### Form- A

## FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of			
	•		
	1 1 1		
•		<b>7</b> .	- 4
Case No	· / 17//	/2020	
	7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7		

S.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge
1	2	3
1-	18/12/2020	The appeal presented today by Mr. Munfat Ali Yousafz  Advocate may be entered in the Institution Register and put to the Learne
	·	Member for proper order please.
		REGISTRAR,
2		This case is entrusted to S. Bench for preliminary hearing to be po
	.*	up there on $\frac{4/3/2}{2}$
,	. 9	
	* **	
		MEMBER(J)
	·	
,	i	
, -	0.000	
	04.03.2021	Learned Member (J) is under transfer, therefore the case is
-		adjourned to 29.07.2021 before S.B.
	-	**
İ		
	:	READER
	-	
	· :	
-		
	-	
	. ,	
1		<b>*</b> .

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO.	/2020.
	•

KALSOOM KAUSAR

### **EDUCATION DEPTT:**

#### INDEX

VS .

S.NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Memo of appeal		1-3
2.	Notification	A	4
3.	Pay Slips	B&C	5-6
4.	Departmental Appeal	D	7
5.	Service Tribunal Judgment	E	8-9
6.	Vakalat Nama		10

**APPELLANT** 

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI
ADVOCATE

CELL NO. 0344-9213367

Note:

Sir,

Spare copies will be submitted MARTER Submission of the case.

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. 16/15 /2020

Khyber Pakhtukhw Service Tribunal

MRS. KALSOOM KAUSAR, SS (BPS-17) GGHS BAGHICHA DHERI MARDAN Personnel Number: 00394506 Diary NJ6684

.APPELLANT

#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- 5- The Director of (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar

.....RESPONDENTS

APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS.

#### **PRAYER**

That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance during vacations period (Summer & Winter Vacations) and make the payment of all outstanding amount of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted previously with all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the appellant.

R/SHEWETH ON FACTS:

- 1. That the appellant is serving in the Elementary & Secondary Education Department as SS (BPS-17) quite efficiently and up to the entire satisfaction of their superiors.
- 2. That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the Civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD(PRC)1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. That later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the

- 5. That some of teachers of different pay scale approached to this august Tribunal in different service appeals which allowed by this august tribunal vide its Judgment No 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department Dated 11-11-2019...... E.
- 6. That the appellant also prayed to be treated through the principals of consistency for allowing such relief which was granted in appeal No. 1452/2019 titled Maqsad Hayat versus Education Department in Judgement Dated 11.11.2019.
- 7. That where after the appellant waited for the statutory period of ninety days but no reply has been received from the respondents. That appellant feeling aggrieved and having no other remedy filed the instant service appeal on the following grounds amongst the others.

#### **GROUNDS:**

- A- That the action and inaction of the respondents regarding deduction of conveyance allowance for vacations period/months is illegal, against the law, facts, norms of natural justice.
- B- That the appellant have not been treated by the respondent Department in accordance with law and rules on the subject noted above and as such the respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973.
- C- That the action of the respondents is without any legal authority, Discriminatory and in clear violation of fundamental rights duly conferred by the Constitution and is liable to be declared as null and void.

- D- That there is clear difference between leave and vacation as leave is applied by the Civil Servant in light Government Servant. Revised Leave Rules, 1981
- while the vacations are always announced by the Government, therefore under the law and Rules the appellant fully entitled for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations period.
- E-That the Government Servants Revised Leave Rules, 1981 clearly explain that the civil servants who avail the vacations are allowed only one leave in a month whereas, the other civil servants may avail 04 days leave in a calendar months and the same are credited to his account and in this way he may avail 48 days earned leave with full pay, whereas the Government servants to avail vacation such as appellant is allowed one day leave in a month and twelve (12) days in a year and earned leave for twelve days in a year are credited to his account and there is no question of deduction of conveyance allowance for vacation period, the respondents while making the deduction of conveyance allowance lost sight of this legal aspect and illegally and without any authority started the recovery and deduction of conveyance allowance from appellant.
- F- That as the act of the respondents is illegal, unconstitutional, without any legal authority and not only discriminatory but is also the result of malafide on the part of respondents.
- G- That appellant has the vested right of equal treatment before law and the act of the respondents to deprive the petitioners from the conveyance/allowance is unconstitutional and clear violation of fundamental rights.
- H- That according to Government Servants Revised leave Rules, 1981 vacations are holidays and not leave of any kind, therefore, the deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations is against the law and rules.
- I- That according to Article 38 (e) of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 the state is bound to reduce disparity in the income and earning of individuals including persons in the services of the federation, therefore in light of the said Article the appellant fully entitle for the grant of conveyance allowance during vacations.
  - J- That the petitioners seeks permission of this Honorable Court to raise any other grounds available at the time of arguments.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that the appeal of the appellant may be accepted as prayed for under the golden principals of consistency.

KALSOOM KAUSAR

APPELLANT

THROUGH:

MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE



# FINANCE DEPARTMENT

NO. FD/SO(SR-Ity/6-52/2012 Dated Peshawar the: 20-12-2012 4

From

The Secretary to Govi, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Finance Department,

<u>Peshawar.</u>

To:

- All Administrative Scotteries to Govt. of Kinyber Pakhtenkhwa.
- 2. The Senior Member, Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhlundvag.
- 3 The Secretary to Governor Whyter Pakhiunkinks
- 4 The Secretary to Chief Missey, Khyber Palinturkhwa.
- 5. The Secretary, Provincial Ascembly, Knyber Pakhturkhwa
- 6 All Hoods of Altached Departments in Knylger Pakinginklywa.
- All District Coordination Officers in Klyber Pakhtunkhous.
- 8. All Political Agents / Digitical & Sepalons Judges in Khyber Palchtunkhwa
- 3. The Registras, Pashawar High Coorl. Poshawar.
- 10. The Chairman, Public Service Commension, Khyber Pakhunchang,
- The Chairman, Services Tribunial, Khybor Pakhtunkhwa.

Subject

REVISION IN THE BATE OF CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE FOR THE CIVIL EMPLOYEES OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT BPS 1-19

Dear, Sir

The Government of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa has been pleased to enhance / newsome rete of Conveyance Allowance admissible to all the Provinced Civil Servants, Govt: of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa (working in BPS-1 to BPS-15) w.e.f from 1° September, 2012 at the following rates. However, the conveyance allowance for employees in BPS-16 to BPS-19 will remain. \*\* unchanged.\*\*

S.NO	BPS		EXISTING RATE (PM)	REVISED RATE (PH)
1	1-4	<del>-</del>	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,700/-
2.	5-10	• ;	Rs.1,500/-	Rs.1,840/-
<u>.</u> 3	11-15		Rs-2,000/-	Rs.2,720/-
ci.	16-19		Rs.5,000/-	Rs:5,000/-

2 Conveyance Allowance at the above rates per month shall be admissible to those BPS-97, 18 and 19 officers who have not been sanctioned official vehicles...

Yours Fanhfully,

(Sahibzada Saund Ahmad)
Sucretary Finance

Endso NO. FD/SO(SR-II)/8-52/2012.

Dated Peclianger the Mills Degrander, 2017

A Copy is forwarded for information to the:-

1. Accountant General Kingger Pakhtunkhen, Peshawat-

2 Secretarios to Gavernovient of Punjab, Sordh & Sabot estan. Foreince Department.

I All Augmannous / Semi Augmanage Booles in Khyber Pakht, ikh na

ATTESTED to be the copy Advecate

1/

#### Dist. Govt. NWFP-Provincial District Accounts Office Mardan Monthly Salary Statement (July-2019)

Entry into Govt. Service: 02.10.2007,

#### Personal Information of Miss KALSOOM KAUSAR d/w/s of QAISAR KHAN

Personnel Number: 00394506

Date of Birth: 20.03.1982

CNIC: 1620209041748 .

NTN:

Length of Service: 11 Years 10 Months 000 Days

**Employment Category: Active Temporary** 

Designation: SUBJECT SPECIALIST

80003519-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: MR6126-H.MRS G.G.H.S BAGHICHA DHERI MARDAN

Payroll Section: 003

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center:

GPF A/C No: Interest Applied: Yes GPF Balance:

257,142.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

Pay Stage: 3

	Wage type	Amount	Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	37,270.00	1000 House Rent Allowance	4,433.00
1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	1,312.00	2148 15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	740.00
2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	504.00	2211 Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,612.00
2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,727.00	2247 Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,727.00
2265	Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	1,863.00		0.00

#### **Deductions - General**

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3017	GPF Subscription - Rs4270	-4,270.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-186.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004	R Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00			0.00

#### Deductions - Loans and Advances

		<del></del>	<del></del>	,	1
Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance	ĺ

Deductions - Income Tax

Recovered till July-2019:

186.00

Exempted: 1485.04

Recoverable:

2,042.26

Gross Pay (Rs.):

Deductions: (Rs.):

-6,406.00

Net Pay: (Rs.):

49,782.00

Payee Name: KALSOOM KAUSAR Account Number: 01-200-0428-6

Bank Details: ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250826 KALU KHAN SWABI KALU KHAN SWABI,

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address:

City: SWABI

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email:

#### Monthly Salary Statement (September-2019)



Personnel Number: 00394506

CNIC: 1620209041748

NTN:

Date of Birth: 20.03.1982 Entry into Govt. Service: 02.10.2007 Length of Service: 12 Years 00 Months 000 Days

**Employment Category: Active Temporary** 

Designation: SUBJECT SPECIALIST

80003519-DISTRICT GOVERNMENT KHYBE

DDO Code: MR6126-H.MRS G.G.H.S BAGHICHA DHERI MARDAN

Payroll Section: 003

GPF Section: 001

Cash Center:

GPF A/C No:

Interest Applied: Yes

GPF Balance:

298,599.00

Vendor Number: -

Pay and Allowances:

Pay scale: BPS For - 2017

Pay Scale Type: Civil

BPS: 17

Pay Stage: 3

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
0001	Basic Pay	37,270.00	1000	House Rent Allowance	4,433.00
1210	Convey Allowance 2005	5,000.00	1947	Medical Allow 15% (16-22)	1,312.00
2148	15% Adhoc Relief All-2013	740.00	2199	Adhoc Relief Allow @10%	1504.00
2211	Adhoc Relief All 2016 10%	2,612.00	2224	Adhoc Relief All 2017 10%	3,727.00
2247	Adhoc Relief All 2018 10%	3,727.00	2265	Adhoc Relief All 2019 05%	1,863.00

#### Deductions - Géneral

	Wage type	Amount		Wage type	Amount
3017	GPF Subscription	-4,270.00	3501	Benevolent Fund	-800.00
3609	Income Tax	-336.00	3990	Emp.Edu. Fund KPK	-250.00
4004	R. Benefits & Death Comp:	-900.00			0.00

#### **Deductions - Loans and Advances**

		Y	·	,
Loan	Description	Principal amount	Deduction	Balance

Deductions - Income Tax

Payable: , 6,213.20

Recovered till September-2019:

708.00

Exempted: 2484.89

Recoverable:

3,020.31

Gross Pay (Rs.):

61,188.00

Deductions: (Rs.):

-6,556.00

54,632.00

Payee Name: KALSOOM KAUSAR

Net Pay: (Rs.):

Account Number: 01-200-0428-6

Bank Details: ALLIED BANK LIMITED, 250826 KALU KHAN SWABI KALU KHAN SWABI.

Leaves:

Opening Balance:

Availed:

Earned:

Balance:

Permanent Address:

City: SWABI

Domicile: NW - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Housing Status: No Official

Temp. Address:

City:

Email:

The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.



Subject:

DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL AGAINST THE IMPUGNED ACTION OF THE CONCERNED AUTHORITY BY ILLEGALLY AND UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS.

Respected Sir,

With due respect it is stated that I am the employee of your good self Department and is serving as SS (BPS-17) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors. It is stated for kind information that Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14.07.2011 was issued. Later on vide revised Notification dated 20.12.2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees working in BPS-I to 15 were enhance/revised while employees from BPS-15 to 19 have been treated under the previous Notification by not enhancing their conveyance allowance. Respected Sir, I was receiving the conveyance allowance as admissible under the law and rules but the concerned authority without any valid and justifiable reasons stopped/deducted the payment of conveyance allowance under the wrong and illegal pretext that the same is not allowed for the leave period. One of the employee of Education Department in Islamabad filed service appeal No.1888 (R)CS/2016 before the Federal Service Tribunal, Islamabad regarding conveyance allowance which was accepted by the Honorable Service Tribunal vide its judgment dated 03.12.2018. That the august K.P.K service tribunal also allowed the restoration of the conveyance allowance in its judgment dated 11.11.2019 in appeal No 1452/2019 titled Magsad Hayat versus Education Department. Copy attached. That I also the similar employee of Education Department and under the principle of consistency I am also entitled for the same treatment meted out in the above mentioned service appeal but the concerned authority is not willing to issue/grant the same conveyance allowance which is granting to other employees. Copy attached. I am feeling aggrieved from the action of the concerned authority regarding deduction of conveyance allowance in vacations period/months preferred this Departmental appeal before your good self.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of this Departmental appeal the concerned authority may very kindly be directed the conveyance allowance may not be deducted from my monthly salary during the winter & Summer vacations.

Dated: 06.08.2020

**Your Obediently** 

KALSOOM KAUSAR

ATTESTED

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR." APPEAL NO. 1452 /2019 Mr. Magsad Hayat, SCT (BPS-16), APPELLANT GHS Masho Gagar, Peshawar. VERSUS 1- The Government of Knyber Pakhtunkhwa through Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 2- The Secretary (E&SE) Department, Knyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 3- The Secretary Finance Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 4- The Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. 5- The Director (E&SE) Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar. RESPONDENTS APPEAL UDNER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED OF THE RESPONDENTS BY ILLEGALLY UNLAWFULLY DEDUCTING THE CONVEYANCE ALLOWANCE OF THE APPELLANT DURING WINTER & SUMMER VACATIONS AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD OF NINETY DAYS. That on acceptance of this appeal the respondents may PRAYER:

That on acceptance of this appear the respondence kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance kindly be directed not to make deduction of conveyance allowance period (Summer & Winter allowance allowance which have been deducted of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted of Conveyance allowance which have been deducted which all back benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in this augu

# R/SHEWETH:

97. 1.81 12

1-That the appellant is serving in the elementary and secondary education department as Certified Teacher (BPS-15) quite efficiency and up to the entire satisfaction of the superiors.

EXAMINER Khybor

2- That the Conveyance Allowance is admissible to all the civil servants and to this effect a Notification No. FD (PRC) 1-1/2011 dated 14:07:2011 was issued. That later ion vide revised Notification dated 20:12:2012 whereby the conveyance allowance for employees

ATIESTED

to be true copy Advocate Appeal No-1452/2019 Marshad Hayat is Gost

11.2019

Counsel for the appellant present.

Learned counsel referred to the judgment passed by learned Federal Service Tribunal in Appeal No. 1888(R)CS/2016 which was handed down on 03.12:2018. Through the said judgment the issue of payment of Conveyance Allowance to a civil servant during summer and winter. vacations was held to be within his entitlement, and the deduction already made from him was to be reimbursed. Similar reference was made to the judgment by Honourable Peshawar High Court passed on 01:10:2019 in the case of appellant.

Learned counsel, when confronted with the proposition that the issue, in essence, was dilated upon by the Federal Service Tribunal and. more particularly, by the Honourable Peshawar High Court in the case of appellant, stated that in case the respondents are required to execute the judgment of Peshawar High Court, the appellant will have no cavil about disposal of instant appeal.

The record suggests that while handing down judgment in the Writ Petition preferred by the appellant, the Honourable High Court not only expounded the definition of "Pay" as well as "Salary", but also entitlement of a civil servant for the Conveyance Allowance during the period of vacations. It is important to note that the respondents were represented before the High Court during the proceedings.

In view of the above noted facts and circumstances and in order to protect the appellant from a fresh round of litigation which may protract: over a formidable period, the appeal in hand is disposed of with observation that the judgment of Honourable Peshawar High Court passed in Writ Pétitions including W.P. No. 3152-P/2019 shall be honoured and implemented by the respondents within shortest possible time. The appellant shall, however, be at liberty to seek remedy in accordance with law in case his grievance is not redressed by the respondents within a reasonable time:

Cattified

File be consigned to the record.

Peshawar

ANNOUNCED

11.11.2019

ATVES/YED

be the copy

M

### **VAKALATNAMA**

#### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TIBUNAL, PESHAWAR

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		OF 2020
		(APPELLANT)
KALSOOM KAUSAR		(PLAINTIFF)
		(PETITIONER)
	<u>versus</u>	
. ·		(RESPONDENT)
Education Department		(DEFENDANT)
compromise, withdraw counsel/Advocate in the ab and with the authority to en	or refer to arbitration ove noted matter, withoungage/appoint any other	do hereby appoint and hawar to appear, plead, act, for me/us as my/our and liability for his default Advocate Counsel on my/our adraw and receive on my/our
		my/our account in the above
Dated/20	)20	
		(Kalyan)45

ACCEPTED ( MUNFAT ALI YOUSAFZAI ADVOCATE

CLIENT