

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

Service Appeal # 324/2024

Mr. Murad GulAppellant.

VERSUS

Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others.....Respondents.

Service INDEX # 324/2024

S.#	Description of Documents	Annex	Pages
1.	Para-wise comments/reply		1-3
2.	Affidavit		4
3.	Authority Letter		5
4.	Annexures	A-E	6-17

Description of Documents Page
 1. Para-wise comments/reply
 2. Affidavit
 3. Authority Letter
 4. Annexures

Deponent

Description of Documents Page
 1. Para-wise comments/reply
 2. Affidavit
 3. Authority Letter
 4. Annexures

Deponent

Description of Documents Page
 1. Para-wise comments/reply
 2. Affidavit
 3. Authority Letter
 4. Annexures

Deponent

BEFORE THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA SERVICE TRIBUNAL, PESHAWAR.

In Service Appeal No. 324/2024

Mr. Murad GulAppellant.

VERSUS

Secretary E&SE Department & Others.....Respondents.

PARAWISE COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF THE RESPONDENTS NOS. 01 & 02.

Respectfully Sheweth,

Preliminary Objections:

1. The appellant has not come to this Court with clean hands.
2. The appellant is estopped by her own conduct to file the present service appeal.
3. The present appeal is against the prevailing law and rules hence not maintainable in the eye of law.
4. The appellant is not entitled for any relief, he has sought from this Honorable Tribunal.
5. The present appellant is liable to be dismissed being devoid of any merits.
6. The appellant is just wasting the precious time of this Honorable Tribunal.
7. The appellant has no local standi to file the instant service appeal.
8. The appellant is not aggrieved under Section-04 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal Act, 1974 read with Article-212 of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

On Facts

1. Para-01 pertains to the appellant record of appointment in Elementary & Secondary Education Department as Arabic Teacher and his subsequent regularization, which has no concern with the instant case, therefore needs no comments.
2. Para-02 pertains to the nomination of the appellant for Provincial Text Books review committee which is not disputed hence needs no comments.
3. Incorrect and denied. Consequent upon various complaints, received regarding serious mistakes and errors in the textbooks of Islamiyah for Classes 4th, 7th, 8th published for the Academic year 2022-23, the respondent Constituted inquiry committee vide notification bearing No. SO(B&T)/11-13/SS Islamiyah/TBB Peshawar dated 22-09-2022. The inquiry committee submitted its report and held responsible the appellants amongst others. As sufficient evidence was available therefore, on the basis of findings/recommendations of the Fact Finding Inquiry, the competent authority served the appellant direct show cause notice under section 5(1) of E&D Rules 2011, dispensing with formal inquiry as provided in Rule-07 of the Rules ibid as amended on 31-12-2021. The competent authority authorized Secretary Tourism to extend the opportunity of personal hearing. The competent authority after the recommendation of the inquiry committee, reply of show cause notice and report of personal hearing officer has passed the impugned notification whereby two annual increments have been withheld for two years.

4. Para-04 pertains to record of order dated 22-09-2022 for examination of review record and conformity of errors/mistakes, in which the name of the appellant was included hence needs no comments.
5. Para-5 is incorrect and denied. The respondents issued show-cause notice on 18-12-2022 against which the appellant submitted reply, however the respondents after examining the reply of show-cause notice, affording opportunity of personal hearing on 09-02-2023 by the Secretary Culture, Tourism, Archaeology & Museum Department on behalf of the competent authority, cross-examination, consulting other relevant record and after fulfilling the codal formalities rightly/legally imposed minor penalty withholding of 02 annual increments for two years.
6. Para-6 is incorrect and denied. As narrated above the appellant was provided opportunity of personal hearing to defend himself before the personal hearing officer on 09-02-2023, hence the appellant was treated as per Principal of natural justice and cannot claimed as unheard.
7. Para-07 is incorrect and denied. Consequent upon various complaints, received regarding serious mistakes and errors in the textbooks of Islamiyah for Classes 4th, 7th, 8th published for the Academic year 2022-23, the respondent Constituted inquiry committee vide notification bearing No. SO(B&T)/11-13/SS Islamiyah/TBB Peshawar dated 22-09-2022. The inquiry committee submitted is report and held responsible the appellants amongst others.(**Inquiry Report Annexure-A**). As sufficient evidence was available therefore, on the basis of findings/recommendations of the Fact Finding Inquiry, the competent authority served the appellant direct show cause notice under section 5(1) of E&D Rules 2011, dispensing with formal inquiry as provided in Rule-07 of the Rules ibid as amended on 31-12-2021 (**Annexure-B**). The competent authority authorized Secretary Tourism to extend the opportunity of personal hearing. The competent authority after the recommendation of the inquiry committee, reply of show cause notice and report of personal hearing officer has passed the impugned notification whereby two annual increments have been withhold for two years.
8. Para-08 is incorrect and denied. The impugned order was timely communicated to the appellant and departmental appeal/review was filed by the competent authority being devoid of merit.

On Grounds:

- A. Incorrect and denied. The respondents fulfilled the legal procedure as laid down in E&D Rules, 2011 awarded the penalty impugned in the instant service appeal. The details are given at Para-07 of the facts above.
- B. Incorrect and denied. The impugned notification dated 19-10-2023 was issued after following the procedure and provisions of E&D Rules, 2011. As sufficient evidence was available therefore, on the basis of findings/recommendations of the Fact Finding

Inquiry, the competent authority served the appellant direct show cause notice under section 5(1) of E&D Rules 2011, dispensing with formal inquiry as provided in Rule-07 of the Rules ibid as amended on 31-12-2021. Therefore, the contention of the appellant regarding formal inquiry is not required and is as for section 5(1) of E&D Rules 2011.

- C. Incorrect and denied. The appellant was found guilty due to errors/mistakes/negligence in reviewing the textbooks of Class-VII by the inquiry committee and subsequent departmental proceedings.
- D. Incorrect and denied. The respondents penalized all the co-accused. For example Dr. Sajid Ur Rehman was awarded minor penalty of holding of two annual increments vide notification dated 19-10-2023 (Annex-C) similarly penalty of two annual increments is also imposed upon Mr. Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan and Mr. Saeed Ur Rehman vide notifications dated 19-10-2023 and dated 13-10-2022 (Annex-D & E) therefore, the contention of the appellant regarding discriminatory treatment is baseless and liable to be rejected.
- E. Incorrect and denied. The impugned notification dated 19-10-2023 issued by the respondents is as per E&D Rules, 2011 and other Laws/Rules/Policies in field.
- F. Incorrect and denied. As per ground-E above.
- G. Incorrect and denied. The respondents imposed the impugned penalty in light of relevant Law/Rules and Policies in field and the instant service appeal being de-void of merits is liable to be dismissed with cost.
- H. Incorrect and denied. The appellant was treated as per relevant Laws/Rules/Policies and acted as per Article-04 & Article-25 of the Constitution of Pakistan, 1973 as per details mentioned at Para No. D of the grounds.

It is therefore, most humbly requested that the applicant being non-maintainable may kindly be dismissed with cost.



(Mr. Faiz Alam)
(Additional Secretary (Estab),
E&SE Department
On behalf of
SECRETARY
E&SE Department Khyber
Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
(Respondent No: 01 & 02)

BEFORE THE HON'BLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

Service Appeal # 324/2024

Mr. Murad Gul Appellant

VERSUS

Secretary E&SE Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others..... Respondents

BEFORE THE HON'BLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

AFFIDAVIT

Service Appeal # 324/2024

I, **Fiaz Alam**, Additional Secretary (Estab), Elementary & Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that
Mr. Murad Gul Appellant

Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that

VERSUS

the contents of the accompanying para-wise comments, submitted by the Secretary E&SE Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others..... Respondents,

respondents, are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and

BEFORE THE HON'BLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Court.

Service Appeal # 324/2024

It is further, stated on oath that in this appeal the answering

I, **Fiaz Alam**, Additional Secretary (Estab), Elementary & Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that
Mr. Murad Gul Appellant

Respondents have neither been placed ex-parte nor has their defense Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that

been struck off.

VERSUS

the contents of the accompanying para-wise comments, submitted by the Secretary E&SE Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others..... Respondents,

respondents, are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and

BEFORE THE HON'BLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Court.

Service Appeal # 324/2024

(Fiaz Alam)

Additional Secretary (Estab)



It is further, stated on oath that in this appeal the answering I, **Fiaz Alam**, Additional Secretary (Estab), Elementary & Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that
Mr. Murad Gul Appellant

Respondents have neither been placed ex-parte nor has their defense Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that

been struck off. the contents of the accompanying para-wise comments, submitted by the Secretary E&SE Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others..... Respondents,

respondents, are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and

BEFORE THE HON'BLE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR nothing has been concealed from this Honorable Court.

Service Appeal # 324/2024 (Fiaz Alam) Additional Secretary (Estab)

It is further, stated on oath that in this appeal the answering I, **Fiaz Alam**, Additional Secretary (Estab), Elementary & Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that
Mr. Murad Gul Appellant

Respondents have neither been placed ex-parte nor has their defense Secondary Education, Department do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that

been struck off. the contents of the accompanying para-wise comments, submitted by the Secretary E&SE Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa & others..... Respondents,

5



**GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT**

Block "A" Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

Phone No. 091-9211128

AUTHORITY LETTER

It is certified that **Muhammad Shah Orakzai, Superintendent (Litigation-II)** Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar is hereby authorized to submit parawise comments on behalf of Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Peshawar in "Service Appeal" # B24/2024 Case Titled Mr. Murad Gul

Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar & Others.

It is certified that **Muhammad Shah Orakzai, Superintendent (Litigation-II)** Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar is hereby authorized to submit parawise comments on behalf of Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Peshawar in "Service Appeal" # B24/2024 Case Titled Mr. Murad Gul

Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar & Others.

It is certified that **Muhammad Shah Orakzai, Superintendent (Litigation-II)** Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar is hereby authorized to submit parawise comments on behalf of Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Peshawar in "Service Appeal" # B24/2024 Case Titled Mr. Murad Gul

Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar & Others.

It is certified that **Muhammad Shah Orakzai, Superintendent (Litigation-II)** Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar is hereby authorized to submit parawise comments on behalf of Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Peshawar in "Service Appeal" # B24/2024 Case Titled Mr. Murad Gul

Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar & Others.



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

Block "A" Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

Phone No. 091-9211128

Dated Peshawar, the 27-08-2024.

NOTIFICATION

NO.SO(Lit-II)/E&SED/1-5/2021. I, Mr. Masood Ahmad, Secretary Elementary & Secondary Education Department is pleased to authorize Mr. Fiaz Alam, Additional Secretary (Establishment) Elementary & Secondary Education Department to sign parawise comments, replies, implementation reports, objection petitions, civil miscellaneous applications etc on my behalf for submission before various courts of law/tribunals in the best public interest.

(MASOOD AHMAD)
SECRETARY TO THE
GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

Endst: of even No. & date.

Copy forwarded to the:-

1. Chief Secretary Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
2. Advocate General Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
3. Secretary Law Department.
4. Registrar Peshawar High Court Peshawar (with one each Spare copy for the Honorable Judges).
5. Registrar Service Tribunal Peshawar (with one each Spare copy for the Honorable Chairman/Members).
6. All Section Officers (Litigation) E&SE Department.
7. FS to Secretary, E&SE Department.
8. PA to Additional Secretary (General) E&SE Department.
9. PA to Deputy Secretary (Legal-I&II) E&SE Department.

SECTION OFFICER (Lit-II)

INQUIRY REPORTNOTIFICATION

The Competent Authority vide Notification No. SO(B.T)/11-13/SS ISLAMIYAT/TBB Peshawar dated 22-09-2022 constituted an Inquiry Committee comprising of the following officers to probe into the mistakes and errors in the Textbooks of Islamiyat for Classes 4th, 7th & 8th published for the Academic Year 2022-23 (Annex-A).

INQUIRY COMMITTEE

1. Mr. Abdul Akram,
Additional Secretary (General)
2. Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Ibrahim,
Director, Directorate of E&SE

INQUIRY PROCEEDINGS

The following procedure has been followed to dig out the reported mistakes in the Textbook of Islamiyat for class 4th, 7th and 8th for academic year 2022-23.

- i. Collected textbooks of Islamiyat of all the Classes from grade 01 to 12 including Class 4th, 7th & 8th from Textbook Board Peshawar.
- ii. Summoned all the stakeholders including authorities from DCTE, Textbook Board and publishers to appear before the inquiry committee on 19-09-2022 along with all relevant records, manuscripts, NOCs, minutes of the meetings and etc (Annex-B).
- iii. Received minutes, manuscripts and other materials from TBB, DCTE and publishers (Annex-C, D & E)
- iv. Recorded statements of all the stakeholders including DCTE, TBB, reviewers and publishers (Annex-F, G, H & I).
- v. Discussed each and every word, phrase and sentences with all the stakeholders in light of all parameters set for textbooks including Students Learning Outcomes, ideology and boundaries based on religious beliefs and so on.
- vi. The inquiry committee thoroughly interviewed representatives from DCTE, TBB and publishers.
- vii. Examined and scrutinized all available relevant policies, records, minutes, statements and manuscripts right from single national curriculum, DCTE, TBB, publishers and to printers.

BRIEF OF THE CASE

Authorities of the Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa received various reports from different sources regarding mistakes and errors in

Atty. Gen.
Muz

نمبر شمار	کتاب	کلاس	صفحہ نمبر	لائسن نمبر	غلطی
1	اسلامیات	7	10	4	خلیفہ دوم حضرت ابوبکرؓ
2	اسلامیات	7	10	16	اہل بیتؑ کی بعثت کے ساتھ وحی کی آمد کا سلسلہ رک چکا ہے۔
3	اسلامیات	8	97	15	سیدنا امام حسینؑ
4	اسلامیات	4			اگرچہ اسلام قبول نہیں کیا۔
5	اردو	7 th	-	-	غازی علم الدین کا سبق درسی کتاب سے ہٹایا گیا ہے۔

KPTLM POLICY REGARDING TEXTBOOK AND LEARNING MATERIALS PRINTING AND PUBLICATION

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board (TBB) and Directorate of Curriculum and Teachers Education (DCTE) are empowered to develop, review and print textbooks and learning materials for all the institutions in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa from Grade 01-12 through Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action 2017. Therefore, relevant Sections in respect of Textbook & Learning Materials development, review and printing are reproduced here as under:

- 2.2 Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board shall be transformed to competently perform the functions of facilitating, monitoring and regulating the process of textbooks development, and shall review and help support the process of approval of textbooks for use in schools in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 2.3 DCTE is the competent authority to approve textbooks and certify that a particular textbook is compatible with Curriculum. As part of the review and approval process, Textbook Board shall seek a No Objection Certificate from the DCTE for all textbooks whether prepared by publishers or by the Textbook Board(Annex-J).

REVIEW PROCESS

In the KPTLM Policy, 2017, review of Textbook is based on three tiers: Internal Review Committee (IRC), Provincial Textbook Review Committee(PTRC) and Select Committee(SC). Book development starts at the desk of concerned Subject Specialist in KPTBB when a publisher submits initial draft/ manuscript for desk review. After necessary correction and alignment with curriculum, the final shape of book is set in terms of layout, designing, pictures, illustrations, SLOs and benchmark etc.

After approval from the IRC, the book is sent to the DCTE for PTRC. PTRC is conducted under the supervision of DCTE, Abbottabad and experts from diverse educational background are invited to participate. PTRC is the foundation on which the structure of the whole textbook is erected.

The publisher makes all the necessary changes proposed by the PTRC and after incorporation, the book is submitted for SC.

The mandate of the SC is a superior review committee and is responsible to review the manuscript and reduce errors and mistakes upto Zero Level. Select Committee is responsible to take the final decision on the manuscript.

ROLE OF KPTBB

Under KPTLM Policy, Textbook Board is responsible for development of textbooks and conducts a review on the book through a committee, call the Internal Review Committee (IRC). In the case of these Textbooks this stage was skipped as per agreed timeline. Textbook Board shall seek No Objection Certificate (NOC) from DCTE for all textbooks whether prepared by publisher or Textbook Board.

ROLE OF DCTE

DCTE is the Competent Authority to approve textbooks and certify that the particular textbook is compatible with the curriculum and issues NOC. For this purpose the book is reviewed twice in the DCTE.

First review is called PTRC. In PTRC there are five members, two are the subject specialists of DCTE and TBB while three other experts are nominated by the DCTE. The book is reviewed within 4 to 5 days and errors/ mistakes/ addition/ deletion is recommended and incorporated accordingly.

After incorporation of all the recommendations the book is placed before the SC i.e. a review committee at DCTE, consisting of four members, same two subject specialists of DCTE and KPTBB and two subject experts nominated by DCTE. In this review the book is further refined in light of the curriculum and recommendations of PTRC, and after that NOC is issued. They have also the power to recommend the book to be rejected.

FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF ERROR NO. 01

- i. From perusal of record it is evident that the representative of DCTE produced tempered and modified manuscript without bearing signatures neither reviewers nor any representative of the DCTE.
- ii. The mistake i.e. writing second Khalifa Hazrat Abu Baker (RA) instead of first Khalifa in the Class 7th Textbook of Islamiyat Page-10 (Line No. 04) was found in both the manuscript of Textbook Board and publisher (AFAQ).
- iii. Reviewers Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal Govt. High School No. 01, Haveliyan, Abbottabad, Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher, Govt. High School Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad, Mr. Rajab Ali, SST, Govt. High School No. 01, Abbottabad, Mst. Shabana Shaheen, Desk Officer, DCTE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Abbottabad, Dr. Sajid Rehman Orakzai Hangu (Subject Specialist) Islamiyat, KPTBB are mainly responsible for the mistakes and errors.
- iv. Chairman TBB, Mr. Jaffar Mansoor Abbasi, Director, DCTE being head of reviewer committee, Syed Amjad Ali Shah, Additional Director, DCTE being heads of the their respective formations are accountable.
- v. It is also evident from the textbooks that the reviewers have gone through

M. Ali

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

- (10)
- ii. The textbook is bearing the text "Test Edition" at title page and a proforma for getting feedback from all stakeholders is available at the 02nd last page of the textbook.

FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF ERROR NO. 02

- i. A very grave nature of error rather blunder was reported on Page-10 (Line No. 16) in the textbook of Islamiyat for Class 7th, where revelation has been shown stopped after bestowing prophethood on the Hazrat Muhammad (PBUH).
- ii. From perusal of record it is evident that Line No. 15 & 16 of Page-10 were not present in the manuscript of National Curriculum Council (NCC) but the two lines were inserted in the second manuscript of NCC.
- iii. Authorities of DCTE and reviewers have neither raised any objection on the fresh and modified two lines nor bothered to correct the blunder and issued NOC to the publisher (AFAQ) without proper review and rectification.
- iv. Subject Specialist of TBB has also shown negligence and failed to point out the mistake and correct the manuscript before sending it to printers.
- vi. Reviewers Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal Govt. High School No. 01, Haveliyan, Abbottabad, Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher, Govt. High School Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad, Mr. Rajab Ali, SST, Govt. High School No. 01, Abbottabad, Mst. Shabana Shaheen, Desk Officer, DCTE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Abbottabad, Dr. Sajid Rehman Orakzai Hangu (Subject Specialist) Islamiyat, KPTBB are mainly responsible for the mistakes and errors.
- vii. Chairman TBB, Mr. Jaffar Mansoor Abbasi, Director, DCTE being head of reviewer committee, Syed Amjad Ali Shah, Additional Director, DCTE being heads of the their respective formations are accountable.
- viii. The textbook is bearing the text "Test Edition" at title page and a proforma for getting feedback from all stakeholders is available at the 02nd last page of the textbook.

FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF ERROR NO. 03

- iii. An error i.e. Syedna Imam Hussain (RA) was written instead of Syedna Imam Hassan (RA) in the textbook of Islamiyat for Class-08th at Page-97 (Line No. 15),
- iv. Publisher i.e. AFAQ admitted the above said mistake.
- v. According to KPTLM Policy Section 3.2.5 Textbook Board and DCTE will establish their review panels to review the manuscripts submitted in light of the standards set for textbooks. Meaning thereby, reviewers at TBB and DCTE have not played their due role during review and failed to identify
- AFAQ
DCTE

- vi. Reviewers Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal Govt. High School No. 01, Haveliyan, Abbottabad, Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher, Govt. High School Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad, Mr. Rajab Ali, SST, Govt. High School No. 01, Abbottabad, Mst. Shabana Shaheen, Desk Officer, DCTE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Abbottabad, Dr. Sajid Rehman Orakzai Hangu (Subject Specialist) Islamiyat, KPTBB are mainly responsible for the mistakes and errors.
- vii. Chairman TBB, Mr. Jaffar Mansoor Abbasi, Director, DCTE being head of reviewer committee, Syed Amjad Ali Shah, Additional Director, DCTE being heads of their respective formations are accountable.
- viii. The textbook is bearing the text "Test Edition" at title page and a proforma for getting feedback from all stakeholders is available at the 02nd last page of the textbook.

FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF ERROR NO. 04

- i. A phrase or clause has been reported by different sources and found in the textbook of Islamiyat for Class-4th at Page-36 (Line No. 18) گرچہ اسلام قبول نہیں کیا
- ii. After thorough and careful examination of record, statement and during discussion it was found that the above said phrase or clause was not present in the textbook of 2021-22 but it was inserted in the textbook of 2022-23.
- iii. It was also found that during scrutiny of documents Special Committee constituted by Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa for special review recommended the above said phrase to insert in the textbook. A Sub Committee was constituted at TBB on the subject issue to further ponder on the matter recommended by special committee. Subcommittee, after due deliberation, advised not to insert the above said phrase. But later on Subject Specialist at TBB inserted the same into the textbook but its approval from Competent Authority i.e. Chairman TBB has not been found.
- iv. Reviewer and Subject Specialist at TBB is responsible of the insertion of the phrase or clause which is not advisable for the students of Class-04th.
- v. Sufficient time to review the manuscripts were not given to the reviewers due to shrinking of this academic year.

FINDINGS IN RESPECT OF ERROR NO. 05

- i. A lesson on Ghazi Aleem Ud Din was present in the textbook of Class 07th published in 2021-22 but the same is missing in the new edition i.e. for 2022-23.

Murad Mansoor

RECOMMENDATIONS

- i. Disciplinary proceedings under E&D Rules may be initiated against the following officers because these are mainly responsible of the errors, mistakes and blunders:
 1. Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal Govt. High School No. 01, Haveliyan, Abbottabad
 2. Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher, Govt. High School Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad
 3. Mr. Rajab Ali, SST, Govt. High School No. 01, Abbottabad
 4. Mst. Shabana Shaheen, Desk Officer, DCTE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Abbottabad
 5. Dr. Sajid Rehman, Subject Specialist Islamiyat, KPTBB
- ii. Strict Instructions may be served upon the following officers for remaining careful in future:
 1. Mr. Arshad Afridi, the then Chairman TBB
 2. Mr. Jaffar Mansoor Abbasi, the then Director, DCTE
 3. Syed Amjad Ali Shah, Additional Director, DCTE
- iii. Subject Specialists of Islamiyat at TBB and DCTE may immediately be removed from their present positions.
- iv. Chairman Textbook Board Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Director DCTE may be directed to nominate different subject specialists for IRC, PTRC and SC instead of giving the task to one and the same subject specialist.
- v. Selection and appointment of Subject Specialist for TBB and DCTE may be carried out through strict merit and tough competition taking into account their qualifications, publications, experience, suitability and aptitude.
- vi. Sufficient time may be given to the reviewers in order to avoid such like mistakes in future.
- vii. KP TBB and DCTE may introduce necessary amendments in KPTLM Policy for development textbooks at any level to avoid any manipulation.
- viii. KP TBB may be directed to issue a Notification where the above referred mistakes may be rectified.
- ix. KP TBB may be directed to re-include the lesson of "Ghazi Aleem Ud Din" in textbook of Urdu Class 07th for upcoming Academic Year 2023-24.

Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Ibrahim
Director/
E&SE Peshawar 4/107.

Mr. Abdul Akram
Additional Secretary
E&SED

13

Annexure - B



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the, 19th October, 2023.

NOTIFICATION.

No. SO(B&T)E&SE/11-1/SS Islamiyat/TBB

WHEREAS Mr. Murad Gul,

Islamiyat Teacher (BS-15), GHS Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad was proceeded against under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011 for mistakes and errors in the Textbooks of Islamiyat for Classes 4th, 7th & 8th for the Academic Year, 2022-23.

2. AND WHEREAS Mr. Abdul Akram, (PMS BS-18), Addl. Secretary, E&SE Department and Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Ibrahim, Ex-Director, Directorate of E&SE conducted inquiry against the accused.

3. AND WHEREAS the inquiry committee after having examined the charges, evidence on record and explanation of the accused, submitted the report.

4. AND WHEREAS a show cause notice was served on him and major penalty of "Dismissal from Service" was tentatively imposed upon the accused by the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). In response to the show cause notice, Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism, was nominated to give an opportunity of personal hearing to the accused on his behalf.

5. AND WHEREAS Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism afforded personal hearing to the accused on behalf of the Competent Authority on 09.02.2023 who recommended imposition of minor penalty instead of major penalty under Rules-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.

6. NOW, THEREFORE, in exercise of the powers conferred upon him under Rule 4 (1) (a) (ii) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011, the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) after considering the findings and recommendations of the inquiry committee and hearing officer, is pleased to impose minor penalty of "Withholding Of Two Annual Increment For Two Years" upon Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher (BS-15), GHS Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad with immediate effect.

SECRETARY

Ends: of even No. & Date.

Copy is forwarded to:-

1. Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
2. Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
3. Chairman, KP-Textbook Board, Peshawar.
4. Director, E&SE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
5. District Education Officer (Male), Abbottabad.
6. Mr. Murad Gul, Islamiyat Teacher (BS-15), GHS Kangarh Mera, Abbottabad.
7. PS to Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
8. PS to Secretary E&SE Department, Peshawar.
9. Office order file.

20-10-23

[Signature]
SECTION OFFICER (BOARDS & TRG)

Attested
[Signature]

promotion or financial advancement, in accordance with the rules or orders pertaining to the service or post:

Provided that the penalty of withholding increments shall not be imposed on a Government servant who has reached the maximum of his pay scale:

- (iii) recovery of the whole or any part of any pecuniary loss caused to Government by negligence or breach of order;

(b) Major penalties:

- ¹[(i) reduction to a lower post or pay scale or to a lower stage in a time scale for a maximum period of five years:

Provided that on a restoration to original pay scale or post, the penalized Government servant will be placed below his erstwhile juniors promoted to higher posts during subsistence of the period of penalty;]

- (ii) compulsory retirement;
- (iii) removal from service; and
- (iv) dismissal from service.

(2) Dismissal from service under these rules shall disqualify a Government servant from future employment under Government.

(3) Any penalty under these rules shall not absolve a Government servant from liability to any other punishment to which he may be liable for an offence, under any other law, committed by him while in service.

5. Initiation of proceedings.—(1) If on the basis of its own knowledge or information placed before it, the competent authority is of the opinion that there are sufficient grounds for initiating proceedings against a Government servant under these rules it shall either:-

- (a) proceed itself against the accused by issuing a show cause notice under rule 7 and, for reasons to be recorded in writing, dispense with inquiry:

Provided that no opportunity of showing cause or personal hearing shall be given where-

- (i) the competent authority is satisfied that in the interest of security of Pakistan or any part thereof, it is not expedient to give such an opportunity; or
- (ii) a Government servant has entered into plea bargain under any law for the time being in force or has been convicted on the charges of corruption which have led to a sentence of fine or imprisonment; or
- (iii) a Government servant is involved in subversive activities; or
- (iv) it is not reasonably practicable to give such an opportunity to the accused; or

- (b) get an inquiry conducted into the charge or charges against the accused, by appointing an inquiry officer or an inquiry committee, as the case may be, under rule 11:

Provided that the competent authority shall dispense with the inquiry where-

- (i) a Government servant has been convicted of any offence other than corruption by a court of law under any law for the time being in force; or
- (ii) a Government servant is or has been absent from duty without prior approval of leave:

Provided that the competent authority may dispense with the inquiry where it is in possession of sufficient documentary

Attestal
[Signature]

(15)

Annexure - C

44



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the, 19th October.2023.

NOTIFICATION.

No.SO(B&T)E&SE/11-13/SS Islamiyat/TBB

WHEREAS Dr. Sajid Ur Rehman, Ex-Subject Specialist (BS-18), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board was proceeded against under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011 for mistakes and errors in the Textbooks of Islamiyat for Classes 4th, 7th & 8th for the Academic Year, 2022-23.

2. AND WHEREAS Mr. Abdul Akram, (PMS BS-18), Addl. Secretary, E&SE Department and Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Ibrahim, Ex-Director, Directorate of E&SE conducted inquiry against the accused.

3. AND WHEREAS the inquiry committee after having examined the charges, evidence on record and explanation of the accused, submitted the report.

4. AND WHEREAS a show cause notice was served on him and major penalty of "Dismissal from Service" was tentatively imposed upon the accused by the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). In response to the show cause notice, Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism, was nominated to give an opportunity of personal hearing to the accused on his behalf.

5. AND WHEREAS Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism afforded personal hearing to the accused on behalf of the Competent Authority on 09.02.2023 who recommended imposition of minor penalty instead of major penalty under Rules-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.

6. NOW, THEREFORE, in exercise of the powers conferred upon him under Rule 4 (1) (a) (ii) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011, the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) after considering the findings and recommendations of the inquiry committee and hearing officer, is pleased to impose minor penalty of "Withholding Of Two Annual Increment For Two Years" upon Dr, Sajid Ur Rehman, Ex-Subject Specialist (BS-18), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Textbook Board with immediate effect.

SECRETARY

Endst: of even No. & Date.

Copy is forwarded to:-

1. Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
2. Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
3. Chairman, KP-Textbook Board, Peshawar.
4. Director, E&SE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
5. District Education Officer (Male), Peshawar.
6. Dr. Sajid Ur Rehman, Ex-Subject Specialist (BS-18), KP-Textbook Board.
7. PS to Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
8. PS to Secretary E&SE Department, Peshawar.
9. Office order file.

SECTION OFFICER (BOARDS & TRG)

16

Annexure - B

443



GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the, 19th October, 2023.

NOTIFICATION

NO. SOU/DE&SE/II-L/SS Islamabad/2023

1. Amir Khan, Principal BS-19, GHS No.1, Haveliyan Abbottabad was proceeded against under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011 for mistakes and errors in the Textbooks of Islamiyat for Classes 4th, 7th & 8th for the Academic Year, 2022-23.

2. AND WHEREAS Mr. Abdul Akram, (PMS BS-18), Addl. Secretary, E&SE Department and Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Ibrahim, Ex-Director, Directorate of E&SE conducted inquiry against the accused.

3. AND WHEREAS the inquiry committee after having examined the charges, evidence on record and explanation of the accused, submitted the report.

4. AND WHEREAS a show cause notice was served on him and major penalty of "Dismissal from Service" was tentatively imposed upon the accused by the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). In response to the show cause notice, Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism, was nominated to give an opportunity of personal hearing to the accused on his behalf.

5. AND WHEREAS Mr. Tahir Orakzai, Secretary Tourism afforded personal hearing to the accused on behalf of the Competent Authority on 09.02.2023 who recommended imposition of minor penalty instead of major penalty under Rules-4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.

6. NOW, THEREFORE, in exercise of the powers conferred upon him under Rule 4 (1) (a) (ii) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011, the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) after considering the findings and recommendations of the inquiry committee and hearing officer, is pleased to impose minor penalty of "Withholding Of Two Annual Increment For Two Years" upon Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal BS-19, GHS No.1, Haveliyan Abbottabad with immediate effect.

SECRETARY

Ends: of even No. & Date.

Copy is forwarded to:-

- Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- Chairman, KP-Textbook Board, Peshawar.
- Director, E&SE, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- District Education Officer (Male), Abbottabad.
- Qazi Muhammad Amir Khan, Principal BS-19, GHS No.1, Haveliyan Abbottabad.
- PS to Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
- PS to Secretary E&SE Department, Peshawar.
- Office order file.

AC

DIRECTOR (BOARDS & TRG)

ABE
M

(17)

Annexure - E

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT

Dated Peshawar the, 13.10.2022.

NOTIFICATION,

No. SOU/ST/ESSE/8-6/1111/Free Books/Vol-I

Rehman (DS-19), Ex-member (E&P) KP-Textbook Board was proceeded against under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011 for missing / deletion / non-printing an important chapter pertaining to Khim-U-Nabawat in Textbooks of Islamiyat for Grade-1st.

2. AND WHEREAS Mr. Khalista Rehman (PCS SCI DS-20), PC Computerization of Land Record-II and Mr. Sharif Gul, Principal (DS-19), Govt Shalheed Saqib HSS No. 2, Peshawar Cantt conducted formal inquiry against the accused.

3. AND WHEREAS the inquiry committee after having examined the charges, evidence on record and explanation of the accused, submitted the report.

4. AND WHEREAS minor penalty of "Withholding Of Two Annual Increment For Two Year" was tentatively imposed upon the accused by the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa).

5. AND WHEREAS Secretary Zakat & Usher Department afforded personal hearing to the accused on behalf of the Competent Authority on 15.03.2022 who endorsed the minor penalty of "Withholding of Two Annual Increments for Two Years".

6. NOW, THEREFORE, in exercise of the powers conferred upon him under Rule 4-(1) (a) (ii) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011, the Competent Authority (Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) after considering the findings and recommendations of the formal inquiry report and personal hearing granted to the accused is pleased to impose minor penalty of "Withholding Of Two Annual Increment For Two Years" upon Mr. Sneed Ur Rehman (DS-19), Ex-Member (E&P) with immediate effect.

SECRETARY

Enclt: of given No. & Date.

Copy is forwarded to:-

1. Accountant General, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
2. Director, Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
3. Chairman, KP-Textbook Board, Peshawar.
4. District Education Officer (Male), Peshawar.
5. Mr. Saeed Ur Rehman (DS-19), Ex-Member (E&P), KP-Textbook Board, Peshawar.
6. PS to Chief Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar.
7. PS to Secretary E&SE Department, Peshawar.
8. Office order file.

SECTION OFFICER (BOARDS & TRG)

Attended
My