretaries to Government of Punjab, Shidh & Solochistan, Finance Department 2 Secretaries to Government or manyour or the secret access Pakhtunkhwa 3 All Autonomous / Secret Autonomous Booles in Khyper Pakhtunkhwa 2

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial x District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salary Statement (January-2020)



Personal Information of Mrs SAMINA JABEEN d/w/s of HAJI FAZAL WAHAB

Personnel Number: 00268926 Date of Birth: 01.01.1969

CNIC: 1540228705550 Entry into Govt. Service: 11.05.1992 NTN:

Length of Service: 27 Years 08 Months 022 Days

Employment Category: Active Permanent

Designation: SENIOR ENGLISH TEACHER DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS TIMERGARA GPF Section: 001 Payroll Section: 001 GPF A/C No: EDUDA008556 Interest Applied: Yes Vendor Number: -Pay scale: BPS For - 2017 **Pay and Allowances:**

80001486-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

Cash Center:

GPF Balance:

Pay Scale Type: Civil **BPS: 16**

Pay Stage: 21

761,894.00

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type		Amount
0001	Basic Pay	50,830.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	2,727.00
1924	UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G/NG)	1,500.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,003.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,140.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	763.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,892.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	5,083.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	5,083.00	2264	Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	5,083.00

Deductions - General

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3016	GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501 Be	nevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-1,128.00	3990 En	np.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

· Loan	De	scription	Principa	l amount	Dedu	ction		Balance
Deductions Payable:	s - Income Tax 17,618.35 Reco	overed till January-2020:	7,577.00	Exempted	: 4404.00	Reco	overable:	5,637.35
Gross Pay	(Rs.): 78,104.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-6,068.00)	Net Pay: (R	s.):	72,036.00	
Account N	ne: SAMINA JABEEN lumber: PLS 3505-2 ils: NATIONAL BAN	I K OF PAKISTAN, 230841	NBP TIMAR(GARA DIR	NBP TIMAI	, RGAR/	A DIR, KOH	AT

Balance: Earned: Leaves: **Opening Balance:** Availed:

Permanent Address: VILL THANA	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
City: DIR LOWER	Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Status: No Official
Temp. Address:	Λ.	· · · · ·
City:	Email:	
	TESTER	
	ATA	

(265994/24.01.2020/12:51:43) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Dir at Timargar Monthly Salàry Statement (October-2020)



Personal Information of Mrs SAMINA JABEEN d/w/s of HAJI FAZAL WAHAB

Personnel Number: 00268926 Date of Birth: 01.01.1969 CNIC: 1540228705550 Entry into Govt. Service: 11.05.1992 NTN:

C-6

Length of Service: 28 Years 05 Months 022 Days

Employment Category: Active	Permanent				
Designation: SENIOR ENGLIST	H TEACHER	80001486-DISTRICT GO	OVERNME	NT KHYBE	
DDO Code: DA6096-GGHSS T	IMERGARA				
Payroll Section: 001	GPF Section: 001	Cash Center:			
GPF A/C No: EDUDA008556	Interest Applied: Yes	GPF Balance:		883,181.00	
Vendor Number: -					
Pav and Allowances:	Pay scale: BPS For - 2017	Pay Scale Type: Civil	BPS: 16	Pay Stage: 21	

Wage type		Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	50,830.00	1210 Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00
1924	UAA-OTHER 20%(16 G/NG)	1,500.00	1947 Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	2,003.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	1,140.00	2199 Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	763.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	3,892.00	2224 Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	5,083.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	5,083.00	2264 Adhoc Relief All 2019 10%	5,083.00

Deductions - General

Wage type		Amount	Amount Wage type		Amount
3016	GPF Subscription	-3,340.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	1,139.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-150.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-650.00			0.00

Deductions - Loans and Advances

Loan	Descr	iption	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance
Deductions Payable:	- Income Tax 17,976.15 Recover	ed till October-2020:	4,371.00 Exempte	ed: 4493.95 Recov	verable: 9,111.20
Gross Pay ((Rs.): 80,377.00	Deductions: (Rs.):	-6,079.00	Net Pay: (Rs.):	74,298.00
Account Nu	e: SAMINA JABEEN umber: PLS 3505-2 ls: NATIONAL BANK (DF PAKISTAN, 230841	NBP TIMARGARA DI	R NBP TIMARGARA	DIR, KOHAT
Leaves:	Opening Balance:	Availed:	Earned:	Balance:	
Permanent . City: DIR L Temp. Add City:			hyber Pakhtunkhwa	Housing Sta	atus: No Official

(265994/26.10.2020/21:02:06) 2) All amounts are in Pak Rupees 3) Errors & omissions excepted

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

<u>Subject:</u>

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SET (BPS-16) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 4 /10/2020

ATTESTED

Your Obediently

SAMINA JABEEN

Samina

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNA

PESHAWAR

1452 /2019 APPEAL NO.

11-62

EXAMENTO

Khyber

500

Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), .APPELLANT GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar.....

VERSUS

1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED AND ILLEGALLY RESPONDENTS BY THE OF ACTION UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER SUMMER 8 OF: VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

PRAYER:

2-4/10/19

5

112

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted ledte-day previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in Registrar favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH: ON FACTS:

ATTENTED

1- That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012, whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

11.11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Appeal No. 1452/2019 Marked Hayat vs Govt

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12.2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter vacations was held to be within his entitlement and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01.10.2019 in the case of appellant.

Learner' counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and, more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary" but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protractover a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Petitions including W.P. No. 3152-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remeasy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time.

1. 112

 $C \sim$

ت چ

Chairmán

File be consigned to the record. ATZESZEC

ANNOUNCED

TESTED

11.11.2019

Cartina

Peshawat-

VAKALATNAMA

SEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

OF 2020

(APPELLANT)

SAMINA JABEEN

__(PLAINTIFF)

(PETITIONER)

<u>VERSUS</u>

(RESPONDENT)

(DEFENDANT)

Education Department

I/We SAMINA JABEEN _______ do hereby appoint and constitute **AKHUNZADA ASAD IQBAL**, **Advocate**, **Peshawar** to appear, plead, act, compromise, withdraw or refer to arbitration for me/us as my/our Counsel/Advocate in the above noted matter, without any liability for his default and with the authority to engage/appoint any other Advocate Counsel on my/our cost. I/we authorize the said Advocate to deposit, withdraw and receive on my/our behalf all sums and amounts payable or deposited on my/our account in the above noted matter.

Dated. _____ / _____ /202♥

Samin CLIENT

ACCEPTED AKHUNZADA ASAD IOBAL ADVOCATE SSUSQUS 7/0