Cost of Rs. received in Service Axpest No. in the office of Superintendent Vide Order Dated: 2 SUPERMITERIENT Khyber Pakhtunkhy/g Knyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Peshawar

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR.

## Service Appeal No. 1913/2023

Dr. Jamal Shah		(Appellant)
	Versus	
Government of Khyber Pakl	ntunkhwa through Secretary He	alth
	***************************************	(Respondent)

### INDEX.

S.No.	Description of documents	Annexure	Page
01	Parawise Comments		01-02
02	Office order dated 09th July 2008	А	03
03	Supreme Court judgment dated 21.10.2020	В	4-9
04	Affidavit	С	10
05	Authority Letter	. , D	11

Section officer (Lit-II)

Govt: of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Health Department

odro4 24

#### BEFORE THE HONORABLE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

### **SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR**

#### **SERVICE APPEAL NO. 1913 OF 2023**

Khyber Pakhtukhwa Service Tribunal

Diary No. 12054

Dated 02-04-24

Dr. Jamal Shah	Appellant
	•

#### Versus

Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and others......Respondents

#### PARAWISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENT NO. 01 TO 04

#### **Respectfully Sheweth:**

#### **Preliminary Objections:-**

- 1. That the appellant has got no cause of action or locus standi to file the instant appeal.
- 2. That the appellant has filed the instant appeal just to pressurize the respondents.
- 3. That the instant appeal is against the prevailing Law and Rules.
- 4. That the appeal is not maintainable in its present form and also in the present circumstances of the issue.
- 5. That the appellant has filed the instant appeal with mala-fide intention hence liable to be dismissed.
- 6. That the appellant has not come to this Honorable Tribunal with clean hands.
- 7. That the appeal is barred by law and limitation.
- 8. That the instant appeal is bad for mis-joinder of unnecessary and non-joinder of necessary parties.
- 9. That the appellant has been conditionally re-instated till final decision of the Apex Court which is still pending however, the Apex Court vide its judgment reported as 2021 PLC (CS) SC 341 and 2022 SCMR 406 wherein similar nature cases of regularization appeals of the provincial government have been allowed.

#### ON FACTS:

- Incorrect. The appellant was appointed by a registered company Sarhad Rural Support Program for a program namely People's Primary Healthcare Initiative (PPHI) under the sign of District Support Manager and not by the Provincial Government. (Annex-A).
- 2. Subject to proof.
- 3. Correct to the extent of WP No. 945-P/2017 which was allowed by the Peshawar High Court however, besides the WP No. 945-P/2017 so many other employees also filed WPs which were allowed and the Provincial Government filed appeals before the Apex Court wherein the Apex Court has

- d. already allowed the appeals of the Provincial Government vide various judgments in which some of the judgments have been reported as 2021 PLC (CS) SC 341 and 2022 SCMR 406 wherein the Apex Court has clearly mentioned that company employees has no right to be regularized. It is worth to mention that cases of the appellant along with other 78 appeals are pending before the Apex Court for adjudication. (Copies of some of the judgments of August Supreme Court of Pakistan are annexed as Annex-B).
- 45. As in preceding para. However, it is worth to mention that the replying respondents have already an opinion of law department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa rendered in similar nature matter wherein the law department has clearly mentioned that there is no provision in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servant Pension Rules 2021 for counting of temporary services towards regular for the purpose of pension. Moreover, he was not the employee of the Provincial Government.
- 56. As in preceding para.
- 7. Incorrect. No vested right of the appellant has been violated by the replying respondents.

#### **ON GROUNDS:**

- A. Incorrect. The replying Kespondents acted in accordance with law, rules and principles of natural justice.
- B. Incorrect. Already replied in the preceding paras.
- C. Pertains to Court record. The Apex Court has held in a report judgment 2010 PLC CS 924 "Every case has different facts and circumstances, needs to be decided on its own merit".
- D. As above in para C.
- E. As per para 04 of the facts. As the West Pakistan Civil Servant pension Rules is not applicable to the appellant after notifying the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servant Pension Rules 2021.
- F. As per preceding paras.
- G. Answering respondents also seek prior permission of this Honorable Tribunal to adduce additional grounds at the time of final arguments.

#### PRAYER:

It is therefore humbly prayed that on acceptance of the comments, the instant appeal of the appellant may very graciously be dismissed with costs.

Secretary to Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Health Department

(Respondent No. 01)

Mehmord Aslam

Director General Health Services Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

(Respondent No. 03)

Shaulcet Ali

Secretary to Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Finance Department

(Respondent No. 02)

Amer Sutan Taxee

District Health Officer Nowshera

(Respondent No. 04)

Oistrict Health Officer Page 2 of 2
Nowshera



People's Primary Healthcare Initiative (PHIII) District Support Unit Nowshers

Letter No. 649-24-MON/DSO/ SISR Dated, 9th July 2008

#### Office Order

No. 640-21 MOR/ DSU NSR. On the recommendation of the selection committee and upon the receptance of the offer of appointment given by KPH/DSU Noveshera, Mr. Jamal Shaja is hereby appointed as Medical Officer in BHU Wazir Garlii District Nowshern according to the terms & conditions of the contract signed by him with this office with immediate effect in the public interest.

DSU-KPH Nowshera

#### Copy to:

- Program Director, PPHI NWFP/FATA.
- District Coordination Officer Nowshera. 2.
- Exicative District Officer (Health) Nowshera. 3..
- Personal Secretary to District Nazim (Nowshera)
- Executive (F&A) DSIJ Nowshera.
- Official Concerned.

Support Manager

DSU-KPH Nowshera

Attached to Sarhad Rural Support Program (Regd. under section 42 of Companies Ord., 1983)

, Village Pupu Novshera Lelephone No. 6923-586414, Fax No. 6923-586978

Lemail dar inversalisocome,

alles teel

#### **BETTER COPY**



# People's Primary Healthcare Initiative (PPHI) District Support Unit Nowshera

Letter No. 619-21/MON/DSU/NSR dated 09th July, 2008

#### Office Order

No. 649-21/MON/DSU/NSR: On the recommendation of the selection committee and upon the acceptance of the offer of appointment given by KPH/DSU Nowshera, Mr. Jamal Shah is hereby appointed as Medical Officer in BHU Wazir Garhi District Nowshera according to the terms & conditions of the contract signed by him which this office with immediate effect in the public interest.

District Support Manager
DSU-KPH Nowshera

#### Copy to:

- 1. Program Director PPHI NWFP/FATA
- 2. District Coordination Officer Nowshera
- 3. Executive District Officer (Health) Nowshera
- 4. Personal Secretary to District Nazim (Nowshera)
- 5. Executive (F&A) DSU Nowshera
- 6. Official Concerned

District Support Manager DSU-KPH Nowshera

Attached to Sarhad Rural Support Program (Regd. Under section 42 of companies Ord. 1984)
Village Pirpiai Nowshera
Telephone No. 0923-580414 Fax No. 0923-580978

Email: dsu\_nsr@yahoo.com

allested (

John C.

# IN THE SUPPEME COURT OF PAKISTAN (APPELLATE JURISDICTION)

PRESENT: MR. JUSTICE GULZAR AHMED, HCJ MR. JUSTICE FAISAL ARAB MR. JUSTICE-IJAZ UL AHBAN

MR. JUSTICE IJAZ UL AHSAN

CIVIL APPEAL NOB. 228 TO 306 M 91-P TO 100-P OF 2020

(Against the Judgmenta dated 18.02.2014, 26.06.2014 26.09.2017, 23.11.2017, 09.02.2016, 17.03.2018, 29.09.2016, 07.10.2015, 12.11.2015, 03.02.2016, 07.09.2016, 27.09.2016, 06.09.2016, 07.10.2015, 12.11.2015, 03.02.2016, 04.02.2016, 07.10.2017, 17.02.2015, 12.04.2017, 04.10.2017, 22.11.2017, 20.11.2017, 23.11.2017, 22.1.2017, 05.12.2017, 12.04.2017, 04.10.2017, 12.01.2017, 17.01.2018, 14.03.2014, 01.02.2016, 13.10.2015, 13.01.2017, 23.11.2017, 22.1.2017, 17.04.2018, 04.09.2018, 10.04.2018, 15.05.2018, 05.10.2017, 17.07.2018, 14.03.2014, 01.01.2018, 05.12.2018, 04.09.2018, 16.10.2018, 15.05.2018, 05.10.2017, 17.07.2016, 04.04.2018, 05.12.2018, 26.11.2018, 16.10.2018, 12.01.2019, 12.02.2019, 11.01.2019, 14.03.2015, 02.04.2019, 18.12.2018, 16.10.2018, 12.01.2019, 12.02.2019, 11.01.2019, 14.03.2015, 02.04.2019, 18.12.2018, 19.06.2019, 30.10.2019, 14.11.2016, 14.11.2016, 20.11.2018, 07.00.2018, 07.00.2018, 07.00.2018, 07.00.2019, 18.12.2018, 08.10.2019, 14.11.2019, 36 title Pashawar Iligh passed in W.P.1924/2013, W.P.2006-P/2013, W.P.2099-P/2013, W.P.309-P/2012, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.1924-P/2015, W.P.1941-P/2015, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2014, W.P.309-P/2016, W.P.309-P/2013, W.P.409-D/2016, W.P.309-P/2017, W.P.309-P/2016, W.P.309-P/2016, W.P.309-P/2016, W.P.309-P/2017, W.P.309-P/2017, W.P.309-P/2017, W.P.309-P/2018, W.P.309-P/2017, W.P.309-P/2018, W.P.309-P/

Govt. of KPK through Scoretary Higher Education Archives & Libraries . Department, Peshawar etc.

In C.As. 228, 234 & 267/2020

Govt. of KPK through Chief Secretary, Peshawar etc.

In C.As. 229, 230, 236, 238, 244, 245, 251, 256, 257, 258 253, 266, 273, 27,4, 276, 283 286, 287, 301, 303, 305, 306, 91-P to 100-P/2020

Deputy Director, Finance & Administration FATA through Additional Chief Secretary, FATA Peshawar etc.

In C.A. 231/2020

Director, Human Resource Development, In C.A. 232/2020 Peshawar etc.

allest of final ESTED

In C.As., 233, 261, 262, 264, 279, 261, 290, 291, 292, 293, 294, Secretariat, Warsak Road, Peshawar etc. 295, 296, 299/2020 Secretary, Government of KPK Agriculture, In C.A. 235/2020 Livestock & Dairy Cooperatives & Fisheries, Peshawar etc. In C.As. 237, 241, 242, 243, 247, 248, 252, 253, 254, 265, 269, 270, 271, 277, 280, 284, 300 & 302/2020 Govt. of KPK through Secretary Health, Peshawar ctc. In C.A. 239/2020 Govt. of KPK through Secretary Public Health Engineering Peshawar In C.As. 240, 259 Govt. of KPK through Secretary Industries, Commerce & Technical Education, Manpower Training Department, Peshawar 医272/2020 . In C.As. 246, 249, etc. Govt. of KPK through Secretary Agriculture, Livestock & Cooperative 285 282, 289/2020 Department, Peshawar etc. In C.A. 250/2020 District Officer (DO) On-Farm Water Management, Dir Lower etc. In C.A. 260/2020 Govt. of KPK through Secretary Higher Education, Peshawar etc. In C.A. 268/2020 Secretary of KPK through Administration Department, Peshawar etc.

Additional Chief Secretary FATA, PATA

FATA Secretariat, Peshawar etc. In C.A. 288/2020 Govt. of KPK through Secretary Energy & Power Peshawar etc.

of KPK through Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Peshawar etc.

Deputy Commissioner, Upper Dir etc.

Directorate of Livestock & Dairy Development FATA through its Director,

Secretary Health Service, FATA Secretariat Warsak Road, Peshawar etc.

In C.A. 304/2020

In C.A. 298/2020

In C.A. 275/2020

In C.A. 278/2020

...Appellantic)

Mastel Jand

VERSUS Sher Ali etc. Mst. Mchrun Nissa etc. Mst. Nahita Adil etc. Dr. Lai Marjan & another Sher Amon Sher Farooq Oismat Oul etc. Barkat Ali etc. Lai Rehman etc. Dr. Asadullah etc Sycda Humaira Sultana etc. Abdul Manan etc. Shahzad Iqbal etc. Muqadar Shah etc. Nazecrullah etc. Muhammad Farooq and another Nacem Khan etc. Dr. Muhammad Ishraq etc. Zain ul Abedin etc. Kamran Khan etc. Jawad Ali etc. Saced ul Hassan etc. Shahzada Sher Bahadar etc. Inamullah etc. Fazal Rabbi etc. Shafiq ur Rehman etc. Muhammad Imren Hamayun Khan Muhammad Waris Khan Muhammad Yasir Jamshed etc. Muhammad Younas etc. Rehmat Gul etc. Umar Muhammad Farcoq etc. Bilal Ahmed and another Gul Wali Shah etc. Salih Shah & another Riaz & another Samiullah etc. Irshad Hussain etc. Muhammad Asif Mehmood Liagat Ali Nisar Ahmad Recma Bibi Babar Sultan Muhanimad Asil & another Muhammad Irlan & another Ijaz Ali Shah etc. Mst. Nusrat Begum Muhammad Iqbal etc. Mumtaz Hussain & another Dr. Sajjad ur Rehman Farzan Ullah etc. Ishfaq Bacha Znher Ud Din Syed Muhammad Iqbal etc

In C.A. 228/2020 In C.A. 228/2020 In C.A. 229/2020 In C.A. 230/2020 In C.A. 231/2020 In C.A. 232/2020 In C.A. 233/2020 In C.A. 234/2020 C.A. 205/2020 In C.A. 237/2020 In C.A. 239/2020 In C.A. 240/2020 In C.A. 241/2020 In C.A. 242/2020 In C.A. 243/2020 In C.A. 244/2020 In C.A. 245/2020 In C.A. 246/2020 In C.A. 247/2020 In C.A. 248/2020 In C.A. 249/2020 In C.A. 250/2020 In C.A. 251/2020 In C.A. 252/2020 In C.A. 253/2020 In C.A. 254/2020 In C.A. 255/2020 In C:A. 256/2020 In C.A. 257/2020 In C.A. 258/2020 In C.A. 259/2020 In C.A. 260/2020 In C.A. 261/2020 In C.A. 262/2020 In C.A. 263/2020 In C.A. 264/2020 In C.A. 265/2020 In C.A., 266/2020 In C.A. 267/2020 In C.A. 268/2020 In C.A. 269/2020 In C.A. 270/2020 In C.A. 271/2020 In C.A. 272/2020 In C.A. 273/2020 In C.A. 274/2020 In C.A. 275/2020 In C.A. 276/2020 In C.A. 277/2020 In C.A. 278/2020 In C.A. 279/2020 In C.A. 280/2020 In C.A. 281/2020 In C.A. 282/2020

1.

Within .

Muhammad Nawaz etc. Rahcel Zeb etc. In C.A. 283/2020 In C.A. 281/2020 In C.A. 285/2020 Saida Rehman Muhammad Tohir Afridi In C.A. 286/2020 In C.A. 287/2020 In C.A. 288/2020 Irshad Ahmad etc. Matiullah In C.A. 289/2020 Ijaz Hussain & another In C.A. 290/2020 In C.A. 291/2020 In C.A. 292/2020 Alipur Khan Oimat Khan Sher Alam etc. In C.A. 293/2020 Naikdar Khan In C.A. 291/2020 Yousaf Khan etc. In C.A. 295/2020 In C.A. 296/2020 In C.A. 297/2020 Wali Khan Saifur Khan & another In C.A. 298/2020 Mrs. Nayyar Nazir Zaidi In C.A. 299/2020 Nazir Gul etc. In C.A. 300/2020 In C.A. 301/2020 Nadeem Ahmad etc. In C.A. 302/2020 Muhammad Arif In C.A. 303/2020 Faizan Rashid & another In C.A. 304/2020 In C.A. 305/2020 Sonia Nawab etc. Muhammad Zada & another In C.A. 306/2020 In C.A. 91-P/2020 In C.A. 92-P/2020 In C.A. 92-P/2020 Naik Amal Shah etc. Mst. Saeeda Rehman Khan Zeb and others In C.A. 93-P/2020 Mushtaq and others In C.A. 94-P/2020 Zulfigar Ahmad and others In C.A. 95-P/2020 HC Muhammad Ashraf and others In C.A. 96-P/2020 HC Muhammad Ramzan and others In C.A. 97-P/2020 HC Khewa Din and others In C.A. 98-P/2020 In C.A. 99-P/2020 Munir Khan and others HC Shireen Khan and others 100 C A Dauod Jan and others P/2020 ...Respondent(t) Gul Khan and others

CIVIL APPEAL NOS. 248, 252, 253, 254, 268, 269, 270, 371,

277, 280, 284 & 302 OF 2020 [CATEGORY-I]

For the Appellants:

Barrister Qasim Wadood, Addl. A.G. KP Mr. Auf Ali Khan, Addl. A.G. KP (in all cants)

For the Respondents:

Mr. Muhammad Shoaib Shaheen, ASC Syed Rifagat Hussain Shah, AOR (Far respondents 3.3, 5, 6, 8-25 in CA 248/2026)

(For respondents 4, 7, 28 fa CA 246/2020)

Mr. Mukhtar Ahmed Muneri, ASC [For respondents 1, 3, 7, 8, 11, 13, 16, 16, 19.21 In. CA 252/2020, for respondents 3, 8, 7, 16, 13 in. CA. 265/2020, and for respondent 2 in CA 304/2020]

For the Respondents:

Mr. Khalild Rehmun, ASC Mr. Muhammud Shonih Shahren, ASC Mr. Afnan Karim Kundi, ASC Mr. Abdul Qayum Qureshi, ASC Hafiz S.A. Rehman, Sr. ASC Mr. Salcem Ullah Ranazai, ASC Mr. Nasir Mehmood, ASC Mr. Muhammad Asif Yousafzai, ASC Barrister Adnus Khan, ASC Mr. Waserm ud Din Khattak, ASC Mr. Muzamil Klim, ASC Mr. Altof Ahmed, ASC Mr. Muhammad Anwar Khon, ASC Mr. Muhammad Munir Paracha, ASC Mr. Asad Jan, ASC

Official respondents:

Mr. Asif Khan, LO, HED Department, KP Mr. Nadecin Akhtur, DS Litigation HED Ms. Irum Shuheen, Deputy Director, HELL Mr. Lajbar Khan, SDO, PHE
Mr. Lajbar Khan, SDO, PHE
Mr. Zlauttah, LO Heatth Department, PSG
Mr. Muhammad Sneed, Dy. Director, PSG
Mr. Asif Ali, Dy Scendary,
Mr. Asif Ali, Dy Scendary, Me. Sheema Ayu, AD(1) PEDO Mr. Ghazab Taj, AD Chief Settlement, PATA

Date of Hearing!

21,10,2030

ORDER

allester Ismit

252, 253, 264, 265, 269, 270, 271, GULZAR AHMED, CJ.:

CIVIL APPEAL NOS.

We have heard learned counsel for the parties and 277, 280, 284 & 302 OF 2020 have also gone through the record of the case. For reasons to be recorded later, all these appeals are allowed and the impugned judgments are set aside.

# CIVII. APPEAL NOS. 276, 305; 91-F to 100-P/2020

By consent of the learned counsel for the parties, the impugned judgments dated 21.06.2018, 19.06.2019 & 14.11.2019 are set aside and Writ Petition Nos. 4490-P/2016, 4039-P/2018, 2394-P/2019, 2484-P/2019, 2535-P/2019, 2558-P/2019, 2560-. P/2019, 2589-P/2019, 2664-P/2019, 2628-P/2019, 4671-P/2019

& 5064-P/2019 are dismissed. The respondents shall, however, avail remedy pursuant to call up letters if and when cause of action arises to them and at the same time the appellant shall consider the letters and take appropriate measures regarding the respondents in accordance with law. The appeals are allowed in terms noted above.

#### CIVIL APPEAL NO. 288/2020

At the outset, learned counsel for the respondents admits that the High Court in the impugned judgment dated 16.10.2018 has wrongly relied upon the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees (Regularization of Services) Act, 2018. He contends that this very law was not applicable to the case of the respondents as they were governed by statute namely Pakhtunkhwa Energy Development Organization Act, 1993 and the rules framed thereunder. In this view of the submission made by the learned counsel for the respondents, the impugned judgment is set aside and the matter is remanded to the High Court for deciding Writ Petition No. 09-M/2017 of the respondents afresh in accordance with law. The appeal in the above terms stands allowed.

CIVIL APPEAL NO. 268/2020 Respondent seeks time to engage a counsel. Adjourned

to a date after two weeks.

Rest of the appeals are adjourned for a date after two REMAINING CASES

5. weeks.

Sd/-HCJ

allestel Carillied to be True Dopy

# BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

## Service Appeal No. 1913/2023

Dr. Jamal Shah		(Appellant)
•	Versus	+
Government of Khyber Pa	khtunkhwa through Secretar	y Health
		(Respondent)

#### **AFFIDAVIT**

I Mehmood Aslam, Secretary Health Govt. of Khyber do hereby solemnly affirm and declare on oath that the contents of the joint parawise comments are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, belief and that nothing has been concealed from this Hon'ble Court.

Secretary Health, Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

allester Infly



### GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA HEALTH DEAPRTMENT

#### **AUTHORITY LETTER**

Mr. Safi Ullah, Focal Person (Litigation-II), Health Department, Civil Secretariat is hereby authorized to attend/defend the Court Cases and file comments on behalf of Secretary Health Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa before the Service Tribunal and lower Courts.

(MAHMOOD ASLAM)

Secretary to Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Health Departments Secretary to Governs Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Health Department

Section Officer (Lit-II)
Health Department
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa