## Form- A FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court of	<u> </u>
_	

### Implementation Petition No. 1028/2024

5.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge			
1	2	3			
1	09.09.2024	The implementation petition submitted today be			
1		Mr. Noor Muhammad Khattak Advocate. It is fixed for			
		implementation report before Single Bench at Peshawa			
		on 23.09.2024. Original file be requisitioned. AAG has			
!		noted the next date. Parcha Peshi given to counsel for			
		the petitioner.			
	4.57	By order of the Chairman			
		PS al			
		REGISTRAR			
,					
	•				
:					
	•				

#### 8

## BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICED TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

L/ CITVICE AF AL NO. \_\_\_\_\_ /2024

Abdullah Shar v.

**GOVT OF KPK & OTHERS:** 

## <u>APPLICATION FOR FIXATION OF THE ABOVE TITLED APPEAL AT</u> <u>PRINCIPAL SEAT, PESHAWAR.</u>

Respectfully Sheweth:

- 1. That the above mentioned appeal is pending adjudication before this Hon'ble Tribunal in which no date has been fixed so far.
- 2. That according to Rule 5 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Rules 1974, a Tribunal may hold its sittings at any place in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa which would be convenient to the parties whose matters are to be heard.
- 3. That it is worth mentioning that the offices of all the respondents concerned are at Peshawar and Peshawar is also convenient to the appellant/applicant meaning thereby that Principal Seat would be convenient to the parties concerned.
- 4. That any other ground will be raised at the time of arguments with the permission of this Hon'ble court.

It is therefore prayed that on acceptance of this application the appeal may please be fixed at principal seat Peshawar for the Convenience of parties and best interest of justice.

**Applicant** 

Dated: - <u>🔑 /</u> \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_/2024

Through

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE SUPREME COURT

## \*BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR.

Execution Petition No. /028 \_\_/2024 In Appeal No. 2418/2023

Mr. Abdullah Shah

**VS** 

**EDU: DEPTT:** 

#### **INDEX**

S. NO.	DOCUMENTS	ANNEXURE	PAGE
1.	Implementation Petition with  Affidavit	mmitem	1-2
2.	Copy of the judgment dated 16/02/2024	<b>"A"</b>	3-10
3.	Copy of application	"B"	11-12
4.	Vakalat Nama		13

Petitioner Abdullah Shah

**THROUGH:** 

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE SUPREME COURT

#### E BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR.

Execution Petition No. / 2024
In
Appeal No. 2418/2023

Khyber Pakhtuk**hwa** Service Tribunat

Diary No. 1558

Dated 09-09-2021

Mr. Abdullah Shah, PST BPS-12, GPS Sundrawal, District Dir Upper.

Petitioner

#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar
- 2- The Director Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3- District Education Officer (Male) District Dir Upper.

..... RESPONDENTS

EXECUTION PETITION UNDER SECTION 7(2)(d) OF THE KP SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT 1974, RULE 27 OF THE KP SERVICE TRIBUNAL RULES 1974 READ WITH SECTIONS 36 AND 51 OF THE CIVIL PROCEDURE CODE AND ALL ENABLING LAWS ON THE SUBJECT FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE JUDGMENT DATED 16/02/2024 IN LETTER AND SPIRIT.

#### **R/SHEWETH:**

- 1- That the petitioner filed service appeal bearing No. 2418/2023 before this august Service Tribunal, against the impugned seniority list dated 31/12/2022, whereby the seniority of the appellant has been determined on the basis of merit position and not on the basis of Clause 9 of the terms and conditions of Regularization Notification dated 21/03/2018 and Sub Section (2) of the Section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the E&SE Department appointment and Regularization Act, 2017.
- 2- That the appeal of the petitioner was finally heard on dated 16/02/2024 and as such the ibid appeal is allowed as follows:
  - "11. In view of the above discussion, it is directed that the inter-se-seniority of those PSTs, who were regularized through notification bearing Endorsement No 1561-67-F. No 158/DEO(M)/ADO(P)Estb dated 21/03/2018, shall be determined on the basis of Clause-9 of terms and conditions of regularization

- 3- That after obtaining copy of the judgment dated 16/02/2024 the same was submitted with the respondents for implementation of his grievance coupled with an application, but the respondents/ department failed to do so, which is the violation of the judgment supra. Copy of application is attached as annexure.
- 4- That petitioner having no other remedy but to file this implementation petition.

It is therefore, most humbly prayed that on acceptance of the instant execution petition the respondents may kindly be directed to implement the Judgment dated 16/02/2024 passed in Appeal No. 2418/2023 in letter and spirit. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deems fit that may also be awarded in favor of the petitioner.

Petitioner Abdullah Shah

THROUGH:

NOOR MOHAMMAD KHATTAK ADVOCATE SUPREME COURT

#### **AFFIDAVIT**

I, Abdullah Shah, (appellant) do hereby solemnly affirm that the contents of this Execution Petition are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Court.

DEPONENT

-A 3

## → BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR PESHAWAR

APPEAL NO. <u>2418</u> 12023

Mr. Abdullah Shah, PST BPS-12, GPS Sundrawal, District Dir Upper.



#### **VERSUS**

- 1- The Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar
- 2- The Director Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3- District Education Officer (Male) District Dir Upper.

.....RESPONDENTS

SERVICE APPEAL UNDER SECTION-4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, 1974 AGAINST THE IMPUGNED SENIORITY LIST DATED 31/12/2022, WHEREBY THE SENIORITY OF THE APPELLANT HAS BEEN DETERMINED ON THE BASIS OF MERIT POSITION AND NOT ON THE BASIS OF CLAUSE 9 OF THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF REGULARIZATION NOTIFICATION DATED 17/03/2018 AND SUB SECTION (2) OF THE SECTION 4 OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA EMPLOYEES OF THE E&SE DEPARTMENT APPOINTMENT AND REGULARIZATION ACT, 2017 AND AGAINST NO ACTION TAKEN ON THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEAL OF THE APPELLANT WITHIN THE STATUTORY PERIOD.

Prayer:-

That on acceptance of the instant service appeal, the impugned seniority list dated 31/12/2022 may kindly be corrected/rectified to the extent that the appellant's seniority may be determined on the basis of clause 9 of the terms and conditions of Regularization Notification dated 17/03/2018 as well as Sub Section (2) of Section 4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of E&SE Department (Appointment & Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 by placing the name of the appellant at correct seniority



#### BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICES TRIBUNALPESHAWAR.

Service Appeal No. 2361/2023

BEFORE:

MRS. RASHIDA BANO

MISS FAREEHA PAUL

MEMBER (J)

MEMBER (E)

Muliammad Iqbal PST, BPS-12, GPS Bedamai, District Dir Upper

(Appellant)

#### **VERSUS**

1. Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

2. Director, Elementary & Secondary Education, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.

3. District Education Officer, (Male), District Dir-Upper.

(Respondents)

Mr. Noor Muhammad Khattak

Advocate

For appellants

Mr. Asif Masood Ali Shah

Deputy District Attorney

For respondents

Date of Institution.......16.11.2023 

#### **JUDGMENT**

RASHIDA BANO, MEMBER (J): The instant service appeal has been instituted under section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal, Act 1974 with the prayer as copied below:

> "On acceptance of instant appeal, the impugned seniority list dated 31.12.2022 may kindly be corrected/rectified to the extent that the appellant's seniority may be determined on the basis of clause 9 of the terms and conditions of Regularization Notification dated 21.03.2018 as well as Sub Section (2) of Section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of E&SE Department (Appointment & Regularization of Services) Act, ATTESTED

**医**尼州拉纳 1897年第

2017 by placing the name of the appellant at correct seniority position with all consequential benefits. Any other remedy which this august Tribunal deem fit may also be awarded in favour of appellant."

- Through this single judgment, we intend to dispose of the instant service appeal as well as connected service appeals, which are mentioned below as in all these appeals common questions of law and facts are involved.
  - 1. Service Appeal No. 2362/2023
  - Service Appeal No. 2363/2023
  - 3. Service Appeal No. 2364/2023
  - Service Appeal No. 2365/2023
  - Service Appeal No. 2366/2023
  - Service Appeal No. 2367/2023

  - Service Appeal No. 2368/2023
  - 8. Service Appeal No. 2369/2023
  - 9. Service Appeal No. 2370/2023
  - 10. Service Appeal No. 2371/2023
  - 11. Service Appeal No. 2372/2023
  - 12. Service Appeal No. 2373/2023
  - 13. Service Appeal No. 2374/2023
  - 14. Service Appeal No. 2375/2023
  - 15. Service Appeal No. 2376/2023
  - Service Appeal No. 2377/2023
  - 17. Service Appeal No. 2378/2023
  - 18. Service Appeal No. 2379/2023
  - 19. Service Appeal No. 2380/2023
  - 20. Service Appeal No. 2381/2023
  - 21. Service Appeal No. 2382/2023
  - 22. Service Appeal No. 2383/2023
  - 23. Service Appeal No. 2384/2023
  - 24. Service Appeal No. 2385/2023
  - 25: Service Appeal No. 2386/2023
  - 26. Service Appeal No. 2387/2023

  - 27. Service Appeal No. 2388/2023
  - 28. Service Appeal No. 2389/2023
  - 29. Service Appeal No. 2390/2023 30. Service Appeal No. 2391/2023

  - 31. Service Appeal No. 2392/2023 32. Service Appeal No. 2393/2023
  - 33. Service Appeal No. 2394/2023
  - 34. Service Appeal No. 2395/2023
  - 35. Service Appeal No. 2396/2023
  - 36. Service Appeal No. 2397/2023.
  - 37. Service Appeal No. 2398/2023
  - 38. Service Appeal No. 2399/2023
  - 39. Service Appeal No. 2400/2023
  - 40. Service Appeal No. 2401/2023
  - 41. Service Appeal No. 2402/2023



(b)

42. Service Appeal No. 2403/2023

43 Service Appeal No. 2404/2023

44. Service Appeal No. 2405/2023.

45. Service Appeal No. 2406/2023

46. Service Appeal No. 2407/2023

47. Service Appeal No. 2408/2023

48. Service Appeal No. 2409/2023

49. Service Appeal No. 2410/2023

50. Service Appeal No. 2411/2023

51. Service Appeal No. 2412/2023

52. Service Appeal No. 2413/2023

53. Service Appeal No. 2414/2023

54. Service Appeal No. 2415/2023

55. Service Appeal No. 2416/2023

56. Service Appeal No. 2417/2023

57. Service Appeal No. 2418/2023

58. Service Appeal No. 2419/2023

59. Service Appeal No. 2420/2023

Brief facts giving rise to the service appeals are that, the appellants were initially appointed as PSTs on contract basis vide Notificationdated: 05.03.2016, 07.03.2016 and 03.05.2016 by the DEO (M) Dir Upper. During course of their service, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointmentand Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 was promulgated and in light of the same, their services were regularized vide Notification bearing Endorsement No. 1561-67/No. 158/DEO(M)ADO (P) PES/Estab dated 21.03.2018 with effect from the date of their initial appointment. The seniority list of the appellants, as well as other adhoc appointees whose services were regularized on the strength of Regularization Act, 2017 vide order dated 21.03.2018, was drawn on the basis of score obtained by them in test conducted by National Testing Service (NTS). The appellants are of the view that their inter-se-seniority was required to have been fixe daTe-wise in view of Clause-9 of terms and conditions of the regularization Notification dated 21.03.2018 as well as Sub-Section-2 of Section-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of Elementary & Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017, therefore, they filed objection on the seniority list on 17.08.2019,

KIND THE RINGS



however the same was not responded. The appellants, thereafter, submitted departmental appeal on 26.07.2023 but the same was also not responded, constraining them to file appeals before this Tribunal for redressal of their grievance.

- 4. Respondents were put on notice who submitted written replies/comments on the appeal. We have heard the learned counsel for the appellant as well as the learned Deputy District Attorney and perused the case file with connected documents in detail.
- Learned counsel for the appellant argued that appellants have not been treated in accordance with law and rules on the subject and as such respondents violated Article 4 and 25 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. He further argued that impugned seniority list issued by the respondents, whereby the seniority of the appellant has been determined on the basis of merit position and not on the basis of clause 9 of the terms and condition of Regularization of Notification dated 21.03.2018 and Sub-Section 2 of the Section 4 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the E&SE. Department Appointment and Regularization Act, 2017 are against the law, facts, norms of natural justice and material on the record, hence not tenable and liable to be modified. He further argued that appellants are fully entitled for seniority, being eligible in all respect, therefore, he requested that instant appeal might be accepted.
- 6. Conversely learned Deputy District Attorney contended that the appellants have been treated in accordance with law and rules. He further contended that after promulgation of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointmentand Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 appellants have been placed in the seniority list on the basis of merit accordingly as per section 17 (part-vi)

(g)

Seniority of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989. Furthermore, terms and condition No.9 of the regularization notification dated 21.03.2018, is for those candidates who are having same merit position in their first appointment order.

Perusal of record reveals that the appellants were appointed as PSTs 7. (BPS-12) on contract basis vide Notification dated 05.03.2016, 07.03.2016 and 03.05.2016. During the course of their service, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 was enacted vide Notification bearing Endorsement No.1561-67-F.No. 21.03.2018, their services 158/DEO(M)/ADO(P)Estb dated regularized with effect from the date of their initial appointments. Clause-9 of Terms and Conditions as mentioned in the afore-mentioned regularization Notification dated 21.03.2018 is regarding determination of seniority, which is reproduced as below:-

"Their Seniority shall be determined on the basis of their continuous service in cadre, provided that if the date of continuous service in the case of two or more employees is the same, the employees older in age shall rank senior to the younger one."

8. Moreover, the criteria for determination of inter-se-seniority of the employees regularized under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 has been provided in Sub-Section 2 of Section-4 of the said Act, which is reproduced as below:-

"4. Determination of seniority.---(1)The employees whose services are regularized under this Act or in the process of ATTESTED attaining service at the commencement of this Act, shall rank

junior to all other employees belonging to the same Cadre, who are in service on regular basis on the commencement of this Act, and shall also rank junior to such other persons, if any, who, in pursuance of the recommendation of the Commission made before the commencement of this Act, or to be appointed to the Cadre, irrespective of their actual date of appointment.

- (2) The seniority inter-se of those employees, whose services are regularized under this Act within the Cadre, shall be determined on the basis of their continuous service in Cadre:
- Provided that if the date of continuous service in the case of two or more employees is the same, the employee older in age shall rank senior to the younger one."
- 9. It is also worth mentioning that according to Section-5 of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017, the provisions of the said act shall have an overriding effect and the provisions of any such law or rules to the extent of inconsistency with the said Act shall cease to have effect.
- 10. In view of Clause-9 of regularization notification bearing Endorsement No. dated 21.03.2018 as well as Sub-Section-2 of Section-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017, the inter-se-seniority of the regularized PSTs was to be determined on the basis of their continuous service in cadre provided that if the date of continuous service in the case of two or more employees was the same, the employee older in age shall rank senior to the younger one. While going through the impugned seniority list attached by the appellants with their appeals, the inter-se seniority of the PSTs regularized through Notification dated 21.03.2018 has been determined, on the basis of score obtained by them in written test conducted through NTS, which was not a correct criteria for determining their

Khybur

inter-se-seniority. The NTS score was relevant for appointment and not for determining inter-se-seniority of the regularized PSTs.

- In view of the above discussion, it is directed that theinter-se seniority 11. of those PSTs, who were regularized through notification bearing Endorsement No. 1561-67-F.No. 158/DEO(M)/ADO(P)Estb dated 21.03:2018, shall be determined on the basis of Clause-9 of terms and conditions of regularization Notification dated 21.03.2018 as well as Sub-Section-2 of Section-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Employees of the Elementary and Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017 by placing the names of the appellants at correct seniority positions with all consequential benefits. The appeals are allowed in the said terms. Costs shall followithe events. Consign.
- Pronounced in open court inPeshawar and given under our hands and 12. seal of the Tribunal on this 16th day of February, 2024.

(FAREEHA PAUL) Member (E)

(RASHIDA BANO)

Member (J)

ATTESTED

Date of ? Number of VC Copying From Petto of Date of Loa.

# ۱۱ (۱) الم الكالفي المحالية ا

عنوان: درخواست بمرادعمل درآمد کرنے تھم و فیصله محرره16/02/2024 جاری کرده ازال خیبر پختو نخواه سروس ٹرابیول، پیثاور

جناب عالی! مؤد بانہ گزارش کی جاتی ہے کہ ہم نے (محمد اقبال و 59 دیگر) سکورہیں سینیار ٹی اور پچھلے 199 ساتذہ کرام جوسکورہیں سینیار ٹی پر 30/05/2022 کو پروموٹ ہو چکے تھے سروس ٹرابیوئل خیبر پختو نخواہ بیں چیلئے کر کے عمر کے لحاظ سے سینیار ٹی اور پروموثن، بقایا جات اور 99 پروموٹ شدہ اساتذہ کرام سے سینیار ٹی کی استدعا کی تھی ۔ جس پرمعزز عدالت سروس ٹرابیوئل خیبر پختو نخواہ نے ہمارے حق میں فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ محررہ فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ محررہ فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ محررہ فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ محررہ فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ محررہ فیصلہ سناتے ہوئے سینیار ٹی ، پروموثن اور بقایا جات دینے کا تھم جاری کیا ہے ۔ (تھم و فیصلہ میں ٹرابیوئل خیبر پختونخواہ لف ہمرا درخواست بزاہے )۔

اس لئے آپ کی خدمت اقدس میں التماس کی جاتی ہے کہ ہمیں سینیارٹی اور بقایا جات تھم و فیصلہ محررہ 16/02/2024 سر وس ٹرابیونل خیبر پختو نخواہ کی روشنی میں وینے کے احکامات صادر فرمائے جائے۔

عين نوازش ہوگی۔ المرقوم: 14/05/2024

ا کے دستھا و درخواست کے دستھط درخواست کے ساتھ لف ہیں



Denson of the sol Se add in JAD Juing Former ? aphology 220 J. W. W. 255 1600 Zat 52 40 5 lm Somewald J. Will 5 me hay 2 1 - 1 - 1 2 5 cm 3 WOLL Cepp D 2 EL 2013 52 IN ONE ). July Chi STE ( May 1) 22 St Eliab St Will 200 gr 2.12 Nin de Davis Housell -200 00 JOD Strong mar 181 Excly سال اس ام The woller The farm سيده كشمه 46 Al Lougher Days 34 prices tooth 1502th मी जारल Notus 15 Herito tox Der \$ 19 -181 W/ (W/ 14. Warst متدائمه وع 181 DEN/810 Jan Mary as do da سلامك المع 112/0/201 Se swiring 38 21 WOLLE MINE Jalus, 29 INVAL The same 3 2 NOV - stoll UL 13 EL 83 35 12 LS 35 The Just 21 Sul 1 lun Nous Wolf ( 797PM 18 m/4/20 12000 ) 1 Shulle. 22 2/1/245 00 com 2 33 - Comment appen 22 Jana 1 08/91 Jems whole The same 25 Whay 15 -de 1800 STATION 10/0/ - my

## VAKALATNAMA BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

_	EP	No/20 <u>2</u> 4	. '
<u>Bodullah</u>	Shall	(PLAI	LLANT) NTIFF)
	· VI	(PETI E <b>RSUS</b>	TIONER)
Edu ol.	<del></del>		ONDENT) NDANT)
I/We Abdu	llah Sha		
for his default an Advocate Couns Advocate to dep	id with the aut el on my/ou osit, withdraw its payable or o	noted matter, without hority to engage/approximately to engage/approximately authority and receive on my/our deposited on my/our	ooint any other rize the said our behalf all
Dated/	/202	Abaly	in while
		<u>CLIENT</u>	
		<u>ACCEPTED</u>	
		NOOR MOHAMM ADVOCATE SUPE WALEED ADNAM	
		. (	J.
		UMAR FAROOQ I	HOHMAND
	8	KHANŽAD GUL	
		ABID ALI SHAH	

**ADVOCATES** 

OFFICE;

Flat No. (TF) 291-292 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Deans Trade Centre, Peshawar Cantt. (0311-9314232)