FORM OF ORDER SHEET

Court oi	
	·
Appeal No.	2223 /2024

Appeal No. 2223 /2024				
.No.	Date of order proceedings	Order or other proceedings with signature of judge		
1	2	3		
1-	30/10/2024	The appeal presented today by Mr. Muhammad		
		Muazzam Butt Advocate. It is fixed for preliminary hearing		
		before Single Bench at Peshawar on 06.11.2024. Parcha Pesh		
:		given to counsel for the appellant.		
		By order of the Chairman		
	•	RECESTRAR		
		The second secon		
		The second of th		
		y specification to the same		
		1. : c. (* 1 · c. (*		
	,			
		· ·		
		ļ.		
		i		

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PAKHTUNKHUWA

€MNo	-P of 2024
In Ref to	
Service Anneal No.	2223 2024

Kashif Shah

VERSUS

Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, & others

INDEX

S#	DESCRIPTION OF DOCUMENTS	ANNEX	PAGES
1.	Appeal and Verification	ψ , {, #	. 1-4
2.	Application for suspension	* .	5
3.	Copy of Monthly Salary Account	Α	.6
4.	Copy of notification No. SD (Policy) EV AD/1-3/2020 dated 06/08/2020	В	7-8
5.	Copy of impugned Letter dated June 6 th , 2023	C T	9-11
6.	Copy of Minutes of meeting dated 06-07-2023	D	12 -15
₹7.	Copy of Letter dated 23-08-2023	E .	16-17
8.	Copy of Impugned letter dated 07.09-2023	F	18 -19
9.	Copy of Representation against the said notification and representation made by APTA President	<u>[</u>	20, 21'
10.	Wakalat Nama	4.	23

ADVOCATE

M. Muazzam Butt

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL KHYBER PAKHTUNKHUWA

In Ref to

Service Appeal No 2223 /2024

Kasl	hif Shah son of Ain Ud Din SPST
Ädd	a Teri, PO Khas, Tehsil Banda Dawood shah, Karak
	VERSUSAppellan
1)	Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Establishment Department, Civ. Secretariat, Peshawar
2)	Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Elementary and Secondar Education Department, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar
3)	Director Elementary and Secondary Education Department, Civil Secretariat Nea MPA Hostel, Peshawar —
	SERVICE APPEAL UNDER SECTION 4 OF KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT

SERVICE APPEAL UNDER SECTION 4 OF KPK SERVICE TRIBUNAL ACT 1974. AGAINST THE IMPUGNED NOTIFICATION BEARING NO.SO(POLICY)E&AD/1-3/2020. DATED 06/08/2020. COMMUNICATED TO RESPONDENT NO. 2 VIDE LETTER DATED 06/06/2023. WHEREIN IT WAS STATED THAT SUB RULE 5 OF RULE 7 OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES. 1989 STANDS DELETED.

PRAYER:

ON ACCEPTANCE OF INSTANT SERVICE APPEAL. THE IMPUGNED NOTIFICATION BEARING NO: SO (POLICY) E&AD/1-3/2020. DATED 06/08/2020. COMMUNICATED TO RESPONDENT NO. 2 VIDE LETTER DATED 06/06/2023. MAY BE DECLARED AND ORDERED TO BE STRUCK DOWN BEING VOID AND ULTRA VIRES TO THE CONSTITUTION OF PAKISTAN AND FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF NATURAL JUSTICE AND AGAINST THE RIGHTS OF APPELLANT.

ANY OTHER RELIEF WHICH THIS HONOURABLE TRIBUNAL DEEMS FIT AND PROPER IN THE CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE CASE MAY ALSO BE GRANTED TO THE APPELLANT.

RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH:

 That the Respondents Department appointed the Appellant as Senior Primary School Teacher.
 Copy of Appointment letter is annexed as <u>Annexure A</u>

- That as per Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Appointment/ Promotion/ Transfer) Rules, 1989, as well as in other sister services of the other Provinces and Federation as well, availing of promotion by the employees is always optional and the employees as a matter of right may avail or forego their promotion and the next employee in seniority list is to be promoted.
- 3. That some employees specifically have foregone their promotion as they could not serve in the areas where there is no facility of accommodation and no houses of their elders are available to look after them in far-flung and solitary mountainous hard areas, and as per Section 25 of per KP Civil Servant Act, 1973, rules to the extent of terms and condition is framed by the Chief Minister and such promotion rules are not made applicable with retrospective effect. The rules framed are published in the Gazette notification and part and parcel of KP Civil Servant Appointment, Transfer and Promotion Rules 1989.
- 4. That Government of K.P without following the rules position mentioned in Para 6 above promulgated Notification No. SO (Policy) E&AD/1 3/2020, dated 06/08/2020, communicated to Respondent No.2 vide letter dated 06/06/23 wherein it has been made mandatory to the employees to avail the promotion, otherwise, disciplinary action shall be taken against the employees. The impugned Notification is reproduced as under:-

"Furthermore, those officers/officials who do not comply with promotion order of the competent authority or try to evade promotion through different means shall be proceeded against under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Efficiency Discipline) Rules, 2011, please".

- 5. That as per notification No. SD (Policy) /EDAD/1- 3/2020 dated 06/08/2020, the right of foregoing of promotion was withdrawn and the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Establishment Department (Regulation Wing) deleted Rule 7(5) in the Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 vide notification no SOR-VI (E & AD)/1-2/2020 dated 06-08-2020.
 Copy of notification No. SD (Policy) EV AD/1- 3/2020 dated 06/08/2020 is attached as Annexure B
- 6. That the Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar asked for guidance regarding deletion of Rule 7(5) in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 in respect of which the respondent No. 1 vide its letter No. SO(Policy) E&AD/1-3/2020 dated Peshawar the June 06th, 2023 directed the respondent No 3 (Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education) that Rule 7(5) in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 has been deleted vide notification dated 06-08-2020 and ,therefore, no provision exists to decline or forgo promotion and it is obligatory upon every civil servant to accept promotion under every condition.

 Copy of Impugned Letter dated June 06th, 2023 is attached as Annexure C
- 7. That thereafter the meeting was also held in the office of Additional Secretary Establishment on 06-07-2023 in which it was decided to examine the case properly and submit a self-contained/ consolidated case for onward submission to the Establishment Department for further necessary action.

 Copy of Minutes of Meeting dated 06-07-2023 is attached as Annexure D
- 8. That the Respondent No.3 i-e. Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also wrote a letter to the office of Establishment & Administrative Department vide No SO(Primary-M) E&SED/2-2/Appointment Rule/2023 dated 23-08-2023 to reconsider the amendment made in Khyber

Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 as it had negatively affected a large number of teachers and especially female teachers. Copy of Letter dated 23-08-2023 is attached as Annexure E

- 9. That the respondent vide its letter dated 07th of September 2023 directed the Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa that necessary guidance has already been provided to the department and therefore no provision exists to decline or forgo promotion and those teachers who do not comply with the promotion order of the competent authority or try to evade promotion through different means shall be proceeded under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servant (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.
 Copy of Impugned letter dated 07-09-2023 is attached as Annexure F
- 10. That the petitioner feeling aggrieved, filed Representation to the respondents in person, and also approached to respondents through APTA President but the grievances of the appellant have not so far been redressed.
 Copy of Representation against the said notification is annexed as <u>Annexure G & H</u>
- 11. That feeling aggrieved from the letters dated 06-06-2023 and 07-09-2023 and the deletion of Rule 7(5) in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989; the petitioners filed this Hence, the instant service appeal is filed on the following grounds:-

GROUNDS:-

- a. That as per various judgments it is established and settled principle that executive notifications cannot be given retrospective effect. A valid Notification which confers rights is always applicable with prospective effect, however, if an amendment notification that adversely effects the interests of the employees or causes disadvantage to the employee is not tenable in the eyes of law. The notification/guidance dated 06/08/2020 06/06/2023 are liable to be set-aside.
- b. That there are no terms and conditions of service mentioned in the appointment order of the appellant wherein, availing of promotion is mandatory. It is further submitted that employees in the past, have foregone their promotion along with their posting. It is submitted that when domestic and other personal issues do not permit the employees/appellant to avail the promotion order and in that case, the employees who foregone their promotion were allowed not to avail the promotion for a period or 04 years and on second refusal the employees were permanently debarred from availing the facility of promotion during their entire service. Hence the employees himself/herself forebear agonies of foregoing their promotions. As a result, junior to the appellant according to the order of seniority cum fitness are granted promotion to next rank.
- c. That as per Civil Servant laws, promotion is a kind of appointment which is always optional to get promotion or not, hence the impugned notification is void, illegal and against the law and the same to the extent of the appellant is liable to be set-aside.
- d. That it is further submitted that on account of grant of promotion, some employees who are suffering from severe medical ailment or facing acute domestic issues cannot avail promotion with transfer in other areas, therefore, no employee can be compelled to accept the promotion compulsorily which is not beneficial to the employee but if an employee does not avail and get benefit of her promotion it must be optional for the employees as to whether to avail or forego the benefits. Any promotion without willingness of employee is illegal and liable to be setaside.

- e. That non-availing of promotion and foregoing thereof does not cause loss to the government exchequer and in consequence of foregoing promotion, pave way to the next employee in seniority, aspiring for promotion could be promoted.
- f. That the impugned promotion Notification dated 06/08/2020 communicated on 06/06/2023 is perverse, discriminatory, against the law, pungent and is a blunt blow of hammer on the rights of the appellant. It is not out of place to mention here that the appellant are teachers and have to look after their children as well as ailing dependent family members and in these circumstances in the presence of impugned Notification dated 06/08/2023 communicated on 06/06/23 would not be able to serve in the department and which shall amount to the snatching of bread and butter of the poor employees

It is, therefore, humbly prayed that on the acceptance of the instant Service Appeal; the impugned Notification bearing No. SO (POLICY) E&D/1-3 1-2020 DATED 06/08/2020, communicated to Respondent No.2 by Respondent No.1, vide letter dated 06/06/2023, may please be declared and ordered to be struck down being Void, Uitra vires to the Constitution of Pakistan and against the fundamental principles of natural justice.

It is further prayed that no penal action as proposed and envisaged in letter dated 60/06/2023 may be declared as unlawful, illegal and without having any legal effect.

Any other relief, which this honorable Tribunal deems fit and proper in the circumstances of the case, may also be granted to the appellant.

AFFIDAVIT:

I Kashif Shah Son of Ain Ud Din Resident of Banda Daud Shah District Karak do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that the contents of foregoing application are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed therein from this Honourable Court

Deponent

Appellant

Through

Muhammad Muazzzam Butt Advocate Supreme Court

Muhammad Adeel Butt

Advocate High Court

Bassam Ahmad Siddiqui Advocate High Court LL.M- Human Rights

BEFORE T	HE SERVICE	TRIBUŅĀL	KHYBER PA	AKHTUNK	AWUH
C.M No	/2024				•
In .	• '	•			
Service Appeal No	0	<u>'</u> /2024	•	•	

Kashif Shah

V/S

Government of KP & others

APPLICATION FOR SUSPENSION OF IMPUGNED NOTIFICATION SO. (POLICY)E&AD/1-3/2020 NO. DATED 06/08/2023 AND PROMOTION ORDER DATED 29/08/2023 TILL FINAL DISPOSAL OF MAIN SERVICE APPEAL.

Respectfully Sheweth:-

- That the instant application may be treated as part and parcel of service appeal of the appellant.
- 2. That the appellant has brought a good prima facie case and balance of convenience also lies in favour
- 3. There is likelihood of success of the appellant in the lis. The impugned notification dated 06/06/2023 is against Section 25 of KP Civil Servant Act, 1973 and promotion order dated 29/08/2023 of the appellant/applicant is also to be set-aside.
- 4. That valuable right of the appellant is involved.

In view of the above it is humbly prayed that notification No. SO(POLICY)E & Ad/1-3/2020, dated 06/06/2023 and promotion order dated 29/08/2023 to the extent of appellant/applicant may graciously be ordered to be suspended till final disposal of the main service appeal.

AFFIDAVIT:

through

Deponent

I Kashif Shah Son of Ain Ud Din Resident of Banda Daud Shah District Karak do hereby solemnly affirm and declare that the contents of foregoing application are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and nothing has been concealed therein from this Honourable

Muhammad Adeel Butt
Advocate High Court

Muhammad Muazzzam Butt

Advocate Supreme Court

Appellant

-9 -

District Accusable (1870 valuely (1884) (1884) Dist. Govt. EP-Provincial

Emp into Goot, Service: 28.04 (495)

peaking gazeed 34 Acms 03 ppinifis 000 Days

CORECT MERCHANISTS

MICHAEL TO THE STATE STATES AND ADDRESS OF THE STATES AND ADDRESS OF T

Designation: PRINARY SCHOOL READ TEACH

ज्यारा उन्नरम्

BERTHALL CHEENING AND AND AND AND AND AND ADDRESS OF THE PROPERTY.

DDO Code, KKrill I Depary District Officer (Milliming B.D Shih (KAKAK)

Payodi Sertion, 101 . OPF Section 1011 GPP A.C.No. BUDKKOM1555 . OPF tolerast applied

estate outly per and · Totalist Supary

रक्षार नेप इसम् अध्य अस

। अवाध्यक्त भाषान

pri:

ST San Bout #451 heis wa

CUP Bidaners

MOODES DESIRECT GOVERNMENT RHYBE

मान अन्यस

व्यक्ति श्रीकृत् हर अक्षाद कर

(0.1105.) (#) TE + [

paramete no cellular

10 (05) LISARE WELL WHILE SHAPE COLD 1205 summonth guidant alf. 1054226 हा((टनाए)भ्यत्रम् अव्याप सङ्ग (II) 174£ POSTWOILS SENSOR SHIP I rick samentte mail small, till)t.

5008 026 9480

HAMPSHIPSHAMI

कि सीम क्षेत्र वाम्म आकारी

00,5132.40

(i) 2 (i)

GO DECT

HIMMIV

12765310

PHOLEGAL From KIN

hand jostorsasti 106f

STREETH. STURES CONTRA

्र व्याह (कार्यकान

scally road too.

00,001,41-

BOOK DECORES AVAILUMENT BEAKE OIL BEVERZEEM, THOSE BEVERE BEAKE BEKENE BEKENE BEKEN EKREKE

1/0 (0.04

001616

INI CEL CL

មាមស្ន

100565

DO DE

181.023.E

OVI CON 59

Heleway

कार स्थापने क्षेत्रका स्थापन

Complete SW - Rights Published

Deductions: (हरा ::

Advocate Subrame Durd Court of the black of the contract of the court of the court

TTUS MAKSAUM M

व्यानामा द्वापानी

START AND INCOME.

Settl Edmil mundan

Leath, Address:

CO. KARAK

KYEVK

ecyddol farannauff

HARE SHIP KASHUF STANI

00729711

*LUC-SAL the horszonali — EGLOT.CC :जहर (द_ि

	 			
- अवसम्बद्धाः -	anitrobiti	tunoms lagianin'i	ostinjeresQ	ALO.
00 (53,17)	00,577.5	00000057	the President in 190	ALIA.
			enTiermenal - e	ant tantes (

AND R. Benefits & Dente Commit.

455 4505 HA 18658 9566 ATES

नुसारक्षा बरा वाप एक्स व्यवस्था विस्त

THE PROPERTY VIEW IS NOT

CHY, STREET VIDE STREET, CHET

1505 Charte Albasance

OW 14 BUD 24 03/1615

20480500 reduced beams to f

वस्त्र अञ्चा १४४०

14 () 350 ()

म्मी क्ष्यमञ्ज्या शिल्हे

Peductions - Gentral

				<u> </u>	
1	00 (20,177)	00,577.5	00103005	hant bycard mad 190	भारक
	ंकावसम्बद्धाः	anitrobit	Surrents largeants?	oritopieseld	nio.
		<u> </u>		e⊐havliv firm edala' • n	antructuci ———

Additional Chief Secretary, Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Planning & Development Department.
The Solder Member Board of Remain Khyber Pakhtunkhwa d forwarded to:-The Schlor Member Board of Revonue, Khyber Pakhrunkhwa. All Administrative Segretaries to Gove of Khyber Palthunkhwa. The Principal Secteury to Covernor. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
The Principal Secteury to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
An Divisional Commissioners in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. All Beids of Attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. All Autonomous Semi Autonomous Bodies in Khyber Pakhiunkhwa All Deputy Commissioners in Khyber, Pakhunkhiwa. The Registrar Peshawar High Court Peshawar.

The Registrar Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal, Preshawar.

The Registrar Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Service Commission.

Peshawar.

The Registrar Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Service Commission.

Peshawar.

The Registrar Peshawar High Court Peshawar.

The Registrar Peshawar High Court Peshawar.

Peshawar. he Carcuker, Administration Department. arrange 20 gazene copies.

ATTESTED

DEBUTY SECRETARY (POLIC

ATTESTED M. MUXZZ

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA ESTABLISHMENT DEPARTMENT (REGULATION WING)

NOTIFICATION Dated Peshawar the, 06/08/2020

In exercise of the powers conferred by section 26 of the Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants Act, 1973(Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Act No XVIII of B) the chief Minister of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa is pleased to direct that in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment Promotion and Transfer) Rules 1989, the following further amendment shall be made, namely:

AMENDMENT

In rule 7, sub-ruler (5) shall be deleted.

CHIEF SECRETARY
GOVERNMENT OF THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA

(ANDS): & EVEN DATE

Copy is forwarded to :-

- 1. Additional Chief Secretary, Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Planning & Development Department)
- 2. The Senior Member Board of Revenue, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 3. All Administrative Secretaries to Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 4. The Principal Secretary to Governor, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 5. The Principal Secretary to Chief Minister, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 6. All Divisional Commissioners in Knyper Pakhtunkhwa.
- 7. All Heads of Attached Departments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 8. All Autonomous/Semi Autonomous Bodies in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 9. All Deputy Commissioners in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- 10. The Registrar, Peshawar High Court, Peshawar.
- .11. The Registrar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Service Tribunal, Peshawar
- 12. The Secretary, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Service Commission, Peshawar.
- 13. The Deputy Director (IT), E&A Department.
- 14. All Section Officers in Establishment & Administration, Department.
- 15. The Section Officer (Admin), Administration Department with the request to arrange 20 gazette copies.
- 16. The Caretaker, Administration Department.

(WARDAH LATIF)
DEPUTY SECRETARY (POLICY)

M. MUAZZAM BUT
Advocate Supremo Court

Annexure



. Government of Royner Partitunkova RSTANIASHMENT DEPARTMENT No. SO(Policy)!!&AD/1-1/2020 Italed Perhawar die June 08, 2023

62

The Covernment of Kin liet Prichtucklium, Westernlary & Secondary Princeton Department.

Subject: •

CHUPANCH REGARDING DIRECTION OF THEIR HUMBER PARKITUNICIWA GIVIL MERVANTH M PROMOTION AND TRANSPRIE RULPS, 1989.

I am directed to refer to your letter No. SO(Primary-Myrleesin)/2-2/Appolyimen/2023 dated 14,04,2023 on the subject noted chove and to stole that Sub-Rule Deat Str. (5) of Rule-7 of Khyber Pekhumkhau Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) fuller. 1989 stands deleted while this deportural northenium dated 06.08.2020; thus, no provisión exists la decilhe ar largo prematica.

- The basic tailonaic behind the defenden of the lold rule is almed at preventing a civil servant from temptation for liftell gain by sticking to a single literative post/position or to prevent those who lead to fergo premotion to evade positing/transfer or show lock of capselly to tackle higher responsibilities in case of promotion. Therefore, it is obligatory upon every civil servant to except promotion in every condition.
- Funhermoie, those officers officials who do not comply with promotion order of the competent asthurity or try to evada promation through different means shall be proceeded ordinat under Khyber Pakhunkirwa Civil Servants (Petitelency & Disciplina) Rules, 101 ل, الأدعي*ة*

Radil/Of even No & dale

Copy forwarded to the:-PS to Special Secretary (Reg.) Bushiliment Repartment PA to Additional Secretary (Ren. 10, Untabilitizant Department PA to Additional Secretary (Policy), Entablishment Department

mad Khen)

difficer (holley)

W44442-2072 AZIZULLAH VS GOVT CF PG43

FOVERNMENT OF MAYBER PARATUMENWA FLEMEIITARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT CIVIL SECRETARIAT PESHAWAR

(Phone No.091-9223587)

No.SO (Primary-M)/E&SED/2-6/2023 Daled Peshavrar the, June 257, 2023

36/6/23

Tρ

The Director

Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Khyber Pakhlunkhwa, Peshawar.

Aziz Ullah Khan

President

All Primary Teacher's Association, KP

Subject:

GUIDANCE REGARDING DELETION OF RULE 7(5) IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS JAPPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES, 1989,

I am directed to refer to the subject noted above and to enclose here with a letter of Establishment Department letter No. SO (Policy)E8AD/1-3/2020 dated 06 June, 2023 and to state that the subject meeting is to be held on 06 July, 2023 at 11:00 AM in this department under the Chalimanship of Additional Secretary (Estab) E&SE Department in his office.

You are, therefore, requested to depute a representative of your respective Department to attend the meeting on a date, time & venue as mentioned ábove, please.

Encl: AA

(MUHAMMAD ISHAO) SECTION OFFICER (PRIMARY MALE)

Copy forwarded to the:

1. PS to Secretary, E&SE Department Khyber Pakhtynkhwa.

SECTION OFFICER

Advocate Supreme Court

WP4442-2023 AZIZULLAH VS GOVT CF PG43

11

ھاد

No SO (Primary-M)/6&SED/2-6/2023 Dated Poshawar the June 25th 2023

To

The Director Elementary & Secondary Education Department Khyber Poichtunkhwa, Peshawar

Aziz Ullah Khan President President All Primary Teacher's Association, KP

Subject:

GUIDANCE REGARDING DELETION OF RULE 7(5) IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES, 1989.

I am directed to refor to the subject noted above and to enclose here with a letter of Establishment Department letter No. 50 (Policy)E&AD/1-3/2020 dated 06 June, 2023 and to state that the subject meeting is to be held on 06 July, 2023 at 11:00 AM in this department under the Chairmanship of Additional Secretary (Estab) E&SE Department in his office.

 You are, therefore, requested to depute a representative of your respective Department to attend the meeting on a date, time & venue as mentioned above, please.

Encl: AA

(MUHAMMAD ISHAQ)
SECTION OFFICER (PRIMARY MALE)

Copy forwarded to the:

1. PS to Secretary, E&SE Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

SECTION OFFICER (PRIMARY MALE)

ATTESTED

M. MUAZZAM BUTT

Advocate Supreda Court

WP4442-Z023 AZIZULLAH V8 GOVT CF PG43

MINUTES OF THE MEETING REGARDING APPLICATION SUBMITTED BY MR. ATIX LILLAH PROVINCIAL PRESIDENT ALL PRIMARY TEACHERS ASSOCIATION XHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA REGARDING OF DELETION OF RULE 7(5) IN THE CIVIL SERVANT (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION A TRANSFER RULES 1989).

A meeting regarding the subject matter was held an 04-07-2023 at 1 1:00 AM under the Chairmanship of Additional Secretary Establishment in his affice. The following attended the meeting.

S#	NAME_	DESIGNATION		
1	Mr. Pazal Wahld	Deputy Director Establishment of Office locate Elementary & Secondary Education Department		
2	ı Mr. Aziz Vilah	Provincial President All Primary Teachers - Association - Khyber Pakhtunkhwa		
3	Mr. Rologal Ullah	General Secretary APTA Pashawar		
4	Muhammad Ishaq	Saction Officer (Primary) EASE Department Civil Sacreforlat Khyber Pokhtunkhwa Peshawar		

- The meeting started with recitation from the Holy Ouran. The chair welcomed
 the participants. The Deputy Director (Establishment) at Directorate at Elementary &
 Socondary Education briefed the forum regarding agendo term in detail.
- 3. After threadbare discussion it was decided that Directorate of Bernantary & Secondary Education Department may examine the case properly and submit a self-contained/consolidated case for anward submission to Establishment Department for further necessary action.

The meeting ended with a vale of thanks from the Chair.

(Mr. Fozii Wahid) Deputy Phecior-I ELSE Deportment (Mr) Autz Ullah)
Havinztal President
Frimary Teachers Association
Knyber Potniunkhwa

(Mr. Rolandt Vilah) General Sacretory APIA Peshawar (Muhammed Lines)
Saction Officer (Primary-Male)
E&SC Department

(Abdullah) Addillonal Secretary (Establishment) E4SE Department

M. MUAZZAMBUTT

WP4442-2023 AZIZIRLAH VS GOVT CF PG43

<u>/3'</u> -Blc.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING REGARDING APPLICATION SUBMITTED BY MR AZIZ ULLAH PROVINCIAL PRESIDENT ALL PRIMARY TEACHERS ASSOCIATION KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA REGARDING OF DELETION OF RULE 715) IN THE CIVIL SERVANT (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION & TRANSFER RULES 1889).

A meeting regarding the subject matter was held on 06-07-2023 at 11:00 AM under the Chairmanship of Additional Secretary Establishment in his office. The following attended the meeting

5//	NAME.	DESIGNATION
1.	Mr. Fazal Wahld	Deputy Director Establishment of Directorate Elementary & Secondary Education Department
2	Mr. Aziz Ullah	Provincial President All Primary Teachers Association: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
3	Mr. Rofaqat Ullah	General Secretary APTA Peshawar
	Muhammad Ishaq	Section Officer (Primary) E&SE Department Civil Secreturial Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar

- 2. The meeting started with recitation from The Holy Quran. The chair welcomed the participants. The Deputy Director (Establishment) of Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education briefed the forum regarding agenda item in detail.
- 3. After threadbare discussion it was decided that Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Department may examine the case properly and, submit & self-contained/consolidated case for onward submission to Establishment Department for further necessary action.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks from the Chair.

•			₽.
1		٠,	į
•	d-	· q	(9)
		· 	
		•••	•
	10°	4	
	•	-	·. · ·
on :	<u> </u>	· · ·	<u> </u>
٠,	•	•	
	•		

ATTESTED M. MUAZZAM BUTT Advicate Suprem Court



Kliyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar 8145 IF.No. 34/SST/MGeneral Cases Dated 2-1

Email: estableibesentmale (@gmail.com

ţ

The Sociton Officer (Primary-Male). Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtimkhwa Peshawar...

Subject: -

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

Dear Sir. f am directed to refer to the letter No.50(Primary-h1)E&SED/3-1/ G.Affsc/Minutes of the Meeting/PST72023 dated 10-07-2023 on the subject clied above and to present brief littory about the background of the case as under:

- That Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Establishment Department (Regulation Wing) deleted Rule 7(5) in the Civil Servents (Appointment, promotion & Transfer Rules 1989) vide notification No. No. SOR-VI (E&AD)/I-1/2020 dated 06-08-2020.
- That this office zought guidonce from your good office to the following words vide letter No.6987 dated 06-02-2023.
 - (I) Now U is obligatory upon the civil servant to accept Promotion in every condition.
 (II) It is the prerogative of the civil servant to either accept or turn down the affer of promotion
- That your goof office forwarded the same to the quarter concerned vide letter Na.SO (Pelmary-M) E&SEDI2-2/Appointment/2023 for necessary guidance.
- They the Government of Kleyber Pakhtunkhwo Establishment Department (Regulation Wing) vide letter No.SO (Policy) E&AD/1-3/2020 doted 6-06-2023 categorically stated that there exists no provision to decline or forgo promotion. It is obligatory upon every civil servant to accept pramation under every condition.
- The same was received by this office from your good office vide letter No.50 (Primary-M) E&SEO7-2/Appointment/2023 dated 12-04-2023.
- That, in the light of the minutes of meeting dated \$-07-2023 held under the Chairmonship of Hun, Additional Secretary Establishment at his office this office has heen asked for submission of consolidated case.

In view of the above, this office is of considered opinion that the deletion of Rules 7(5) have affected negatively a large numbers of Female Teachers. Thus it is proposed that Teachers below OAS-16 may be exempted of implications of the amondment in the rules lold provided they subpili their written refusal prior to conduction of the meeting of Deportmental Proportion Committee.

The case is submitted for persual and necessary actions please.

Assistant Oliveliar (Estab 61-1) Elementary & Secondary Education

Endn: No.

4

Copy of the above is to:-

- 1. PA to Director Local Directorate.
- 2. Master Copy.

Assistant Director (Establit-I) Elementary & Secondary Ethication Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

ATTESTE

M. MUAZZAM

Advocate Supreme Court

WH4442-2023 AZIZIALAH VS GOVT CF PG43

-B/c-

DIRECTORATE OF ELEMENTARY ESECONDARY EDUCATION, KPK

PESKAWAR. (21-7-2023)

To:

Section Officer (Primary Male).
Elementary & Secondary Education Department.
KPK, Peshawar.

Subject: Minutes of Meeting

Dogs Sir) g am directed to refer to letter No. (50 himagy-M) E & SED /5-1/GNBL/ Minstes of meeting /PST/2013 dated 20-7-2023 on subject cited above and to present bold history, about backgrand of cute as under.

That Continuous of HP Establishment dependment (Regulation Wing)

That Continued of KP Establishment dependment (Regulation Wing) delided rule 7(5) In Civil Servents (Appointment, premations, Timefor Rule 1989) vide notification No. No. SOR-VI(ESAD)1-3/2020 dealed ob 08-2020.

· That this office sought guidance from your good office in the following words vide letter No. 6987 defed ob-overson

(i) Now it is obligatory upon civil securent to accept promotion. (ii) It is presignative of civil servent to alter accept/temdern the offer of promotion.

• That you good office forwarded the same to questes concerned wide letter No. So (Prinary M) EG SED/2-2/Appointment 2023 for recessary guidonce.

- That the government of KP-ED (Regulation Wing) vide letter No. 30 (Policy) ES. AD (1-3) 2070 dated 6-06-2073 categorically stated that there exists no provision to decline for promotion. It is obligating upon every civil servant to accept pomotion under entry condition.
- That in light of the minutes of the meeting dated 6-07-2027 held under the Ctainmanship of then. Additional Secretary Establishment at his effice. This office has been asked for submission of consolidated case.

In view of the above, this office is of considered opinions that the deletion of Rules 7(5) have affected negatively a huge members of Female teachers.

The case is submitted for person and necessary action

Copy of the copie to:

1. PA to Director Local Directorate

Accidented Director

Elementary & Secondary Education

Oracle Khyles Ruthburkhus.

2. Master Copy

WP4442-2023 AZIZULLAH V5 GOVT CF PG41

ATTESTED

M, MUAZZAM BUTT



ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT CIVIL SECRETARIAT PESHAWAR (Phone No.091-9223587)

No. SO(Primary-M)EBSED/2-2/Appointment-Rule /2023 Peshawar Dated 23rd August, 2023

The Secretary to Govt, of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Egisphehment & Administration Department, Fachaviar

SUBJECT: - GUIDANCE REGARDING DELETION OF RULE 7(5) IN THE CIVIL SERVANT (APPOINTMENT, PREMOTION & TRANSFER RULES

I am directed to refer to your letter No. 50(Policy)/ EBAD/ 1-3/2020 dated راالا الاعرا 067 June 2023 and to state that after deletion of rule 7(5) Khyber Pakittunkhwa CMI Servers (Applentment, Promotion & Transfer Rules 1989) It has been intimated that those officers/ officials virto do not comply with promotion order of the competent authority or ... by so evade promotion through different means shall be proceed under Khyber Patriounkarna Civil Servant (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.

In this connection it is submitted that in some cases lady teacher of primary who avail such promotions have to face serious inconvience while they have to certorm duties in the remotest station with no residential or transport facility. Most of them are married with kids and elder father of mother-in-law who heed care. In such cases, there are negative effects on service delivery.

In view of the above, the sald amendment may be reconsidered to the where of lady teacher in primary schools.

WITH THE LAND IN THE WAY SECTION OFFICER (PRIMARY MALE)

SECTION OFFICER

copy forwarded to the:

Director E&SE Kiryber Pakhbinkhwa.
 PS to Secretary, EBSE Department Knyber Pakhbinkhwa.

Scanned with CamScanner

Advocate Supreme

WP#442-2073 AZIZULLAH VS GOVT OF PG43

No.50 (Primary - M) FESED |2-21 Pedramar Dated 23rd August, 2013.

The Secretary to Government of Khybo Pakhhinbhina Establishment and Administration Depostment, Peshauro.

Guidance regarding deletion of Rule 7(5) in the SUBJECT: and Servant (Appointment, Amostian & Transfer Rules 1989)

9 am directed to refer to your letter No. Solfring. Dear Sir, 11-3/2020 dated B+ June 2023 and to state that after deletion of Rule 7(5) Khyber Paktornthium Civil Servant (Appointment) Romotion and Transfer Rules 1989) 91 has been intimated that those officers officials who do not comply with promotion order of the competent authority or try to evade promotion though different means shall be proceed under khyber flikhtunkhun and Dixipline) Role 2011.

In this connection it is submitted that in some cases lady teacher of primary level who avail such promotion have to face serious incovenience while they have to perform duties in the remotest stations with no residential / transport facilities. Most of them one married with kids and elder father of Mother-in-law into need case in such cases there are negative effects on service delivery. In view of above, the said ammendment may be reconsidered to the extent of locky teacher in primary schools.

Copy forwarded to;

uction officer (Ri

Director E& SE Ktyles Pakethorkhung

PS to Secretary, E & SE Depositment Marchar Part boundings

Advocate Supremy Cour



COVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA ESTABLISHMENT DEPARTMENT

No. SO(Policy)E&AD/1-3/2020 Dated Peshawar the September 07, 2023

The Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Elementary & Secondary Education Department.

Subject: -

GUIDANCE REGARDING DELETION OF RULE 7(5) IN THE KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES, 1989.

1 am directed to refer to your letter No. SO(Primary-M)/E&SED/2-Dear Sir. 2/Appointment-Rule/2023 dated 23.08.2023 on the subject noted above and to state that necessary guidance has already been tendered to your good office vide this department letter of even No. dated 06.06.2023 (copy enclosed).

Yours faithfully,

Endst. Of even No & date

Copy forwarded to the:-

- 1. PS to Special Secretary (Reg), Establishment Department.
- 2. PA to Additional Secretary (Reg-II), Establishment Department.
- PS to Deputy Secretary (Policy), Establishment Depurtment.

GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA ESTABLISHMENT DEPARTMENT No. SO(Policy)E&AD/1-3/2020 Dated Peshawar the September 07, 2023

To

The Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Elementary & Secondary Education Department

Subject -

Guidance regarding deletion of Rule 7(5) in the KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES, 1989.

Dear Sir.

I am directed to refer to your letter No. SO(Primary-M)/E&SED/2- 2/Appointment-Rule/2023 dated 23.08.2023 on the subject noted above and to state that necessary guidance has already been tendered to your good office vide this department letter of even No. dated 06.06.2023 (copy enclosed).

Yours faithfully,

Section Officer (Policy)

Endst. Of even No & date

Copy forwarded to the:-

- 1. PS to Special Secretary (Reg), Establishment Department.
- 2. PA to Additional Secretary (Reg-II), Establishment Department.
- 3. PS to Deputy Secretary (Policy), Establishment Department

Section picor (Policy)

M. MUAZZAM Advocate Supreme

WP4442-2023 AZIZULLAH VS GOVT CF PG43

To.

Dated: 24-01-2024

1) Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Establishment Department, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

Secretary to Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Elementary and Secondary
 Education Department, Civil Secretariat, Peshawar

3) Director Elementary and Secondary Education Department .

REPRESENTATION AGAINST THE IMPUGNED NOTIFICATION BEARING NO.SO(POLICY)E&AD/1-312020. DATED 06/08/2020. COMMUNICATED TO SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA. ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION DEPARTMENT VIDE LETTER D06/06/2023. WHEREIN IT WAS STATED THAT SUB RULE 5 OF RULE 7 OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA CIVIL SERVANTS (APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER) RULES, 1989 STANDS DELETED

Sir/ Madam:-

Your Honorable authority promulgated Notification No. SO (Policy) E&AD/1 3/2020, dated 06/08/2020, communicated to Elementary & Secondary Education vide letter dated 06/06/23 wherein it has been made mandatory to the employees to avail the promotion, otherwise, disciplinary action shall be taken against the employees. That, as per notification No. SD (Policy) /EDAD/1- 3/2020 dâted 06/08/2020; the right of foregoing of promotion was withdrawn and the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Establishment Department (Regulation Wing) deleted Rule 7(5) in the Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 vide notification no SOR-VI (E & AD)/1-2/2020 dated 06-08-2020. That the Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar asked for guidance regarding deletion of Rule 7(5) in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 in respect of which the Establishment Department vide its letter No. SO.(Policy) E&AD/1- 3/2020 dated Peshawar the June 06th, 2023 directed the Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education that Rule 7(5) in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 has been deleted vide notification dated 06-08-2020 and therefore, no provision exists to decline or forgo promotion and it is obligatory upon every civil servant to accept promotion under every condition. That Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also wrote a letter to the office of Establishment & Administrative Department vide No SO(Primary-M) E&SED/2-2/Appointment Rule/2023 dated 23-08-2023 to reconsider the amendment made in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servants (Appointment, Promotion and Transfer) Rules, 1989 as it had negatively affected a large number of teachers and especially female teachers. In the meanwhile, the department vide its letter dated 07th of September 2023 directed the Directorate of Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa that necessary guidance has already been provided to the department and therefore no provision exists to decline or forgo promotion and those teachers who do not comply with the promotion order of the competent authority or try to evade promotion through different means shall be proceeded under the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Civil Servant (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 2011.

It is, therefore, humbly prayed that on the acceptance of the instant representation; the Notification bearing No. SO (POLICY) E&D/1-3 1-2020 DATED 06/08/2020, communicated to vide letter dated 06/06/2023, may please be declared and ordered to be struck down being Void, Ultra vires to the Constitution of Pakistan.

Best Regards

Kashif Shah

M. MUAZZAM BUT

Son of Ain Ud Din Resident of

Banda Daud Shah District Karak

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

annexure

Note (Wirth Kilmin Produkent B 0333-041-888 Satusahi 973@gmeb.com El netningk



اً كَ يُراتَمُرَى لِمُحِمِرُ السوى الشِّن (ابنا) فيبر يختونو ا

بهب: ميكول ولمنزل ٥ يجلول ايم مين فير بنزاوا مَهُا الْ يُرامَرُي لِي إِدَائِويَ الْمُثَى فَيْرِ بِيُوْلِياً

کروٹ ہے کے پرد موشو پر ادامت میں است ایں از کر مراکبات اللہ کی فرانل اللّائے پردموشوکا ایک الله اوا کروٹ کا کرو محد یک قدے ایک وقد پروموشو فد کی 7 دو ایم آئٹ ہا مال تک پروموشو میں ساتھے جے معظب باد مال تک بار اس کا پروموشو پیورٹ فت ایک ولد پروموٹر ند عی آور ہر آئو ، پلر مال علی پروموٹر تک سامنے ہے سنٹ پلاسل علی ہر اس لما پر اموٹر تک اوسی کا کہ ہر اس اللہ کا کہ اس کا کہ ہم اس مال بار کی برائی کی اور اندوبر سال بار کا کہ اور ایک کو اگر ایک کا اور ایک کی تاریخ کی اور ایک کی تاک ایک اور ایک کی تاک ایک کی تاک اور ایک کی تاک کی تاک اور ایک کی تاک کی تاک

البداله فرك في على باع

کے کا الیکن بلکا اس کی کا الیکن بلکا اس کا پہاڑی است کا ایک طور ہور کرنے کا سلا فرحا ہوتا ہے۔ بلاا م یہ وقت رکت مل کی اسلام اول ایکنی کر سر برے بائری میاد، ضرب لیسل برافری میاد، کر این این البعاث میان ال

مزيزاند خال شوبائی مندد . آلَ بِمَاثَرِي نَجِرُدُ الدِي النَّ فَيْمَ بَيْرُ مِنْ ال

> ATTESTED M. MUAZZAM BUTT
> Advocate Suprema Court

H2-2023 AZIZULLAH VE GOVT CF PG43

07.05.2024

4.7 . Learned counsel for the appellant present.

2. Let a pre-admission notice be issued to the respondents through TCS for submission of reply/comments. Appellant is directed to deposit TCS expenses within three days. To come up for reply/comments as well as preliminary licaring on 10.06,2024 before S.S. P.P given to learned counsel for the appellant.

in Alongwith the service appeal there is san application for suspension of Notification dated 06.06.2023 and iener dated 23.08.2023 till the final disposal of main service appeal. In the meanwhile, in adverse action shall be taken against the appellant till next date of hearing.

Geriffied to be true copy(Muhammad Akbar Khan)

Member (E)

Date of Presentation of Americanian La Tr. L.

Children Children

Total----

Dacof C

and the state of t

ATTESTED

M. MUAZZAM BÚTT

Advocate Supreme Conve

CS CamScanner

JAKALAT NAMA

BEFORE THE SERVICE TRIBUNAL PESHAWAR

KASHIF SHAH Versus **Appellant**

Government of KP & others

Respondents

I (the Appellant)

do hereby appoint and retain

MUHAMMAD MUAZZAM BUTT ASC. MUHAMMAD ADEEL BUTT AHC BASSAM AHMAD SIDDIQULAHC

& ASSOCIATES OF MUAZZAM LAW FIRM

to act and appear for me in the above Suit and on my behalf to conduct and prosecute (or defend) the same and all proceedings that may be taken in respect of any petition connected with the same or any decree or order passed therein and Applications for review to file and obtain return of documents, and to represent me/us and to take all necessary steps on my/our behalf in the above matter.

l agree to ratify all acts done by the aforesaid Advocate in pursuance of this Authority.

APPELLANT

ACCEPTED

MUHAMMAD MUAZZAM BUTT

Advocate Surreme Court

MUHAMMAD ADEEL BUTT

Advocate High Court

BASSAM AHMAD SIDDIQUI

Advocate High Court